

To Register or Not To Register? Unregistered Christians in China under Increasing Pressure

XUCHU XU

China, for all its booming economy, is listed among the 'top ten countries' where Christianity is 'severely restricted'.¹ According to Nina Shea, director of Freedom House's Puebla Program on Religious Freedom (formerly the Puebla Institute), 'from our research, China now has the largest number of Christian prisoners in the world. Religious intolerance is not dissipating with the expansion of the capitalist system.'² In China there is certainly economic *glasnost*, yet there is no real political *pere-stroika*.

The year 1995 saw a drive by the government to register all unapproved Christian meetings throughout China in accordance with *Decree No. 145* signed by premier Li Peng on 31 January the year before. The purpose of registration is, as the Religious Affairs Bureau (RAB) put it in April 1994, 'to strengthen control of religious affairs and make religion compatible with socialist society'.³ The RAB urged its local officials to complete the registration by the end of 1995; it was said that they would be paid annual bonuses if they successfully completed quotas for registering all independent churches in their respective areas.⁴ Two things, however, prevented some independent churches from registering with the RAB. One was that they could not afford the high fees which some of the local RAB officials arbitrarily exacted for registration. Complaints about these were lodged, for example, in Jiangsu province.⁵ The other was that their places of worship were sometimes regarded by the local officials as 'illegal and reactionary meeting places' – places which did not meet the state's criteria for registration and must therefore be outlawed.⁶

While some independent churches, particularly in rural areas, decided to register in order to save their church buildings, many independent or unregistered churches,⁷ 'congregational' in ecclesial polity, opposed any kind of centralised control and therefore refused to register with the state. They have argued that to register with the government would compromise their congregational principles by giving final authority to the state.⁸ The purpose of the registration campaign, unregistered Christians in Henan province argued, was to enable the RAB to control the church and limit its growth. It was simply impossible, they continued, for them to register without being drawn under the control of the Three Self Patriotic Movement (TSPM) and the RAB. Once they were controlled, they believed, they would no longer have any freedom to do itinerant preaching, which is regarded by the government officials as 'illegal'.⁹

The defiance of many unregistered churches against the 1994 state decrees on religion has resulted in waves of government crackdowns. There are at least three ominous factors which show that the religious situation in China will probably get worse.

The first ominous factor is the appointment of Ye Xiaowen as the new director of the RAB of China's State Council in June 1995. This man, who used to serve in the Communist Party Youth League and has now replaced Zhang Shengzuo, has generally been regarded as a committed atheist as well as a doctrinaire Marxist who is convinced that 'religion comes into being, develops and declines'.¹⁰ He is said to have reminded his colleagues that 'we still have to continue our struggle against religion'.¹¹ He is particularly worried, it is said, about the rapid growth of Christianity, and probably because of this he is disliked by religious believers in China.¹² As Nina Shea remarks, 'at least in the short term, we can expect it [the religious situation] to worsen because there's been a new appointment of a Communist hard-liner to the RAB.'¹³

The second ominous factor for Chinese Christians is that research into the religious situation in China has now been passed from the RAB to the State Security Ministry (SSM, the counterpart of the former Soviet Union's KGB). This indicates once again that the government is taking 'religious problems' very seriously,¹⁴ as is shown in the statement issued by the government in 1995 that the growing number of Christians is 'one of the foremost threats to stability'.¹⁵ It is in part the rapid spread of Christianity that has caused the government to take concerted action against the 'illegitimate' churches, whether Protestant or Roman Catholic, as they, unlike Daoism, Buddhism, and Islam, are still viewed by the government as connected with 'foreign' forces.¹⁶

The third ominous factor is that the RAB of the State Council summoned a national conference in January 1996 to discuss how to deal with and solve the difficult religious problems of public concern in the Year of the Rat. In the session of 14 January a new order was issued that all places of worship be registered with the government. This was no more than a reiteration of the 1994 decree.¹⁷

It is certain that the government has never ceased to take religious problems seriously and to call for tighter control over religious bodies, particularly Christianity, despite the fact that its persecution of those Christians who refuse to register is spasmodic. By 'tighter control over religion', to quote Ye Xiaowen, 'is [actually] meant the administrative control and supervision exercised by the government through the laws, regulations, and policies concerning religion'.¹⁸ It is also a fact that economic reform, though it has led to some openness for religions, has never helped the Chinese Communist Party (CCP) as a whole, excluding some party officials in some coastal areas, such as Wenzhou and Zhejiang, to take a liberal attitude towards religion. The religious situation in China remains very much unchanged and is probably getting even worse. Tony Lambert, a Hong Kong-based researcher on the church in China who met 'a large number of [house] church leaders' in China in January 1996, observed 'firsthand' that 'the situation is very tight and tense and likely to get worse' and 'it seems the church is now entering a period of growing persecution which is unlikely to ease'.¹⁹ Later in the same year, a few days before going on a trip to China again, he remarked that 'we are seeing a major clamp-down by the authorities as they enforce registration of "illegal" house-churches and seek to curb the extraordinary growth of the church.'²⁰

In general, the government seemed to have begun to tighten its overall control of both unregistered Protestant churches and 'underground' Roman Catholic communities across the whole country in the last quarter of 1995, during which a

number of unregistered church leaders and pro-Vatican Catholic priests are reported to have been detained in the Beijing and Shanghai municipalities and Hebei, Anhui, Jiangxi, Zhejiang and Fujian provinces after they refused to register their places of worship. Several church buildings, both Catholic and Protestant, are also said to have been demolished in Hebei, Anhui, Jiangxi and Guizhou provinces after the authorities announced that these were 'illegally-built' buildings.²¹ Moreover, an arrest warrant with the names of 3000 unregistered church preachers was being circulated throughout China by the Public Security Bureau (PSB), according to an American missionary.²²

There were many serious incidents during 1996 which further demonstrated the fact that state control over religious activities had become tighter since the previous autumn. From late February reports found their way into Hong Kong that local governments in various provinces had been conducting a crackdown upon unregistered churches.²³ It is impossible here to cite all incidents concerned,²⁴ so I shall single out and discuss in some detail some typical incidents which occurred in Shanghai municipality and Henan, Anhui, Zhejiang and Hebei provinces. I am choosing these regions because Shanghai is one of the cities in China where Christianity is concentrated and Henan, Zhejiang and Anhui are provinces where the largest percentages of Protestants are to be found in China – around 3 million in Henan, 1.4 million in Zhejiang and 1.2 million in Anhui at a conservative estimate. Henan and Anhui are both known abroad as the main centres of Christian revival in the country. There are almost a million Catholics in Hebei province, about a quarter of the national Catholic population. All these provinces, with the possible exception of Zhejiang, are known as the areas in China where the police have most frequently targeted unregistered Christians since 1979.²⁵

Shanghai

Shanghai has for years seen the mushrooming of independent Christian meeting-places alongside registered TSPM churches. A series of government raids began on 2 November 1995, at a Christian wedding ceremony in a restaurant that had been the site of several house church gatherings. Two days later the police surrounded two homes where church meetings were being held, videoed all participants – about 30 at each – and took down their names and addresses. The speakers at the meetings were taken to the district police station for questioning. Afterwards another 22 house meetings were raided and their members were cross-examined regarding the production of Christian literature and the use of other literature, including study Bibles, from outside China.²⁶ A few days after his return from Shanghai, Tony Lambert wrote:

There were many arrests and house searches in November and December last year – over 30 homes were searched by the police and hundreds of Bibles and locally-produced Christian literature all confiscated. A number of young people involved with an underground printing operation were also detained. At present, the police are warning all the house churches to register. If they do not, after March, they will be heavily fined – 100 RMB for believers; 1000 RMB for house-owners and over 20,000 RMB for evangelists.²⁷

The crackdown, according to an unregistered Christian leader in Shanghai, was a 'large-scale' and 'unprecedented' one. Four special agents are said to have come down from Beijing to Shanghai to oversee it.²⁸ As a result of the operation, according

to another unregistered Christian leader, unregistered churches that had numbered 20, 50 or 100 worshippers no longer met as one group. Ironically there were now thousands of smaller groups secretly meeting all across the city, far more than there had been a few months before.²⁹ As yet, however, few unregistered church leaders had given any details of church activities and members to the RAB, and few house meetings had registered.³⁰ Probably because of this, in early March 1996 some unregistered church leaders were arrested for refusing to register with the RAB and join the TSPM.³¹ At almost the same time two international Christian meetings in Shanghai (one numbering 200 foreign students and workers, the other 100), both of which had met in rooms in the Hilton Hotel since late 1995, were closed down by PSB officers who cited a new regulation enforced on 1 March that foreign nationals might attend services of registered churches only.³² The Hong Kong newspaper *South China Morning Post* later reported that the police had closed 300 more unregistered Christian meeting-points during April; the newspaper predicted that more house meetings would be suppressed by the end of the year.

Henan

As there was a huge number of unregistered churches in Henan the government had to extend the original deadline to complete registration to the end of 1995.³³ As a result of their defiant stand against the registration order, over 200 unregistered church leaders were arrested and believers' belongings confiscated. This crackdown, according to one unregistered church pastor, was the most severe in recent years. In Zhoukou region of Henan families were asked to fill in detailed forms and report the number of Christians among their members. Local Christians believed that this registration process would enable the government to interfere in religious activities. Meanwhile the mass arrests of more than 200 Christians did nothing but discourage them from complying with the new registration order. Eventually nearly all of them refused to register and were therefore fined.³⁴ Voice of America reported on 5 June that another 70 Christians in Henan had been arrested and that a 36-year-old female believer, Zhang Xiujia, had been beaten to death by police on 26 May.³⁵ The atmosphere in Henan was so repressive that even the WCC delegation which visited Henan in May could sense it. Members of the delegation stated that their visit had been 'stage-managed' and the presence of the RAB had made it 'virtually impossible' for them to have 'free conversations with church leaders and believers'.³⁶

Zhejiang

Compared with other provinces, Zhejiang appears to be relatively 'peaceful'. Christians can live 'at ease' and in relative affluence, and many churches, newly built or renovated, are often filled with predominantly young congregations. In some places around 20 per cent of the people are Christians.³⁷ In early 1996, however, in the southern part of the province the RAB gave one large church repeated notice to register with the RAB or face serious consequences. No sooner had 100 members agreed to register than the local TSPM occupied the church building and appointed its own elders from among its own members and a TSPM pastor to direct the work of the church. The remaining 700 members were told that if they wanted to worship in the church they must accept TSPM leadership. The unregistered church leaders eventually decided to relinquish the church building but to keep the congregation away from state control.³⁸ A campaign was subsequently launched to crack down on the

construction of unauthorised churches in the province. One congregation near Wenzhou, it is said, was warned that its church would be demolished if it continued to refuse to register with the RAB. Obviously this campaign was an integral part of the current nation-wide drive against unregistered churches.³⁹ Later one Christian was said to have been 'beaten to death by the police in the last two months'. This incident occurred at the time when an unregistered church, also near Wenzhou, was raided and its leader arrested. Meanwhile, two young Christian men were reported to have been sentenced to three years in a labour camp, supposedly for receiving Christian literature from overseas and running a printing press for religious materials.⁴⁰

Anhui

Anhui is another centre of revival in China, second only to Henan. The persecution of unregistered churches in this province is intense. In summer 1995, according to a report in *News Network International*, the police conducted a series of raids on unregistered churches across the whole of Yingshang county and arrested up to 300 Christians for 'illegal' meetings, although the latter were eventually released after paying fines ranging from 800 to 1000 RMB.⁴¹ In another part of the province six unregistered Christians were arrested for 'illegal' religious activities in September 1995 and one of them, Wang Yaohua, was sentenced to three years' reeducation through labour.⁴² The campaign continued to target those who engaged in 'illegal activities under the banner of Christianity'. The provincial party committee and government announced that on 16 November eight illegal groups had been broken up, that the group members had been arrested and imprisoned, and that a large quantity of telecommunication and printing equipment in their possession had been seized. At the end of December local cadres held a meeting to plan their next moves.⁴³ The campaign still seemed to be under way in the province in March 1996, when some unregistered church leaders were arrested in northern Anhui for refusing to register with the RAB and join the TSPM.⁴⁴

Hebei

Hebei is known as the centre of 'underground' Catholic activities in China, with frequent reports of police targeting the pro-Vatican Catholics, who outnumber by probably five to one the Catholics belonging to the Catholic Patriotic Association (CPA), a Catholic version of the TSPM.⁴⁵ In 1995 it was reported that a very senior pro-Vatican leader, Bishop Johannes Han Dingxiang of Handan diocese, had been arrested on 27 August.⁴⁶ Several months later more than 40 police vehicles carrying some 150 PSB men arrived in Bei Deng village in the early morning of 22 November and blockaded all roads leading to the newly-built Catholic church. After announcing that the building had been 'illegally' constructed, the PSB men began to knock it down. In this incident, according to a report of the Cardinal Kung Foundation (CKF), a Catholic research centre in Connecticut, USA, five Catholic construction workers were savagely beaten and seven lay church workers arrested.⁴⁷ According to the newsletter of the Puebla Institute two more pro-Vatican churchmen, Bishop Su Chimin and Auxiliary Bishop An Shuxin of Baoding diocese, were arrested in March 1996.⁴⁸

Concluding Remarks

It is clear that unregistered Christians in China are still being routinely harassed or

persecuted by police through arbitrary beatings, confiscations of property, arrests, detentions and heavy fines. They still face imprisonment, although it seems fines have become more common. They may be fined for possessing Bibles or other Christian literature printed abroad, or for gathering together for 'illegal' worship. An unregistered Christian pastor may be detained for conducting an 'illegal' service. The pastor may not be released unless he pays a fine of 10,000–20,000 RMB, equivalent to 2–5 years of an ordinary person's salary. According to Dr Kim-Kwong Chan, a research fellow in the Department of East Asian Studies at the University of Leeds, 'one new strategy implemented against many religious leaders is an "on-and-off" pattern of arrest, detention and release [with heavy fines – X.X.], with cases never going through the proper legal process.'⁴⁹ Ironically, however, it is often where Christians suffer that Christianity has grown most rapidly. This is particularly true of Christianity in Henan and Anhui. 'The greater the persecution, the faster our growth', said a pastor in Henan.⁵⁰

Why are a large number of Christians in China reluctant to register their places of worship with the state? As previously mentioned, the unregistered Christians are firmly convinced that to register with the state will compromise their congregational principles by giving final authority to the state, and that their church will be tightly controlled by both the RAB and the TSPM.⁵¹ Unlike most Christians in Europe, in whose minds is deeply ingrained the concept of the state church, the majority of Chinese Christians remain in favour of the separation of the church and state and the lordship of Christ over the church. In this they resemble the dissenting Protestants, particularly those in England in the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, who attempted to free the church from state supervision and control. A radical separatist would deem it a great sin to worship in a church established even by a Christian monarch, as he could not do so without a guilty conscience. To some, however, this would be too sectarian a view. Must we call these Chinese Christians who refuse to register with the state 'sectarians'? There is of course an important difference between the 'state church' in China and, say, the Church of England. The queen, as head of the church, does not operate a policy of outlawing all 'nonconformists', much less 'limiting' and finally 'destroying' even the established faith. 'The TSPM', by contrast, 'is a state church in the sense that the state *recognises no other Protestant organisation*; but the state also *limits, obstructs and opposes its expansion*.'⁵² In order to bring all 'nonconformist' churches under its administrative supervision and control, the government stipulates that all Protestants should either register with the 'established' TSPM or 'be classified as an illegal assembly subject to police harassment'.⁵³ However, the unregistered Christians are afraid that once they register themselves they will have to follow government guidelines wherein the state has defined what 'normal' or 'abnormal' religious belief and activities are. They will not be allowed to preach religion outside the 'designated' religious venues or to disseminate any 'unsanctioned' Christian literature, as religious belief is held by the Communist Party to be the 'private affair' of an individual believer.⁵⁴ They fear that they will soon find that they cannot join an organisation ultimately controlled by the Communist Party without denying the lordship of Christ over the church.⁵⁵ Seen in this light, the reluctance of the Chinese Christians to register with the state is perfectly understandable. It should not be construed as narrow-mindedness. The same can be said of the pro-Vatican Chinese Catholics. In China 'any faith group that rejects the leadership of the CCP', as Dr Chan observes, 'is still automatically deemed to be a "counterrevolutionary" organisation.'⁵⁶ The CPA is therefore compelled to deny the supremacy of the pope over the church, actually a fundamental

tenet of the Catholic faith, and to accept the leadership of the Communist Party instead.⁵⁷ The CPA in China, like the Church of England under Henry VIII (1534–47), is *not*, therefore, a Roman Catholic church in any sense of the term. The Chinese Roman Catholics, namely those Catholics who are officially outlawed, have found it extremely difficult to register with and join the more or less ‘schismatic’ CPA. In prison for refusing to abjure the pope, Sir Thomas More wrote that ‘to swear it was against my conscience’. Likewise the Chinese Roman Catholics will say that ‘to register with and join the CPA is against our consciences’.

All evidence shows that despite its liberal economic policy the Chinese government has never relaxed its vigilance against unregistered churches and their rapid growth. Christianity is still viewed as connected with ‘subversive’ foreign forces, and therefore a threat to the state. In order to prevent Christianity from expanding and keep it under its tight control the government has attempted to complete registration of all churches. The refusal of Christians to register their places of worship has, however, resulted in the government’s increasing harassment and persecution of Christians which, as some signs indicate, is likely to be intensified. For the unregistered Christians in China, whether Protestant or Roman Catholic, the question remains the same: the Party or Christ? To register or not to register? This is a matter of conscience.

Notes and references

- ¹ The other severely restricted countries include Saudi Arabia, Iran, Sudan, North Korea and Egypt. See ‘World watch persecution index’, *Open Doors with Brother Andrew: Serving the Suffering Church Worldwide* (hereafter abbreviated as *OD*), Anniversary Special Commemorative Issue, 1995.
- ² *News Network International: A Religious Freedom News and Information Agency* (hereafter abbreviated as *NNI*), 19 January 1996.
- ³ *OMF: China Prayer*, March 1996.
- ⁴ *NNI*, 19 January 1996.
- ⁵ *Amity News Service*, October 1995.
- ⁶ *Chinese Around the World*, February/March 1996; *NNI*, 19 January 1996. The criteria for registration given by the RAB in May 1994 are these: (1) a fixed place and name of the meeting; (2) a regular congregation of religious believers; (3) a management organisation for the church or meeting-point; (4) professional clergy or persons who meet the requirements of the particular religious group to conduct services; (5) management regulations; and (6) a legal source of income. See *OMF: China Prayer*, March 1996. The above is but another version of ‘three designates’: (1) Christian activities are to take place in designated places; (2) they are to be led by designated pastors; and (3) pastoral work must be carried on within the designated districts. See *Tian Feng* (journal of the China Christian Council), no. 13 (1983), p. 13. What the government has narrowly defined as ‘normal’ or ‘legitimate’ Christian activity actually outlaws many unregistered churches’ missionary crusades across the country, many unregistered churches where religious ‘professionals’ are either in short supply, or in line with ‘free church’ tradition not necessarily needed, and many small urban congregations which have to meet by rotation in different places. By ‘normal’ or ‘legitimate’ religious activities, to put it bluntly, is meant religious activities taking place within the guidelines defined by the Chinese Communist Party and supervised by the RAB officials.
- ⁷ The term ‘house church’ as used by Christians in the West may not be appropriate, as the size of some of the independent churches as seen particularly in Zhejiang has now outgrown the limits of any individual household. It is therefore safer to use the term ‘unregistered church’, which can refer both to an ‘illegal’ house meeting and to a large number of Christians who worship in an ‘illegally’ built church.

- ⁸ NNI, 19 January 1996.
- ⁹ *Chinese Around the World*, February/March 1996; *OD*, January 1996; *OMF: China Prayer*, December/January, March 1996.
- ¹⁰ Ye Xiaowen, 'The importance of sincerely implementing the "Three Guidelines" for religious work', *The People's Daily*, 14 March 1996.
- ¹¹ *South China Morning Post* (Hong Kong English newspaper; hereafter abbreviated as *SCMP*), 8 July 1995; 3 June 1996; 'China continues crackdown on Christians', *The First Freedom* (newsletter of the Puebla Institute), January–June 1996, p. 8.
- ¹² *China Study Journal* (published by China Department, Council of Churches for Britain and Ireland; hereafter abbreviated as *CSJ*), vol. 10, no. 2, August 1995, p. 19.
- ¹³ NNI, 19 January 1996.
- ¹⁴ *China News and Church Report* (Chinese Church Research Center, Hong Kong; hereafter abbreviated as *CNCR*), 26 January 1996.
- ¹⁵ NNI, 19 January 1996.
- ¹⁶ Kim-Kwong Chan, 'Resurgence of religion presents authorities with new dilemmas', *Special Report: A Closer Look at Issues Concerning Religious Liberty Worldwide*, 8 December 1995.
- ¹⁷ *Eastern Express*, 15 January 1996; *CNCR*, 26 January 1996.
- ¹⁸ Ye Xiawoen, *ibid.*
- ¹⁹ Letter from Lambert dated 6 February 1996.
- ²⁰ Lambert's *Prayer Letter*, June 1996.
- ²¹ NNI, 19 January 1996.
- ²² *Quarterly Review* (published by the Puebla Program on Religious Freedom), 1 October–31 December 1995.
- ²³ *CNCR*, 5 April 1996.
- ²⁴ For persecution of unregistered Protestants in Shanxi, Hebei, Inner Mongolia, Shandong, Sichuan, Hunan, Jiangsu, Guangdong, and Xinjiang provinces, see *OMF: China Prayer*, March 1996; *CNCR*, 8 March, 5 April 1996; *SCMP*, 10 November 1995; 19 May, 15 June 1996; *Compass Direct: Global News from the Frontlines*, 30 May, 27 June 1996; Lambert's *Prayer Letter*, June 1996. For persecution of Roman Catholics in Jiangxi and Jiangsu provinces who refused to join the Catholic Patriotic Association and comply with government regulations that required them to register, see *CSJ*, vol. 10, no. 2, August 1995, pp. 27–8; *CNCR*, 6 October 1995; *NNI*, 8 December 1995.
- ²⁵ For these, see Alan Hunter and Kim-Kwong Chan, *Protestantism in Contemporary China* (Cambridge, 1993), pp. 67–68, 70, 243; Tony Lambert, *The Resurrection of the Chinese Church* (Sevenoaks, Hodder & Stoughton, 1991), pp. 82–94, 143–48, 159, 179–81, 197–200, 242, 256; *CSJ*, vol. 10, no. 2, August 1995, pp. 17–18.
- ²⁶ NNI, 19 January 1996.
- ²⁷ Letter from Lambert dated 6 February 1996.
- ²⁸ NNI, 19 January 1996.
- ²⁹ *CNCR*, 23 February 1996.
- ³⁰ *OMF: China Prayer*, March 1996.
- ³¹ *CNCR*, 5 April 1996.
- ³² *Eastern Express*, 11 April 1996; *Compass Direct*, 30 May 1996.
- ³³ *Eastern Express*, 30 August 1995.
- ³⁴ *SCMP*, 22 October 1995; *CNCR*, 8 September, 3 November 1995.
- ³⁵ Lambert's *Prayer Letter*, June 1996. See also *Compass Direct*, 27 June 1996.
- ³⁶ *Ecumenical News International Bulletin* (WCC), 28 May 1996.
- ³⁷ Paul Oestreicher, 'Christian buds grow in China', *The Tablet* (London), 8 June 1996.
- ³⁸ *CNCR*, 5 April 1996.
- ³⁹ *CNCR*, 3 May 1996.
- ⁴⁰ *Compass Direct*, 30 May, 27 June 1996.
- ⁴¹ NNI, 14 July 1995.
- ⁴² *Open Doors Prayer Diary for the Suffering Church*, February 1996.

⁴³ *Eastern Express*, 16 January 1996; *CNCR*, 26 January 1996.

⁴⁴ *CNCR*, 5 April 1996.

⁴⁵ Tony Lambert, *op. cit.*, pp. 197–200.

⁴⁶ *SCMP*, 16 September 1995.

⁴⁷ *SCMP*, 3 December 1995; *NNI*, 8 December 1995.

⁴⁸ ‘China continues crackdown on Christians’, *The First Freedom*, January–June 1996, p. 8.

⁴⁹ Kim-Kwong Chan, ‘Resurgence of religion presents authorities with new dilemmas’, *Special Report*, 8 December 1995.

⁵⁰ Quoted in *China Prayer Update* (Chinese Church Support Ministries), November 1995.

⁵¹ See above, p. 201.

⁵² Alan Hunter and Kim-Kwong Chan, *op. cit.*, p. 139. Italics mine.

⁵³ Kim-Kwong Chan, *op. cit.*

⁵⁴ Tony Lambert, *op. cit.*, pp. 56–57.

⁵⁵ *ibid.*, p. 190.

⁵⁶ Kim-Kwong Chan, *op. cit.*

⁵⁷ For the CPA clergy running the church in accordance with the dictates of the Communist Party, see Tony Lambert, *op. cit.*, pp. 188–89. See also Hunter and Kim-Kwong Chan, *op. cit.*, p. 250.