

8. Die Akten des Karpus des Papyrus und der Agathonike. Eine Urkunde aus der Zeit Marc Aurel's. 1888.
  9. Der pseudocyprianische Tractat de aleatoribus, die älteste lateinische christliche Schrift, ein Werk des römischen Bischofs Victor I. 1888.
  10. Sieben neue Bruchstücke der Syllogismen des Apelles. Die Gwynn'schen Cajus und Hippolytus Fragmente. 1890.
  11. Über das gnostische Buch Pistis-Sophia—Brod und Wasser: die eucharistischen Elemente bei Justin. 1891.
  12. Die griechische Übersetzung des Apologeticus Tertullian's. Medicinisches aus der ältesten Kirchengeschichte. 1892.
  13. Bruchstücke des Evangeliums und der Apokalypse des Petrus. 1893.
  14. Geschichte der altchristlichen Litteratur bis Eusebius. 1. Teil. Die Überlieferung und der Bestand bearbeitet unter Mitwirkung von Lic. Erwin Preuschen 35 M. 1893.
  15. Zur Überlieferungsgeschichte der altchristlichen Litteratur. 1894.
  16. Patrum apostolicorum opera. Clement, Barnabas, Ignatius und Polycarp, Hermas (together with Osc. Gebhardt and Thdr. Zahn). Large edition, 16 M.; small edition, paper covers, 3 M.
  17. Supplement to Resch's Agrapha: on the Fayum fragment. 1889.
  18. Introduction to Vischer's Die Offenbarung Johannis. 1886.
  19. Articles innumerable in the Theologische Literaturzeitung, of which Harnack is joint editor.
  20. Several articles in Herzog's Encyclopedia.
- N.B.*—Most of these are published by J. C. Hinrichs, Leipzig.
21. Lehrbuch der Dogmengeschichte, vol. i. 14 M.; vol. ii. 9 M.; vol. iii. 17 M. Published by Mohr, Freiburg und Leipzig. Condensed edition, in one vol., 8,50 M. English Translation published by Hodder & Stoughton (very inferior).
  22. Pro domo; by Adolph Harnack. The Outlook, April 28, 1894.
  23. Zur Quellen Kritik der Geschichte des Gnosticismus. Leip., 1873.
  24. De Appellis gnosi monarchica. Leip., 1874.
  25. Evangeliorum Codex graecus purpureus Rossanensis: seine Entdeckung. Leip., 1880.
  26. Das Monchithum seine Ideale und seine Geschichte. Giessen, 1881.
- (Together with)
27. Martin Luther in seiner Bedeutung für die Geschichte der Wissenschaft und der Bildung (1860). Giessen, 1886.
  28. Das neue Testament um das Jahr 200 (Th. Zahn's Geschichte des Neutestamentes Kanons geprüft. Freib., 1889.
  29. Augustin's Confessionen.
  30. Die Briefe d. röm. Klerus aus d. Zeit. d. Sedis vacanz in Abhandlungen Theologische (dedicated to C. v. Weizsäcker on his 70th birthday).
  31. Das Apostolische Glaubensbekenntniss. Ein geschichtliches Bericht nebst einem Nachwort v. A. Harnack.
  32. Antwort auf die Streitschrift Dr. Cremers zum Kampf um die Apostolischebekenntniss. 1892. (Christichen Welt No. 3).
  33. Bemerkungen zu den Sätzen der Antwort Prof. Harnacks an eine Abordnung Theologie Studirender in Sachen des Apostolicums und seinem Geschichtlichen Bericht. (Synodal Report.)

## At the Literary Table.

### THE BOOKS OF THE MONTH.

THE LIFE AND LETTERS OF EDWARD A. FREEMAN, D.C.L., LL.D. By M. R. W. STEPHENS, B.D. (*Macmillan*. 2 vols. Crown 8vo, pp. 435, 499. 17s. net.) This biography will be a great surprise to those who knew Freeman only as a celebrated historian. They had no suspicion that he had ever been what he was at first, or passed to what he finally became. A high-churchman, who would not enter the Church because he believed in the celibacy of the clergy, and unfortunately was already engaged! And then a Liberal of the Liberals, who would try to wrest a county from the Conservatives that had always been theirs by right! And we cannot tell what wrought the change.

The Dean of Winchester has given us one of the best biographies of our time, and spent abundant pains to make it faithful, yet he cannot tell us what subtle influences wrought on this gifted man's mind and made him what he was. Men did something (women did nothing at all), books did more. But the man's own gifts did the most of it. He was a self-made man.

The book is full of interest; but it is most difficult to say wherein the interest lies. A busy man will take it up, and without intending it read on and let the hours pass, and yet he cannot say what makes him read it. Of course Freeman was a great man and a good man, but he never had

the subtle attractiveness of men whose genius and goodness were less conspicuous. Perhaps the secret is the sense of truth. That is everywhere. It clings round the man and all his work as scent around a rose-bush. He loved the truth, he hated those who loved it not. We know his quarrel with Froude. Some men took Froude's side just because he was attacked, others because he wrote so pleasantly. But Freeman was wholly right.

THE OLD TESTAMENT IN GREEK. EDITED BY H. B. SWETE, D.D. (Cambridge: *At the University Press*. Crown 8vo, vol. i. 2nd edition, pp. 828. 7s. 6d.) To the eye of the careless, comfortable reader there will seem to be no difference between this edition and the first. If it were not that the publishers have printed 'Second Edition' in bright gold on the back, they would not even have known it was so. Yet there has been much conscientious labour spent to make this differ from the first edition. Account has now been taken of Professor Nestle's collation of the Roman Photograph of Codex B, and of fresh collations of Codices D and E. Dr. Ceriani sent the editor many useful corrections the year after the first edition was issued, and these have been made glad use of. But the best work has been done by Mr. Redpath, the editor of the great *Septuagint Concordance*, and by the editor himself. It may be well to say that the publishers (*Messrs. C. J. Clay & Sons, Ave Maria Lane, London*) offer the sheets containing the changes in the new edition to purchasers of the first who ask them.

THE SYRO-LATIN TEXT OF THE GOSPELS. BY F. H. CHASE, D.D. (*Macmillan*. 8vo, pp. x, 148. 7s. 6d. net.) In New Testament Criticism the most interesting question at present is the origin of the so-called 'Western Text,' or to put it briefly and boldly, the origin of the peculiarities of Codex Bezae. Dr. Chase (who wisely prefers to say 'Syro-Latin' instead of 'Western') has already published a volume on this question. In that volume he sought to prove that the peculiarities are owing to the influence of Syriac translation. He chose the Book of Acts for examination. And he was able to make out a case for at least further investigation. He now takes up the Gospels and examines them in the same way. And he makes his case much stronger than before. That at least may safely be

said. But that he has actually won it, cannot be said just yet. Meantime, this is the subject for the student of the New Testament text to investigate. He will find stimulus and much valuable knowledge in Dr. Chase's volume; he may even find conviction and a 'Cause.'

THE DOCTRINE AND PRACTICE OF THE EUCHARIST. BY J. R. MILNE. (*Longmans*. Crown 8vo, pp. vii, 150. 3s. 6d.) There is many a gallant general who could not win a battle. There is many a fertile thinker who cannot write a book. Mr. Milne is one of the freshest thinkers we have met for a time and times, but he is one of the worst writers of English. And it does not make the pity less that he knows it already himself. His subject here is commanding. He has good thoughts upon it, which if gathered by honest men might work much good in the midst of our present unhappy divisions. But it needs more patience to gather the thoughts than the most of men will give.

The question is something like this: Is the Eucharist a sacrifice or is it not? The Protestant (to use the word in its modern and somewhat offensive sense) says that it is not. And there the Protestant is wrong. The Ritualist (to use another offensive word offensively) says it is, and there the Ritualist is right. But when the further question is asked, Who offers the sacrifice in the Eucharist? then the Ritualist goes painfully wrong. For he says that it is himself, that he the priest must offer the Eucharistic sacrifice. But it is Christ that offers it in heaven. So when we sit at the feast it is a sacrificial feast that we enjoy; but the sacrifice is not ours, nor the priest's, it is the sacrifice offered in heaven for us by the great High Priest Himself.

THE BOOK OF JEREMIAH. BY W. H. BENNETT, M.A. (*Hodder & Stoughton*. Crown 8vo, pp. xx, 372.) One of the earliest volumes of the *Expositor's Bible* was 'The Prophecies of Jeremiah,' by Mr. Ball. It carried us only through the first twenty chapters of the book (including an early handling of the 26th), but we thought it was all we should receive. The editor has been better than his profession. He has given us the remainder of Jeremiah, and he has given it through a scholar whose work is always of the finest texture. It certainly would have been a very great weakness

in the series if Jeremiah had been neglected. For there are few books that tell so deeply interesting a story and at the same time yield so much of the richest expository ore. We have not yet got clear of our way of handling prophecy as if like its Lord it were the same yesterday and to-day and for ever. When we reach the perspective in prophecy, Isaiah will retain his place as the 'evangelical' prophet, but Jeremiah will regain his, and be found evangelical also. This scholarly volume is as immediately useful to the preacher as the least scholarly and most homiletical in the series.

THE BOOK OF JEREMIAH IN HEBREW. BY C. H. CORNILL, D.D. THE BOOK OF JOSHUA IN HEBREW. BY W. H. BENNETT, M.A. (*Nutt*. Large 8vo, pp. 80, 5s. net, and 32, 3s. net.) These are the latest issues of Professor Haupt's Hebrew Series. They strikingly differ. The main intention being to print the text in colours so as to show its various sources, Professor Bennett has done that to purpose, but Dr. Cornill has not done it at all. On the other hand, Dr. Cornill's Notes are far fuller than Professor Bennett's. Both writers touch the highest water-mark of the scholarship of to-day. The printing, as before, is a marvel of clearness and beauty.

THE PATHWAY OF LIGHT. BY J. P. LILLEY, M.A. (*Kelly*. Fcap. 8vo, pp. 135.) Mr. Lilley is one of our most conscientious writers. He puts his whole soul into his works. There is no haste to be modern and up to date. There is conscience to be true. The little book will startle no one. If there are 'gentle readers' left, it will do them good. We might call it a study of St. John's First Epistle. And it certainly touches St. John's mood and follows his thought very closely.

LIGHT FROM PLANT LIFE. BY H. GIRLING. (*Fisher Unwin*. Crown 8vo, pp. 178.) Mr. Girling's way is to think of certain broad ideas, religious or ethical, and then make the knowledge we possess of the ways of plants illustrate them. For instance: He is talking of 'Suffering and Trial,' and he says, 'The good both in plants and in men can be perverted into the grossest evils. The grape vine may either serve us by its beauty and fruitfulness, or injure us by its being

made to yield an intoxicating spirit.' So, you see, wine is not a good creature of God; it is not a creature of God at all, and it is not good. And Mr. Girling is no fanatic. He says many most useful things in his own way, and out of the flower in the crannied wall tells us much of what God and man is.

LOGIC AND OTHER NONSENSE. BY J. D. M'CROSSAN. (*Fisher Unwin*. Crown 8vo, pp. 165.) It is the reported conversation of some four or five sane men. A trifle smart perhaps, it is never flippant. The things are graver, indeed, than those our everyday talk turns upon, and thoughts worthy of their gravity are sometimes uttered on them. As for logic, there is no more than in men's ordinary conversation. But that is not to say there is not much, for men are for the most part far more logical when they speak than when they write. They dare not write the logic they are freely allowed to speak.

THE IDEAL HUSBAND. BY LADY JEUNE AND OTHERS. (*H. B. Marshall*. Fcap. 8vo, pp. 141. 1s.) These articles appeared in one of Mr. Atkins' successful monthlies. They are plain-spoken and modern. Whether each of these married ladies has actually described her own husband we cannot tell. But it is certain that that is what as many men would do if they had to write upon the ideal wife.

AROUND A CORN-FIELD. DOWN THE LANE AND BACK. THROUGH THE COPSE. ACROSS THE COMMON. A STROLL IN A MARSH. (*Nelson*. Crown 8vo, pp. 98, 114, 106, 98, 94. 1s. each.) The old proverb that there is no royal road to learning is out of date some time ago. This is the royal road to botany. It is 'child's play' from beginning to end, yet the child that plays at it will get the foundation of a genuine botanical knowledge. How much better this as a gift or a reading-book for our little ones than all the romances in the world!

INTO THE HAVEN. CLIMBING THE HILL. WARNER'S CHASE. BY ANNIE S. SWAN. (*Blackie*. Crown 8vo, pp. 192, 191, 192. 1s. each.) Here are three books containing in all six stories by her who of this particular kind of

story is perhaps the most acceptable writer we have at present. The stories are not new, but their dress is, and their interest will keep them alive for a good many new editions yet.

POOR JACK. BY CAPTAIN MARRYAT.  
FEATS ON THE FIORD. BY HARRIET MARTINEAU. (*Blackie*. Crown 8vo, pp. 245, 208. 1s. 4d. each.) It is surprising that Messrs. Blackie are still able to find books of interest for their School and Home Library. For general everyday reading, for boys' and girls' libraries, for cheap presents and prizes, it is doubtful if we have anything to compete with them.

THE MASTERPIECE LIBRARY. VOL. II. (*Review of Reviews Office*. 6d.) Mr. Stead has recently begun to issue penny editions of the poets, and he is binding four together in a volume. There is no end to the surprises Mr. Stead is waiting to give us. This is the greatest as yet. For the paper, printing, binding, editing, and all else are satisfactory, and the price is next to nothing.

WOMAN'S WORK IN THE HOME. BY F. W. FARRAR, D.D. (*Nisbet*. Fcap. 8vo, pp. 109. 1s. 6d.) The late Professor Blackie, having been offered an attractive book for review, replied that he dabbled in most things, but he drew the line at reviewing. That is the way with the Dean of Canterbury also—except that we dare not use the word 'dabbled,' though he might playfully use it himself. Nay, he writes well on everything, and supremely well on some things, such as Woman's Work in the Home. No other living writer could bring the same wealth of appropriate illustration to bear upon this subject. Perhaps none could altogether write on this subject so humanly and so pleasantly.

HUMILITY THE BEAUTY OF HOLINESS. BY REV. ANDREW MURRAY. (*Nisbet*. Fcap. 8vo, pp. 99. 1s.) This is more than a book, it is a spiritual thermometer. And some of us will find our temperature very low as we make its application. It is a book to let alone and cry Peace, Peace, or to read and cry aloud for the living God.

BIBLE DIAGRAM WITH KEY. BY MRS. ALAN P. SMITH. (Baltimore: *Hoen*. Crown 8vo.) In this Diagram the history of the Bible is presented from the day on which the Decalogue was given by the hand of Moses, till the day on which the Revised Version was issued by the University Presses. And there is a Key of 27 pages, itself a useful handbook to the subject, reliable, and up to date. If the author had only thought of adding a Key to the folding of it! For this is the trouble with Diagrams, that when you have unfolded them they never will go together again.

THE CONDUCT OF PUBLIC MEETINGS. BY J. HUNT COOKE. (*Alexander & Shephard*. Crown 8vo, pp. 64. 1s.) There need be no more incompetent chairmen. For here is the whole duty of man in a chair. But do not let Mr. Cooke find you in it. For all his terrible examples are from the life, and he may write another volume.

RADICAL CRITICISM. BY FRANCIS R. BEATTIE. (Chicago: *Revell*. Crown 8vo, pp. 321.) This is the first complete and popular exposition of the Higher Criticism that has been published, and it is interesting to find that it comes from America. For an American, Professor Beattie will perhaps be reckoned to be with the critics. Yet he is very fair, no advocate but a judge. And he writes with the freedom of knowledge and detachment. We doubt not that his book will have a large circulation, for many are craving to know what this Criticism is and what they are to do with it.

SELECTED FEAST-DAY HYMNS. HYMNS FOR THE ECCLESIASTICAL YEAR. (*Art & Book Co.* 1s. and 3d.) They are Hymns of the Roman Church, so that some would not be sung by you. Yet some are sweet and helpful. In the larger book the Latin is given as well as the English.

JUBILEE OF THE Y.M.C.A. (Exeter Hall. 8vo, pp. xxxvi, 346.) It was a great event, and deserved so great a commemoration as this fine volume. The editor has done his work with signal completeness and reserve. The letterpress is readable and worth reading; the illustrations are in almost every instance successful. It

is a mighty movement, and it is easy to prophesy that it has a mightier future before it.

THE SALT OF THE EARTH. BY PHILIP LAFARGUE. (*Constable*. Crown 8vo, pp. 240. 3s. 6d.) The title is perhaps too strong, too good to use just here. These men are noble enough, but there are nobler I have seen (especially in the use of language), and I am not sure that they

would salt the earth so preservingly. They are worth knowing most assuredly, in a book. They are full of interest, to themselves most of all. They are better a thousand times than the miserable men who do not believe that there is any saltiness in manhood, or any virtue in womanhood. We have had enough of these: this is delightful after.

There are six stories. The first strikes the deepest note.

## The Theology of Malachi.

BY PROFESSOR THE REV. J. T. MARSHALL, M.A., MANCHESTER.

BIBLICAL THEOLOGY is, from its very conception, precluded from detailed critical investigation as to the origin of the several books of Scripture. It borrows from the department known by the unfortunate name of 'higher criticism' its information as to the genuineness, date, and authorship of the separate books; and, with the exegesis well in hand, it endeavours to extract the doctrinal teaching of each book as though *that* was the only portion of Holy Writ that had come down to us. And it does this under a fixed conviction that biblical theology will form a secure basis for biblical dogmatics; that the knowledge of the teaching of each part of Scripture in its entirety will form a far more reliable basis for the unification of biblical doctrine than the usual practice of theologians of culling 'proof texts' from various parts of Scripture, without due regard to their contextual relations.

In many instances it happens that historical-critical introduction has not arrived at results which are undisputed; and in such cases the work of the biblical theologian must be to some extent provisional, for our knowledge of the precise significance of many passages in the non-historical books must depend on the circumstances of the writer's own day.

The Book of Malachi is one of few happy instances in which, side by side with the prophecy, we possess a contemporaneous history in considerable detail. The author of our book certainly belongs to the age of Ezra and Nehemiah; but within this narrow range there is difference of opinion as to the precise date of composition. It is disputed whether the prophecy was written

before the arrival of Ezra in B.C. 458 (Bleek, Reuss, Duhm, Wellhausen), or before the arrival of Nehemiah on his second visit in B.C. 432 or later (Schrader, Köhler, Keil, Orelli, Baudissin, Driver, and most others). The decision of this question is of importance to some pentateuchal theories, and affects slightly the exegesis of some passages in Malachi; but happily it leaves untouched most, if not all, those passages in our author which are of doctrinal import. In my own judgment, the evidence for the later date is overwhelming, the former view resting mainly on presumed exigencies of pentateuchal hypotheses.

Passing over, as a question that does not now concern us, the disputed point as to whether Malachi was the personal name of the author, or whether he wrote anonymously, and the name Malachi = 'My messenger,' or, if an abbreviation of Malachijah = 'messenger of Jah,' was given by a compiler as descriptive of his office, we will briefly narrate the history of the period.

It was in B.C. 458 that Ezra the priest and scribe left Babylon at the head of the second band of colonists, with the law in his hand, and with royal instructions to re-establish divine worship according to the law (Ezra vii. 11-26). One of his first undertakings was to persuade the people to put away their foreign wives: but this stirred up the hatred of their neighbours so as to put a stop to further aggressive work; and before twelve years had passed away, the doleful news was carried to Nehemiah, in the court of Shushan, that the returned exiles were 'in great affliction and reproach,' and the walls still unrepaired. How Nehemiah secured the post of Governor of Judah