One recorded appearance there is which might seem to militate against this position—the appearance, namely, of the risen Jesus to Paul on the way to Damascus. Paul himself classes this appearance in the same category with the appearances to the other Apostles during the forty days. But Paul at the time of the glorified Christ’s appearance to him was still an unbeliever, an enemy of Jesus Christ, and a ‘devastator’ of the faith (Gal 1:13, ἐπώθεις). He was, indeed, on his way to Damascus, there to enter upon a fresh course of ‘menace and bloodshed’ (Ac 9:1, ἐπνίκησεν ἀπελευθής καὶ φόνον). Saul the prosecutor, however, had not been without his inward questionings. He had felt the prick of the goad (Ac 26:14), though up to the moment of Christ’s appearance to him he had steeled his mind and will against it. To his conscience and heart the risen Jesus now by direct supernatural action appealed: ‘I am Jesus whom thou persecutest’ (v.15); and it was that inward visitation or appeal which enabled him to recognize in the outward sensible appearances of Christ, so far from being a ‘spiritual’ was inaccessible to the senses of all but those possessed of a certain inward spiritual receptiveness? His outward manifestation of Himself, in short, to men, if a revelation on His part was also a discovery on their part. If this can be established, then one thing follows: The restriction to believers of the recorded appearances of the risen Christ, so far from being a ground of objection to the Evangelic narratives—as it has been made from Celsus downwards,—becomes rather an additional corroboration and attestation of their historical trustworthiness.

Literature.

THE LAND OF THE HITTITES.

Those who possess Dr. Wright’s Empire of the Hittites, which was published in 1884, should place beside it Professor Garstang’s Land of the Hittites, published in 1910 (Constable; 12s. 6d. net). We cannot conceive a better way of showing the advance that has been made within the last five-and-twenty years in our knowledge of the ancient East. Five-and-twenty years hence another book will be written on the Hittites which will show as great an advance in knowledge. For with all that we know about the Hittites, there is much of which we are ignorant; we only know that we are on the eve of more and greater discoveries. But for that we must wait. Meantime we have Professor Garstang’s book, which brings our knowledge right up to date. It is a great book. For the subject is a greater one than some have realized yet, and Professor Garstang rises to the height of it. One of our most experienced explorers, he has lately made the Hittites the special field of his exploration. And if his name is not associated with them as is the name of Professor Winckler, we are quite sure that he has written a better book about them than Professor Winckler could have written.

The difference between Dr. Wright and Professor Garstang is due chiefly to the entrance of Asia Minor. Professor Sayce writes an introductory note. In that note he tells us that whereas scientific excavations have long been carried on in Egypt, Assyria, Babylonia, and Palestine, it is now the turn of Asia Minor, both north and south of the Taurus. And there are indications, he says, that the revelation which Asia Minor and the
neighbouring lands of Syria have in store for us will be even more startling than that which has come from Egypt and Babylonia. There we already knew that great empires and wide-reaching cultures had once flourished; the earlier history of Asia Minor, on the other hand, was a blank. But the blank is beginning to be filled up, and we are learning that there too an empire once existed, which contended on equal terms with those of the Nile and the Euphrates, and possessed a culture that formed a link between the east and the west.

What has hitherto been done to fill up the blank will be found in Professor Garstang's *The Land of the Hittites*, and nothing is spared in the way of excellent illustration to make the book acceptable.

**THE FOURTH GOSPEL.**

The authorship of the Fourth Gospel is still an open question. We say so after reading an immense volume which has been written by Professor Bacon of Yale against the Johannine authorship. For there is no living scholar, in our judgment, who is more conscientious or more courageous than Professor Bacon, and none who knows the subject better. This, then, is the utmost that can be said against the belief that this Gospel was written by the Apostle John. And it is an open question still. Professor Bacon deals separately with the external and with the internal evidence. His handling of the external evidence is masterly and minute. With the internal evidence he is not so much at home. But whether it is external or internal, there is far too much evidence in favour of the Apostle left unexplained.

And above everything else there remains the difficulty of finding an author. The question forces itself on one's mind at every step. How is it possible for a man who could write a book like this, to write it and immediately drop out of sight? If we were reviewing a book in favour of the Johannine authorship, we should lay stress on the difficulties that stand in the way of that belief. For the difficulties are many and great. All we contend for now is that the question of the authorship is still unsolved. And we contend for it after reading with an open mind the strongest book on the negative side that has yet been written in English.

Some of the book has already appeared in the form of articles in magazines. But it is none the worse for that. These articles were part of a complete subject. When brought together they fit into their place without any trouble. For it is long since Professor Bacon had his mind fully made up. He is not one of those who write to clear their own minds or to give themselves courage; he writes always to prove to others the things that are most certainly believed by himself. The title of the book is *The Fourth Gospel in Research and Debate* (Fisher Unwin; 15s. net).

**HISTORY OF THE CATHOLIC CHURCH IN THE NINETEENTH CENTURY.**

The Rev. James MacCaffrey, Professor of Ecclesiastical History in St. Patrick's College, Maynooth, is astonished that his *History of the Catholic Church in the Nineteenth Century* (Gill & Son; 2 vols.) should, within a very few months, have reached a second edition. There is nothing to be astonished at. The nineteenth century covers the career of Wiseman, of Manning, of Newman; it covers the period of the Catholic emancipation and of disestablishment in Ireland; and these persons and things are still of so intense an interest and so far-reaching an influence that a book which gave a complete and unbiased account of them, even if it contained nothing else, was sure of a widespread welcome. Professor MacCaffrey writes the history of his Church not only in great Britain and Ireland, but throughout the whole world. And he does undoubtedly write it with less prejudice than we should have thought possible in a man who believes so whole-heartedly in its exclusive mission to the world.

To these three things, then, its fairness, its comprehensiveness, and the nearness of the events it describes, may be chiefly attributed the book's success. Professor MacCaffrey is no stylist. He is not always precise in the choice of his words; he has no ear for rhythm. But style is not greatly taken into account now in historical writing. History has become much more a science than an art. So long as the historian verifies his references and arrives at sensible conclusions, his work is readily accepted.

It was inevitable that Ireland should occupy large space in the book. To all but an Irishman, the space will appear out of proportion. But there is this compensation, that if the rest is good, the Irish chapters are supremely good.

The whole production of the book, in spite of
We are not foolhardy enough to criticise the contents of the book. Dr. Churchward wrote a book some time ago on the origin and antiquity of Freemasonry; and some one reviewing it, remarked that a little Egyptian knowledge is a dangerous thing. 'His observation,' retorts Dr. Churchward, 'is true, and most applicable to critics of his métier, but does not concern writers who have devoted many years to the study of Egyptology. It would certainly add to the value of the Ars Quatuor Coronatorum if the reviewers learned something first of the subject they attempt to criticise, and did not hazard an opinion on a subject of the alphabet of whose language they are ignorant.'

The misinterpretation of nature has much to do with the difficulty which men of science seem to feel in associating themselves with the Church. And the misinterpretation is not all on one side. The Rev. H. Farquhar, B.D., has written a little book—it is one of the 'Guild Text-Books'—on The Interpretation of Nature (Black; 6d. net). He admits frankly and quite cheerfully that the Bible does not contain a scientific interpretation of nature. Its science, he says, is loose and inaccurate and is now superseded. But, on the other hand, he shows that the Bible contains an accurate interpretation of nature, an interpretation that is both poetic and spiritual. That is the interpretation which the man of science is invited to consider. The little book will work wonders in the way of reconciliation if both sides can be induced to read it.

Theodore Parker was at his best in prayer. He could not pray in the name of the Lord Jesus Christ, and it is such a pity that he could not. But he held communion with God as Father, a communion which we need not hesitate to say, he reached through Jesus Christ, though he did not know or acknowledge it. And in that communion all the strife is forgotten; the gulf of separation is filled up; at one with God, he is at one with us. And so, as it is fitting that in the hundredth year after his birth a new edition of his Prayers should be published, it is also very welcome. The edition has been edited by the Rev. Charles Hargrove of Leeds, for the British and Foreign Unitarian Association (1s. net).
What is Christianity? This is the question to which the Rev. N. Macnicol, M.A., has written an answer under the title of The Religion of Jesus. The book is intended for the use of missionaries in India, and it is published by the Christian Literature Society for India (1s.). But it will be of service everywhere. Mr. Macnicol, one of the missionaries of the United Free Church of Scotland, is a very competent scholar, and writes with great simplicity.

The new volume of the Revised Version for Schools is The First Book of the Kings (Cambridge University Press; 1s. 6d. net). The editor is the Rev. H. C. O. Lanchester, M.A., formerly Fellow of Pembroke College. The editor of this series is more careful in selecting his authors than was the original editor of the 'Cambridge Bible for Schools.'

When Professor Andrew Halliday Douglas was Presbyterian minister in Cambridge, he wrote a thesis for the B.A. degree on The Philosophy and Psychology of Pietro Pomponazzi. After many years the thesis has now been edited by his brother — Dr. Charles Douglas — and Dr. R. P. Hardie; and has been published by the Cambridge University Press (7s. 6d. net). Three men, each of exceptional intellectual ability, have given themselves to the making of the book; and, in spite of the limited interest that is now taken in the Schoolmen, it is not at all unlikely that this volume, which describes the last of them, will obtain a considerable circulation. Professor Halliday Douglas saw clearly and wrote clearly. The reader may depend upon it that whatever Pietro Pomponazzi has for this generation will be found in this book. We look upon it, both for its subject and for the treatment of its subject, as a model for all those who have a thesis to write.

It must have been difficult for Mr. Edward Mortimer Chapman to find a title for his book. The title he has chosen, English Literature and Religion (Constable; 8s. 6d. net), is not distinctive enough. His purpose is, on the one hand, to set forth the debt which literature owes to religion for its subjects, its language, its antagonisms, and its inspirations; and, on the other hand, to suggest the debt which religion owes to literature for the extension of its influence and the humanizing of its ideals.

It is a large subject. Mr. Chapman has been wise to restrict the range of it. He deals with the writers of the nineteenth century only. He does not, however, plunge us straight into the literature of the nineteenth century. He leads us towards it by two introductory lectures of considerable length. In these lectures, and especially in their treatment of Burns, there is much courageous writing. As so often happens in both literature and life, the religious element in Burns shows to best advantage when it is implicit. He hated hypocrisy, and, like many a conscience-smitten man, exalted his hatred into a special virtue. "Holy Willie's Prayer," for instance, is a diatribe acid enough to have come from the pen of Churchill or of Junius. It is an attack upon ultra-Calvinism in general,—which was sufficiently justifiable; and upon a certain William Fisher in particular,—which nothing could justify. So in the "Holy Fair," with its innuendoes and personalities, there is far less Christian spirit than in the rollicking stanzas of the "Jolly Beggars," a poem which for genuine inspiration must take precedence of the far more famous "Tam o' Shanter." But the "Lines to a Mountain Daisy," to the mouse whose poor home was invaded by his ploughshare, the closing stanzas of his "Address to the Unco Guid," and especially—

A man's a man for a' that
Are instinct with the very spirit of the Gospel.
Somewhere this man
Learnt the touch that speeds
Right to the natural heart of things!
Struck rootage down to where Life feeds
At the eternal Springs.

Whatever this does for Burns, it throws some light upon Mr. Chapman. His manner is never less free and daring throughout the book. He calls Wordsworth and Coleridge the 'sons of the morning;' Carlyle and Ruskin he calls 'Elijah and Elisha.' He is able to appreciate Mr. Thomas Hardy.

The Wesleyan Book Room deserves the thanks of the whole Christian world for the persistent courage of its publications on the social problem. Every other month a new volume appears, and every new volume is instinct with life and earnestness. The latest is The Social Outlook (Culley;
The fortieth Fernley Lecture was delivered by the Rev. Edward J. Brailsford. Where did he go for a subject? He went far away from all the beaten tracks of the Fernley Lecturers. He went to the legendary lore that has gathered round the narratives of the Old and New Testaments. Where he found these legends he does not always say, which is a pity. It would be convenient to have a storehouse of the legends as with their meaning. His interest is not literary but devotional, not intellectual but spiritual. Wherever he got them, he quotes them freely, sometimes in the words of his source, and sometimes in his own words, but always for the purpose of bringing out the spiritual meaning underlying them. The title of his book is The Spiritual Sense in Sacred Legend (Culley: 3s. 6d.).

Here are two volumes of sermon essays, both published by Messrs. Funk & Wagnalls. Dominion and Power (5s.), by Mr. Charles Brodie Patterson, is in its seventh edition, so that there is evidently a market for the sermon-essay. No doubt the market is mainly an American one; and indeed the essay which is also a sermon is a peculiar product of modern American life, where the resolution to make the best of both worlds is more determined than it has ever been in the history of this earth. The way to make the best of both worlds is just what the sermon-essay proposes to show. It must be admitted that this world has the lion's share of attention. That perhaps accounts for the success of this form of literature. But at least it is always maintained that character is necessary to true success. And how can character be attained without a background of eternity?

The other volume is called The Good of Life, and Other Little Essays (5s.). Among the subjects of the essays are the Dance Question, Outspokenness, the Elusive in Poetry, and Is it right sometimes to Lie? The author of this volume is Professor William Cleaver Wilkinson.

Messrs. Funk & Wagnalls have published another volume of the same kind. But this time it is a translation. It is a translation made by Marian Lindsay from the French of Dora Melegari. The title is Makers of Sorrow and Makers of Joy (5s.).

Messrs. Gowans & Gray of Glasgow are the publishers of the 'Pocket Anthologies' (6d. net). No. 7 contains Characteristic Passages from the Hundred Best Prose-Writers in the English Language.

That there is a spreading, and rapidly spreading, interest in the study of religion is proved by the number of books on the subject which are pouring from the press. Harper's Library of Living Thought is not necessarily religious; yet of the seventeen volumes now issued eleven are distinctly so. The latest is Professor E. A. Gardner's Religion and Art in Ancient Greece (2s. 6d. net). It is a delightful little book. The members of the family to which Professor Gardner belongs have all the gift of style, and they are all scholars. Moreover, this is Professor E. A. Gardner's special subject. There is no one living who knows it more intimately.

Dr. T. Todd-Potts of Gorleston-on-Sea is the publisher of his own poems. The small volume we have seen is entitled Lays of Faith and Love (2s. 6d.). It contains a tribute to the memory of King Edward vii., and another to the memory of His Majesty King Oscar of Sweden. But for the most part the theme is human love in one or other of its many manifestations.

The versatility of Professor Flinders Petrie is astounding. When we thought he was digging and deciphering in Egypt, we find he was working out a new solution of the Synoptic problem. His solution of the problem is just as enterprising and original as we should expect it to be. But after all, there is a connexion between cause and effect. He has reached his solution after looking at the Logia or Sayings of Jesus which have been discovered in Egypt. These Logia are separate fragments. There is the same difference between them and a gospel as there is between a notebook and a treatise. Now, let us suppose that there were a great number of such Logia in existence at the beginning. Suppose, further, that Mark gathered a number of them together, gave them links of connexion and produced a gospel,
Suppose that Matthew and Luke got hold of Mark's collection and added other separate Logia to it, and so made other gospels. Professor Filders Petrie believes that this, or something like this, is the way in which the present Synoptic Gospels came into existence. What is the test of his solution? It is that the difference between one Gospel and another is not a difference of words and phrases. It is a difference of episodes; that is to say, of portions containing a narrative or a saying which can stand by itself as a whole. Professor Filders Petrie has presented his theory with amazing attractiveness in a little volume which he calls The Growth of the Gospels (Murray).

Under the curious title of Old Theology (Nisbet; 7s. 6d. net), the Rev. W. H. K. Soames, M.A., has published 'an attempt to expound some of the difficult or obscure or misunderstood texts, passages, and expressions in the New Testament.' Mr. Soames is a keen, earnest evangelical. And he is conscious of it. Much of the exposition is apologetic, but being honest exposition it is all the better for that. One of the passages most fully handled is Jn 3:8, the passage which deals with the fact and circumstances of the new birth. Mr. Soames draws a sharp distinction between the new birth and conversion. He insists just as sharply that the new birth is not due to baptism. But the passage which receives most attention of all is Mt 26:26-28, which begins with the words, 'And as they were eating.' The handling of this passage will be a discovery to those who did not already know that Mr. Soames is one of the best-equipped theologians of our time.

The Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam has taken in hand to publish a series of volumes describing the native tribes for whose welfare it is responsible. The volumes are issued in London by Mr. David Nutt. Already we have received those dealing with the Khasis, the Mikir, and the Meitheis. The new volume deals with The Garos. Its author is Major A. Playfair, I.A. The religion of these tribes, which is the most interesting thing about them, will be described in the Encyclopaedia of Religion and Ethics. Major Playfair devotes forty pages to the religion of the Garos. Speaking of their beliefs about death, he says that in the human body there lives a spirit, which, on being released from its mortal covering, wends its way to Mangru-Mangram, the abode of spirits. Mangru-Mangram, which is now believed to be situated on Chikmang, an isolated peak of the Garo hills, is a kind of purgatory, through which all must pass, good and bad alike. On arriving, the spirit inquires for his relatives, builds his house beside them, and works at the trade he worked at on earth. But Mangru-Mangram is not a place of joy or rest, and the spirit ever hopes for a reincarnation.

The new volume of the R.T.S. Devotional Commentary is The First Epistle General of St. John (2s.). The editor is the Rev. G. S. Barrett, D.D. The volume will rank with the best work in the series. Dr. Barrett as an expositor is not easily surpassed. From his volume on the Temptation, published so long ago as 1883, down to this volume, every book he has published has been the outcome of conscientious study and clear thought.

The Semitic series has been enriched by a volume of Tales and Maxims from the Talmud ( Routledge; 5s. net). The tales and maxims have been selected, arranged, and translated by the Rev. Samuel Rapaport. The book opens with a reprint of Deutsch's famous Essay on the Talmud. And we welcome the reprint. But it is made almost unnecessary by the excellent introduction which Mr. Rapaport himself writes.

Take an example of the precepts: 'Be thou the cursed, not he who curses. Be of them that are persecuted, not of them that persecute. Look at Scripture: there is not a single bird more persecuted than the dove; yet God has chosen her to be offered up on his altar. The bull is hunted by the lion, the sheep by the wolf, the goat by the tiger. And God said, "Bring me a sacrifice, not from them that persecute, but from them that are persecuted."'

Let the example of the tales be a tale of Rabbi Akiba. On his way home one day he met Jonathan, the brother of Dosé, of whom his brother says that he could give a hundred answers to every question he was asked. 'But he was also fond of asking questions, and when he met Rabbi Akiba he unloaded a host of problems which the famous Rabbi failed to solve. "Art thou Akiba, the famous Akiba?" asked this
infant: terrible. "It is nice to have fame; but in my opinion you do not know enough to be qualified for the position of a herdsman of oxen." So far from being offended by this disparaging remark, the meek Rabbi Akiba added a rider, "Aye, not even as a herdsman of sheep." So the famous Akiba was the famous Akiba after all.

_St. Paul and his Converts_ is the title which the Rev. Harrington C. Lees gives to a small volume of studies in the Pauline Epistles (Robert Scott; rs. net). Mr. Lees always finishes his work. This book has more in it than some formal Introductions, though it is so unpretentious.

_Psychism_, by M. Hume (Walter Scott; 2s. 6d. net), has seven sections. The titles of the sections are Hallucinations, Force, Soul, Fore-knowledge, Sub-conscious Memory, General Sub-conscious Action, and Mysticism. Each section is divided into short paragraphs. Here is a paragraph from the Hallucinations: 'During two years I had a servant who amused me by her habit of saying "Good-morning" and "Good-night" twice over; first with her internal body-voice, not audible to herself, but quite audible to me, and then properly and externally. She was rather scared when at last I told her of it.'

Chronology has a curious fascination for some minds. And Bible Chronology has the additional attraction of a vindication of the accuracy of Holy Scripture. Drawn by this twofold cord, Canon R. B. Girdlestone has published _Outlines of Bible Chronology Illustrated from External Sources_ (S.P.C.K.; 2s.).

The Principal of Ridley Hall, Cambridge, lectures on the Thirty-nine Articles. He recommends no text-book. If he is asked what text-book he recommends to his students, he answers the library. But he dictates outlines. And these outlines he has now printed and published, not for the use of his own students only, but for the use and to the great advantage of students and lecturers everywhere. The title is, _Lecture Outlines on the Thirty-nine Articles_, by Arthur J. Tait, B.D. (Stock; 3s. net).

For the encouragement of those who are trying to recover the lost art of pulpit exposition, the Rev. D. Macfadyen, M.A., has published an exposition of the prophet Malachi, which he delivered in lectures on Sunday mornings to the congregations worshipping at the Highgate Congregational Church. The success of the lectures will make the book successful. And others will be encouraged to attempt what he has done so easily and so well. The title of the book is _The Messenger of God_ (Elliot Stock; 2s. net).

Mr. F. C. Conybeare has issued a new edition of his _Myth, Magic, and Morals_ (Watts; 4s. 6d. net). He himself, however, calls it simply a reprint. He says: 'A few insignificant verbal changes have been made in the text, and such clerical errors corrected as had been noticed by reviewers or detected by myself. Several additions have also been made to the notes at the end of the book.' But there is also a new preface. In that preface Mr. Conybeare replies to Professor Sanday. Professor Sanday reviewed the first edition in a pamphlet which he entitled _A New Marcin_. It is to that pamphlet Mr. Conybeare replies. But it is a disappointing reply. Not a position is seriously defended. Mr. Conybeare simply repeats the not very original statement that there are two Christs, the historical Christ and the Christ of the Church. He expects us to draw the inference that his is the historical Christ.

---

**Christologies Ancient and Modern.**

**By the Rev. H. R. Mackintosh, D. Phil., D.D., Professor of Systematic Theology in the New College, Edinburgh.**

An exposition of Dr. Sanday's 'new and unexplored' theory of our Lord's Person ought, so far as may be, to keep sedulously to the words he himself has chosen, for the matter is one of some preciseness and delicacy. We may perhaps start with this summary statement, which comes at the