

NOTES AND STUDIES

A NEW TEXT OF THE APOCALYPSE OF PETER. II.

§ 1. *The Text continued.*

THE continuation of the Ethiopic tract on the Second Coming, in which a large portion of the text of the Apocalypse of Peter is incorporated, has been published by M. Sylvain Grébaud in the last number of the *Revue de l'Orient Chrétien*. The present instalment contains, as will be speedily seen, only a small portion of the *Apocalypse*. The greater part of what is now published is due to the compiler of the tract, and is a comparatively late composition. In the following pages I transcribe M. Grébaud's French version, and the corresponding portions of the Akhmim Greek text. I subjoin an analysis of the remainder of the Ethiopic tract. In dealing with the end of it I have again had the advantage of seeing M. Grébaud's as yet unpublished version, which he has, with great courtesy and kindness, lent to me.

Mon Seigneur Jésus-Christ notre roi me dit : 'Allons à la montagne sainte.' Ses disciples vinrent avec lui, en priant.

Voici qu'il y avait deux hommes (sur la montagne).

Nous ne pûmes pas regarder le visage d'aucun d'eux, car il en provenait une lumière qui brillait plus que le soleil. Leurs vêtements étaient lumineux. Il est impossible d'exposer cela. Rien ne peut être comparé à cela dans le monde. La bouche n'ayant pas assez de douceur ne peut pas exposer la

Καὶ προσθεῖς ὁ Κύριος ἔφη· Ἄγωμεν εἰς τὸ ὄρος (καὶ) εἰζώμεθα· ἀπερχόμενοι δὲ μετ' αὐτοῦ ἡμεῖς οἱ δώδεκα μαθηταὶ εἰδείθημεν ὅπως δείξῃ ἡμῖν ἕνα τῶν ἀδελφῶν ἡμῶν (τῶν) δικαίων τῶν ἐξεληθόντων ἀπὸ τοῦ κόσμου, ἵνα ἴδωμεν ποταποὶ εἰσι τὴν μορφήν, καὶ θαρσύναντες παραθαρσύνωμεν καὶ τοὺς ἀκούοντας ἡμῶν ἀνθρώπους. καὶ εὐχομένων ἡμῶν ἀ(φνω φαίν)ονται δύο ἄνδρες ἐστῶτες ἔμπροσθεν τοῦ Κυρίου πρὸς (οὓς) οὐκ ἐδυνήθημεν ἀντιβλέψαι· ἐξήρχετο γὰρ ἀπὸ τῆς ὄψεως αὐτῶν ἀκτῖς ὡς ἡλίου, καὶ φωτινὸν ἦν αὐ(τῶν ὄλον τὸ) εἶδμα, ὁποῖον οὐδέποτε ὀφθαλμὸς ἀνθρώπου εἶδεν, οὐδὲ) στόμα δύναται ἐξηγήσασθαι ἢ καρ(διά ἐκφράσα)ι τὴν δόξαν ἣν ἐνεδέδυντο καὶ τὸ κάλ(λος τῆς προσό)ψεως αὐτῶν· οὓς ἰδόντες ἐθαμβώθημεν.

beauté de leurs formes. En effet, leur aspect était merveilleux, prodigieux, et je dirai plus grand encore. Dans leur aspect ils brillaient plus que le cristal. Le type de la couleur de leur aspect et de leur corps était la fleur de rose.

τὰ μὲν γὰρ σώματα αὐτῶν ἦν λευκότερα πάσης χιόνος,
καὶ ἐρυθρότερα παντὸς ῥόδου.

Leur tête était une merveille. A leur front se trouvait une couronne. Sur leurs épaules tombaient des tresses (parfumées) de nard et (ornées) de belles fleurs. (*The Ethiopic text is here confused, according to M. Grébaut.*) Leur chevelure était comme l'arc-en-ciel (plongeant) dans l'eau. Telle était la grâce de leur visage. Ils étaient ornés de toutes sortes d'ornements. Lorsque nous les vîmes soudain, nous nous étonnâmes.

Je m'approchai du Seigneur Jésus-Christ et lui dis : 'Mon Seigneur, qui sont-ils ? . . . Le Seigneur me dit : 'Ce sont Moïse, Élie [*Eth. has : 'Moses and Elias. And I said to Him : "Abraham and Isaac,"' &c. Evidently we must supply 'And where are Abraham', &c.]*, Abraham, Isaac, Jacob, et aussi les autres Pères justes.'

συνεκέκρατο δὲ τὸ ἐρυθρὸν αὐτῶν τῷ λευκῷ, καὶ ἀπλῶς οὐ δύναμαι ἐξηγήσασθαι τὸ κάλλος αὐτῶν· ἡ τε γὰρ κόμη αὐτῶν οὐλη ἦν καὶ ἀνθηρὰ καὶ ἐπιπρέπουσα αὐτῶν τῷ τε προσώπῳ καὶ τοῖς ὄμοις ὡσπερὶ στέφανος ἐκ ναρδοστάχυος (*στ νάρδου στάχυος*) πεπλεγμένος καὶ ποικίλων ἀνθῶν, ἡ ὡσπερ ἶρις ἐν ἀέρι, τοιαύτη ἦν αὐτῶν ἡ εὐπρέπεια.

Ἰδόντες οὖν αὐτῶν τὸ κάλλος, ἔκθαμβοι γεγόναμεν πρὸς αὐτούς, ἐπειδὴ ἄφνω ἐφάνησαν·

καὶ προσελθὼν τῷ Κυρίῳ εἶπον· τίνας εἰσὶν οὗτοι;

λέγει μοι· Οὗτοί εἰσιν οἱ ἀδελφοὶ ὑμῶν οἱ δίκαιοι ὧν ἠθελήσατε τὰς μορφὰς ἰδεῖν.

κἀγὼ ἔφην αὐτῷ· Καὶ ποῦ εἰσι πάντες οἱ δίκαιοι, ἡ ποῖός ἐστιν ὁ αἰὼν ἐν ᾧ εἰσι ταύτην ἔχοντες τὴν δόξαν;

καὶ ὁ Κύριος ἔδειξέ μοι μέγιστον χῶρον ἐκτὸς τούτου τοῦ κόσμου ὑπερλαμπρον τῷ φωτί, καὶ τὸν ἀέρα τὸν ἐκεῖ ἀκτίσιν ἡλίου καταλαμπόμενον,

Il nous fit voir le paradis grand ouvert.

Il y avait un arbre fertile. (Ses) fruits de bénédiction étaient remplis d'odeurs de parfums et étaient remplis de bonnes odeurs. Leur odeur venait vers (le paradis ; *more probably* vers nous). A (cet arbre) je vis beaucoup de fruits.

Mon Seigneur et mon Dieu Jésus-Christ me dit : 'As-tu vu la foule des Pères ? Tel est leur repos.'

Je me réjouis, je crus et j'eus confiance.

Tel est l'honneur et la gloire de ceux qui ont suivi ma justice. Je compris ces (paroles) qui sont écrites dans l'Écriture, (paroles) de mon Seigneur Jésus-Christ. Je lui dis : 'Mon Seigneur, veux-tu que je fasse ici trois tentes, une pour toi, une pour Moïse, une pour Élie ? Il me dit en colère : 'Satan te fera la guerre. Il voilera ton intelligence. Les biens de ce monde te vaincra. Que tes yeux soient donc ouverts, et que tes oreilles soient ouvertes. (Il n'y a qu')une seule tente, que n'a pas fabriquée la main des hommes, mais qu'a fabriquée mon Père céleste, pour (mes) élus et pour moi.' Nous (la) vîmes en nous réjouissant. Voici que soudain vint du ciel une voix qui disait : 'Celui-ci est mon Fils que j'aime et en qui je me plais. (Il garde) mes ordres.' Survint une grande nuée, qui s'étendit sur nos têtes. Elle était très blanche. Elle enleva Notre-Seigneur, Moïse, et Élie. Quant à moi, je tremblai et je fus effrayé. Nous regardâmes. Le ciel lui-même était ouvert. Nous vîmes des hommes qui étaient en chair. Ils vinrent et allèrent dans un autre ciel. La parole de l'Écriture fut accomplie : *Cette génération cherchera* (le Seigneur), *cherchera la face du dieu de Jacob.* Survinrent une grande crainte et une grande frayeur au ciel. Les anges se pressaient entre eux afin que fût accomplie la parole de l'Écriture qui dit : *Ouvrez vos portes, ô princes.* Alors se ferma le ciel qui s'était ouvert.

Nous priâmes et descendîmes de la montagne, en glorifiant le

καὶ τὴν γῆν αὐτὴν ἀνθοῦσαν ἀμαράντοις ἄνθεσι, καὶ ἄρωμάτων πλήρη καὶ φυτῶν εὐανθῶν καὶ ἀφθάρτων καὶ καρπὸν εὐλογημένον φερόντων. τοσοῦτον δὲ ἦν τὸ ἄνθος ὡς (ὁσμὴν *add.* Usener) καὶ ἐφ' ἡμᾶς ἐκείθεν φέρεσθαι.

Οἱ δὲ οἰκήτορες τοῦ τόπου ἐκείνου ἐνδεδυμένοι ἦσαν ἔνδυμα ἀγγέλων φωτῶν, καὶ ὅμοιον ἦν τὸ ἔνδυμα αὐτῶν τῇ χόρᾳ αὐτῶν· ἄγγελοι δὲ περιμέτρεχον αὐτοὺς ἐκείσε· ἴση δὲ ἦν ἡ δόξα τῶν ἐκεῖ οἰκητόρων, καὶ μιᾷ φωνῇ τὸν Κύριον θεὸν ἀνευφήμουν, εὐφραυνόμενοι ἐν ἐκείνῳ τῷ τόπῳ.

λέγει ἡμῖν ὁ Κύριος· Οὗτός ἐστιν ὁ τόπος τῶν ἄρχερων ὑμῶν τῶν δικαίων ἀνθρώπων.

Seigneur de ce qu'il avait écrit les noms des justes sur le livre de vie, qui est au cieux.

At this point there is a distinct break. The text continues in the words of Clement (who, it must be remembered, is the supposed recorder of the whole *corpus* of revelations):—

'Peter opened his mouth and said to me: Hearken, my son Clement. God created all things for His glory,' &c. This theme is dwelt upon at some length. There are promises, put into the mouth of the Father, to those who celebrate the glory of God. In the description of their future happiness, and in a description of the angels, which follows upon this, traits are drawn from the description of the blessed in *A. P.* Thus: '(The Son) will at His coming raise the dead at the sound of His word, and will make my righteous ones shine seven times more than the sun, and will make their crowns shine like the crystal, and like the rainbow in the time of rain: (crowns) which are perfumed with nard, and cannot be contemplated: (which are adorned) with rubies, with the colour of emerald, shining brightly, with topazes, gems, and yellow pearls that shine like the stars in heaven, and like the rays of the sun, sparkling, which cannot be gazed upon.' Then, of the angels: 'The faces of His angels shine more than the sun; their crowns are as the rainbow in the time of rain. (They are perfumed) with nard. Their eyes shine like the morning star. The beauty of their appearance cannot be expressed. The music of their songs is as the sound of an instrument. Their hymns are sweet, their speech is pleasant to hear, and, above all, their joy has no end. Their raiment is not woven, but is white as that of the fuller, according as I saw on the mountain where Moses and Elias were.' He continues: 'Our Lord shewed at the transfiguration to Peter, James and John, sons of Zebedee, the raiment of the last day after the resurrection and the day (of judgement).' He then speaks of the cloud and the Voice from heaven, and ends 'we knew not what we said, because of the greatness of that day, and of the mountain where He shewed us the second coming of Christ in the kingdom that has no end'. A new start is then made: 'The Father has committed all judgement to Christ (John v 22 is quoted).' A list of sins and virtues is given; and we now find that Peter is the speaker 'Forget me not in regard to the sinners, when thou hast pity upon them at the last day'. This begins an appeal on behalf of sinners addressed by Peter to Christ. He weeps for many hours, and finally receives an answer, with strict injunctions not to reveal it, lest men should go on in their sins. The answer is very diffuse and obscure, but it seems distinctly to promise at one point universal salvation. This occurs in the portion as yet unpublished. 'My Father will give to them all the life, the glory, and the kingdom which shall have no end.' It seems also that this is done for the sake

of the righteous. 'It is because of those who have believed in me that I am come. It is also because of those who have believed in me that, at their word, I shall have pity (on men).' After a discourse of some length uttered by our Lord, Peter speaks again in his own person, and enjoins Clement to hide this revelation in a box that foolish men may not see it. Then follow orders as to the observance of the greater feasts, a last injunction as to secrecy, and the conclusion.

That the portion of the Ethiopic tract following the descent from the mountain is almost wholly of quite late date does not admit of doubt. But we see that it borrows a few traits from the *A. P.*; and the question will be worth considering at a later time whether the central topic—the final salvation of sinners—which the Ethiopic writer wraps up in such a mist of words, and as to which he shews so much hesitation, was not also in some form derived from the same source. That question I cannot undertake to discuss now. It is more immediately necessary to examine the relation of the Ethiopic text (*Eth.*) to our Greek fragment (*Akh.*) in the portion in which they are obviously connected.

There are two omissions of some length in *Eth.* The first extends from the word ἐδεήθημεν to εὐχομένων ἡμῶν. *Eth.* has for these lines only 'en priant'. It is a question whether this omission is not due to *homoeoteleuton* in Ethiopic. The two Greek words being of similar meaning may have been rendered in the Ethiopic (or its parent version) by the same word.

No such explanation is possible in the case of the other long omission,—that in the description of Paradise and its inhabitants. *Eth.* here gives us a much shorter text, which contains two striking phrases of *Akh.*, but introduces a new feature in the shape of a tree. Possibly the text is corrupt: possibly the Tree of Life may be meant. *Eth.* also omits all mention of the inhabitants of Paradise.

An important difference between *Eth.* and *Akh.* is in the passage about the two glorified beings. In the description of their aspect almost every phrase of the Greek text can be traced in *Eth.*, though the latter is confused and corrupt. But when Peter asks who the two saints are, the answer in *Akh.* is that they are 'your righteous brethren, whose forms ye desired to see', in *Eth.*, that they are 'Moses and Elias'.

A reference to *Eth.* shews traces of a question corresponding to that in *Akh.*: 'And where are all the righteous?' &c. We thus have a text (in which the narrative of the Transfiguration is utilized) consistent with itself, but differing widely from *Akh.* Be it noted that the latter is difficult of interpretation. The Apostles have asked to be shewn 'one of their righteous brethren who have departed out of the world'. Now, though in the time of the real author of the *A. P.* there were many Christians who had departed this life, we must credit him with having

made some attempt at putting himself into the position, and throwing himself back into the time, of the Apostles: and in their days—more especially before the Ascension—there were no departed Christians to appear, and Old Testament saints are the most obvious persons to play the required part. Such are the worthies whom Paul meets in Paradise: such also the 'elect and righteous who dwell in the garden' according to Enoch.

There may be some other elements of the original conclusion of the *A. P.* in the text; in particular, the clause about the descent from the mountain is such as would have proved a very fitting end to the book. I do not forget that 2 Peter, which shews points of contact with *Akh.*, mentions the Voice from Heaven, and the holy mountain: but I am not at present in a position to put forward a theory of the incorporation by the *A. P.* of the narrative of the Transfiguration.

§ 2. *The Bodleian fragment.*

In the additional notes to my last article I said something of this fragment. A fuller account of it is clearly desirable.

I will remind my readers that it is a vellum fragment measuring three-and-a-quarter inches in height by two in breadth: complete at top and bottom, containing thirteen lines of from eight to ten letters apiece on each side. In other words it is the greater part of a leaf of a very small book. It is in well-formed uncials assigned to the fifth century. It was acquired from Egypt in 1894 or 5: its class-mark is 'MS. Gr. Theol. f. 4 (P)', and it is No. 31810 in Madan's *Summary Catalogue*.

I owe my first knowledge of it to a photograph kindly sent to me by the Librarian soon after its acquisition by the Bodleian. Upon the discovery of the Ethiopic text I obtained the kind help of Dr Cowley and Mr E. O. Winstedt, the latter of whom has furnished me with most careful transcripts of all that could be read on the vellum. More recently Professor J. Vernon Bartlet has very generously sent me his own reading of the fragment. I have also procured another photograph of the very difficult *verso* of the leaf.

The result attained is that we have a short piece of a text of the *A. P.*, which may be said to correspond to the end of the Akhmim fragment. The *recto*, which I printed in my Additional Note II (*J. T. S.* xii p. 157) is fairly legible.

(γυ)ναικες κ(ρα)το)ντες αλυ(σ)εις και μα(σ)τ)ιγοντε(ς) | (ε)αυτους ε(μ)|
(πρ)οσθεν τ(ου) | (τ)ων ειδω(λων) | (τ)ων πλαν(ων) | και αναγα(π)αυστως (ε)|
ξουσιν τη(ν) | κολασιν (three dots, indicating a stop) | και εγγυς .¹

The passage corresponding to this in the Akhmim text is:—

¹ Some such words as *και πλησιον αυτων ησαν (ισονται) άλλοι άνδρες και* must be supplied at the beginning. Prof. Bartlet reads *κροτούντες άλύσεις*: I suggest *κρατούντες* (= holding) as an amendment of this. He also reads *ειδώνων τῆ πλάνη*.

καὶ παρὰ τῷ κρημνῷ ἐκείνῳ τόπος ἦν πυρὸς πλείστου γέμων κάκει εἰστήκεισαν ἄνδρες οἵτινες ταῖς ἰδίαις χερσὶ ξόανα ἑαυτοῖς ἐποίησαν ἀντὶ θεοῦ. καὶ παρ' ἐκείνους ἄνδρες ἕτεροι καὶ γυναῖκες ῥάβδους πυρὸς ἔχοντες καὶ ἀλλήλους τύπτοντες καὶ μηδέποτε παύομενοι τῆς τοιαύτης κολάσεως.

Eth. has: Near these will be a furnace (?). Beneath them the angel Ezrael will prepare a great flare of fire. There will be all the idols of gold and silver, all the idols, the works of the hands of the sons of men, and the images which are like them (i. e. images in human form): images of cats and lions, of creeping things, and of beasts. As for the men and women who have made these images, they will be loaded with fiery chains, and will be chastised because of their error in the presence of these idols. Such will be their punishment for ever.

Akhmim seems to be clearly a faulty text here. If we cut out the words καὶ παρ' ἐκείνους ἄνδρες ἕτεροι καὶ γυναῖκες we get a more coherent account: a single class of sinners whose sin and punishment are both specified; whereas the present text mentions two classes, says nothing distinctive about the punishment of the first, and nothing at all about the sin of the second.

It has this much of resemblance to *Bodl.* that the sinners are ἀλλήλους τύπτοντες (*Bodl.* μαστιγοῦντες ἑαυτοῦς), and that the ceaselessness of the punishment is specially mentioned.

Eth. and *Bodl.* have in common the mention of chains, and the chastisement in the presence of the idols. Very probably the words rendered 'because of their error' may represent the adjective πλάνων applied to the idols in *Bodl.*

The *verso* of *Bodl.* is in its upper part very faint. The last reading of it which I have from Mr Winstedt, who has been untiring in the pains he has kindly spent over it, is this

Τ]ΩΝΕ . . . [
Ε]ÇΟΝΤΑΙΑ[Ν	
Δ]ΡΕÇΚΑΙΓ[Υ	
Ν]ΑΙΚΕΚ[
. .]Ε . . ΟΤΗ[5
] . . ÇΕ!ΤΩ[
] . ΔΩΚΕΜ[
]ΩΝΟΥΤΟ[Ι	
Δ]ΕΕΙCΙΝΟ[Ι	
ΤΙ]ΝΕCΚΑ	10
ΤΕ]ΑΙΠΟΝΟ	
ΔΟ]ΝΤΟΥΘΥΟ	
ΛΩ]ÇΚΑΙΠΡΟΕ	

The first lines (taken with the last line of the *recto*) seem then to have been

καὶ ἐγγὺς αὐτῶν ἕτεροι ἔσονται ἄνδρες καὶ γυναῖκες.

In the next lines Prof. Bartlet reads *καίόμενοι τῇ καύσει τῶν εἰδωλομανῶν*: the last word was suggested to him by Bodley's Librarian; it occurs in *Athenagoras* 29. This reading seems to me admirable. Lines 8-13 read

οὗτοι δὲ εἰσιν οἵτινες κατέλιπον ὁδὸν τοῦ θεοῦ ὅλως (?) [κατέλ. τὴν τοῦ θεοῦ ὁδὸν Bartlet] καὶ πρὸς . . .

The portion of *Akhmim* corresponding to this is

καὶ ἕτεροι πάλιν ἐγγὺς ἐκείνων γυναῖκες καὶ ἄνδρες φλεγόμενοι καὶ στρεφόμενοι καὶ τηγανιζόμενοι, οὗτοι δὲ ἦσαν οἱ ἀφέντες τὴν ὁδὸν τοῦ θεοῦ.

Eth. Near them will be other men and women. They will burn in the flames of torment. Their punishment will be for ever. Here are they who have forsaken the commandments of the Lord and followed the suggestions of devils.

Here again *Bodl.* seems nearer to *Eth.* than to *Akhmim*. There is not room enough in *Bodl.* for the three long participles of *Akhmim* φλεγόμενοι καὶ στρεφόμενοι καὶ τηγανιζόμενοι. Note that it has the future tense ἔσονται, and a present εἰσίν, both in agreement with *Eth.*

§ 3. *The quotations from Apoc. Peter in Clement of Alexandria and Methodius.*

These passages demand a fresh discussion in the light of the new Ethiopic text. Unnecessary doubt has been thrown on the Clementine passages in regard of the number and extent of the quotations from *A. P.* The passages in question are all in the collection of excerpts known as *Eclogae ex prophetis scripturis*. This collection is preserved in but one ancient manuscript. In this the excerpts are not divided, nor, of course, numbered. It is important to remember this, and to realize that the division and numbering of the excerpts in the printed editions is the work of comparatively modern scholars. That which appears in the Berlin edition of 1909 by Dr Otto Stählin differs widely from previous arrangements, and for our present purpose is perfectly satisfactory.

Leaving out of sight for the present the probable allusion to *A. P.* in *Ecl.* 38, 39, let us take the overt quotations. I use Stählin's text.

(1) *Ecl.* 41. 1. Ἡ γραφή φησι τὰ βρέφη τὰ ἐκτεθέντα τημελοῦχψ παραδίδοσθαι ἀγγέλῳ, ὑφ' οὗ παιδεύεσθαι τε καὶ αὔξειν. 'καὶ ἔσονται' φησὶν 'ὡς οἱ ἑκατὸν ἐτῶν ἐνταῦθα πιστοί.'

2 Δὼ καὶ Πέτρος ἐν τῇ Ἀποκαλύψει φησι. 'καὶ ἀστραπή πυρὸς πηδῶσα ἀπὸ τῶν βρεφῶν ἐκείνων καὶ πλήσσοσα τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς τῶν γυναικῶν.' 3 ἐπεὶ ὁ δίκαιος 'ὡς σπινθὴρ διὰ καλάμης ἐκλάμπει καὶ κρίνει ἔθνη.' (*Wisd.* iii. 7.)

Zahn and others have referred § 1 to another Apocalypse, unnamed, because in § 2 the *A. P.* is named definitely. But nothing surely can

be clearer than that § 2 is a separate excerpt ; by no possibility can Διώ be connected with § 1. The excerptor has simply copied all the references to the *A. P.* which he noticed. I suggested this in 1892. Surely, again when we find the words τὰ βρέφη . . . τημελοῦχῳ παραδίδοσθαι ἀγγέλῳ repeated as a definite quotation from the *A. P.* in *Ecl.* 48 we shall be going very far out of the plain track if we seek to attribute them to another source in *Ecl.* 41. The word τημελοῦχος, it may be useful to remind my readers, is found nowhere in Greek literature save in these two *Eclogae* of Clement and in the passage of Methodius which deals with the same subject. The Ethiopic version of the *A. P.* gives it under the form Temlâkos as a proper name ; and in the later Greek Apocalypses of Paul and John we find it again, misunderstood, corrupted, and made into a proper name, Τεμελοῦχος or Τεμελούχ. Not only so, but it becomes the name of a tormenting angel. The passages are : *Paul* 16 παραδοθήτω ἡ ψυχὴ αὐτῆ ἀνίλεψ ἀγγέλῳ Τεμελοῦχῳ. 34 καὶ ἔλθων ὁ ἄγγελος ὁ Τεμελοῦχος κατέειχεν ἐν τῇ χειρὶ αὐτοῦ σίδηρον : *John*, Tischendorf, p. 94, καὶ φωνήσει ὁ τεμελοῦχ (is paullo ante thurwors constitutus est) τὸν ταρούκ, and later on : καὶ λέγει ὁ τεμελοῦχ τῷ ταρούκ· ἔγειρε τὸν ὄφιν κτλ . . . καὶ συνάξει ὁ τεμελοῦχ τὸ πλῆθος τῶν ἁμαρτωλῶν.

In the Latin version of *Paul* the word Tartaruchus is substituted for Temeluchus ; thus ' 16 Tradatur ergo angelo Tartaruchus qui prepositus est penis. 34 uidi . . . hominem subfocari ab angelos tartaricos abentes in manibus suis ferrum '.

This word Ταρταρούχος, again, demands some attention. It is not given in the *Thesaurus* of Stephanus at all ; but it does occur in Greek, though with extreme rarity. In Hippolytus *Ref. Haer.* x 34 we have (ἐκφεύξεσθε) ταρταρούχων ἀγγέλων κολαστῶν ὄμμα αἰεὶ μένον ἐν ἀπειλῇ ; in *Paul* 18 παραδοθήτω ἡ ψυχὴ αὐτῆ Ταρταρούχῳ ἀγγέλῳ (apparently a proper name ; the Latin has ' Anima ista in manibus Tartari tradatur '). In *John* we have seen it in the corrupt form ταρούκ. It occurs also in Latin in a fragment printed by De Bruyne as probably Priscillianist (*Revue Bénédictine*, 1907, p. 323) ' tradatur hunc ad angelum tartaruchus ', and once a few lines before. The Ethiopic of *A. P.* gives it as a proper name Tâtirokos.

I must add that *Paul* 40 speaking of the destiny of murdered infants, and approaching very near the *A. P.* as quoted by Clement, says (Gr.) καὶ ἐδόθησαν αὐτὰ ἀγγέλῳ ἀπενεχθῆναι αὐτὰ εἰς εὐρύχωρον τόπον, (Lat.) ' Infantes autem illi traditi sunt angelis tartari qui erant super penas ut ducerent¹ eos in locum spaciosum misericordiae ', where one cannot but suspect that our Greek text is guilty of an omission.

¹ The unique MS of the Latin text reads *doceret* which happens to correspond with Clement's παιδεύεσθαι. But it is safer to take it (as I have done) as a corruption of *ducerent* = ἀπενεχθῆναι of Gr.

The evidence I have set out leads me to the conclusion that these two very rare adjectives, *τημελοῦχος* and *ταρταροῦχος*, *δοθή* occurred in the source of *Eth.* and of *Paul*; and that this source was the *A. P.* is demonstrated in the case of *τημελοῦχος*, and almost absolutely certain in the case of *ταρταροῦχος*.

καὶ ἔσονται, φησὶν, ὡς οἱ ἑκατὸν ἐτῶν ἐνταῦθα πιστοί.

This must be another quotation from the *γραφὴ* mentioned in the first clause, and was very likely continuous with it. It is alluded to again in *Ecl.* 48, where Clement speaks of the children attaining to *γνώσις* and experiencing what they would have experienced had they remained in the body. *Ecl.* 48, in fact, contains Clement's interpretation of the words (ὕψ' οὐ παιδεύεσθαι καὶ αὔξειν) καὶ ἔσονται κτλ. The children will become equal in experience to the believers who survive to a patriarchal age on earth. The Ethiopic has no equivalent to this clause.

I can point to but one passage which shews a coincidence of language such as may have suggested the idea, viz. Isa. lxx 20 οὐδ' οὐ μὴ γένηται ἔτι ἐκεῖ ἄωρος καὶ πρεσβύτης ὃς οὐκ ἐμπλήσει τὸν χρόνον αὐτοῦ· ἔσται γὰρ ὁ νέος ἑκατὸν ἐτῶν, ὃ δὲ ἀποθνήσκων ἁμαρτωλὸς ἑκατὸν ἐτῶν, καὶ ἐπικατάρατος ἔσται. The word *ἄωρος* occurs in the Akhmim text in connexion with our subject (20 Preuschen); in *Wisdom*, as we shall see, the thought of honourable age independent of grey hairs is expressed more than once.

The consideration of the future tense *ἔσονται* must be noted, but discussion of it is reserved.

καὶ ἀστραπὴ πυρὸς πηδῶσα ἀπὸ τῶν βρεφῶν ἐκείνων καὶ πλήσσοσα τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς τῶν γυναικῶν.

The parallel passage in the Akhmim text, hardly coinciding with this at all in vocabulary, is: καὶ προήρχοντο ἐξ αὐτῶν ἀκτίνας (or φλόγες: the letters -es only remain in the MS) πυρός, καὶ τὰς γυναῖκας ἐπλησσον κατὰ τῶν ὀφθαλμῶν. The antecedent to αὐτῶν is παῖδες, not βρέφη.

The Ethiopic has: 'a flash shall come from the children. There will be a dazzling in the eyes of the women who by fornication have brought about their corruption.' The last clause may correspond to a separate sentence in the original, such as αὐταὶ εἰσιν αἱ πορνεύσασαι καὶ τὰ βρέφη φθείρασαι: but on the other hand a similar sentence has already occurred ('ce sont celles qui ont fait avorter leurs enfants et ont corrompu l'œuvre du Seigneur qui les avait formés').

The tense—an important matter—is left undetermined in Clement's quotation. The verb may equally well have been past or future.

As to the language, there is a curious reminder of it in *Wisdom* xi 18 ἢ δεινὸς ἀπ' ὀμμάτων σπινθήρας ἀστράπτοντας: one of a good many resemblances, which will be presented all together at a later period.

(2) *Ecl.* 48. 1 Ἡ θεία πρόνοια (ο)ὐ (κ)αταστρέφει ἐπὶ μόνους τοὺς ἐν σαρκί. αὐτίκα ὁ Πέτρος ἐν τῇ Ἀποκαλύψει φησὶν 'τὰ βρέφη ἑξαμβλωθέντα

τῆς ἀμείνονος ἐσόμενα μοίρας, ταῦτα ἀγγέλῳ τημελούχῳ παραδίδοσθαι, ἵνα γνώσεως μεταλάβοντα τῆς ἀμείνονος τύχῃ μονῆς, παθόντα ἃ ἂν ἔπαθεν καὶ ἐν σώματι γεγόμενα'. τὰ δ' ἕτερα μονῆς τῆς σωτηρίας τεύξεται, ὡς ἡδικημένα ἐλεγήθοντα, καὶ μενεῖ ἄνευ κολάσεως, τοῦτο γέρας λαβόντα.

The inverted commas are Stählin's, and shew his view of the extent of the quotation. Zahn would stop at μοίρας (or πείρας, the reading of the MS) and Harnack at μονῆς. My view is that little if anything beyond the words τὰ βρέφη and ταῦτα ἀγγ. τημ. παραδίδοσθαι can be looked upon as quoted, and that the rest is Clement's interpretation or paraphrase. I see no reason for inserting any mark of distinction after γεγόμενα.

As to the text, Stählin is the first editor who has rightly read the opening sentence ('Ἡ θεία . . . σαρκί) and has connected it with this excerpt instead of the preceding one. He also suggests and, I think, again rightly, that τὰ should be supplied after ἐξαμβλωθέντα.

Now as to the meaning of the excerpt. Two classes of children are distinguished in it. What are they? Not, as has been thought, τὰ ἐξαμβλωθέντα and τὰ ἐκτεθέντα, but (τὰ) τῆς ἀμείνονος ἐσόμενα μοίρας and τὰ ἕτερα: that is, the children who are destined to be of the better part (i.e. to be saved) and the children who are not so destined; in other words, those who, if they had attained maturity on earth, would have been saved, and those who, in the like case, would not. The first class are permitted to attain γνώσις, and to go through such probation as they would have experienced on earth; to the second, in consideration of the injury they have suffered at the hands of their parents, punishment is remitted, but no positive advantages are given. This interpretation (which I have not seen set forth before, though I think it must have been present to Dr Stählin's mind) seems to me to be required by the presence of ἐσόμενα, which qualifies the class of children described. The words have been thought to mean simply that the children in question 'will belong to the better part', but this would require ἔσεσθαι. Possibly we ought to read ἐσόμενα ἄν: I do not think this essential to the interpretation I have given.

How much of this speculation did Clement derive from the text of *A. P.*? I think very little, and for this reason, that what we have of the text of *A. P.* is altogether on a lower plane of thought. It is materialistic in its imagery. It describes the destiny of these very children in a concrete way, 'they will be like the faithful here who have attained the age of a hundred years', and I do not suppose that it said much more about them. The distinction drawn between the two classes seems to me too subtle to be attributed to the *A. P.*

The Ethiopic text, however, shews us the grounds upon which Clement built his distinction; for, though it does not mention two

different kinds of children, it does contain mention of two sets or groups of children, and says something about the destiny of the second set. This it does in the following manner:—

First we have the punishment of the women who caused abortion. Their children are set over against them, and flashes of fire come from them and smite the women's eyes.

Then men and women are seen standing naked. Over against them also are children whom they have exposed to death. The children cry to God for vengeance on their parents. The milk of their mothers forms into beasts, which torment both the men and the women. These children are to be delivered to the angel Temlâkos.

Here, then, is mention of two groups of children, and what is said and not said about them furnishes a reason for, if it does not justify, the distinction which Clement draws between them. For be it noted that *Eth.* says nothing about the destiny of the first set. They are the means of inflicting punishment on their parents, and, though they are not themselves in torment, they are not represented as happy, nor is anything said as to there being happiness in store for them. Thus they correspond very well to the second class of children in Clement who merely escape punishment. The others, of whom it is said that they are handed over to the angel Temlâkos, are, of course, Clement's first class. Whether the author of *A. P.* really intended to draw a distinction between the ultimate destinies of these two groups of children, I do not feel sure; but it is evident that, by making the presence of the one class essential to the torment which he has devised, he has put it out of his own power to improve their prospects. In a somewhat similar fashion he brings the souls of murdered people to watch the torments of their murderers, and Dieterich (*Nekyia* p. 61) points out that this is an indication that we are dealing with conceptions originally Greek.

At this point, having shewn, as I believe, that Clement's quotation is from a text which is pretty faithfully represented by *Eth.*, I must take account of the passage in Methodius (*Sympos.* ii 6):—

‘Ὅθεν δὴ καὶ τημελοῦχοις ἀγγέλοις, κὰν ἐκ μοιχείας ὤσω, τὰ ἀποικιτόμενα παραδίδοσθαι παρελήφαμεν ἐν θεοπνεύστοις γράμμασιν· εἰ γὰρ παρὰ τὴν γνώμην ἐγίνοντο καὶ τὸν θεσμὸν τῆς μακαρίας ἐκείνης φύσεως τοῦ θεοῦ, πῶς ἀγγέλοις ταῦτα παρεδίδοτο τραφησόμενα μετὰ πολλῆς ἀναπαύσεως καὶ βραστώνης; πῶς δὲ καὶ κατηγορήσοντα σφῶν αὐτῶν τοὺς γονεῖς εὐπαρρησιάστως εἰς τὸ δικαστήριον ἐκίκλησκον τοῦ Χριστοῦ· ‘Σὺ οὐκ ἐφθόνησας ἡμῖν, ὦ κύριε, τὸ κοινὸν’ λέγοντα ‘τοῦτο φῶς, οὗτοι δὲ ἡμᾶς, εἰς θάνατον ἐξέθεντο καταφρονήσαντες τῆς σῆς ἐντολῆς’;

If we make allowance for the desire for elegance which is conspicuous in this passage (we owe to it the plural ἀγγέλοις and much else) we shall see in it almost all the elements of the passage quoted by Clement

There is the delivery to the angel, the education, and (what is only implied in Clement) the happy abode of the children. What Methodius adds is the complaint of the children, and this he gives, very probably, in the exact words of the *A. P.*, and certainly in a form which comes very close to *Eth.* This same incident is one of those borrowed by *Paul* (§ 40); the Greek text gives it very shortly, the Latin at greater length. It was very likely suggested to the author of *A. P.* by a passage in *Wisdom* (iv 6), which, indeed, Methodius himself, struck by the resemblance, quotes in the lines immediately following those I have transcribed. ἐκ γὰρ ἀνόμων ὑπνον τέκνα γεννόμενα μάρτυρές εἰσι πονηρίας κατὰ γονέων ἐν ἐξετασμῶ αὐτῶν.

Clement's next quotation (τὸ δὲ γάλα τῶν γυναικῶν κτλ.) is again supported by *Eth.* and not by *Akhimim.* The evidence of *Eth.* leads us to conclude that it followed immediately upon the complaint of the children, and was followed by the passage about the τημελοῦχος ἄγγελος. For this incident, again, there are curious parallels in *Wisdom.* A notable feature is the employment of future and present tenses (γεννήσει, κατεσθίει), but the discussion of the bearing of this belongs to another part of my subject.

As to the extent of the quotation. It clearly goes as far as κατεσθίει. The next words are διὰ τὰς ἁμαρτίας γενέσθαι τὰς κολάσεις διδάσκων. ἐκ τῶν ἁμαρτιῶν γενᾶσθαι αὐτὰς φησιν, ὡς διὰ τὰς ἁμαρτίας ἐπράθη ὁ λαός κτλ. Clearly the clause διὰ . . . διδάσκων need not be more than an inference drawn by Clement from the text he has quoted. But the next clause with its φησίν raises the question whether the *A. P.* is still the subject, and whether it contained a definite pronouncement to this effect. I do not think it did. The doctrine of like sin like suffering is taught in it not only here but throughout the description of Hell, so obviously that a definite statement would seem otiose. I suggest that in all probability some words have been omitted between διδάσκων and ἐκ τῶν ἁμ. : that we are dealing with a fresh extract. Further, that all the quotations from *A. P.* in the *Eclogae* are adduced as illustrations, and that in particular that of *Ecl.* 49 is an illustration of a passage in *Wisdom.* In more than one place in *Wisdom* this particular truth is enforced; perhaps the most striking is xi 16, 17 (of the Egyptian plagues): ἀντὶ δὲ λογισμῶν ἀσυνέτων ἀδικίας αὐτῶν, ἐν οἷς πλανηθέντες ἐθρήσκεον ἄλογα ἔρπετὰ καὶ κνώδαλα εὐτελεῆ, ἐπαπέστειλας αὐτοῖς πλῆθος ἀλόγων ζῶων εἰς ἐδίκησιν, ἵνα γνῶσιν ὅτι δι' ὧν τις ἁμαρτάνει, διὰ τούτων κολάζεται. Here the plaguing of the Egyptians by beasts, and the retributive doctrine, occur in combination, so that the passage is one which might very easily recall to Clement's mind the words he has quoted from *A. P.*

There is another of the *Eclogae* in which an allusion to the *A. P.* has been suspected by other editors as well as by myself, viz. *Ecl.* 38. 2, 39 εἶπε μὲν ὡς κολάσεις εἰσὶ βλασφημιῶν, φλυαρίας, ἀκολάστων ῥημάτων, λόγῳ

κολαζομένων καὶ παιδευομένων ἔφασκεν δὲ καὶ διὰ τὰς τρίχας κολάζεσθαι καὶ τὸν κόσμον τὰς γυναῖκας ὑπὸ δυνάμεως τῆς ἐπὶ τούτοις τεταγμένης, ἢ καὶ τῷ Σαμφῶν δυνάμιν παρέιχε ταῖς θριξίν, ἧτις κολάζει τὰς διὰ κόσμον τριχῶν ἐπὶ πορνείαν ὀρμώσας. This of course recalls the passage in the Akhmim text about women hung up by their hair : αὐται δὲ ἦσαν αἱ πρὸς μοιχείας κοσμηθεῖσαι.

The Ethiopic text puts it more nearly in the terms of Clement. 'Ce sont celles qui ont arrangé leurs tresses . . . Elles se sont *tournées vers la fornication*', which might well be a rendering of ἐπὶ πορνείαν ὀρμώσας.

Yet there is a difficulty ; ἔφασκεν cannot be meant to introduce a quotation from a written work. It must be the report of a spoken word, and the speaker was very probably the same who is mentioned in *Ecl.* 50 Ἐλεγεν πρεσβύτης (τις) (οἱ (ὁ) πρεσβ.) ζῶν εἶναι τὸ κατὰ γαστρός. My own belief is that the quotation from *A. P.* must be confined to the last clause of the excerpt, and that it is more probably due to Clement himself than to his authority.

I suggest that the excerpt is part of a comment on *Wisdom* i 8-11, in which these phrases occur : φθεγγόμενος ἄδικα οὐδεὶς μὴ λάθῃ, οὐδὲ μὴν παροδεύσῃ αὐτὸν ἐλέγχουσα ἡ δίκη. ἐν γὰρ διαβουλίαις ἀσεβοῦς ἐξέτασις ἔσται . . . θροῦς γογγυσμῶν οὐκ ἀποκρίπτεται. φυλάξασθε τοῖνον γογγυσμὸν ἀνωφελῆ, καὶ ἀπὸ καταλαλιᾶς φείσασθε γλώσσης.

§ 4. *The Apocalypse of Peter and the Book of Wisdom.*

More than once in the preceding pages I have adduced passages from the *Wisdom of Solomon* as possible sources of phrases in the *A. P.*, or as texts on which Clement was commenting in the *Eclogae*. A perusal of *Wisdom* has yielded a rather large number of coincidences of language and thought, of varying force, which I have thought well to present in a collected form. They seem to me too striking to be the result of accident ; and I cannot but believe that the writer of *A. P.* was very familiar with the *Book of Wisdom*.

I take the passages in the order of the Akhmim text, intercalating the fragments preserved in quotations in their proper places.

A. P. 1, 2, 3 ἀπόλεια . . . ἀνομία.

Wisd. v 7 ἀνομίας ἐνεπλήσθημεν . . . καὶ ἀπωλείας.

A. P. 3 δοκιμάζοντες τὰς ψυχὰς ἑαυτῶν.

Wisd. iii 1 Δικαίων δὲ ψυχαὶ ἐν χειρὶ θεοῦ . . . 6 ἐδοκίμασεν αὐτούς. δοκιμάζειν also occurs in i 3, ii 19, xi 10.

A. P. 6-11 The appearance of the glorified saints : οὓς ἰδόντες ἐθαμβώθημεν . . . τὸ κάλλος αὐτῶν . . . ἰδόντες τὸ κάλλος ἔκθαμβοι γεγόναμεν . . . τοιαύτη ἦν αὐτῶν ἡ εὐπρέπεια.

Wisd. v 1 Τότε στήσονται ἐν παρρησίᾳ πολλῇ (οἱ δίκαιοι) . . . 2 (the sinners) ἰδόντες παραχθήσονται . . . καὶ ἐκοτήσονται.

v 15, 16 δίκαιοι δὲ εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα ζῶσι . . . λήφονται τὸ βασιλεῖον τῆς εὐπρεπειᾶς καὶ τὸ διάδημα τοῦ κάλλους.

A. P. 15 χῶρον . . . ὑπέρλαμπρον τῷ φωτί, καὶ τὸν ἀέρα τὸν ἐκεῖ ἀκτίσιν ἡλίου καταλαμπόμενον . . . τὴν γῆν . . . ἀνθοῦσαν ἀμαράντοις ἄνθει.

Wisd. xvii 20 ὅλος γὰρ ὁ κόσμος λαμπρῷ κατελάμπετο φωτί.

xviii 1 Τοῖς δὲ ὁσίοις σου μέγιστον ἦν φῶς.

vi 12 λαμπρὰ καὶ ἀμάραντος ἡ σοφία.

A. P. 22, 28 τὴν ὁδὸν τῆς δικαιοσύνης : 34 ἀφέντες τὴν ὁδὸν τοῦ θεοῦ.

Wisd. v 6, 7 ἐπλανήθημεν ἀπὸ ὁδοῦ ἀληθείας . . . τὴν δὲ ὁδὸν Κυρίου οὐκ ἔγνωμεν.

A. P. 21 σκοτεινὸν εἶχον τὸ ἔνδυμα κατὰ τὸν ἀέρα τοῦ τόπου.

Wisd. xvii 21 εἰκὼν τοῦ μέλλοντος αὐτοὺς διαδέχεσθαι σκότους.

A. P. 26 Punishment of parents who destroyed and cast out their children ; the children are the means of punishment.

Wisd. xi 14 ὃν γὰρ ἐν ἐκθέσει πάλαι ριφέντα ἀπίεπον χλευάζοντες, ἐπὶ τέλει τῶν ἐκβάσεων ἐθαύμασαν.

xii 5 τέκνων φονέας ἀνελεήμονας.

xii 6 αὐθέντας γονεῖς ψυχῶν ἀβοηθήτων.

xiv 23 τεκνοφόνους τελετάς.

A. P. ap. Clem. ἀστραπὴ πυρὸς πηδῶσα ἀπὸ τῶν βρεφῶν ἐκείνων καὶ πλήσσοσα τοὺς ὀφθαλμοὺς τῶν γυναικῶν.

Wisd. xi 18 ἡ δεινοὺς ἀπ' ὀμμάτων σπινθήρας ἀστράπτοντας.¹

A. P. ap. Clem. τὸ δὲ γάλα τῶν γυναικῶν . . . γεννήσει θηρία λεπτὰ σαρκοφάγα. With Clement's comment, διὰ τὰς ἀμαρτίας γενέσθαι τὰς κολάσεις διδάσκων, and ἐκ τῶν ἀμαρτιῶν γεννάσθαι αὐτὰς φησιν.

Wisd. xi 16 ἐπαπέστειλας αὐτοῖς πλήθος ἀλόγων ζώων εἰς ἐκδίκησιν, ἵνα γνῶσιν ὅτι δι' ὧν τις ἀμαρτάνει διὰ τούτων κολάζεται.

18 νεοκτίστους θυμοῦ πλήρεις θήρας ἀγνώστους.

xii 23 διὰ τῶν ἰδίων ἐβασάνισας βδελυγμάτων.

xvi 1 δι' ὁμοίων ἐκολάσθησαν ἀξίως καὶ διὰ πλήθους κνωδάλων ἐβασανίσθησαν.

9 οὓς μὲν γὰρ ἀκριδῶν καὶ μυιῶν ἀπέκτεινε δῆγματα, καὶ οὐχ εὐρέθη ἡματὴ ψυχῇ αὐτῶν, ὅτι ἀξιοὶ ἦσαν ὑπὸ τοιούτων κολασθῆναι.

Cf. xii 2 ἐν οἷς ἀμαρτάνουσιν ὑπομνησκῶν νουθετεῖς, and xi 5.

A. P. ap Method. The complaint of the exposed children to God.

Wisd. iv 6 ἐκ γὰρ ἀνόμων ἔπνων τέκνα γεννώμενα μάρτυρές εἰσι πονηρίας κατὰ γονέων ἐν ἐξετασμῷ αὐτῶν (quoted by Methodius himself).

A. P. ap Clem. (of the children) καὶ ἔσονται ὡς οἱ ἑκατὸν ἐτῶν ἐνταῦθα πιστοί.

¹ Dieterich *Nekyia* p. 62 quotes a striking parallel from an Orphic Hymn to the Eumenides (Ixx 6) : ἀπαστράπτουσαι ἀπ' ὄσσαν δεινὴν ἀνταυγῇ φάεος σαρκοφθόρον ἀγλῆν. The date of the Hymn is uncertain : probably late.

Wisd. iii 16-18 (which seems at once to suggest this idea and to contradict the assertion contained in *A. P.*) τέκνα δὲ μοιχῶν ἀτέλεστα ἔσται κτλ.

In iv 8, 16 we have the thought that honourable age does not consist in length of days.

A. P. 26 ἄωροι, *Wisd.* iv 5, xiv 15.

A. P. 28, 29 Punishment of blasphemers and false witnesses.

Wisd. i 6-11 οὐκ ἀθώωσει βλάσφημον ἀπὸ χειλέων αὐτοῦ κτλ.

A. P. 30 ἀμελήσαντες τῆς ἐντολῆς τοῦ θεοῦ. 34 ἀφέντες τὴν ὁδὸν τοῦ θεοῦ.

Wisd. iii 10 οἱ δὲ ἀσεβεῖς καθ' ἃ ἐλογίσαντο ἔξουσιν ἐπιτιμίαν, οἱ ἀμελήσαντες τοῦ δικαίου καὶ τοῦ κυρίου ἀποστάντες.

A. P. 30 and *Eth.*, and Bodleian fragment. Idolaters punished in presence of the idols.

Wisd. xii 27 ἐπὶ τούτοις οὓς ἐδόκουν θεούς, ἐν αὐτοῖς κολαζόμενοι.

xiv 10 καὶ γὰρ τὸ πραχθὲν σὺν τῷ δράσαντι κολασθήσεται. διὰ τοῦτο καὶ ἐν εἰδώλοις ἔθνων ἐπισκοπῆ ἔσται.

A. P. Eth. Idols of silver and gold, images of cats and lions, &c.

Wisd. xiii 10 χρυσοὺν καὶ ἄργυρον, τέχνης ἐμμελέτημα, καὶ ἀπεικάσματα ζώων.

Considering the small compass of the Greek text of *A. P.*, I think that the above list is very striking in respect of the number and the closeness of its resemblances both in expression and in thought to *Wisdom*.

I have suggested already that some of Clement's *Eclogae* belong to comments on passages of *Wisdom*. To those who hold the view that these *Eclogae* are taken from the *Hypotyposes*, in which comments were made on all the books of scripture, this supposition will not appear improbable. But whatever may be our view of the source of the *Eclogae*, it seems worth while to point out that there are a good many passages and phrases in a particular group of them which might very readily be suggested by *Wisdom*. The group in question begins with *Ecl.* 39. This deals with the punishment of blasphemy and of women who tire their hair. I have quoted above some words from *Wisd.* i 6-11 which might have served as the text for this.

Ecl. 40 begins καθάπερ ἀγαθοῦ ἀπορροία ἀγαθύνονται.

In *Wisd.* vii 25 *Wisdom* is described as ἀπόρροια τῆς τοῦ παντοκράτορος δόξης εἰλικρινῆς.

Ecl. 41. 1. The exposed children educated by the angel. This might well be suggested by *Wisd.* iii 16-18 and iv 8, 16 cited above.

41. 2, 3. (Flashes from the eyes of the children.) Cf. *Wisd.* xi 18 quoted above. Clement himself quotes *Wisd.* iii 7, 8.

42-45 are comments on Ps. xvii 26, 44, 45, 51, xviii 11.

46 'Πνεύματα' λέγεται τὰ πάθη τὰ ἐν τῇ ψυχῇ κτλ.

Wisd. vii 23 διὰ πάντων χωρῶν πνευμάτων νοερῶν κτλ. (also vii 20 πνευμάτων βίας).

47 relates to wealth; possibly suggested by *Wisd.* viii 5.

48. 1 Ἡ θεία πρόνοια οὐ καταστρέφει ἐπὶ μόνους τοὺς ἐν σαρκί.

Wisd. vi 7 ὁμοίως τε προνοεῖ περὶ πάντων.

Two resemblances of language may be noted in passing:

Ibid. τῆς ἀμείνονος ἐσόμενα μοίρας.

Cf. *Wisd.* i 16 ἄξιοί εἰσι τῆς ἐκείνου μερίδος εἶναι.

ii 24 οἱ τῆς ἐκείνου μερίδος ὄντες.

48. 2 τοῦτο γέρας λαβόντα.

Wisd. ii 22 γέρας ψυχῶν ἀμώμων.

49. 1. The milk of the mothers changing into beasts in accordance with the teaching διὰ τὰς ἁμαρτίας γεννᾶσθαι τὰς κολάσεις.

See *Wisd.* xi 15 sqq., xii 23, xvi 1, 9, &c., quoted above.

49. 12. Allusion to the people bitten by the serpents (1 Cor. x 9, quoted).

Cf. *Wisd.* xvi 5 δῆγμασί τε σκολιῶν διεφθείροντο ὄφειων.

50. Ἐλεγεν πρεσβύτης ζῶον εἶναι τὸ κατὰ γαστρός. The infusion of the soul.

Cf. *Wisd.* vii 2, viii 19, 20.

The extracts which follow are all comments on Ps. xviii, xix.

Outside this group of extracts, 39-41, 46-50, I find few if any allusions to *Wisdom* in the *Eclogae*, save in *Ecl.* 10 οἱ ἐν σαθρῷ οἰκοῦντες σώματα καθάπερ ἐν πλοίῳ πλείοντες παλαιῷ, with which compare *Wisd.* xiv 1 τοῦ φέροντος αὐτὸν πλοίου σαθρότερον ξύλον.

My own present impression of the relations between *Wisdom*, *A. P.*, and Clement, is that *A. P.* derived ideas from *Wisdom*, and that Clement, commenting on *Wisdom*, is therefore reminded of passages in *A. P.*, and quotes them as illustrations. This was the case also with Methodius.

§ 5. *The Apocalypse of Peter and the Book of Enoch.*

The Book of Enoch has been mentioned once or twice in the course of this investigation as having furnished ideas or phrases to the *A. P.* It will be useful therefore to present the relevant passages together. The Greek fragment, as last edited by Flemming and Radermacher, and Dr Charles's version of the Ethiopic, will be used.

(1) *En.* i 6 (ὄρη) τακῆσονται ὡς κηρὸς ἀπὸ προσώπου πυρὸς ἐν φλογί. Cf. *A. P.*, *Eth.*, *J. T. S.* xii p. 42.

(2) *En.* xiv 16 (διαφέρων ἐν δόξῃ) ὥστε μὴ δύνασθαι με ἐξαιρεῖν ὑμῖν περὶ τῆς δόξης κτλ. *Akh.* 7, 9.

- (3) *En.* xiv 20 ἡλίου λαμπρότερον καὶ λευκότερον πάσης χιόνης.
Akh. 7 ἄκτις ὡς ἡλίου 8 λευκότερα πάσης χιόνης.
- (4) *En.* xx 1 Οὐριήλ ὁ εἰς τῶν ἀγίων ἀγγέλων ὁ ἐπὶ τοῦ κόσμου καὶ τοῦ ταρτάρου. *J. T. S.* xii p. 40 Ourâ'êl . . . whom the Lord hath set over the resurrection of the dead at the judgement.
- (5) *En.* xxi 7 πῦρ μέγα ἐκεῖ καιόμενον καὶ φλεγόμενον. Cf. *Akh.* 23, 29, 34.
- (6) The frequent use of τόπος in these chapters recalls *Akh.*
- (7) *En.* xxii 9 οὗτος ἐχωρίσθη εἰς τὰ πνεύματα τῶν δικαίων, οὐ ἡ πηγὴ τοῦ ὕδατος ἐν αὐτῷ φωτεινῇ. Cf. the Paradise of *Akh.*
- (8) *En.* xxii 12 The souls of the murdered. Cf. *Akh.* 25.
- (9) *En.* xxiv 4 ὁσμὴν εἶχεν εὐωδεστέραν πάντων ἀρωμάτων καὶ τὰ φύλλα αὐτοῦ καὶ τὸ ἄνθος καὶ τὸ δένδρον οὐ φθίνει εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα. *Akh.* 15, 16.
- (10) *En.* xxv 6 τότε εὐφρανθήσονται εὐφραινόμενοι. *Akh.* 19.
- (11) *En.* xxvi 1 τόπον ἡύλογγμένον ἐν ᾧ δένδρα. *Akh.* 15.
- (12) *En.* xxvii 3 ὡδε εὐλογήσουσιν οἱ εὐσεβεῖς τὸν κύριον τῆς δόξης. *Akh.* 19.
- (13) *En.* xxix 1 εἶδον κρίσεως δένδρα πνέοντα ἀρωμάτων. *Akh.* 15.
- (14) *En.* xxxii 3 ἦλθον πρὸς τὸν παράδεισον τῆς δικαιοσύνης καὶ εἶδον . . . δένδρον . . . 4 ἡ δὲ ὁσμὴ αὐτοῦ διέτρεχεν πόρρω ἀπὸ τοῦ δένδρου. *Akh.* 16.
- (15) *En.* xxxix 5-7 description of the dwelling-place of the righteous. They intercede for men (cf. *Sib. Orac.* ii 330-338). They are resplendent as lights of fire (cf. cviii 2-15) and their mouth is full of blessing.
- (16) *En.* liii 3, lvi 1, lxii 11 &c. Angels of punishment. *Akh.* 21, 23.
- (17) *En.* lx 8 The garden where the elect and righteous dwell. *Akh.* 15 &c.
Also lxi 5 The elect who dwell in the garden of life.
and lxx 4 There I saw the first fathers and the righteous who from the beginning dwell in this place.
- (18) *En.* lxi 5 They who have been devoured by the fish of the sea and by the beasts . . . will return . . . for no one will be destroyed before the Lord of Spirits. *J. T. S.* xii pp. 39, 40.
- (19) *En.* lxiii 1 sqq. The sinners implore the angels of punishment to whom they were delivered to grant them a little respite. *J. T. S.* xii pp. 50, 51.
- (20) *En.* xciv 8 Woe to you, ye rich, for ye have trusted in your riches. *Akh.* 30 (τῷ πλούτῳ αὐτῶν πεποιθότες).
- (21) *En.* xcvi 7 Ye persecute the righteous. *Akh.* 27 οἱ διώξαντες τοὺς δικαίους.
- (22) *En.* xcix 5 (Those who will be reduced to want) will mangle their

children and cast them away, and there will be miscarriages ; and they will cast away their sucklings and will not return unto them, and will have no pity on their beloved ones. Cf. *Akh.* 26 and *J. T. S.* xii p. 46.

- (23) *En.* cii 1 sqq. When He brings a grievous fire upon you, whither will ye flee? and where will ye find deliverance? . . . 2 And all the luminaries will quake with great fear, and all the earth will be affrighted and tremble and be alarmed. *J. T. S.* xii pp. 42, 43.
- (24) *En.* cvi 2 His body was white as snow and red as a blooming rose . . . when he opened his eyes he lighted up the whole house like the sun. 10 The colour of his body is whiter than snow and redder than a blooming rose . . . and his eyes are like the rays of the sun. *Akh.* 7, 8. Cf. no. 3 above.
- (25) *En.* cviii 7 sqq. That which will befall the sinners and the spirits of the humble and of those who afflict their bodies. 9 and who . . . longed not after earthly food . . . and were much tried by the Lord, and their spirits were found pure. Cf. *Akh.* 3 *πεινώντας κ. διψῶντας κ. θλιβομένους κ. ἐν τούτῳ τῷ βίῳ τὰς ψυχὰς ἑαυτῶν δοκιμάζοντας.*

These passages constitute sufficient proof of the indebtedness of the *A. P.* to *Enoch*, and shew that the influence of the latter upon the former was not inconsiderable. It should also be noted that passages from all parts of *Enoch*, even the latest in date, seem to have been used in the *A. P.*

§ 6. *The Apocalypse of Peter in the West.*

While we have sufficient—if not abundant—evidence of the use of *A. P.* in writings of Egyptian and Asiatic provenance, it has hitherto been impossible to adduce any but the scantiest evidence of its use in the West.¹ Harnack in *Texte und Untersuchungen* (xiii 1 pp. 71–73 *Die Petrusapokalypse in der alten Abendländischen Kirche*) brought together all the evidence which was accessible to him in 1895. Passing over the mention in the stichometry of the Codex Chromontanus, as not certainly Western, he cites (1) the Muratorian Canon, (2) Hippolytus *περὶ τοῦ παντός* and *Ref. Haer.* x 34, (3) a passage from the tract *de laude Martyrii* printed among Cyprian's works, but which H. ascribes to Novatian, (4) the Acts of SS. Felix, Fortunatus, and Achillaeus (*Acta SS.* 23 Ap.): he refers also to the Acts of Ferreolus and Ferrutio (16 June) and of Dorothea and Theophilus (6 Feb.).

¹ I exclude African writings in Latin such as the Passion of Perpetua, the *Carmen de resurrectione mortuorum*, and Verecundus's poem *de satisfactione poenitentiae* in *Pitra Spicil. Solesm.* IV.

Bonwetsch *Studien z. Hippolytus' Danielkommentar* &c. p. 27 suggests that in comparing the lions' den to Hades and the lions to the angels of punishment Hippolytus had the *A. P.* in mind. It may be so, but the reminiscence is a faint one at best. However, I consider that Hippolytus's acquaintance with the *A. P.* is rendered certain by his use of the word *ταρταροῦχος* in *Ref. Haer.* x 34.

To the above scanty list of Western references to the *A. P.* a few more, some probable, and some certain, can now be added. We ought, in the first place to interrogate Hermas. Judging from his use of other books, we shall expect to find, not overt quotations (it will be remembered that there is but one such in the whole of the *Shepherd*), but veiled allusions and reminiscences. I have compiled a list of these: it is not convincing, but it leaves me with the impression that he probably knew the *A. P.* I give the passages in the order in which they appear in the *Shepherd*.

Vis. i 1. 8 οἱ τὸν αἰῶνα τοῦτον περιποιοῦμενοι καὶ γαυριῶντες ἐν τῷ πλούτῳ αὐτῶν καὶ μὴ ἀντεχόμενοι τῶν ἀγαθῶν τῶν μελλόντων.

Akh. 30 οἱ πλουτοῦντες καὶ τῷ πλούτῳ αὐτῶν πεποιθότες κτλ.

Vis. i 2. 4 εἰς πάνσεμνον πνεῦμα καὶ ἤδη δεδοκιμασμένον.

Akh. 3 ἐν τούτῳ τῷ βίῳ τὰς ψυχὰς ἑαυτῶν δοκιμάζοντας.

Vis. ii 1. 3 βλέπω ἀπέναντί μου τὴν πρεσβυτέραν.

Akh. 6 φαίνονται δύο ἄνδρες ἐστῶτες ἔμπροσθεν τοῦ κυρίου.

Vis. iii 1. 5 ἔκθαμβος ἐγενόμην καὶ ὡσεὶ τρόμος με ἔλαβεν.

Akh. 11 ἔκθαμβοι γεγόναμεν πρὸς αὐτούς.

Vis. iii 1. 9 ὁ εἰς τὰ δεξιὰ μέρη τόπος ἄλλων ἐστίν, τῶν ἤδη εὐαρεστηκῶτων τῷ θεῷ καὶ παθόντων εἵνεκα τοῦ ὀνόματος.

Akh. 20 οὗτός ἐστιν ὁ τόπος τῶν ἀρχηγῶν (?) ὑμῶν τῶν δικαίων ἀνθρώπων.

Vis. iii 4. 1 οἱ ἄγιοι ἄγγελοι . . . οἷς παρέδωκεν ὁ κύριος πᾶσαν τὴν κτίσιν αὐτοῦ, αὔξειν καὶ οἰκοδομεῖν.

A. P. *ap.* Clem. Alex. παραδίδοσθαι ἀγγέλω ὑφ' οὗ . . . αὔξειν.

Vis. iii 4. 2 πάντες ὁμοῦ εὐφρανθήσονται κύκλῳ τοῦ πυργοῦ καὶ δοξάσουσιν τὸν θεόν.

Akh. 19 μᾶ φωνῆ τὸν κύριον θεὸν ἀνευφήμουν εὐφραϊνόμενοι.

Vis. iii 5. 3 τοῦτους ὁ κύριος ἐδοκίμασεν. Cf. *Vis.* iv 3. 4, *Sim.* ix 5. 2.

Akh. 3 quoted above.

Vis. iii 5. 4 νέοι εἰσὶν ἐν τῇ πίστει καὶ πιστοί· νουθετοῦνται δὲ ὑπὸ τῶν ἀγγέλων.

A. P. *ap.* Clem. ἀγγέλω ὑφ' οὗ παιδεύεσθαι . . .

Vis. iii 6. 1 οὗτοί εἰσιν οἱ υἱοὶ τῆς ἀνομίας.

Akh. 3 κρινεῖ τοὺς υἱοὺς τῆς ἀνομίας.

Vis. iii 10. 2 περὶ τῶν τριῶν μορφῶν ἐν αἷς μοι ἐνεφανίσθη.

Akh. 13 τὰς μορφὰς ἰδεῖν.

Vis. iv 3. 5 τὸ δὲ λευκὸν μέρος ὁ αἰὼν ὁ ἐπερχόμενός ἐστιν, ἐν ᾧ κατοικήσουσιν οἱ ἐκλεκτοὶ τοῦ θεοῦ.

- Sim.* iv 2 τὰ δένδρα οἱ δίκαιοι εἰσιν, οἱ μέλλοντες κατοικεῖν εἰς τὸν αἰῶνα τὸν ἐρχόμενον.
Akh. 14 καὶ ποῦ εἰσι πάντες οἱ δίκαιοι, ἢ ποῖός ἐστιν ὁ αἰὼν ἐν ᾧ εἰσι ταύτην ἔχοντες τὴν δόξαν;
- Sim.* vi 1. 5 καὶ μετὰ τὸ ταῦτα λαλήσαι αὐτὸν μετ' ἐμοῦ λέγει μοι. Ἔγωμεν εἰς ἀγρόν. Cf. *Sim.* ix 5. 6.
Akh. 4 καὶ προσθεῖς ὁ κύριος ἔφη. Ἔγωμεν εἰς τὸ ὄρος.
- Sim.* vi 1. 6 περιέτρεχε. Cf. *Sim.* ix 3. 1.
Akh. 8. 18 ἄγγελοι δὲ περιέτρεχον αὐτοὺς ἐκεῖσε.
- Sim.* vi 2. 5 τοιοῦτον εἶχε τὸ βλέμμα.
Akh. 10 τοιαύτη ἦν αὐτῶν ἡ εὐπρέπεια.
- Sim.* vi 3. 1 ἐβασανίζοντο καὶ ἀνοχὴν ὄλως οὐκ εἶχον.
Akh. 33 μηδέποτε πανόμενοι τῆς τοιαύτης κολάσεως.
- Sim.* vi 3. 2 ἐκ δὲ τῶν ἀγγέλων τῶν δικαίων ἐστὶ, κείμενος δὲ ἐπὶ τῆς τιμωρίας.
Akh. 23 καὶ ἐπέκειντο αὐτοῖς ἄγγελοι βασανισταί.
- Sim.* vii 2 οὐ τοσαῦτα ὥστε τῷ ἀγγέλῳ τούτῳ παραδοθῆναι.
A. P. ap. Clem. παραδίδοσθαι ἀγγέλῳ.
- Sim.* viii 3 Κύριε, νῦν οὖν μοι δήλωσον . . . ἵνα ἀκούσαντες οἱ πιστεύσαντες . . . μετανοήσωσι.
Akh. 5 ὅπως δείξῃ ἡμῖν . . . ἵνα . . . θαρσύνωμεν καὶ τοὺς ἀκούοντας ἡμῶν ἀνθρώπους.
- Sim.* ix 19. 1 ἀποστάται καὶ βλάσφημοι εἰς τὸν κύριον καὶ προδοταὶ τῶν δούλων τοῦ θεοῦ.
Akh. 28 οἱ βλασφημήσαντες . . . τὴν ὁδὸν τῆς δικαιοσύνης.
 34 οἱ ἀφέντες τὴν ὁδὸν τοῦ θεοῦ.
 27 οἱ διώξαντες τοὺς δικαίους καὶ παραδόντες αὐτούς.

There are two phrases which recall passages of *Eth.* that I conjecture to belong to the *A. P.*:—

- Vis.* i 2. 1 μετὰ τὸ λαλήσαι αὐτὴν τὰ ῥήματα ταῦτα ἐκλείσθησαν οἱ οὐρανοί.
Eth. 'Alors se ferma le ciel qui s'était ouvert.'
- Vis.* i 3. 2 ἐνγραφῆσονται εἰς τὰς βίβλους τῆς ζωῆς μετὰ τῶν ἁγίων. Cf. *Sim.* i 9.
Eth. 'Glorifiant le Seigneur de ce qu'il avait écrit les noms des justes sur le livre de vie qui est aux cieux.'

There are also passages which recall the Gospel of Peter:—

- Sim.* ix 6. 1 εἰς τὸ μέσον ἀνὴρ τις ὑψηλὸς τῷ μεγέθει ὥστε τὸν πύργον ὑπερέχειν. 2 καὶ οἱ ἐξ ἀνδρῶν . . . ἐκ δεξιῶν τε καὶ ἀριστερῶν περιεπέτησαν μετ' αὐτοῦ. Cf. *Sim.* ix 12. 8.
Ev. 39, 40 τρεῖς ἄνδρας, καὶ τοὺς δύο τὸν ἕνα ὑπερθοῦντας . . . καὶ τῶν μὲν δύο τὴν κεφαλὴν χωροῦσαν μέχρι τοῦ οὐρανοῦ, τοῦ δὲ . . . ὑπερβαίνουσαν τοὺς οὐρανοὺς.

- Sim.* ix 16. 3 ἔλαβον οὖν καὶ οὗτοι οἱ κεκοιμημένοι τὴν σφραγίδα.
 4 κἀκείνοις οὖν ἐκηρύχθη ἡ σφραγὶς αὕτη.
 5 κοιμηθέντες . . . ἐκήρυξαν καὶ τοῖς προκεκοιμημένοις.
Ev. 41. 42 ἐκήρυξας τοῖς κοιωμένοις ; . . . Ναί.

Besides the possible, though not certain, testimony of Hermas, we have the passage in the tract *de aleatoribus*, adduced by me in my first article (p. 50, note). It may be repeated here :

§ 8. Aleae tabula qui ludet, et maleficium nosse debet, quod a dei servos longe sit scientes quoniam *foris est maleficus et uenenarius*, et iterum *in iudicii diem in igne rotante torquebitur*.

For *foris est* Harnack read *furor iste* with the MSS, and for *diem in, dei*. But there can be little doubt that in the former place there is an allusion to Rev. xxii 15, and the presence of *et iterum* is surely a very strong indication that the words which follow are again a quotation : this same section, two lines further on, has 'dicente domino: *sacrificans diis eradicabitur* etc., et iterum : *nolite sacrificare diis alienis* etc.' The same formula occurs some six times elsewhere in the tract. In *Eth.* there is a description of the torment of enchanter's by wheels of fire, which I have no doubt was in the mind of the Latin writer.

Within the last few weeks an entirely fresh and undoubted quotation of the *A. P.* has come to light in a Latin text edited by Dom A. Wilmart in the first number of the new *Bulletin d'ancienne littérature et archéologie chrétiennes*. The text in question is an exposition of the Parable of the Ten Virgins, preserved as a 'Homily' in an Épinal MS. It is considered by Dom Wilmart to be a fragment of a series of *Quaestiones* on the Gospels, and he assigns it to the fourth century. On p. 37 is this sentence : '*Ostium clausum flumen igneum est quo impii regno dei arcebuntur, ut apud Danielum et apud Petrum in Apocalypsi eius scriptum est.*' Later on : '*Resurget et illa stultorum pars et inueniet ostium iam clausum, opposito scilicet flumine igneo.*'

There are two mentions of a river of fire in the Ethiopic text of *A. P.*: one on p. 43 'the flames . . . will make them come to the judgement of wrath, in a river of fire, inextinguishable &c.'; the other on p. 44 '(My Father) will command them to pass through the river of fire . . . the elect . . . shall come to me . . . But the unrighteous, . . . shall be set in the midst of abysses of darkness, &c.' Passages from *Sib. Orac.* ii 252 (πάντες διὰ αἰθομένου ποταμοῦ . . . διελεύσονται κτλ.) and Cyril of Jerusalem *Cat.* xv 9 (ποταμοῦ πυρὸς . . . δοκιμαστικοῦ τῶν ἀνθρώπων) confirm, what the Latin text indicates, that the fiery river of Dan. vii had become, in the *A. P.*, an instrument of punishment, and of discrimination between the righteous and the wicked.