

Mukaddasi. 985 A.D.	Nâsir-i-Khusrau. 1047 A.D.	Mujîr ad-Dîn. 1496 A.D.	Modern. 1888 A.D.
1. Bâb al Hittah..	Bâb al Hittah ..	Bâb an Nabî ..	Bâb an Nabî, below Bâbal Maghâribe.
2. Bawâb an Nabî	Bâb an Nabî ..	Gate of the old Aksa.	Gate of the old Aksa. (Double Gate.)
3. Gates of the Mihrâb Mar- yam.	Bâb al 'Ain (?) .. (Gate of the spring)	..	Single Gate (?).
4. Gates ar Rah- mah.	{ Bâb ar Rahmah { Bâb at Taubah..	Bâb ar Rahmah Bâb at Taubah..	Bâb ar Rahmah. Bâb at Taubah. (Golden Gate.)
5. Gate of the Bir- kat Bani Israîl.	Bâb al Abwâb ..	Bâb al Asbât ..	Bâb al Asbât.
6. Bâb al Asbât ..	Bâb al Asbât ..	Bâb al Hittah ..	Bâb al Hittah.
7. H a s h i m i t e Gates.	Gate to the Sufi's Cloisters.	Bâb al Dewatar..	Bâb 'Atm.
8. Gate of Al Walid.	..	Bâb al Ghawâ- nimah.	Bâbal Ghawanimah.
9. Gate of Ibrahim	Bâb as Sakar (?)	Bâb an Nâthîr ..	Bâb an Nathîr.
10. Gate of Umm Khâlid.	..	Bâb al Hadîd or Bâb al Kat- tanîn.	Bâb al Hadîd or Bâb al Kattanîn.
11. Gate Dâûd ..	Bâb Dâûd .. Bâb as Sakînah ..	Bâb as Silsîlah .. Bâb as Sakînah..	Bâb as Silsîlah. Bâb as Salâm.

The page references are to Mr. Guy le Strange's translation of Nâsir-i-Khusrau, published by the Palestine Pilgrims' Text Society.

C. W. W.

THE TEN TRIBES.

THAT Israel was carried into captivity the most sceptical will hardly deny in face of the historical tablet which relates how Sargon, in 722 B.C., took 27,280 prisoners from the city of Samaria, and how he supplied their place with foreign colonists.

The question is what became of these Israelite captives, and this is one which has been very variously answered. I do not here refer to the legend of Jeremiah visiting Ireland, and of the "Stone of Bethel" becoming the Stone of Scone, and the coronation stone now in Westminster Abbey, for, as Dean Stanley once observed, this stone is of some kind of sandstone not to be found in Palestine, and certainly not at Bethel, where all is hard limestone; and these mediæval legends no doubt grew up in England long after Christianity reached our shores, much as the Boer in South Africa yet believes that the Promised Land lies not far north of the Transvaal, which belief caused misery and death to

many families during the extraordinary exodus of the "Trek Boers" north of the Zambesi.

But the question what became of Israel, and what is to happen to Israel in the future, has exercised the minds of Jews, Samaritans, and Christians from the Christian era downwards, and has been very variously answered. The Samaritan solution was simple. Israel returned to Palestine about the time when Judah and Benjamin returned to Jerusalem under Ezra. A great gathering in the Haurân was followed by an advance under the guidance of Sanballat the Levite (or the Horonite) to the sacred mountain at Shechem, and of these returning exiles the modern Samaritans are the descendants. Unfortunately, the "Samaritan Book of Joshua," in which this story occurs, is a late mediæval book, full of strange legends, mostly of Persian origin.

In the early centuries of the Christian era there appears to have been a great diversity of opinion among the Jews on this subject. In the Mishnah (Sanhed x, 3) we read—"the ten tribes will not return" in the days of Messiah, because it is written "and the Lord rooted them out of their land in anger and in wrath and in great indignation, and cast them into another land as this day" (Deut. xxix, 28). On the other hand, passages were understood by other Jewish writers (Philo and the author of the Apocalypse of Baruch) in a contrary sense—"I will gather the remnant of my flock" (Jer. xxiii, 3), "Israel shall dwell safely" (verse 5), "and I will save the house of Joseph, and I will bring them again" (Zech. x, 6). It was on these passages apparently that Rabbi Eliezer relied in controverting R. Akiba's opinion that Israel would not return to Palestine.

In the second book of Ezdras (xiii, 41-50) we learn that the Ten Tribes are in a country never before inhabited, and called Arzareth, beyond a river which is to be dried up when they return.

This is perhaps the earliest foundation of a legend which attracted great attention in the Middle Ages, and induced adventurous travellers to set out in quest of the ten tribes. Mr. William Simpson has called my attention to passages in the travels of Wolff which tend to show that the idea of the Ten Tribes in central Asia survived to the present century; and other travellers have pointed out that the Nestorians claim to be of Hebrew origin. We may first consider the legends and then the historical foundation on which they rest.

In the Korân we find a legend, no doubt partly of Jewish origin, which relates the journey of Moses in search of El Khudr ("the green one"), who answers to the Jewish figure of Elijah as an immortal and ever present spiritual power. In the region of the Greek and Persian seas (apparently the Black Sea and the Caspian) Moses found a people oppressed by Gog and Magog. El Khudr was the Minister of Dhu el Karnein, "he of the two horns," usually identified with Alexander the Great, who on his coins has rams' horns, and who had drunk of the fountain of life and become immortal. Here also was the place where the sun sets in a miry fountain. Moses built an iron wall between two

mountains to shut in Gog and Magog, and poured molten brass over it (Sura xviii, 59-99). It should be noted that the mention of Alexander the Great tends to show that this story may have been partly of Persian origin—legends of that hero being common in Persia; and a few centuries later (in Firdusi's *Shah-Nama*, about 1000 A.D.) we get the same story in Persia, where Gog and Magog are represented as demons and giants who devoured man and beast, and who were shut up inside a wall by Alexander the Great himself.

Sir John Maundeville, in the 14th century, connects Gog and Magog with the Ten Tribes (chap. xxvi), and says that they were shut up till the end of the world between two mountain ranges in Scythia.¹ The Emperor Frederic II says, in a letter to Henry III, that the Tartars were descendants of the Ten Tribes shut up by Alexander the Great in the Caspian Mountains. As time went on, however, and as a Christian kingdom became established in Armenia, the story seems to have migrated east, and the wall was transported to the Great Wall of China in Marco Polo's time (*see* Yule, *Marco Polo*, i, pp. 50, 250, 257, 259).

As regards the river of the land Arzareth, it would seem that the localisation of the legend points to Arzareth being Erzerum, and the river probably the Araxes; and it is remarkable that a Persian legend (mentioned by Du Perron) speaks of Zoroaster, when thirty years of age, as crossing dryshod with his followers over the river Araxes, coming from the mythical mountain Elburz, where he received the *Zendavesta* from Heaven. According to a mediæval Jewish legend the Ten Tribes dwelt beyond the river Sambation, or Sabbatical River. This, though identified with the Ganges (Mid. Bereshith Rabba, 2; *see* Neubauer's *Geog. Tal.*, pp. 33, 386), was originally the present Nahr es Sehta, in Northern Syria (Pliny, *Hist. Nat.* xxxi, 2; Josephus, *Wars*, vii, 7, 5), an intermittent torrent which I have noticed in "Heth and Moab."² Josephus says it flows on the seventh day; Pliny, that it flows six days and rests on the Sabbath. Josephus was nearer the truth, for the rise of the stream is uncertain, and it runs only for a few hours. Thus the mystic river, like the wall of Gog and Magog, was never certainly identified.

Local traditions appear from an early date to have represented the inhabitants of Georgia and Kurdistan and of Bactria, east of the Caspian, as descendants of Israelite tribes.

Thus Benjamin of Tudela, who travelled in the twelfth century from Spain to inquire into the condition of the Jews in the East, speaks of four Israelite tribes in Bactria living under independent rulers. The Nestorian Christians who live in the Kurdish Mountains on the borders of Armenia,

¹ About 1244 Matthew, of Paris, says of the "Enclosure of the Caspian Mountains": "There dwell the Jews whom God shut in at the prayer of King Alexander, who shall come forth before the Day of Judgment, and shall make great slaughter of all kind of folk. They are shut in by mountains, high and great, and cannot come forth." He thus identifies them with Gog and Magog of the book of Ezekiel.

having been driven by Timur and the Mongols from Mesopotamia, are said to claim to be descendants of the tribe of Naphtali, and are closely connected with the Jews of that region. According to Dr. Wolff (*Travels*, vol. ii, published 1861), the inhabitants of Merv and Khiva were regarded by the Jews of that region as descendants of Hivites, Perizzites, and Jebusites,¹ who fled from Joshua to the Caspian and went yet farther north in little boats; and the Jews had, it appears, intermarried with Turkomans of Khiva, whom they regarded as Hivites.

Now, if, as I believe to be the case, the Canaanites were a Tartar people, the Bactrian Jews were not so far wrong. The story shows that a Jewish influence must have existed for some time in the Turkoman country, and we are consequently interested in tracing its history.

The corner of Asia with which we are concerned is one which on account of its mountainous character has always been the hiding place of oppressed nationalities, and the existence of a very mixed population in this region is generally admitted. Thus Armenian is an Aryan language full of Turanian words. The Medes of the time of Cyprus were a mixed Aryan and Turanian people. The Georgian language is inflexional, but many of its particles are apparently Turanian, and the term Alarodian, by which the Caucasian languages are described, serves mainly to show how little is known about them. In the Kurds we have descendants of the Parthians, and, till quite recent times, they preserved the Parthian horn bow; and, in addition to these mixed races, the Jews in the Byzantine age, and subsequently when Islam first conquered Persia and Mesopotamia, fled from alien oppressors of other faiths to the region north of the Caucasus, between the Crimea and the Caspian.

In this connection it is interesting to note that rude sculptures occur both in Turkestan and in Southern Russia, which have been supposed to be of Scythic origin. We may finally discover in these monuments akin to those of Asia Minor and Northern Syria; one of these statues, described

¹ In another passage he includes the Hittites. Now the Hittites were by no means a "peculiar people," they were only one out of numberless Tartar tribes, and it is remarkable that a great tribe existed west of Manchuria, called Khitai (bounded on the west by the Gobi desert, on the north by the Pohai Tartars, and on the south by China); their language approached the Mongol and the Tunguse. Here, rather than among the mixed populations of Georgia, we may seek the Hittite type. The history of the Khitai is traced back to 230 A.D. Their name is said to mean "tattooed," or "painted red"—a practice found among Etruscans, Romans, Guanchos, and Hottentots, who all painted themselves red in sign of rejoicing: but it may have other derivations. (See J. R. A. S. xiii, II.) Tch'ang Te, travelling in 1259 in Turkestan, west of Kuldja, was told that the Kitai formerly dwelt there. Plano Carpini, in 1245, found the "Black Khitai" east of the Aral Sea. Rubruquis, in 1253, says they used to dwell near Lake Balkash (see Schuyler's *Turkestan*, I, note 3). Thus the Khitai were believed to come from Turkestan itself, where languages closely akin to the ancient Medic and Akkadian are still spoken.

by the Chinese traveller Sui-Sun, near Lake Issyk-Kul, represents a man girt with a sword, and placing his left hand to his forehead (compare the Hittite figures for this attitude), and in the same vicinity, north-east of Kashgar, Colonel Tchaikofsky found a human face, with a long text in a character which he supposed to be Thibetan. Further information as to the supposed Scythian statues would be of interest.

No less than 700 Hebrew tombstones, with inscriptions dating from about the second to the tenth century, have been found in the Crimea. The sect of the Karaites, to which these Jewish emigrants belonged, was akin to that of the Sadducees, and their alphabet was the square Hebrew which originated in Aram. They appear to have begun to spread northwards in the Roman age, during which the Jews, already strong in Egypt and in Mesopotamia, were dispersing all over the Roman world, and had their cemeteries also at Naples, Rome, and elsewhere in Italy (*see* "Syrian Stone Lore," p. 228). The same kind of movement which drove the Karaites to the Caucasus may, without any great improbability, have driven some of the Israelite captives from Assyria at an earlier period to the same region ;¹ but, on the other hand, the whole account may be of Jewish origin.

Carmoly, in his valuable notes on the Khozars, shows us how the Karaites came to be so numerous in this region. The Khozars, or Khazars, were a Turkish people who lived west of the Caspian, which was at one time called the Sea of the Khozars. They occupied the Crimea and the region of Daghestan, near Derbend. It is related by Moses of Khorene that they invaded Armenia about 178-198 A.D. In 449 they were under the power of the Huns. In the 6th century they were sufficiently powerful to attack Persia, but Khosru Anurshivan is said to have shut them in by building the Caucasian wall, of which the ruins are said to exist in the passes of Daghestan, near Derbend.² In 625 Heraclius made peace with the Khozar king near Tiflis. In 661 Rabi'at el Bahli was sent by the Khalif to attack the Khozars, but they allied themselves with the Greeks and repulsed him. In the 10th century their power appears to have extended from the Sea of Asof to the Crimea. The Mongols subdued them in 1221, and found many Christians among them.

To this pagan kingdom the Jews fled from Christian persecution in the time of the Byzantine Emperors Basil I and Leon VI, and later on the Christians fled to the same region from the Moslems. It is related by Moses bar Nachman, and by others, that in 740 A.D. a certain Is-hak Sindjari converted the King of the Khozars to Judaism, and many of his subjects became Jews. This curious kingdom is described by Ibn Haukal in 921 A.D., and by Mas'udi in 943 A.D. In 958 the Minister of

¹ In 2 Kings xvii, 6, we read that Israel was taken to Halah, Habor, and "the cities of the Medes." Media lay just south of the Caspian.

² Such defensive walls were of early construction. Arrian (iii, xviii) says that Alexander found the Persian Straits blocked by a wall with towers south of Ebatana (Hamadan) as he advanced into Media.

the Spanish Khalif, 'Abd er Rahman III, who was a certain Chasdai Ibn Is-hak Ibn Ezra Ibn Sprot, hearing of this Jewish kingdom in the Caucasus, wrote a letter (which Carmoly gives) to the Khozar King, which was answered. These letters were published by Is-hak Akrish in 1575. In 1175 the Jewish traveller Petachia, of Ratisbon, set forth to find the Ten Tribes, of whom the Khozars now claimed to be representatives, and, passing through Persia and Media, he found the tribe of Issachar in the mountains beyond—in the Khozar country.

According to Ibn Haukal, in the 10th century there were 6,000 Moslems among the Khozars. The king was a Jew, with 1,200 soldiers; and at the city of Asmid was another allied Jewish king.

Some Khozars were Turks, black-haired; some were very dark, like Indians, some lighter (perhaps Aryans); the latter, he says, sold their children—as the Georgians have always done. They practised the "happy despatch" (like the Chinese), and called their king, who was always a Jew, the Kha-Khan.

Mas'udi, twenty years later, says that all the Court of the Khozar kings consisted of Jews who had come from Moslem and Christian countries. There were pagans of different races among them, and some burned their dead and practised suttee—probably Aryans. They traded in the skins of black and red foxes.¹

There is thus little difficulty in understanding the mediæval ideas about the Ten Tribes. The region in which they were supposed to dwell was the region where the Jewish Kingdom of the Khozars actually existed from 740 to 1220 A.D.—nearly five hundred years—together with the adjoining regions in Bactria, east of the Caspian, which were no doubt influenced by them. Hence the confusion with the Tartars, and with the biblical Gog, for it is generally admitted that Gog (*see* Ezekiel xxxviii, xxxix), connected with Tubal and Ashkenaz (*cf.* Gen. x, 2), represents a Caucasian people.

The legend of the wall originates either in the wall which Alexander stormed in Media or in the later wall of Chosroes, north of the Caucasus, which was built before the Koran and the Shahnamah were written. The story of the river is older, since it is mentioned in Ezdras—probably in the same region (Arzareth; perhaps the western region Arzah of the Persians, Bundahish xi, 4); but, as already mentioned, it is connected with a Persian legend. Those who in more recent time have sought the

¹ There was a great skin trade with the north in Crusading times, when *Fair*, the skin of the Siberian squirrel, was so highly esteemed. The *peltry* or "skins" of the Land of Darkness are mentioned by the mediæval geographers, and the trade with the unseen inhabitants of these Arctic regions is noticed by Ibn Batuta and Abu el Feda (*see* Col. Yule's "Marco Polo" ii, pp. 414, 415). From a recent paper in the "R. E. Journal" I gather that the Jewish early population in the Caucasus is not yet extinct. In Daghestan and the districts near it about 30,000 souls still reside, but as a decreasing population. Their most remarkable custom is the painting of the face (like Jezebel) by the women, who are said to paint broad bars of yellow and red across the face.

lost tribes in Bactria¹ have, it seems, forgotten the existence of this Jewish influence, lasting for five hundred years on the shores of the Caspian, and extending much further east, for there were Jews in China, as Ibn Batuta mentions—and even as early as the 2nd century A.D. A Jewish-Chinese text of 1511 speaks of a synagogue in Pien in 1164 A.D.

But, while the fact of the eastward spread of the Jews is thus historically traced, it is certainly curious that they regarded themselves as descendants of tribes other than Judah and Benjamin. They may have been preceded by Israelites of those tribes, but it is equally probable that the reason lies in their own knowledge of Bible history, which recorded the return of the two tribes under Ezra. Nor must it be forgotten that a descendant of Asher is mentioned in Jerusalem in the New Testament (Luke ii, 36).

C. R. C.

THE HITTITE MONUMENTS.

SOUTHAMPTON, 23rd May, 1888.

THE series of articles in *Nature*, based on the lectures of Mr. Thomas Tyler (January, 1888), having now terminated, I would beg to be allowed to make a few remarks on his work. I have no desire to raise controversy, or to force my own views on any who may not agree with me, but, Mr. Tyler having seen fit to allude to my work, and to bring charges of inaccuracy against me, it is evident that I may be considered as bound to answer. Another reason for speaking lies in the fact that many of Mr. Tyler's comparisons are either identical with, or closely similar to, those which I have put for-

¹ In a very interesting paper, Sutlej Pujahs (J.R.A.S. xvi, 1), Mr. Simpson quotes from Bellew's Journal of a Political Mission to Afghanistan, 1837, who again quotes from Afghan legendary histories an account of the Tabut i Sakinah, or "Ark of the Shekinah," among the Afghans, who call themselves Beni Israil. The Hebrew history may, as he suggests, have come into Afghanistan with the Moslems, but there is another possible origin. One of the authorities quoted is Habb ben Mania, "the Son of Manes." Now the Bundahish agrees with Mas'udi in making the Turko-Tartar tribes in Turkestan, and as far as China even, Manicheans, in the 10th century or earlier, and Manes included Jewish ideas in his great syncretic system.

The word Tabut is applied by Shi'ah Moslems (who have much in common with the Manicheans) to a model of Husein's tomb.

Arks were very commonly used in Asia by the Babylonians and Egyptians and Phœnicians, as well as by the Hebrews. The Canaanites had arks, according to a text translated in "Records of the Past," as early as 1600 B.C. The Khitai in Cathay, in the 10th century, had a consecrated tent used as a temple during their war expeditions.

As regards Manes, however, it should be noted that the legendary ancestor of the Kirghiz in Turkestan was the giant called Manias.