Scivener's comparison of the Greek text underlying the A.V. with that of the R.V. (Parallel New Testament, see above).

The third, the numbers of marginal notes on the new edition of the Bible Society.

Columns 4–7 give the notes from the R.V.—4 from its text, 5 from its margin, 6 the Greek readings fixed by the Revisers (see above), 7 the total of 4–6.

If the new edition will be found tolerably free from misprints, the merit is due, in the first instance, to the skill of the workmen and to the care of the readers of the Cambridge University Press, where the book has been printed.

It is not the intention of these lines to call attention to particular readings of the old or the new text. Only one example may be quoted to show how the position or omission of a comma makes quite a different construction. Ac 27:59, the A.V. has, 'into which they were minded, if it were possible, to thrust in the ship;' the R.V. put 'they took counsel whether they could drive the ship upon it.' The A.V. construed δισουαντο with infinitive and took ei δίσουαντο as conditional clause; the R.V. made ei dependent on δισουαντο and the infinitive on δίσουαντο. No German commentary or translation known to me has ever thought of this possibility, which seems to me the better construction, and both Scivener and Palmer failed to call attention to this difference between A.V. and R.V. In the text of Palmer the, after δίσουαντο must be deleted; in the edition of Scivener a marginal note must be added. It surely pays itself to compare most carefully the R.V. with the Greek, and the new edition will prove a convenient help for this purpose.

At the Literary Table.

THE LIFE OF FARRAR.

THE LIFE OF Frederic William Farrar.

By his son, Reginald Farrar. (Nisbet. 6s. net.)

FARRAR was more to the world than to the Church. And that was because he was less of the world than most Churchmen are. His son admits that 'his work was often the subject of criticism.' There is apology in the admission where there should be pride. If he had been less a man and more a Churchman, he would have been little criticised.

It is the business of men who are men as well as Churchmen to lead the Church forward, to have pride and say all is well; and the leader is always criticised.

Mr. Farrar was alive to the criticism when he undertook to write his father's life. So he has made the life an apology. And the apology, wisely, is written by other men. It is contained in letters and the like. We are glad to see those letters. But they were not needed. No apology was needed. That many men and probably yet more women were saved from spiritual disaster by Farrar, by the very things for which he was so severely criticised, we had no doubt whatever. That the world was altogether a sweeter and more hopeful place to live in because he had lived in it, we had no doubt whatever.

It was not his opinions that saved or sweetened. It was the courage with which he uttered them. It was the man who held the opinions. It is probable that the causes for which he stood—they were chiefly temperance and eternal hope—gained considerably by his advocacy of them. But it was not through the arguments he used. It was by the way he told on the heart. He had a moral, more than an intellectual, hold of his contemporaries. He used words that burned like fire, not words that merely gave clear light.

He was criticised. His son feels it. He feels it too keenly to refer often to it. But once he is very bold and quotes a letter. This is the letter—

'Sir,—If your sermon has been correctly reported in the John Bull, which you preached last Sunday afternoon in Westminster Abbey, in which you boldly denied the doctrine of eternal punishment, which is distinctly taught in the Church of England, as well as in the Word of God, for the Church teaches nothing contrary to God's word; you will, of course, if you are an honest man, secede from that Church as I believe Sir Samuel Minton has done. You may be a theologian, but I fear that you have never been taught by God's Spirit, or you would not preach such a soul destroying error as that which you preached last Sunday, if the report be a correct one. Look, for instance, at one passage, out of multitudes that can be adduced, Rev. xx. 10: 'And the devil that deceived them was cast into the lake of fire and brimstone, where the beast and false prophet are;
and shall be tormented day and night for ever and ever." Then read the 22nd chapter, verses 18, 19, and you may well tremble. I think that your position as a clergyman is a most fearful one, and I pray that your eyes may be opened to see your danger before it be too late, and you find yourself in the lake of unquenchable fire. — I am, Sir, yours faithfully,

A STUDENT OF GOD'S WORD.

THE PROTESTANT DICTIONARY.


We should have preferred the title 'A Dictionary of Protestantism,' but that is a small matter. It is a scholarly book, it is almost ostentatiously Protestant, but it gives good reasons for its Protestantism. Among the writers are Mr. F. C. Conybeare of Oxford, Professor Cowan of Aberdeen, Mrs. Dunlop Gibson of Cambridge, Dr. Gordon Gray of Rome, Professor Herkless of St. Andrews, Thomas Hodgkin, Principal Lindsay of Glasgow, Dr. Mackennal, Professor Margoliouth and Mrs. Margoliouth of Oxford, the Bishop of Durham, Professor Nicol of Aberdeen, Professor Orr of Glasgow, Professor Peake of Manchester, the late Dr. Salmon of Dublin, Mr. Thatcher of Mansfield College, and the Dean of Canterbury.

It must not be supposed that the articles are confined to the controversy with Rome. It is a dictionary of the Church according to the Protestant faith. That is to say, all the great doctrines are described, but they are described in such a way as to expose whatever Romish error has crept into them; all the vestments are described (and figured as well, some on beautiful plate paper), but their true Catholic character is separated from their merely Roman Catholic; and so with all the rest.

On the whole, the only fault is brevity. The articles should often have been fuller. The risk of excessive shorness is generality. Statements are made of the most sweeping kind, which the writer never means as ipse dixit, but which he has no space to qualify or substantiate. Nevertheless, it is a valuable book. Perhaps its brevity will give it the greater circulation. If it does circulate it will open some eyes and stir some consciences. The writers are alive to the uselessness and the needlessness of over-strong language, for they believe that the Protestant is the most ancient faith, and that it will be the most lasting.

CHINA PAST AND PRESENT.

CHINA PAST AND PRESENT. By Edward Harper Parker. (Chapman & Hall. 8vo, pp. 424. 10s. 6d. net.)

China is a large country. It was no light undertaking to set out to describe it in a single volume. And China past and present! Professor Parker does not let burdens lie heavily on him. His style is light-hearted like himself. If we have not a complete history of China past and present, we have a book of most racy reading about China. It is the modern appetite,—the appetite that crowds the booksellers' counters with 'Strands' and 'Windsors' and 'Royals,'—not pandered to, but met and tickled and lifted just a little to higher things. Professor Harper touches religion with as light a hand as everything else. It is the side of religion that appeals to the man in the street, its seamy side for the most part, with never a word of contempt, however.

The curious thing is that all this barter and buoyancy reveals the fact that life in China, even diplomatic life, is not a screaming farce, but a mighty reality. It is serious, and succeeds by its seriousness. The forms, especially the diplomatic forms, are utterly ridiculous to the European; but the ridiculous forms are an essential part of the serious life the Chinese live. They are not ridiculous to them, they are the body which the soul of all intercourse clothes itself in, and the soul cannot be without the body, at least not in China.

Well, we have our red-tape, too. What a pity it is that Britons insist on using only their own particular colour of tape and sealing-wax. Professor Parker's chapter on 'The Way China is Governed' is a fine example of the humour that incongruity furnishes, but the Chinaman is probably moved to laughter when he comes to know how Britain is governed. One thing above all others does Professor Parker make clear, that China will never be managed by the officials in our Foreign Office.

THE JEWISH ENCYCLOPEDIA.

THE JEWISH ENCYCLOPEDIA. Edited by Isidore Singer, Ph.D., and others. (Funk & Wagnalls. Vol. vi. God—Istria.)

There is no subject of the first importance in
the sixth volume. The most likely is the subject with which the volume opens, and God is dealt with in five articles. But they are all by one hand, and they are all very short. This is almost a lost opportunity. Dr. Davidson has said that the Old Testament speaks but one word, and that word is God. It was a rare privilege the editors of the Jewish Encyclopedia had, to gather together the revelation of God scattered through the Old Testament, and then draw out the advance upon that revelation which has been made by the Talmud, if there is advance. A comparative estimate in detail of the God of the Hebrews and the God of the Jews (to use the words conventionally) would have been of inestimable value. The God of philosophy and the rest we should have been content to look for elsewhere.

Nevertheless, the articles are well done. If Professor Hirsch has been confined, he has made excellent use of his limits. And it must be an extremely difficult thing to apportion the space over so vast an area and through such a variety of work.

The biographical work in this volume is especially useful. One of the earliest (after the thicket of Goldschmidt’s, Goldsmid, and Goldsmiths is past) is Professor Ignaz Goldziher of Budapest, the greatest living authority on Muhammadanism. It seems that he is little more than fifty years of age. A favourable view is taken of the conversion to Judaism of Lord George Gordon. The marks of a sincere believer were upon him. ‘During his stay in Newgate he conformed strictly in all respects to the Jewish religion, eating Kashar meat and wearing phylacteries.’ On the whole, however, the effort to ‘take no side’ is well maintained throughout the Encyclopedia. It is seen conspicuously in the notice of Graetz, the historian of the Jews, a difficult subject, which has been cleverly handled by Professor Deutsch of Cincinnati.

Passing through the book we notice a careful article by Professor Bacher on Hebrew Grammar, and a convenient summary of what Hellenism stands for, by the late Professor Siegfried of Jena and Professor Richard Gottheil of New York. The longest article in the book seems to be that on the Inquisition. There also, there is the determination to ‘take no side’; but the purely historical narrative is more terrible reading than a declamatory style would have been.

THE TREE IN THE MIDST.

The Tree in the Midst. By Greville Macdonald, M.D. (Hodder & Stoughton. 1os. 6d. net.)

‘We now come to the main argument up to which we were climbing. Its purport is to show, in manner as certain as is possible when dealing with abstract ideas, that the evolution of man consists in a perpetual freeing of himself and his race from the environmental restrictions which, in a lower state, had been necessary to his existence. In presenting this idea I shall have recourse to the old biblical legend of the Creation, because it affords a good illustration of one point which we shall understand is essential to all growth. This illustration is the Tree in the Midst of the Garden of Eden, the fruit of which, though declared to be wholesome, and, indeed, necessary to Adam’s enlargement, he was forbidden to eat. And I shall point out how, in his act of insubordination, he found freedom from the stagnation involved in obedience to rigid convention.’

This does not sound very orthodox. Dr. Macdonald has no great consideration for orthodoxy. He holds that there are two antichrists in the world at present—the orthodox man and the materialist. And although his express purpose is to answer and end the materialistic antichrist, he can do nothing without treading constantly on the other. Does he thus offend both sides? He does. But the world is no longer divided between the religious majority and materialism. Dr. Macdonald counts now—for has not his father lived before him?—upon a hearing from a goodly multitude that stands between. And he hopes to make that multitude greater.

His argument is against materialism. He believes in modern physical science: he refuses only to fall down and worship it. He believes in evolution; he refuses only to call it aimless and blind. There is a Divinity that shapes our ends, and we can love Him. The secret of man is in his heart. He can love. That answers all the materialistic arguments. It demands freedom of the will. And when the freedom of the will is granted, the door may be opened to the long, long history of folly and sin in the world, but it is also made open to the entrance of the new Man; and it is shut to materialism. ‘When we assert the unquestionable reality of free-will, we do not say that
man can act without motive, but that he has the power of choosing which of two or more forces shall rule his actions. That is enough. There is no room for materialism there. There is room for everlasting life, as well as the worm that dieth not.

OUTLINES OF PASTORAL THEOLOGY. Translated and Edited by the late W. Hastie, D.D. (T. & T. Clark. Crown 8vo, pp. xiv, 78. Is. 6d. net).—How Professor Hastie discovered this book and how he was drawn to it, how it had to be laid aside and how it would not lie—all this is told with thrilling simplicity in the Introduction. The book is all that Professor Hastie found it. We do greatly need a small competent sympathetic guide to the work of the Ministry. This is the book we need.

THE WORLD'S EPOCH-MAKERS. DESCARTES, SPINOZA, AND THE NEW PHILOSOPHY. By James Iverach, M.A., D.D. (T. & T. Clark. Crown 8vo, pp. xii, 245. 3s.)—Few men in our day are so well equipped for work of this kind as Professor Iverach. He has read till he thinks in the language of philosophy, yet when he has to write for the man in the street he can transmute the jargon into limpid Anglo-Saxon. It is true he does not always do so. Sometimes he retains a rumble of words and sentences as if to show what the task of transmutation involves. In this volume he is nearly always lucid and simple. He moves on from problem to problem with a giant's ease. He makes it manifest, too, that Descartes and Spinoza were of the world's epoch-makers.

NEW LIGHT ON THE LIFE OF JESUS. By Charles Augustus Briggs, D.D., D.Litt. (T. & T. Clark. 8vo, pp. xiv, 196. 4s. 6d. net).—Three of the essays which make up this handsome volume were published in The Expository Times, and attracted much attention. For Professor Briggs announced a great fertile discovery in them. He now reveals the whole wide-ranging influence of that discovery. And it is easy to say that no writer or preacher on the Life of Christ will know his work if he does not take Dr. Briggs into account. As Professor Briggs says: "The new light solves most of the difficult problems of the Gospels, fills up the chasm between the Synoptics and the Gospel of John, and satisfies the most searching inquiries of modern Higher Criticism and Historical Criticism."

PRACTICAL POINTS IN POPULAR PROVERBS. By F.A. Rees (Baptist Union. Crown 8vo, pp. 152. 2s. 6d.).—Mr. Rees turns our common sayings to useful ethical purpose, andwithin a very pithy, pointed manner. Perhaps the ethical interest is not the deepest in his mind. There are few pages that do not discover the name of our Saviour somewhere. But it is not that the moral shades into the spiritual, it is itself spiritual. It is faith working by love in the smallest matters of daily life.

THE DISCIPLINE OF FAITH. By Darwell Stone, M.A. (Brown. Crown 8vo, pp. 198. 3s. 6d.). The title seems to be taken from the second sermon, of which the text is, "Your father Abraham rejoiced to see my day; and he saw it, and was glad." That sermon was preached on behalf of the Association for Promoting the Unity of Christendom. One can understand how Abraham was disciplined through the demand made on him to see afar off; one can understand how the bickerings and jealousies and all the divisions of our day demand the same far vision and afford the same spiritual discipline. This is Mr. Stone's method always. The past is the present, the present is the past. Man, as well as God, is the same yesterday and to-day and for ever. Faith is ever there, discipline is ever through faith. And Abraham, except for ruder ideas of God, is Darwell Stone. Except for ruder ideas of God, we say; for that is the one line along which the race has made progress. That is why you can take Abraham into a modern 'retreat,' and urge the discipline of faith by his example. That is why our Lord could say, "Your father Abraham rejoiced to see my day; and he saw it, and was glad."

THE TEACHING OF JESUS. By George Jackson, B.A. (Holder & Stoughton. Crown 8vo, pp. xii, 252. 3s. 6d.).—This is not a theologian's systematic treatise on the teaching of our Lord; it is a preacher's interpretation, pressed home under the abiding sense that the words He speaks unto us they are spirit and they are life. Mr. Jackson has the gift of directness. He gets
at the heart of his subject, he gets at the heart of his hearer. He does both surely and swiftly. And yet it is not a book to be picked up like the newspaper, scanned, and left. It touches the conscience. It is able almost to create a conscience, so real and direct are its appeals to the man within us that might have been. We say that Jesus did not come to speak, that He came to do, and it is so. But this teaching is doing; the baptism that He has to be baptized with gives the words their flash of revelation. We see the Cross in the Sermon on the Mount. That is the great success of Mr. Jackson's Teaching of Jesus.

THE MAID OF SHULAM. By Hugh Falconer, B.D. (Hodder & Stoughton. Crown 8vo, pp. 167. 3s. 6d.).—If Mr. Falconer should succeed in recovering a lost book of the Bible, his reward will be great. He makes a brave attempt. He knows that the Song of Songs cannot be restored to us on the old lines of the purely allegorical interpretation. He knows also that the modern way of finding in the Song a series of beautiful folk-lyrics is no recovery of the Cross. He finds Christ in the Song of Solomon, as he finds Christ in 'all the Scripture beginning with Moses and the prophets.' But he finds Him through the glory of human love and purity and goodness. The book is most attractively written.

RELIGION AND SCIENCE. By P. N. Waggett, M.A. (Longmans. Crown 8vo, pp. 174. 2s. 6d. net).—'Religion and Science'—the mere juxtaposition of the two words brings 'the eternal note of' dulness 'in.' But Mr. Waggett is not dull. The relation between Religion and Science can be discussed with reality and life. There is no dull page in all the book.

Is that wonderful? The wonder is that men could ever have become dull in discussing such a matter. Heredity, for example: what an interest, what a vital practical interest lies in that word! The old Hebrew prophets felt it. We feel it today as we read their stinging words—'the children's teeth are set on edge.' Mr. Waggett's words sting also. And he is so bravely generous to Science and to Religion. This is a book to be missed by no preacher or worker amongst men.

THE CONSOLATIONS OF THE CROSS. By the Right Rev. C. H. Brent, D.D. (Longmans. Crown 8vo, pp. 122. 2s. 6d. net).—The Bishop of the Philippine Islands has tried to use the Seven Sayings on the Cross in such a way that his hearers should not only admire but repeat them. 'It is finished?' Yes; he believes that we too ought to be able to say, 'It is finished.' He quotes an incident: 'A while since, an afflicted friend sent me one of those home-made tokens of affection that are valuable above gold and silver. "Here," she said, "is a bit of seaweed I gathered some few years back—a bit of God's work which I send as an Easter greeting. Humble enough as far as my own part in it goes, but—God did the rest."' And the Bishop says that if we do our best God will always do the rest, and we shall be able to say, 'It is finished.'

THE COMMON HOPE. Edited by the Rev. Rosslyn Bruce, M.A. (Longmans. Crown 8vo, pp. xv, 207. 3s. 6d. net).—The Bishop of Stepney, in introducing this volume, says that there are two kinds of clergymen in the Church of England, the fussy kind and the quiet kind, the noisy platform and press kind and the parish working kind. This is a volume of essays by the quiet kind. These men have not spoken at Church congresses, they have not written letters to the newspapers; they have stayed at home to see what the Gospel of the grace of God was fit for in modern England when it was allowed fair play. Now they come forward to tell us what it can do and what are the things in the way that prevent it from doing better. The editor's own essay is the most enjoyable. For he writes of 'The Joy of Ministry,' and he has known it. The one of most doubtful good is Mr. H. B. Freeman's on 'The Church and Temperance.' Mr. Freeman is afraid of fanaticism. The cry against fanaticism is quite a familiar one on this subject, but where are the fanatics?

GOD'S LIVING ORACLES. By Arthur T. Pierson (Nisbet. Crown 8vo, pp. x, 257. 3s. 6d. net).—Dr. Pierson thinks that he glorifies the Bible when he proves that the scientific discoveries of modern days are predicted in it—the conservation of energy, the circulation of the blood, and all the rest. His method of proof is peculiar. But if he could prove it, would the Bible be greater, or more the Bible? There is a curious note on page
64: 'Compare Mrs. Helen M. Spurrell's scholarly translation of the Old Testament, published by James Nisbet & Co., London, for which there was so little sale that the edition was sent to the papermill, and a copy can be found only in some second-hand book shop. No translation perhaps surpasses it in excellence.' There is much in the book which is puzzling besides that note, but there is also much that is direct and intelligible and most acceptable.

THE EYE-WITNESSES OF CHRIST. By the Rev. Henry F. Henderson, M.A. (Stockwell. Crown 8vo, pp. 147. 2s. 6d. net).—The most distinct characteristic of Mr. Henderson's sermons is their plainness. It is a refreshing characteristic. There is too much subtlety in the pulpit—not of thought but of language. Few of us can be too subtle in thought for an average congregation, any one can be too subtle in language. Why is it that sermons are ever called dull? Because preachers can speak unintelligibly. Mr. Henderson is always intelligible. His simple directness is his strength. His audience never asks, What does he mean? Every member of it is edified up to the full extent of his meaning.

The subjects of his sermons are theological, ethical, or even mystical, as the case may be; but they are always practical. Now it is the fact of the Resurrection, now the cultivation of piety, now the command, 'Be pitiful'; in every case his hearers hear him gladly and do many things.

Mr. Allenson has issued a revised and enlarged edition of The Nonconformist Minister's Ordinal (1s. 6d. net). Its circulation is a sign and an encouragement. 'Let all things be done decently and in order.'

The Wonderful Story of Uganda has been told by the Rev. J. D. Mullens, M.A., and published by the Church Missionary Society (1s. 6d.). The interest of Mukasa's autobiography at the end is considerable, it is so evidently real and uncoloured. If he could have remembered more of his early religious notions his story would have been of very great value to the science of religion.

At the price of 1s. net, Messrs. Hodder & Stoughton have published Mr. Frank Ballard's 'Clarion Fallacies, the most trenchant attack yet made on the popular agnosticism of our day.

Professor Skinner has given the 'Century Bible' a great lift. His edition of the Books of Kings (Jack; 2s. 6d. net) is out of sight the best commentary in the English language. Its brevity is all in its favour too. For Dr. Skinner says all he means to say in few words, and is always illuminating.

The latest theory of the authorship of the Epistle to the Hebrews is that it is a composite production. There was a letter written, not to Christians probably, but to Jews, yet probably by St. Paul or some well-known apostle. This letter got into the hands of some unknown person, who annotated it before reading it to his own Church. His annotations were Christian, his Church was (at least partly) Gentile. So we have a fine mixture. For the annotations got mixed up with the text, and now—Mr. J. S. foster Chamberlain has disentangled them in his newly published book on The Epistle to the Hebrews (E. Johnson).

Messrs. Longmans have issued Newman's Apologia pro Vita Sua in a cheap form (6d. net).

Under the title of The Training of Life, the Rev. D. W. Whincup, M.A., has published seven sermons on the 'Pilgrim's Progress' (Longmans; 2s. net). The 'Pilgrim' is not often taken into the pulpit, and there are risks run when the Bible is set aside even for Bunyan. But Mr. Whincup is both scriptural and experimental. It is not a very long step from a parable to the immortal allegory in his way of using it. And the common people, he tells us, heard him gladly.

New volumes of Macmillan's Thackeray are Critical Papers in Art and Lovel the Widower (3s. 6d. each). This is to be the edition of Thackeray for all but the few who fancy fine bindings and can pay for them. It is as satisfactory as a working edition can be.

Messrs. Marshall Brothers have published the first volume of an elaborate scheme of bookmaking by the Rev. John Urquhart under the general title of How to Read the Bible (3s. 6d. net).
The great difficulty with the Resurrection of our Lord in some persons' minds is, What is the good of it? That is to say, Why should the body rise? Why is it not enough that the Spirit of Christ should make itself known as alive and able to save? Mr. F. E. Marsh makes a practical answer, in many particulars. The title of his little book is, What does the Resurrection of Christ Mean? (Marshall Brothers).

Messrs. Marshall Brothers have published a third and enlarged edition of the Rev. C. H. Waller's book on the Apocalypse, The Names on the Gates of Pearl. In the new preface there is a touch of pride in the avowal that, 'I wrote these pages in the full belief that “all Scripture” was “given by inspiration of God.” I have not abandoned that position, but I have learned why, in 2 Tim. iii. 16, we say, not “was” but “is inspired.” Not only the dead writer's autograph, but the “living oracles” are “God's word written” still.'

Another issue of Methuen's 'Library of Devotion,' and an attractive one. It is A Day Book from the Saints and Fathers, by the Rev. J. H. Burn, B.D., F.R.S.E. (2s.).

It is surely rather late in the day to 'examine' Bishop Ryle's Early Narratives of Genesis. The chapters of the book appeared ten years or more ago in The Expository Times; the book itself has been out almost as long. The Rev. George Ensor, M.A., has no opinion of the wisdom or even the knowledge of men like Bishop Ryle. 'Higher critics must know—and if they do not know it, they must be guilty of phenomenal ignorance—that the problems of physical science are yet for us exceedingly profound.' The title of his 'Answer' is, Bishop Ryle and Genesis (Nisbet; 2s. 6d. net).

Why is it that Mr. Archibald G. Brown's sermons are so sparingly published? Why is it that they are so little known and read of men? They are among the few that excel equally in the spoken word and the printed page. They are whole-hearted in their evangelical appeal. This volume is published by Simpkin, Marshall, & Co. Its title is, In the Valley of Decision (1s. net).

Mr. Stockwell has published a second edition of The Messages of Christ, by Nathaniel Wiseman (2s. 6d. net).

Messrs. Williams & Norgate have added to their 'Crown Theological Library' a new edition (the third) of Harnack's What is Christianity? (5s.) Mr. Bailey Saunders has revised his translation. No doubt this popular book has some length of life before it yet.


Contributions and Comments.

'Let the Woman learn in Silence.'

It has sometimes been a puzzle to me that English working men, and these not the least intelligent of their class, should be so ready to receive religious teaching from the other sex; and it is my good fortune to know several noble women whose ministries in mission halls have received the divine blessing in quite an unmistakable way. Yet St. Paul forbids women to teach, in spite of the prophecy of Joel quoted by Peter on the day of Pentecost. But Paul himself, in 1 Co 11, implies