Gospel as it stands: and Meyer does not shrink from this. I have tried to shew on the other hand, firstly, that this Gospel represents a natural development in the Ministry of Jesus by which he gradually restricted his teaching, as it became more advanced and faced more and more clearly the apparent failure of the movement, to a limited number of his followers; and secondly, that the 'disciples' who receive this later teaching being in effect the 'Twelve', the Evangelist uses one or other phrase indifferently to describe them, and that any analysis which attempts to separate the two uses as indicating two rival sources raises so many difficulties that it can only be called, even on literary grounds, a failure.

C. H. Turner.

THE MEMORIA APOSTOLORUM ON THE VIA APPIA.

The excavations which have taken place in recent years beneath the Church of S. Sebastiano have awakened great interest on account of the light thrown by them on the cult of the Apostles Peter and Paul on the site now occupied by that church, which in its present form is a building of the sixteenth century. They have been officially described in the Notizie degli Scavi, series v, vol. xx (1923), by G. Mancini and O. Marucchi, and have been the subject of a large literature, to which the most important of recent contributions is the posthumous article of Mgr Duchesne in the Atti della Pontificia Accademia romana di Archeologia, series iii, Memorie vol. i. Since the work of excavation has, at any rate for the time being, ceased, the time seems opportune for a provisional interpretation of the results obtained in the light of the traditions connected with the site.

The existence of a liturgical cult of the Apostles in this region as early as the fourth century is established by a comparison of the Depositio martyrum, a document incorporated in the Calendar of Philocalus (A.D. 354) and the fuller versions of the Martyrologium Hieronymianum, which may be presumed to go back to the fifth-century original. In the Depositio we have the entry (under June 29) Petri in Catacumbas et Pauli Ostense, Tusco et Basso Consulibus; while the fullest form of the entry in the Martyrologium reads thus:—Romae Via Aurelia, natale Sanctorum Apostolorum Petri et Pauli, Petri in Vaticano, Pauli vero in via Ostensi, utrumque in Catacumbas, passi sub Nerone, Basso et Tusco consulibus. The consular date is A.D. 258, and its presence in the entry can only be explained by some connexion with the celebration in Catacumbas, which took place in addition to those
NOTES AND STUDIES

held at the tombs of the Apostles on the Aurelian and Ostian roads. There is, in fact, a hymn (wrongly ascribed to St Ambrose) which belongs to the fifth century, and plainly speaks of a threefold commemoration on June 29:

*Tantae per urbis ambitum
Stipata tendunt agmina:
Trinis celebratur uis
Festum Sanctorum martyrum.*

Other documents leave no doubt as to the region in which the memorial on the Appian Way is to be sought. The life of St Damasus in the *Liber Pontificalis* is preserved in a longer and a shorter recension. The latter, which is the earlier, exists in the form of two abridgements, the ‘Felician’ (F) and the ‘Cononian’ (C). The F-text has:* fecit basilicas II, una ad via Ardiatina ubi requiescit, while in C we read* hie dedicavit platomum in Catacumbas ubi corpora Petri et Pauli apostolorum iacuerunt, quam et versibus ornavit. In the fuller and later version we find: *hic fecit basilicas duas, una beato Laurentio iuxta theatrum et alia via Ardeatine, ubi requiescit; et in Catacumbas, ubi iacuerunt corpora sanctorum apostolorum Petri et Pauli, in quo loco platomam (v.1. platoniam) ipsam, ubi iacuerunt corpora sancta, versibus exornavit.* Whether or no we are to infer that St Damasus erected a third basilica *ad Catacumbas* —and Duchesne gives good reasons for thinking that this was not so—we can have no doubt that he set up there a *platoma,* i.e. an inscribed marble slab, on the spot where their bodies were believed to have lain, Fortunately we possess the text of this inscription, which was copied by the Monk of Einsiedeln in the Church of St Sebastian, and ran as follows:—

*Hic habitasse prius sanctos cognoscere debes,*
*Nomina quisque Petri pariter Paulique requiris;*
*Discipulos Oriens misit, quod sponte fatemur.*
*Sanguinis ob meritum Christumque per astra securi*
*Aetherios petiere sinus regnaque piorum;*
*Roma suos potius meruit defendere cives.*
*Haec Damasus vestras referat, nova sidera, laudes.*

The meaning of *habitasse* in the first line has been disputed; but there is no doubt that the word was used by St Damasus of the resting-place of saints, for in his epitaph on the martyr Gorgonius, formerly in St. Martino ai Monti and now lost, we read:—

*hic quicumque uenit, sanctorum limina quaerat,*
*inveniet uicina in sede habitare beatos.*

A more important question arises with regard to the third and sixth

1 Ihm *Damasi Epigrammata* no. 26.
lines, which, in the somewhat obscure language of St Damasus, mean 'The East sent forth the Disciples [i.e. Peter and Paul]; we freely admit it . . . but Rome earned the right to claim them (defendere = establish a title to land, &c.) as her citizens'. It is, however, impossible to dissociate the lines from the well-known legend that a band of Eastern Christians endeavoured to remove the bodies of the Apostles from Rome, but were frustrated in the act, partly through a convulsion of nature. The version given in the Passio sanctorum apostolorum Petri et Pauli runs as follows:—

§ 63. Statim apparuerunt uiri sancti quos unquam nemo viderat ante nec postea uidere potuerunt. Istit dicebant se propter ipsum de Hierosolymis advenisse, et ipsi una cum Marcello illustri viro qui crediderat et reliquens Simonem Petrum secutus fuerat abstulerant corpus eius occulte et posuerunt sub terebinthum iuxta Naumachiam in locum qui appellatur Vaticanus . . .


The story is also told in a letter of St Gregory the Great (Epist. iv 30) to the Empress Constantina in the following words:—

De corporibus uero beatorum Apostolorum quid ego dicturus sum, dum constat quia co tempore quo passi sunt ex Oriente fideles veneurunt, qui eorum corpora sicut civium suorum repeterent? Quae ducta usque ad secundum urbis miliarum in loco qui dicitur Catacumba collocata sunt. Sed dum ea exinde levare omnis eorum multitudo conveniens niteretur, ita eos vis tonitru et fulguris nimio metu terruit atque dispersit, ut talia denuo nullatenus attentare praesumerent. Tunc autem exuentes Romani eorum corpora, qui haec ex Domini pietate meruerunt, levaverunt, et in locis quibus nunc sunt condita posuerunt.

It must surely be plain that this legend arose from a misunderstanding of the lines of St Damasus and that no account need be taken of it in considering the probable date, real or supposed, of the event commemorated ad Catacumbas on June 29.

Towards the close of the fourth century A.D. the remains of St Quirinus, bishop of Siscia, were brought to Rome when Pannonia was overrun by the barbarians, and buried in the immediate neighbourhood of the Apostolic memorial. The fuller version of the Martyrologium Hieronymianum has the entry: In Sabaria civitate Pannoniae Quirini:
Romae in cimiterio Catacumbas Via appia miliario III; while the Passio S. Sebastiani, a document of the fifth century, relates the legend that St Sebastian appeared in a dream to Lucina and said: perduces ad catacumbas et sepelies in initio cryptae iuxta vestigia apostolorum.

The basilica, which was destroyed when the present church was built, bore the name of ecclesia apostolorum as late as the Pontificate of Hadrian I (A.D. 772–795), as we see from the note in the Liber Pontificalis: ecclesiam apostolorum foris porta Appia mil. III in loco qui appellatur Catacumbas, ubi corpus beati Sebastiani martyris cum aliis quiescit, in ruinis praeventam noviter restauravit. The pilgrim’s guide, known as the Itinerarium Salisburgeo, which dates from the seventh century, gives the following direction:—

postea pervenies Via Appia ad sanctum Sebastianum martyrem, cuius corpus iacet in inferiore loco, et ibi sunt sepulcra apostolorum Petri et Pauli in quibus XL annorum requiescebant. Et in occidentali parte ecclesiae per gradus descendis ubi S. Cyrinus papa et martyr pausat.

In the ninth century the relics of St Sebastian were translated to St Peter’s by Gregory IV (A.D. 827–844) and only restored to the church in the thirteenth century, while the remains of St Quirinus were removed to S. Maria in Trastevere by Innocent II (A.D. 1130–1143). In the Dark Ages, however, a new-comer was established in the Church in the person of St Fabianus, whose altar, in the central aisle of the basilica, became the principal centre of devotion. From the descriptions written in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries it seems that this altar rested on two sarcophagi believed to contain relics of the saint, and that on either side were indicated the traditional sites of the temporary burial of the Apostles Peter and Paul, one of them being marked by a copy of the inscription of St Damasus. From the fourteenth century onwards, moreover, we have evidence of a new legend, according to which the bodies of the Apostles were hidden in a well (puteus) for 252 years: and the site of this ‘well’ was shewn to pilgrims in a roughly semicircular crypt approached by a staircase from the apse of the basilica.

1 The Passio St Quirini (Acta Sanctorum Bollandiana, Jan. 20, p. 383) states that the Pannonians buried St Quirinus in basilica apostolorum Petri et Pauli... aedificantes nominii eius dignam ecclesiam.

2 Cf. the note in the life of Leo III (A.D. 795–816) fecit et super sepulcrum beati Sebastiani martyris via Appia ad Catacumbas vestes maiiores III... et inibi super tumbas Apostolorum Petri et Pauli fecit vestes II.

3 St Fabianus (Pope A.D. 236–250) was buried in the papal crypt in the Catacomb of Callistus, where the inscription ΦΑΒΙΑΝΟϹ ΕΠΙΙ(ςκοροσ) Μ(αρτυρ) may be seen. The date of his festival (Jan. 29) is the same as that of St Sebastian. The subject is discussed by Grossi-Gondi S. Fabiano papa e martire, Rome 1916.
To this crypt has been given in modern times the name Platonia, derived from the variant for platoma found in MSS of the Liber Pontificalis in the Life of St Damasus quoted above.

It has been necessary to set out at some length the documentary history of the church in order to shew what were the problems presented to the excavators. The first attempt to determine the site of the Memoria Apostolorum was made when, in 1893, the so-called Platonia was excavated under the direction of Mgr de Waal. The results were remarkable. Beneath the altar, lighted by a fenestella, is a chamber about eight feet square with a barrel roof, the crown of which is nine feet high. It has the form of a bisomus or double tomb lined with marble slabs, and the walls and roof are decorated with paintings, six apostles being represented on either side below the springing of the vault. Only one of the lunettes has a fresco, which represents the traditio legis according to the usual scheme, except that the recipient of the roll is beardless. The crypt is surrounded by a series of niches, originally twelve in number, with decorations in stucco of good style. What was of greater importance, however, was the discovery of the remains of an inscription in large lettering, later than the time of St Damasus, and probably of the early fifth century, in honour of St Quirinus. The crypt, then, was decorated in his honour, and it is reasonable to suppose that he was buried there. If the tomb beneath the altar is really a bisomus, the second space may have been occupied by the remains of one of St Quirinus's companions in martyrdom: Duchesne has suggested the name of Policamus. It will be noted that the position of the crypt corresponds precisely with that assigned to the sepulchre of St Quirinus in the Itinerarium Salisburgense.

Hitherto the results of excavation, so far as the site of the Apostolic memorial was concerned, were negative. The next step was obviously to explore the area covered by the basilica itself; and this was done, partly by the Pontifical Commission of Sacred Archaeology, represented at first by Dr Paul Styger and afterwards by Prof. Orazio Marucchi, and partly by the Italian Government, in 1915 and the succeeding years.

It was found that beneath the marble pavement of the earlier basilica the whole available space was packed with tombs, of which about two hundred have been excavated. The earliest date from the fourth century, and a slab with the epitaph of a child named Panegyrius, dated A.D. 356 or 357, formed part of the pavement, which seems to shew (though the proof is not absolutely conclusive) that the basilica is earlier than that date and was, therefore, not built by St Damasus.

1 The text will be found in Ihm Damasi Epigrammata no. 76 a, where it is shewn that the composer imitated the style of St Damasus.
Evidently the privilege of burial within the church had been much sought after, and this is to be explained by the presence of the Apostolic memorial. The search for this was continued and the results were remarkable. In the first place it appeared that in the first century A.D. the site now occupied by the church consisted in a roughly semicircular depression bordered by a tufa cliff, along the edge of which ran a row of *columbaria* opening on to a side road which diverged from the Via Appia. In one of these was found the inscription *Callistus Vespasiani servus*, which dates the *columbaria* to the last quarter of the first century. To the South of the *columbaria* were the remains of a private villa of about A.D. 120. At the foot of the cliff, and therefore in the hollow which evidently gave its name to the site (*Catacumba = κατὰ κήμβας*) a series of tombs were excavated in the rock. The most important of these are indicated in Mancini's report by the letters X, Y, and Z. X, which dates from the beginning of the second century, was originally intended to be a *columbarium* for urn-burials, but apparently changed hands in the latter part of the century and was adapted for a burial-vault. The name of the last proprietor, M. Clodius Hermes, is inscribed over the entrance. Y seems to have passed through the same phases, but in its second period it was considerably enlarged, and in the third century it was the burial-place of a group of persons bearing the common designation of *Innocentii*. This is found in three inscriptions in the genitive plural, written in Greek characters *INNOKENTIΩPOM* and in each case it is preceded by the name of an Emperor or Emperors in the dative, *ΔΩΒΟΥC ΓΟΡΔΙΑΝΙC (= duobus Gordiani)*, *ΓΟΡΔΙΑΝΩ* (*Gordiano*), and *ΠΟΤΗΡΙΩ ΒΑΛΒΕΙΝΩ* (*= Pupienio* 1 *Balbino*). It is hard to believe (with Mancini) that these are the names of the persons buried in the vault, or to subscribe to his explanation of the *signum*. He writes 2 'Ben si addice, trattandosi di giovinetti, la denominazione *Innocentiorium*. Ritengo aver appartenuto i defunti ad un collegium, forse d'indole educativa, degli *Innocentiores o Innocentii* che aveva anche uno scopo funeraticio'. He also says (p. 69) 'nel titolo stesso de *Collegium Innocentiorum* vi ha qualche cosa di indefinitamente cristiano'; and Marucchi (op. cit. p. 96) writes 'quelle iscrizioni definite nello stesso sepolcro Y, che ricordano un collegio di *Innocentiores*, possono con molta probabilità riferirsi ad una associazione cristiana'. As a matter of fact, the *signum Innocentii* is found in an inscription from Mediolanum (Dessau 6730) which begins *Innocenti cum Encratio vivas, Innocentius and Encratius* being the

1 *Pupienus* is the form usually found, but *Pupienius* is written in inscriptions (e.g. Dessau 496), and the form *Pupienus* occurs not only in the 'Chronographer of 354' but on coins (see Pauly-Wissowa, iv 92).
signa of one Statorius Marsianus and his wife. It was usual for such groups to possess common burial-places, and we have an instance in the immediate neighbourhood of S. Sebastiano, where the Uranii had such a vault in the Catacomb. There is, however, better evidence for the religion of the persons buried in tomb Y than the name Innocentii, and it is afforded by the Christian graffito ΙΤΧΘΥC, where the Ι represents the Cross. Another inscription ΕΝΘΑ ΚΕΙΤΑΙ ΠΑΡΘΕΝΟC has also been thought to be Christian, but this is less certain. In any case, the burial-vault was not used exclusively by Christians, since the funeral tablet of a certain Elpisius Aug(usti) (servus) has a pagan formula. The third tomb (Z) contains no inscriptions. Its roof has a beautiful stucco decoration of the second century. There were, however, other tombs cut in the face of the cliff, the exploration of which is rendered difficult by the foundation-wall of the basilica which cuts through them; some of the inscriptions, however, shew them to be the burial-places of Christians—the names Theonoe and Irene and the epithets φιλοθεος, φιλοχιρα, θεοφιλεστάτη, may be mentioned. We see, then, that at any rate in the second quarter of the third century, Christians were being buried 'in the hollow'.

Some time afterwards (but still in the third century) the aspect of this region was completely changed. The depression was filled up with earth, the adjacent villa was pulled down, and on the levelled space in the rear of the columbaria were built an open court or atrium with a colonnade, and adjoining it a chamber of irregular shape partly roofed over, with a seat running round three of its sides and a fountain. The walls were decorated in fresco with a garden-scene, and upon them were scratched a number of inscriptions (some two hundred or more have been deciphered), both Latin and Greek, containing invocations of the Apostles and allusions to the rite of refrigerium. The invocations are of the usual type—Paule ed Petre petite pro Victore is a good example, which illustrates the fact that the name of Peter is by no means given general precedence over that of Paul. The graffiti which refer to refrigeria take such forms as Petro et Paulo Tomius refrigerium feci or At Paulo et Pet[ro] refrigeravi. The rite to which they allude has been discussed by Grossi-Gondi in Röm. Quartalschrift xxix (1915), pp. 221 sqq. He shews that this 'partaking of refreshment' took place as an act of charity especially at the tombs of martyrs with the object of securing their intercessions, and that it led to grave abuses.

1 An inscription from Thugga (Annee Epigraphique, 1908, no. 17) affords a good illustration, though the word refrigerium does not occur in it. It runs as follows: Sancti et beatissimi martyres petimus ut mente habeatis ut donentur vobis symposium Mammari Granius Elpidoforum qui haec cit. IIII ad c pm suis sumptibus et suis operibus perferunt. The letters c pm have been explained either as convivia pro martyribus or as corpora martyrum.
St Augustine (Ep. 22) speaks of *in coemeteriis ebrietates et luxuriosae convivia*, and asks (Contr. Faust. 20), *qui autem se in memorii martyrum inebriant, quomodo a nobis approbari possunt?* This was a case in which the Christian church permitted the faithful to continue the observance of practices firmly rooted in the pagan society of the time. Thus in an inscription of Palestrina (Dessau 8090) tells us of a memoria or funeral chapel built by one Aurelius Vitalis, a member of the group known as Syncratii, and ends with the words:— *et hoc peto aego Syncratius a bobis uniuersis sodalibus ut sene bile refrigeretis. Syncratorum.* Various names are given in inscriptions to the chambers annexed to burial-places where these refrigeria took place, but the commonest is that which appears in various forms such as *triclia* (Dessau 7926 (from Portus), 8063 c (from the Via Appia)), *trichlia* (Dessau 8118 (from Cherchell)), and *tricla* in the earliest example (Dessau 1732), in which a freedman of Claudius states that he dedicated to the memory of the Empress of Livia (in the columbarium of her slaves and freedmen) *triclam cum columnis et mensis et maceria.*

Dr. Styger, therefore, had good reason for assigning the name *triclia* to the chamber of the graffiti. These appear to belong to the latter part of the third century or the beginning of the fourth, and as they are not exceptionally crowded or superposed, they probably were scratched within no very long period of time. It is clear that they imply the existence, in the immediate neighbourhood, of a memoria of the Apostles, and one would be inclined to go further and to posit the actual presence of the bodies during the period to which the graffiti belong. It is, therefore, natural to connect the memoria with the date of A.D. 258 which, as we saw, was that of the event celebrated on June 29. The translation of the bodies from their original resting-places would then be a measure of precaution taken in view of the repressive edicts of Valerian, which brought the Christian community face to face with the possibility that the veneration of the Apostolic tropaea, as they were called, would be prohibited.

The important question remains, where was the actual site of the temporary resting-place of the Apostles' bodies. Adjoining the *triclia* on the N.E. is a chamber in which were found three sarcophagi, one of which had an inscription (probably of the eleventh century A.D.)

---

1 Many other references will be found in Grossi-Gondi's article. A poem of St Paulinus of Nola (xxvii de S. Felice) condemns the superstitions attaching to the practice; see especially vv. 566 ff.

2 *Trichilium* is also found (Orelli-Henzen 7372), and in the *Copa* of the Appendix Vergiliana we have *trichila* applied to one of the arbours similar to those which may be seen in the *osteria* outside the gates of modern Rome (the parallel has been drawn by Lanciani).
describing it as the tomb of St Fabianus, which of course was a mediaeval fiction. There is no means of knowing when the three sarcophagi were placed in this chamber, and it has been suggested that this was the actual memoria, the site of which had been forgotten in the Dark Ages. Mancini, however, points out (pp. 45, 78) that there exist in proximity to it the remains of a stairway leading from the triclia (and possibly contemporary with it) to a lower level, as well as those of a second flight of steps leading down from the floor of the basilica, which suggests that a species of confessio was erected on this spot. It is most desirable that further exploration should clear up this question finally, especially as the problem of the memoria has been complicated by the discovery of a staircase, probably at one time in communication with the atrium and triclia, which leads in a southerly direction to a subterranean gallery below the level of the tombs X, Y, and Z, and originally ended in a niche plastered with stucco, on which graffiti similar to those of the triclia were scratched; they seem, however, to belong to a rather later date. Thus the monogram $\mathbb{R}$ accompanies the inscription Petre et Paule in mentem habete Primum et Primam iugale(m) eius et Saturninam conjugem fili Primi et Victorinum patrem in semper in aeterno et ... It would seem as though access to this gallery remained open after the triclia had ceased to be in use, and we may explain this by the supposition that when the bodies of the Apostles had been removed to the basilicae built for them after the Peace of the Church, the refrigilia were discouraged, if not suppressed, with the result that they were, so to speak, driven underground. Marucchi, however, contends that the niche marks the actual site where the bodies of the Apostles were temporarily concealed. This hypothesis has been rejected—rightly, no doubt—by Duchesne.

If the bodies of the Apostles remained in their temporary resting-place until the Peace of the Church, we might reasonably expect that some record of their retranslation would survive; and although the Liber Pontificalis is silent—or rather, it speaks of a retranslation which took place in the papacy of Cornelius (A.D. 251–253)—the martyrologium Hieronymianum has the entry 'Romae translatio Pauli Apostoli' under Jan. 25, the date afterwards celebrated as that of the Apostle's conversion, which gave a new character to the festival.

There seems, therefore, to be no valid objection to the interpretation of the documentary and archaeological evidence given above. The explanation of St Damasus's poem by reference to a supposed residence of the Apostles in the house of a Christian ad Catacumbas has nothing

---

1 The niche was afterwards (we do not know when) broken through, and the gallery tunnelled as far as a deep well, sunk from a spot not far from the 'Platonia'.

to commend it unless it be the discovery in 1912 of the inscription Domvs Petri (probably of the fifth century at earliest) in an apsidal chamber near the 'Platonia': but it has been pointed out that this may be paralleled by the expression domus martyrjs Hippolyti in a sixth-century inscription from the crypt of St Hippolytus.1 Both Dr La Piana (Harvard Theological Review, 1921, p. 53) and Mgr Barnes (The Platonia, a lost Apostolic Sanctuary, 1924, p. 19) suggest that St Peter may have taken refuge in a private villa on the spot: but St Damasus's lines clearly indicate the presence of both Apostles, whether in life or death; and prius would (as Duchesne remarks) be very inappropriately used of so brief a residence in life as compared with their existing place of permanent burial.2

Mgr Barnes would explain the 'Platonia' as the memoria beati Petri set up by St Anacletus, according to the notice of the Liber Pontificalis, ubi episcopi reconderentur, ubi tamen et ipse sepultus est: the words which follow, iuxta corpus beati Petri, are, it is true, absent in the earlier recensions of the notice, but we can hardly believe that they do not represent the tradition. On Mgr Barnes's theory the beardless figure of the fresco in the lunette would of course be St Anacletus. There is, however, no trace of any tradition connecting St Anacletus with this site at the period to which the decoration of the 'Platonia' belongs; St Damasus would not, we may be sure, have failed to raise a suitable memorial to the Saint, of which we should certainly have heard.

H. Stuart Jones.

BIBLE TRANSLATION—OFFICIAL AND UNOFFICIAL.

A STUDY OF PSALM IV IN ENGLISH.

An official translation of the Bible suffers from the conditions of its making. It is the work of many minds; it is (and must be) the result of a compromise or rather of many separate compromises. It must show the scars of a struggle between a 'Liberal' and a 'Conservative' tendency in scholarship. It must sometimes evade points of difficulty which an unofficial translator would grasp; sometimes again, it must be colourless, though the original appears singularly vivid to the solitary scholar.

1 Ihm Damasi Epigrammata no. 82.
2 No connexion can be proved between the 'Platonia' and the second-century villa mentioned above (p. 35), though there is little difference of level, and the structures there found might have been raised on the court-yard of such a house.