

like balm. Did not that soul of which I have written, which loved, which endured, which hoped through the long pain, and gathering shadows of life, did it not lift and strengthen other hearts? Did it not bring benediction?

“Facesti come quei che va di notte,
Che porta il lume dietro, e sè non giova,
Ma dopo sè fa le persone dotte.”

AGNES MACDONELL.

SURVEY OF RECENT LITERATURE ON THE NEW TESTAMENT.

INTRODUCTION.—Even from the Cambridge University Press no more beautiful specimen of the printer's art has ever been issued than *The Witness of Hermas to the Four Gospels*, by C. Taylor, D.D., Master of St. John's College, Cambridge. The form of the book, the paper, the printing and the binding, are as delightful to the eye as a fine picture. Dr. Taylor too has given us such proof of his aptitude for the kind of work here undertaken, that his researches are sure to be eagerly followed and his conclusions scrutinized with expectation. Readers of this present volume, however, must not look for the substantial results and booty of learning they found in the Author's *Sayings of the Jewish Fathers*, and *The Teaching of the Twelve*. Dr. Taylor's aim is to show that in the *Shepherd of Hermas* there is strong and convincing testimony to the Gospels, although that testimony does not lie on the surface. Indeed what first strikes the reader of the *Shepherd* is that it is very surprising the words of our Lord should be so little referred to in a devout Christian work which dates from the last decade of the earlier half of the second century. In the Apostolic Fathers great use is made, if not of the Gospels as we now have them, of the sayings of Jesus, but this Bunyan of the early Church could scarcely have made less allusion to these sayings had he never seen a Gospel. But Dr. Taylor proposes in this volume to show that Hermas “says in effect that the number of the Gospels was actually and necessarily four, as Irenæus said after him; and that Irenæus

was indebted to Hermas in respect of that important and remarkable statement, for which the later writer is always taken to be the independent and original authority." Dr. Taylor also gathers up all the allusions, more or less pronounced, to the substance and language of the Gospels which the *Shepherd* contains; and his book thus becomes a valuable supplement to Lardner, Kirchofer, and other collections of this kind. And the student may at least feel sure that Dr. Taylor has omitted nothing.

Whether he has not included too much and found references where none exist, may reasonably be questioned; and even as regards his main contention, that Hermas anticipates Irenæus in affirming that the Gospels, like the elements, are necessarily four, the evidence he adduces will not be by all accepted as final. The passage on which he founds is that in which the Church appears to Hermas in the form of a lady. At her first appearance she was old and seated on a chair; but in the next vision she was standing as if animated with fresh life; and in the third vision she looked quite young and joyous and was seated on a bench. "For as when to one sorrowing come *good tidings* he straightway forgetteth the former sorrows and giveth heed to nought but the tidings that he heard, and is strengthened thenceforth unto good, and his spirit is renewed through the joy which he received; so ye too have received renewal of your spirits by *seeing these good things*. And whereas thou sawest her seated on a *bench*, the position is a firm one; for the bench has *four feet* and stands firmly; for the world likewise is compacted of *four elements*." The four-footed bench then symbolizes the firm position occupied by the Church as composed of those who, as Hermas goes on to say, are truly penitent and completely renewed. But this firm position has been achieved, according to the tenor of the entire passage, not by the Gospel but by the revelation given to Hermas. If the four feet of the bench then meant anything particular and determinate, they must mean the visions accorded to Hermas and not the four Gospels. But apparently Hermas uses the four-footed bench as a symbol of firmness and security without further asking himself what the four feet symbolized. It is, however, quite possible that Irenæus may have seen and been struck with Hermas' allusion to the four elements; although, after all, it is not in the four elements but in the four quarters of the heavens that Irenæus finds his analogy. And in any case Dr. Taylor

deserves the thanks of all interested in patristic and Biblical studies for the suggestions of his acute and scholarly book.

EXEGESIS.—The most notable contribution to New Testament Exegesis which the present year has yielded is a *Commentary on St. Paul's Epistle to the Ephesians* by the Rev. John Macpherson, M.A., Findhorn (T. & T. Clark). In this very able work Mr. Macpherson shows himself to be a many-sided and thoroughly equipped commentator. He is, perhaps, primarily a theologian, one of that well-bred stock in whose blood run the vitalizing forces of wide and accurate knowledge, clear apprehension of those theological *nuances* which the lights and shadows of centuries of thought have produced, and an inborn and unquenchable thirst for doctrinal discussion. To this there are superadded the tastes and aptitudes of the scholar, and all the attainments and command of various resources to which these aptitudes lead. Wherever help was to be had for the mastery of this Epistle, there Mr. Macpherson has been. Grammatical and lexical aid, critical and exegetical and doctrinal light have been focussed upon it from the most diverse quarters—patristic, puritan, Greek, Latin, Scottish, English. Neither is there any needless obtrusion of other people's opinions for the sake of refuting them, nor any crude and unassimilated material. Rather the book gives one the impression of mature consideration, although at the same time it is absolutely up to date. The *Introduction* is full and instructive. Especially useful is his list of previous works on the Epistle, with brief discriminating characterization of each. Some will question his deliverance on the address of the Epistle, and will think that here he is overconfident; and some may be of opinion that his account of Ephesus might have been both shorter and more telling. Some may still prefer Ellicott, and some Von Soden, but whoever seeks a commentary on this rich Epistle in which due elucidation of the language is furnished by a competent scholar, and guidance into the substance and marrow of the thought is afforded by a ripe theologian, will find satisfaction in Mr. Macpherson's Commentary. [Is there not a discrepancy between page 234 at the top, and page 34 at the bottom?]

Dr. Hutchison, whose excellent volumes on the Epistles to the Thessalonians and Philippians have made him favourably known to Biblical students, has published an interesting study of the miracles recorded in the Gospel of St. John. *Our Lord's Signs in*

St. John's Gospel, by John Hutchison, D.D., Bonnington, Edinburgh (T. & T. Clark). His aim is to furnish his readers with an accurate exegesis and an explanation of the spiritual significance of each of the eight miracles which that evangelist has seen fit to relate. It is recognised by all who read the Fourth Gospel that the miracles of our Lord are in it viewed from a stand-point which somewhat differs from that of the other evangelists. John records them for the sake of their didactic force. He chooses from among the mass of works of healing and beneficence those which have the most direct bearing upon the claims our Lord made, and he leaves us in no doubt as to the lesson he wishes us to read in each. In healing the impotent man Jesus manifests Himself as able to impart life to "whom He would"; in giving sight to the blind He reveals Himself as the Light of the world. In a word, John views the miracles as "signs," as transparencies through which Jesus may be seen as possessed of a power in the spiritual world similar to that which is exhibited, in the miracle, over the physical world. Dr. Hutchison has made it his aim to unfold this significance, and therefore strikes a rich vein of spiritual truth. He has availed himself of the best exegetical helps; he is himself a scholarly and sound exegete, he is sober and balanced in his judgments, and he writes with ease and lucidity, and illustrates his subject with catholic appreciation alike of Mark Twain and Thomas Aquinas. On several points in his exegesis revisal of opinion might be recommended, and his tabular view of the miracles will not prepossess the reader in favour of his insight; but the book as a whole fulfils its purpose; and if any minister is wondering where he can find material for a short course of edifying sermons, this is the book he requires.

BIBLICAL THEOLOGY.—To this department of study an addition of importance has been made by the Rev. R. J. Knowling, M.A., Vice-Principal of King's College, London, in his *Witness of the Epistles, a Study in Modern Criticism* (Longmans, Green & Co.). In this volume Mr. Knowling takes up the argument for the historicity of the Gospels which has been drawn by previous writers from the acknowledged epistles of Paul, and works it out with great detail and with constant reference to every opinion on the subject which has been uttered by modern criticism. For this task he is evidently well equipped by an extensive and minute acquaintance with the most recent works in French and German

criticism. And so full are his references that were his book nothing more than an historical survey or collection of critical opinions, it would have no small value. But it is much more than this. It gives a clear statement of the argument, and of the points at issue in sustaining it; it pushes the argument into greater detail than hitherto has been attempted; it not only gathers before the reader all the material available for forming a judgment, but it judiciously guides him to the just conclusions, and altogether forms an addition of distinct and decided value to Pauline literature. It will be found especially useful by those who have not time or opportunity to make themselves acquainted at first hand with the many critical works which have recently appeared; but even those who are so acquainted will find it convenient to have in this form all the opinions on one important and many-branched theme, and may even find that they have overlooked significant thoughts, and possibly writings, as valuable as those of Paret, Thenius, and Hurant. The only part of the volume which is of doubtful value is the hundred pages devoted to a criticism of Steck and Loman. Such criticism only serves to revive ghosts which may scare, but can do no harm. Gloël's reply was final; and a brief digest of it as one of the finest specimens of modern critical work should have sufficed.

Dr. Wendt's work on *The Teaching of Jesus* was, on its appearance two years ago, at once recognised both in this country and in Germany as an exceptionally successful treatment of an important subject; and Messrs. T. and T. Clark have conferred a very considerable benefit on English readers by furnishing them with a translation worthy of the original. The English edition has been entrusted to the very competent hands of the Rev. John Wilson, M.A., of Montreux, and every page shows that knowledge, skill, and care have been lavished upon it. The original is written with unusual lucidity and force; and the Author must be gratified to find that nothing of these excellencies has been lost in the transference of his thoughts into an English dress. Only one volume has as yet appeared, but the other is promised in some months and will be anxiously expected by all who possess themselves of the first. For Dr. Wendt's exposition of the teaching of Jesus is not only the most comprehensive and systematic that we possess, but it is written with surprising freshness and vivacity, and abounds in striking turns of thought. There are a few points on which

Dr. Wendt's statements will not command universal assent; as when he says that "certainly at the beginning of His career, the necessity of His death had not occurred to Jesus, far less the thought of so early and so dreadful a death." But the trend of the book is decidedly conservative. It is needless to offer any detailed criticism of a book which has been accepted as a standard work by all who are interested in Biblical Theology; but it should be understood that in the preface to his original edition Dr. Wendt expressly says that he endeavoured to throw his material into a form which should make it intelligible to the educated laity. Certainly he has succeeded in doing so, and his lament that the critical part of his work has not been included in the English translation is out of place. The introduction of so large an amount of critical material, however necessary to scholars, would have prevented the book from attaining any circulation among the laity of England. Very cordially do we endorse Dr. Wendt's prayer: "May the loving enthusiasm for this incomparably great and beautiful subject, which has animated me throughout the whole course of my work, be experienced by the reader, and may this book help to contribute somewhat to further on English soil the understanding of the teaching of Jesus." Those who have learned to appreciate the robustness and originality which characterize all the writings of Dr. A. B. Bruce, will not need to be told that his work on *The Kingdom of God*, although not so full as Dr. Wendt's, will not be superseded by it. But with Dr. Wendt's systematic treatment of the entire range of our Lord's teaching, and the true insight into His spirit and meaning which Dr. Bruce gives in his incomparable *Training of the Twelve*, the Biblical student may feel himself well equipped for the understanding of the mind of Jesus.

Messrs. Macmillan & Co. have done a real service to Biblical Theology by producing on this as well as on the other side of the Atlantic *The Soteriology of the New Testament*, by William Porcher Du Bose, M.A., S.T.D., Prof. of Exegesis in the University of the South. The book, although produced in Boston, might have been printed by R. & R. Clark, of Edinburgh, and presents the characteristics which have made Messrs. Macmillan's publications a pleasure to the eye. In the volume now issued the pleasure is not confined to the eye. An unusual treat is provided by Prof. Du Bose for all who find pleasure in original thought expressed in

clear and unaffected English. Few readers perhaps will agree with the writer in all his statements, or even in all his important conclusions, but that reader must be hopelessly impervious to light who does not recognise in these discussions ideas of value which have never before been so clearly set before him. Prof. Du Bose's attitude towards soteriology may be gathered from such a sentence as this: (p. 239) "Our salvation consists *not* in some one's performing a vicarious act or enduring a vicarious penalty which has the effect of a formal and objective satisfaction to the nature, the justice, or the divine government of God for their moral or abstract guilt; *but* it consists in some one's doing, or having done, for us and in us that which will break the power over us of the inherited nature, of the accumulated and consolidated consequences in our nature, which those sins have entailed upon us." Had Prof. Du Bose included both elements in salvation, his soteriology would have been a closer approximation to that of the New Testament. But the one aspect of salvation which he does see, he presents with so much original and profound insight that it seems ungracious to find fault. So too in his handling of the Incarnation, the human nature of our Lord, the Sacraments, he abandons not only the language which theologians have been accustomed to use—this would be readily forgiven—but also some of the conclusions arrived at after controversy and councils. And yet the whole discussion is so reverent, so serious, so thoroughly in the interest of what is real and spiritual in religion, and withal so original and stimulating, that the volume is a distinct and notable gain to theological literature. Prof. Du Bose makes us "ask for more."

MISCELLANEOUS.—That, after all the recent researches into the history of the first Christian centuries, much remains to be done is decisively shown by Mr. Slater's *The Faith and Life of the Early Church*. This title scarcely conveys the right idea of the contents of this important book. It is really a critical history of the Church during the Apostolic and Sub-Apostolic Ages. Mr. Slater is Biblical Tutor in the Wesleyan College at Didsbury, and is not only familiar with the literature in which the Tübingen theory has been expounded and modified, and with the literature in which the weak points of that theory have been exposed, but he also has a first-hand acquaintance with the facts and has sufficient historical aptitude to suggest a theory which better suits the facts

than any of those which have hitherto been promulgated. His theory, briefly, is that the Church Catholic was not the resultant of Ebionitism and Gnosticism, nor of the Petrine and Pauline communities, but was a development of Gentile Christianity. He holds that the Gentile Church, feeling its own strength, gradually excluded from its communion all Judaizing Christians, and branded them as heretics; and, as against Dr. Salmon, he maintains that there was an organic connection between the Judaizers of St. Paul's time and those of the time of Irenæus, and that there was no break in the continuity of that party in the Church from first to last. Probably it is from Ritschl and Harnack Mr. Slater has received suggestions which have ripened into this theory; but whatever has suggested it, its elaboration has given room for much masculine, independent, and learned thinking. Some chapters are slight and have apparently been written for the sake of giving an appearance of completeness to the book. There are also some bad misprints—"pseudo-elements" for "pseudo-Clementines," p. 202; and on p. 174, "in the time of Domitian, A.D. 98." We hope the public, by calling for a second edition, will soon give Mr. Slater an opportunity of effacing such blemishes, for certainly his book takes us nearer to the truth on several points of early Church History than either the Tübingen critics or their opponents have carried us. (The publishers are Messrs. Hodder and Stoughton.)

In *The Progressiveness of Modern Christian Thought*, Mr. James Lindsay, minister of the parish of St. Andrews, Kilmarnock, has executed a supremely difficult and delicate task with marked ability and judgment. His aim has been to define and to justify the advance made during recent years in theology. To accomplish this object in a satisfactory manner calls for so much knowledge of the history of doctrine, so clear a perception of fine distinctions, such trained accuracy in the use of terms, that we might well have despaired of finding any writer who could undertake it. To state with accuracy the altered relations of philosophy and theology, to show the grounds of the different aspect in which miracles are now viewed, to define with precision the amount and character of the fresh light which has in our day been shed upon the Incarnation, the Atonement, Eschatology, and all the chief articles of the Christian faith, is an impossible task to any but a theologian of solid learning, masculine grasp and fine judgment. Mr. Lindsay has proved himself to be such a theologian, and at one step

has placed himself in the front rank. With singular skill he has discriminated spurious progress from progress that is sound and permanent; and while professing and evincing a perfect sympathy with all the main lines of recent advance in theology, he notwithstanding, or therefore, retains a firm hold on all the articles of the Catholic Christian creed. No book has yet appeared so likely to bring the conservative and liberal parties in theology to a common understanding. None has appeared so likely to scatter the fears of those who think that progress in theology means abandonment of ascertained truth, or to abate the presumption of those who hope to advance theological thought by calling in question all that our fathers believed. The only fault which a reader will find with the book is its style. The sentences are intolerably long, more than once all but a page in length, and once at least a full page. They are ponderous as well as long; and although a certain massiveness of style would suit the strength and compactness of the writer's thought, there should be lucidity also to match the perspicuity of the thinking.

Dr. Maclaren, of Manchester, is one of those exceptional men who can afford to print all they utter. He is the happy owner of an inexhaustible fountain of spiritual wisdom, of sound and lucid exposition of Scripture, and of apt and picturesque illustrations. Nothing more likely to be useful has ever been produced by him than the two volumes of his Bible Class Expositions on *The Gospel of St. Matthew*, published by Messrs. Hodder and Stoughton. These expositions are not broken up by critical remarks or minute explanations, but are continuous, and may be read with profit, as they will certainly be read with interest by all. At the same time the *teacher* will find here more to stimulate his own mind, to give him a firm hold of the meaning of the passage, and to suggest suitable thoughts and illustrations than he is likely to get from books more exclusively devoted to his purposes.

The Rev. E. A. Litton, M.A., of Naunton, has issued the second and completing part of his *Introduction to Dogmatic Theology*. It is published by Mr. Elliot Stock. Mr. Litton is a learned and mature theologian. His present work is based upon the Thirty-nine Articles and will certainly be found most helpful to candidates preparing for Holy Orders, or to any studious persons who wish to understand the theological system of the Church of England.

In *The Bridal Song* Mr. James Neil has amplified a part of the Song of Solomon in verse. It is meant to serve as a wedding gift, and is produced accordingly in high art style. The printing is in blue ink and the binding is quite bridal, pale-coloured silk with an embossed design of orange and myrtle in gold. Mr. Neil utilizes his knowledge of the East to furnish some illustrative notes.

We are glad to see that Mr. David Douglas, of Edinburgh, has seen his way to issue in one volume and in a cheap form Dr. Skene's *Gospel History*. Originally delivered as a course of lectures to the senior class in a Sunday school, these lessons on the Life of our Lord were intended to fill up and illustrate the gospel narrative by making use of available knowledge of the views, customs and institutions of the Jewish people. Dr. Skene occupies the position of "Historiographer Royal for Scotland" and the habit of accuracy attained in his ordinary studies has proved helpful in this task. The chronology has evidently been very carefully examined, although it cannot be said that fresh light is thrown upon the obscurities of the narrative. Dr. Skene would have done well to bring his book up to date topographically by availing himself of the identifications made good by the Palestine Exploration. Also, some recognition of the difficulties which recent criticism has started would have won greater acceptance for his book in certain quarters. But after all such deductions, this *Gospel History* remains a volume of great value, giving nearly as much detail as the larger lives of Christ, setting in order and bringing out the significance of the various incidents, while at the same time its cheapness brings it within reach of all.

Of Messrs. Macmillan's re-issue of Dr. Farrar's sermons we have received *Saintly Workers*, a volume containing five Lenten lectures, originally published in 1878, and treating with the author's accustomed picturesqueness and eloquence of the Martyrs, the Hermits, the Monks, the Early Franciscans, the Missionaries. Another old favourite re-appears for the tenth time. It is the volume of sermons preached at Marlborough College between 1871 and 1876. It is entitled *In the Days of Thy Youth*, and contains a great deal of wise council judiciously given, and much that cannot fail to stimulate ingenuous youth. No better volume of the kind can be put into the hands of a boy approaching manhood.—No one knows better the difficulties and needs of those

entering the ministry of the Church of England than the Principal of Ridley Hall. His life and work have for many years lain among men preparing themselves for holy orders, and in a volume addressed *To My Younger Brethren* Mr. Moule gathers up the main thoughts he has uttered in "many a lecture in the library where we work together, and many a conversation in dining hall, or by study fire, or in college garden, or on country road." The characteristic excellence of this volume is its practical treatment of the life and work of the curate. The advice is often homely, and perhaps here and there rather too outspoken; punctuality, smoking, intercourse with young ladies, the investment of money, as well as the making of sermons and the discharge of pastoral work are fully and frankly dealt with.

The winner of the "Le Bas" prize for 1891, Mr. F. W. Thomas, of Trinity College, Cambridge, has published his essay on *The Mutual Influence of Muhammadans and Hindus in Law, Morals, and Religion, during the period of Muhammadan Ascendancy* (Deighton, Bell & Co.). Each new book on India only serves to illustrate what worlds of unexplored life and thought await the inquirer in its "raw, brown, naked humanity," and in its civilization sealed with the heredity of a hundred generations. Even a Rudyard Kipling must feel that he has not yet plucked the heart out of the mystery. Mr. Thomas having drunk deep of Sleeman (why does no reprinting publisher give us a cheap Sleeman?) and of many a more recondite source, is inspired with quite the right feeling for India, and has compiled for less leisurely mortals an excellent manual of information with some strongly thought conclusions. The characteristics of Hinduism and Muhammadanism, their mutual influence in government, law, land tenure, religion, and morality, are traced out with great clearness and in an interesting manner. He does not expect that Christianity will be widely accepted, but he believes that the Bible will exercise a potent influence. "Whatever aspect the religion of India will assume, it will without question be deeply impregnated with Christian ideas, and will appeal at every turn to the character and life of Christ; and one of the greatest achievements of Christianity in the West, that of bringing morality into connection with religion, may be repeated under the relaxing climate, and amid the sensuous influences which mould the peoples of tropical India." Mr. Thomas' book is decidedly one that should be read.

Canon Girdlestone, in his *Doctor Doctorum: The Teacher and the Book* (John F. Shaw & Co.), makes a contribution to one of the burning questions of the day, our Lord's relation to criticism. The spirit of the book is wholly to be commended: it is reverent, and although very convinced and earnest, it is also tolerant. There are also many things in the book which deserved to be said and which are well said. But the thesis it is written to support seems equivalent to Docetism. The Logos is everything, the human nature of our Lord nothing, at least so far as knowledge is concerned. "He knew in one sense what He did not know in another." "The most learned of us may consent to be taught things which we knew long ago," and similarly Christ as man consented to learn what He already knew. "The Lord's authority and infallibility as a Teacher are to be accounted for simply and solely on the ground of His original and inalienable relationship to His Father." In short, Canon Girdlestone leaves no room either for a true humanity or for the work of the Holy Spirit in Jesus. According to this writer the human life is reduced to a mere show, the questions asked by Jesus were never asked for information; His surprise, wonder, and so forth must all be explained in a non-natural sense. The perfectness of Christ's knowledge is maintained at the expense of the reality of the Incarnation.

Too late for fuller notice have reached me the two concluding volumes of the lamented Prof. Hugues Oltramare's *Commentaire sur les Épîtres de S. Paul aux Colossiens, aux Éphésiens, et à Philémon*; a work of such acknowledged excellence that probably the announcement of its completion needs no further comment. The publishing house is the Librairie Fischbacher of Paris.

MARCUS DODS.