
EPWORTH REVIEW

VOLUME TEN/NUMBER TWO

Editorial Panel

Francis C. Godfrey

Henry D. Rack

W. David Stacey (Book Reviews)

John Stacey (Editor)

A. Skevington Wood

Co-opted from the Editorial Sub-Committee of
the Methodist Publishing House

Morna Hooker

Graham Slater

EPWORTH REVIEW is published in
January May and September

© METHODIST PUBLISHING HOUSE 1983

at an annual subscription rate of
£2.25 (which includes postage).

It is available only on subscription
from the Methodist Publishing House.

Wellington Road, Wimbledon, London SW19 8EU.

Printed in Great Britain by Tee & Whiten

Standard House, Bonhill St., London, EC2 4DA

BOOK SECTION

Recent Literature on the Doctrine of the Holy Spirit¹

RICHARD BAUCKHAM

IN 1968, at the end of his life, Karl Barth wrote of 'his dream . . . that someone, and perhaps a whole age, might be allowed to develop a "theology of the Holy Spirit," a "theology which now I can only envisage from afar, as Moses once looked on the promised land".'² It would be claiming far too much to see this dream of Barth's realized in the fourteen years since his death. The scope, complexity and difficulty of a comprehensive pneumatology, which would have to encompass every area of God's relationship with the world, demand a work as ambitious (if not necessarily as extensive) as the *Church Dogmatics* itself. Nevertheless, in retrospect Barth's remark may seem a strikingly prophetic one, for certainly in the period since his death the doctrine of the Holy Spirit has claimed far more theological attention than it did during Barth's career. No Joshua has yet arisen to lead us into Barth's promised land of a whole theology written as theology of the Holy Spirit, but there have been significant explorations of the territory.

These explorations have been as much Roman Catholic as Protestant, and something of a parallel to Barth's dream of a Reformed theology of the Spirit might be found in Pope Paul VI's call for a new theology of the Spirit as a logical consequence of the work of the Second Vatican Council: 'To the Christology and especially to the ecclesiology of the Council there ought to follow a new study, a new cult of the Holy Spirit, precisely as the indispensable complement of the teaching of the Council.'³ In Catholic discussion of the Spirit, the theological consequences of Vatican II and the impact of the Charismatic Movement, which began to penetrate the Roman Catholic Church from 1967, have come together. From the late 60s, the Charismatic Movement has also had some theological effects in Protestant theology. For all these reasons, 1968 — the year of Barth's death and therefore symbolically the end of a theological era — makes a convenient chronological starting-point for this survey.

Biblical Studies

Two eminent New Testament scholars have produced excellent general studies of the Holy Spirit: C. F. D. Moule, *The Holy Spirit* (Oxford: Mowbray, 1978), and E. Schweizer, *The Holy Spirit* (London: SCM Press, 1980). Though primarily expounding the biblical material, both are explicitly concerned with the broad theological questions which arise from this material. Schweizer's book is the more comprehensive and systematic (and includes the Old Testament material on the Spirit, which Moule deliberately excludes from the doctrine of the Holy Spirit as he understands it), while Moule's is valuable especially for chapters on particular issues: 'Inspiration and Incarnation', 'Spirit, Church and Liturgy', 'The Charismatic Question'. J. D. G. Dunn's two books *Baptism in the Holy Spirit* (London: SCM Press, 1970) and *Jesus and the Spirit* (London: SCM Press, 1975) together provide thorough discussion of the Spirit in the Synoptic Gospels, Acts and Paul (other New Testament writings are less adequately treated).⁴ The treatments of the religious experience of Jesus and of Pauline Christianity in *Jesus and the Spirit* are magnificent. Other specialized studies are M. E. Isaacs' work on the Hellenistic Jewish background to New Testament ideas about the Spirit (*The Concept of Spirit*, London: Heythrop College, 1976), and D. J. Lull, *The Spirit in Galatia: Paul's Interpretation of Pneuma as Divine Power* (Chico, California: Scholars Press, 1980), a work which goes on to draw some consequences for modern theology from its exegesis of Galatians.

General Studies

Warren Lewis, *Witnesses to the Spirit* (Valley Forge, Pennsylvania: Judson Press, 1978) is an anthology of writing about the Spirit, from the New Testament Apocrypha to Barth and Vatican II: a useful introduction to the richness of the Christian tradition. P. D. Opsahl ed., *The Holy Spirit in the Life of the Church* (Minneapolis: Augsburg Publishing House, 1978) is a collection of essays by American Lutheran scholars, including valuable surveys of the history of the doctrine, modern theological reflections, and official Lutheran church documents responding to the Charismatic Movement. John V. Taylor's justly famous book *The Go-Between God* (London: SCM Press, 1972) is a theology of the Spirit in relation to the Christian mission, but the exploration of this theme in fact leads to a very comprehensive study, in which Taylor impressively applies his understanding of the Spirit (as the One who creates awareness, relationship, choice, sacrifice, and prophetic insight) to all areas of the Spirit's work. The book has at times a poetic quality and much spiritual wisdom. G. W. H. Lampe's 1976 Bampton Lectures, published as *God as Spirit* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1977), have also been highly praised. As the title suggests, Lampe is not concerned with the Spirit as the Third Person of the Trinity (he argues against the doctrine of the Trinity as an unnecessary theological complication), but with 'Spirit' as a term subsuming all that we can know of God. It is astonishing that so great a patristic scholar could apparently miss the whole point of the Fathers' doctrine of the Trinity. However, the trinitarian question aside, Lampe's work contains much constructive material for a doctrine of the Holy Spirit.

P. J. Rosato has written an appreciative but also very critical study of Barth's pneumatology (*The Spirit as Lord: The Pneumatology of Karl Barth*,

Edinburgh: T. & T. Clark, 1981). His last two chapters of 'Improvisations on Barth's Spirit Theology' constitute wide-ranging proposals for a pneumatology which escapes the christological restriction of Barth's own doctrine of the Spirit. In certain respects, Rosato's thinking coincides with that of J. Moltmann, *The Church in the Power of the Spirit* (London: SCM Press, 1977), who situates the Spirit's work in the Church within the process of God's trinitarian involvement with the history of the world as it moves towards the eschatological Kingdom. Moltmann here provides the pneumatological dimension which was noticeably lacking in his earlier *Theology of Hope*. Some further reflection on the Spirit is found in the context of Moltmann's doctrine of the Trinity in *The Trinity and the Kingdom of God* (London: SCM Press, 1981). Moltmann is one modern theologian who successfully integrates the dynamic and eschatological Spirit of the New Testament into a revitalized doctrine of the Trinity: the Spirit is that Person of the Trinity who opens up the life of God to include the world within it in a history which is open to the eschatological future.

The Spirit outside the Church

The theological potential of the Old Testament concept of the universal presence of the Spirit of God in the natural world has occasionally been realized in recent theological work. Noteworthy are J. V. Taylor's chapter on this subject (op.cit., ch. 3), W. Pannenberg's too brief essay (in *Faith and Reality*, London: Search Press, 1977),⁵ and parts of G. S. Hendry, *Theology of Nature* (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1980). This has almost always been the Cinderella among the various aspects of the doctrine of the Spirit, but is of considerable importance if the redemptive work of the Spirit in the Church is not to be isolated from its total context. It could also be the source of a relevant theological treatment of ecological issues. Both Taylor and Pannenberg emphasize the continuity in the Spirit's work in creation and redemption, but the problems which this emphasis creates in both cases highlight a major issue in the doctrine of the Spirit: how to do justice to the claim that the same one Spirit of God is at work universally *and* to the claim that the Spirit has a special redemptive activity through Christ.

This problem is focused also in Rosato's criticism of Barth's attempt to understand the Spirit consistently christologically, and it also faces those who try to trace the Spirit's activity in non-Christian religions. In this context it is tackled by L. Newbigin, *The Open Secret: sketches for a missionary theology* (London: SPCK, 1978), K. Cragg, *The Christian and Other Religion* (Oxford: Mowbray, 1977), ch. 7, and again by Taylor (op.cit., ch. 9), but once again there is much work to be done in integrating this aspect into a broader theology of the Holy Spirit.

The Spirit and Christ

The activity of the Spirit in the life and ministry of Jesus is a theme which in the past theology has tended to neglect, partly because of the suspicion of an adoptionist Spirit Christology. In recent writing, however, it has been rather thoroughly explored and put to theological use, both by writers who retain a traditional Logos Christology and by those who see a Spirit Christology as a viable alternative approach to Christology.

Dunn's historical study (*Jesus and the Spirit*, chs. II-IV) effectively

vindicates the idea that Jesus must have understood his relation to God in terms of Spirit as well as of sonship, and concludes that we must consider Jesus a charismatic. Taylor's chapter on Jesus (op.cit., ch. 5) is somewhat idiosyncratic, but nevertheless perceptive: he finds the marks of the Spirit's activity which he follows throughout the book all focused in Jesus. Two charismatic writers, the Protestant Tom Smail (*Reflected Glory: The Spirit in Christ and Christians*, London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1975), and the Roman Catholic Heribert Mühlen (*A Charismatic Theology: Initiation in the Spirit*, London: Burns & Oates, 1978), portray Jesus as the 'original charismatic': his relationship to the Spirit is the model and source for the Christian's relationship to the Spirit. As the incarnate Son of God Jesus is unique, but as the man of the Spirit his charismatic experience of God becomes ours. Thus Mühlen denies that the Church is the continuation of the incarnation, but claims that it is 'the historical continuation of Jesus' experience of the Spirit.'⁶ (A similar christological grounding for a charismatic theology was developed in the early nineteenth century by Edward Irving: see C. G. Strachan, *The Pentecostal Theology of Edward Irving*, London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1973.)

Two Roman Catholic writers who go further than this in relating the Spirit to Christology are W. Kasper (*Jesus the Christ* [London: Burns & Oates, 1976] pp. 250-68) and P. J. Rosato (op.cit., ch. VIII). Both wish to set Christology within a broader pneumatological context, while Rosato appears to be advocating a real Spirit Christology in which Jesus' 'divinity' is understood as the presence of the Spirit in him. This approach has been argued especially by G. W. H. Lampe, first in an important essay ('The Holy Spirit and the person of Christ', in S. W. Sykes and J. P. Clayton eds., *Christ, Faith and History*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1972) and then at length in his *God as Spirit*. Lampe rejects the traditional distinction between the immanence of God as Spirit and the incarnation of God in Christ. For him, God's immanence in man as Spirit means that he is always becoming incarnate in his human creatures, and this process culminates in Jesus, the man who is most completely filled with the Spirit.

The adequacy of such an approach is questioned by Moule in a chapter in which he draws a careful distinction between 'Inspiration and Incarnation' (op.cit., ch. V). This distinction is also supported from the point of view of a study of the origins of incarnational Christology by J. D. G. Dunn, *Christology in the Making* (London: SCM Press, 1980), ch. V. Whereas in his earlier work Dunn was inclined towards a spirit Christology,⁷ he now argues that no New Testament writer found a Spirit Christology an adequate account of Jesus. Important as the Spirit is in the New Testament's understanding of Jesus, the primitive Church found it necessary to supplement its use of the idea of Spirit with another christological model: incarnation. A balanced discussion of the advantages and drawbacks of Spirit Christology can be found in O. Hansen's essay, 'Spirit Christology: A Way out of Our Dilemma?' (in Opsahl ed., op.cit., ch. 7).

A very different aspect of the relationship between Christ and the Spirit is the procession of the Spirit within the immanent Trinity. The *Filioque* controversy was the major theological cause of the schism between the Eastern and Western Churches, and as such continues to be extensively debated today. Although some see this controversy as 'one of the most

deplorable chapters in the history of hair-splitting theology',⁸ others relate it to wide-ranging differences between Eastern and Western theology. L. Vischer ed., *Spirit of God, Spirit of Christ: Ecumenical Reflections on the Filioque Controversy* (London: S.P.C.K., 1981), is the product of two consultations of Eastern and Western theologians organized by the Faith and Order Commission of the WCC, and includes the papers presented to and the memorandum drawn up by the consultations. Moltmann's proposals in his essay in that volume also appear in his *The Trinity and the Kingdom of God*, ch. V.

The Spirit in the Church

One of the most important and exciting developments in this area has been the rediscovery of the Pauline understanding of the charismatic structure of the Church, according to which the Spirit is active in the Church not through the channels of institutional offices but through his free distribution of the charismata. One of the fullest expositions of this Pauline view is Dunn, *Jesus and the Spirit*, chs. VIII-X, and major attempts to do it justice in modern ecclesiology are H. Küng, *The Church* (London: Search Press, 1968), ch. C III, and Moltmann, *The Church in the Power of the Spirit*, ch. VI. See also A. Bittlinger, *Gifts and Ministries* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1974).

Pentecostalism and the Charismatic Movement

C. G. Strachan, *The Pentecostal Theology of Edward Irving*, is a very sympathetic study of a much misunderstood precursor of Pentecostalism. The Wesleyan Holiness tradition also belongs to the historical background of modern Pentecostalism, and so it may be appropriate to include here Laurence W. Wood, *Pentecostal Grace* (Wilmore, Kentucky: Francis Asbury, 1980), which is a scholarly and subtle defence of the Wesleyan form of second blessing theology. The standard study of Pentecostalism itself is now W. J. Hollenweger, *The Pentecostals* (London: SCM Press, 1972), which opened the eyes even of Pentecostals to the vitality and diversity of Pentecostalism worldwide. Hollenweger deals with the Pentecostal doctrine of the Spirit along with other aspects of Pentecostal theology, and includes a brief theological assessment.

The literature produced by the Charismatic Movement is vast, but much of it is more devotional or anecdotal than theological. A collection of 104 documents reacting to and assessing the Charismatic Movement, from Roman Catholic, Protestant and Pentecostal Churches throughout the world, is assembled in the three volumes of K. McDonnell ed., *Presence, Power, Praise: Documents on the Charismatic Renewal* (Collegeville, Minnesota: Liturgical Press, 1980). Several collections of essays include important material on various theological aspects of the Movement: M. P. Hamilton ed., *The Charismatic Movement* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans, 1975); S. Tugwell et al., *New Heaven? New Earth? An Encounter with Pentecostalism* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1976); R. P. Spittler ed., *Perspectives on the New Pentecostalism* (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Baker Book House, 1976); E. D. O'Connor ed., *Charismatic Renewal* (London: SPCK, 1978). (The last includes a very comprehensive bibliography of the Roman Catholic Charismatic Renewal up to 1974.)

Insofar as the Charismatic Movement has generated theological reflection

on the doctrine of the Spirit, much of the best work has been Roman Catholic. Some Catholic theologians have been led by the charismatic experience in the direction of a detailed theology of Christian experience. Significant Catholic charismatic works include Cardinal L. J. Suenens, *A New Pentecost?* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1975); S. Tugwell, *Did you receive the Spirit?* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1972); R. Laurentin, *Catholic Pentecostalism* (London: Darton, Longman & Todd, 1977); D. Dorr, *Remove the Heart of Stone: Charismatic Renewal and the Experience of Grace* (Dublin: Gill & Macmillan, 1978); D. L. Gelpi, *Charism and Sacrament: A Theology of Christian Conversion* (London: SPCK, 1977). Unfortunately, Heribert Mühlen's more important books on the Spirit have not been translated into English, but his *A Charismatic Theology* is available. It is designed as a course of practical instruction and meditation, especially for use in small groups like the inter-denominational charismatic groups for which the material was first prepared, but it has a solid theological basis and content. A rare example of a Protestant attempt to provide the charismatic experience with a serious charismatic theology is T. A. Smail, *Reflected Glory*.

A theological assessment of the Movement from a WCC perspective is provided by Rex Davies, *Locusts and Wild Honey: The charismatic renewal and the ecumenical movement* (Geneva: WCC, 1978). K. McDonnell, *Charismatic Renewal and the Churches* (New York: Seabury Press, 1976) provides an interdisciplinary approach, from the perspectives of sociology, social anthropology and psychology, as well as theology, and includes detailed reports of a great deal of research by others, especially on glossolalia.

The most theologically controversial aspect of Pentecostalism and the Charismatic Movement has been the doctrine of baptism in the Spirit. F. D. Bruner's misleadingly entitled *A Theology of the Holy Spirit* (London: Hodder & Stoughton, 1971) is really an examination of this doctrine in Pentecostalism and a study of the New Testament evidence leading to a very negative verdict on Pentecostalism. James Dunn, *Baptism in the Holy Spirit*, is a thorough New Testament study which concedes the Pentecostalist case to the extent that Dunn shows that in the New Testament baptism in the Spirit is a definite experience and is not equivalent to baptism in water, but also destroys the Pentecostalist case by demonstrating that in the New Testament baptism in the Spirit is not a second experience after conversion but an essential element in Christian conversion-initiation. Many of the works from the Charismatic Movement mentioned above have had to come to terms with Dunn's exegetical case, as well as (in the case of Roman Catholic writers) with the fact that the Pentecostalist doctrine of baptism in the Spirit was not easily reconcilable with a Catholic understanding of the sacrament of baptism. As a result, the doctrine has in many cases been modified or qualified.

Finally, among specialized studies of particular gifts of the Spirit, C. G. Williams, *Tongues of the Spirit: A Study of Pentecostal Glossolalia and Related Phenomena* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1981) is the latest and fullest study of glossolalia, while two books on the gift of prophecy concentrate on the New Testament but also include reflection on prophecy today: J. Panagopoulos ed., *Prophetic Vocation in the New Testament and*

Today (Supplements to Novum Testamentum 45; Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1977), and D. Hill, *New Testament Prophecy* (London: Marshall, Morgan & Scott, 1979).

Notes

- 1 This survey is limited to books in English: it does not include journal articles or works in foreign languages.
- 2 E. Busch, *Karl Barth: His Life from Letters and Autobiographical texts* (London: SCM Press, 1976), p. 494.
- 3 Quoted in K. McDonnell, 'The Determinative Doctrine of the Holy Spirit', *Theology Today* 39 (1982), p. 146.
- 4 See also J. D. G. Dunn, *Unity and Diversity in the New Testament* (London: SCM Press, 1977), ch. IX.
- 5 For Pannenberg's doctrine of the Spirit, see also *Jesus — God and Man* (London: SCM Press, 1968), pp. 169-79; *The Apostles' Creed: In the Light of Today's Questions* (London: SCM Press, 1972), pp. 128-43.
- 6 Mühlen, *op.cit.*, p. 117.
- 7 See *Jesus and the Spirit*, p. 92.
- 8 Moule, *op.cit.*, p. 47.