

of all types in metropolitan areas. But there is no easy and comprehensive solution of the problem.

In churches other than Roman Catholic there is indeed a feeling of change – albeit gradual – while in the Roman Catholic church change has been forced simply by the shift to the vernacular, with all the attendant problems. Again Father Sheehan has the right words to describe our position:

[Josquin's *Missa Pange Lingua*] ... reminds us that musically and artistically we are perhaps a culturally deprived and disinherited church, since English in the liturgy and liturgical reform have deprived us of our great Christian heritage of art and beauty. It challenges us ... to remember that we must, like Josquin des Prés and the anonymous monks who created our plainsong, fashion an art which serves and enhances our liturgy and directs us to the same divine persons who inspired those who have gone before us.¹⁷

If we cannot rise to the challenge, let us hear also what Monsignor Wagner says: '... The liturgy, in last analysis, is not dependent on the service of the arts ... it can function without them ... it can even dispense with them.'¹⁸

17. *Ibid.*

18. Wagner, 'Liturgical Art and the Care of Souls,' p. 59.

3 ULRICH S. LEUPOLD

*Worship Music in Ancient Israel: Its Meaning and Purpose**

There has never been any dearth of books on music in the Bible.¹ In spite of the fact that we know little or nothing of the actual music sung by Israel of old, the subject has elicited a considerable body of literature. In contrast, the theology of music in the Bible has received very little attention. And yet the Bible offers more information on the meaning and purpose of music than on its actual form. The present study is an attempt to open up this subject by dealing with the 'why' and 'what for' of worship music in ancient Israel from its beginnings to New Testament times.

In order to understand the meaning of music in pre- or non-western cultures, one must free oneself from two modern assumptions about the role of music. Our age takes it for granted (firstly) that music is made to be *heard* and (secondly) that it serves to express and to inspire *feelings*. Both of these

*This paper was the presidential address at the 1967 meeting of the Canadian Society of Biblical Studies in Montreal and has appeared in an abbreviated form in *Response*, 9 (1968), 116–24.

1. The most recent bibliography is in Eric Werner's article 'Music' in *Interpreter's Dictionary of the Bible*, III, 469.

assumptions are more of a hindrance than a help for understanding the meaning of music in antiquity. Of course, music has always been the art of the ear, and it has always served as a vehicle of feelings. But pre-western cultures regarded it under a much wider scope. They considered it a superhuman force which, though man might utilize it, had effects far beyond the interpersonal sphere.

Animism saw music as a magical power that could be made to influence cosmic powers, the stars and the weather, life and death. Especially could it be used to call or to ward off the spirits.² For example, wailing and noise-making at funerals served, not only the expression of grief, but also the crudely utilitarian purpose of exorcising the spirits of the dead. The biblical custom of playing woodwind instruments (Jer. 48:36; Mt. 9:23) and singing dirges (2 Sam. 1:19–27; 3:31–4) at death, is in keeping with such universal primitive funeral customs.³ But, significantly enough, in our sources this custom seems to have lost its religious connotation. The dirges make no reference to Yahweh. (The case is different in a literary adaptation of the dirge, such as Lamentation or Isa. 14). The animistic understanding of music shines through our sources, but it clearly does not determine the meaning of music which they imply.

At a higher stage of cultural development music came to be seen as a *divine* power. Originally it had belonged to the gods. Now it had become their gift to mankind, still remaining under their protection, or more specifically, under the protection of a god or goddess of music. The Babylonians had a goddess, Bau, pictured with a lyre. The heavenly assembly included musicians. And in the epic *Enuma Elis* the gods praise Marduk's work of creation with a hymn.⁴

This concept of music as a heavenly power is widely reflected in the Bible, yet with significant modifications. To be sure, the ancient idea of heavenly ceremonial included the praise of God by angelic choirs and indeed by all of creation (Ps. 89:5–7; 103:21; 148:2–4). Isaiah heard the glory of the Lord reflected in the hymns of the seraphim (6:4). Yet there is notable restraint in these descriptions. Both the Old and New Testament avoid giving the angelic choirs any kind of normative significance for human affairs. They constitute no more than an 'auxiliary concept for depicting the exalted state of Yahweh.'⁵

Furthermore, the Bible does not know a god of music. To be sure, Yahweh

2. The bells on the priests' garments may also reflect apotropaic purposes. Cf. Peter Gradenwitz, *The Music of Israel* (New York: Norton, 1959), p. 30; Eric Werner, *IDB* III, 458.

3. Cf. Joh. Weiss, *Die musikalischen Instrumente in den Hl. Schriften des Alten Testaments* (Graz: Leuschner & Lubensky, 1895), p. 837.

4. Cf. Alfred Jeremias, *Handbuch der altorientalischen Geisteskultur* (Berlin: W. de Gruyter, 1929), pp. 82f.; A. Jirku, *Altorientalischer Kommentar zum Alten Testament* (Leipzig: A. Deichert, 1923), p. 37.

5. W. Eichrodt, *Theologie des Alten Testaments*. (Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs, 1933–6), vol. II, p. 106.

is not unmusical. He has ears and can hear (Ps. 10:17; 17:6). He has a majestic voice (Isa. 30:30; Ps. 29:4), and he sings (Jer. 25:30). His appearance is accompanied by the sound of the horn. Occasionally it is even said that he himself sounds the trumpet (Zech. 9:14). Yet the horn does not become his attribute, in the sense that the lyre was that of Apollo.

Myths about the heavenly origin of music, which are so frequent in other cultures, are lacking in the Bible. Jubal's invention of the lyre and pipe (Gen. 4:21) is told as a purely secular event.⁶ A late Jewish legend claims that the angels, on leaving Paradise after the fall, were so sad that they broke their instruments. Jubal picked up the pieces and put them together again. But the implication of this story – that music as such is a heavenly power – goes beyond the terms of the Old Testament. Here music as such bears no divine character. Only one kind of music – worship music – is related to Yahweh, and we must seek to determine the nature of this relationship. Our question is: what is the purpose of music in the worship of Yahweh?

It has often been claimed that the principal purpose of music in biblical worship is that of serving as a vehicle for the word. The description of music as a handmaiden of the word is a virtual dogma among liturgiologists. However, while this approach has some merit, it fails to do justice to all the evidence. The fact alone that dances, dance music, and percussion instruments play such a significant role in Israel's worship ought to warn us against basing our theories principally on vocal and verbal music.

The theory that music served as a vehicle for words establishes a merely utilitarian connection between music and worship. Music is simply a technique for uttering sacred words. But it can be shown that the exercise of music had a far more direct and intrinsic relation to worship. For the very act of playing, singing, or dancing before another was regarded as an act of submission or obeisance. The inferior played, sang, or danced before the superior. A study of this phenomenon in social relations will lead us to understand its importance for the role of music in worship.

It has often been noted that music in Israel was performed mainly by women.⁷ This was not music of erotically suggestive character, as in Egypt and later on also in Jerusalem (Isa. 23:16). But political music, in the form of victory or taunting songs, was sung by women. Victorious generals, such as Jephtha, Saul, or David, were being welcomed with dances, drums, and songs by the women. Two women, Miriam and Deborah, are credited with two of the oldest paeans of victory.

Perhaps this custom, which has its parallels among modern Bedouins, reflects the social status of women.⁸ 'To bear a man's name and to increase

6. Alfred Jeremias, *Das Alte Testament im Lichte des alten Orients* (Leipzig: J. C. Hinrichs, 1930), p. 796.

7. Cf. Gradenwitz, *Music of Israel*, p. 27; Werner, *IDB*, III, 457; L. R. Wiley, *Bible Music* (New York: Paebar, 1945), p. 146.

8. Joh. Pedersen, *Israel, its Life and Culture* (London: Oxford University Press, 1926–40), vol. I, p. 231; Gradenwitz, *Music of Israel*, pp. 27f. Cf. also Judith 16:2–17.

it is the honour of the woman.' This she does as much by dance and music in his honour as by giving him a family.⁹ For, to make music for another is an act of submission, an act which acknowledges and thereby enlarges his honour.

This is also true where men are the performers. Laban reproached Jacob because the latter had not allowed his father-in-law to honour him with a farewell dance (Gen. 31:27). Samson was forced to honour the Philistines by dancing and playing before them (Jud. 16:25). The verb *tsaheq* in this passage, is the same as the one used for the dance of the Israelites around the Golden Calf (Ex. 32:6). The ultimate humiliation of the deportees in Babylon consisted in the demand to entertain their captors with music (Ps. 137:3).¹⁰

In this context it may be significant that the invention of music is credited to a member of the Kenite guest tribe. In nomadic cultures, musicians together with smithies and other artisans form a pariah caste. Nor is it unlikely that a direct line connects the Kenite-Midianite tradition, the *nebiim*, and the Levites. All of these, in one way or another, formed a lower caste at the fringe of society. And all of them were involved in music-making.¹¹

In all of these cases, music-making constituted an act of worship in the widest sense of the word. The inferior acknowledged the honour of the superior, and thereby he both increased it and shared in it. It is therefore not surprising that music-making assumed a corresponding role in the worship of Yahweh.¹² Dancing could be used to honour, not only one's earthly superiors, but also Yahweh.

The victory dances of Miriam and Deborah celebrated (as the accompanying hymns show) not so much the earthly generals as Yahweh the supreme war lord. Indeed it seems that ecstatic dances belonged to original Yahwism. (David's dance before the ark probably reflected these desert traditions and therefore offended his city-bred wife [2 Sam. 6:14, 20].) Accordingly, worship in the Jerusalem temple retained dancing and processions also in later times.¹³ At the feast of Tabernacles, the worshippers sang and danced around the altar with instrumental music by the Levites.¹⁴ It is hardly accidental that cymbals (*metsiltajim*: Neh. 12:27; 1 Chr. 15:19; 25:6; 2 Chr. 5:12) played an important part in the temple orchestra.

The role of vocal music in worship is not essentially different from that of dance music. The Hebrew word for 'hymn' (*tehillah*) comes from the root *halal*, 'to shine,' or (in the *piel*) 'to make shine.' The essence of *tehillah* therefore consists in the fact that it adds splendour to the object of its praise. As

9. Cf. Pedersen, *Israel*, vol. 1, p. 232.

10. According to an Assyrian bas-relief, the tribute which Sennacherib exacted from Hezekiah consisted partly in Jewish musicians, male and female (Werner, *IDB*, III, 459).

11. Cf. H. Ringgren, *Israelite Religion* (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1966), p. 216; H. Schmökel, 'Die jahwe-treuen Orden von Israel,' *Theologische Blätter*, 12 (1933), 327ff.

12. Cf. Hubert Junker, *Prophet und Seher in Israel* (Trier: Paulinus-Verlag, 1927), pp. 25 ff.

13. Cf. Ringgren, *Israelite Religion*, pp. 178f.

14. The original meaning of the word *Pesah* may be 'hopping' or 'limping'; cf. H. J. Kraus, *Worship in Israel* (Richmond: John Knox Press, 1955), p. 45.

such, *tehillah* is intimately related to *kabod*.¹⁵ The *tehillah* reflects the *kabod* of the one being praised and at the same time serves to increase it. This implies that the honour of a person depends on his esteem by others, on the praise they will render to him.¹⁶ *Tehillah* can therefore be used synonymously with *kabod*. The *tehillah* of Moab (Jer. 48:2), of Babylon (Jer. 51:41), or of Israel (61:3.11; Zeph. 3:19f.) is their renown, their *kabod*. And *vice versa* the deepest humiliation of a person consists in his becoming the object of a taunting song by his enemies (Job 30:9; Ps. 69:12; Lament. 3:14.62; Mt. 27:40, 42f. par.).

Here then lies the rationale for the hymn of praise to Yahweh. In a sense he himself is its author. He demands the *tehillah*. He needs it in order to maintain and make public his *kabod*. It is a reflection of his *kabod*. The song of praise is part and parcel of his epiphany.¹⁷ 'God has the honour within himself, but through his hymns of praise man *renders* him honour, strengthens and increases it' (Ps. 29:1; 96:7).¹⁸ The praise of the angels belongs therefore as necessarily to Yahweh's *kabod* as does the brightness of his light.¹⁹ And it is characteristic that some of the psalms consist largely if not entirely (Ps. 149 and 150) of the admonition to sing and play for Yahweh. Evidently the psalmists consider this 'joyful noise' itself a perfectly valid expression of Yahweh's *kabod*. To them music in itself is a demonstration of his glory (2 Cor. 4:15; Col. 1:12). For sacred music in the Bible has a definitely joyful character. The line from the Epistle of James (5:13), 'Is any ... suffering? Let him pray. Is any cheerful? Let him sing praise,' fits the whole Bible.²⁰ Singing and playing of instruments are mentioned time and again in the hymns of praise and thanksgiving, but never in the laments.²¹ This is not to imply that the latter were spoken. Poetry recited was unknown in antiquity. But it indicates the religious meaning of music itself in the hymns of praise and thanksgiving.

When we turn from an analysis of Israel's cult, and of the role of music in it, to the attitude towards music and the cult on the part of the prophets, we seem to get a very different picture. For the great prophets of the old covenant have often been portrayed as advocates of a purely subjective, anti-cultic reli-

15. Cf. Joh. Schneider, *Doxa* (Gütersloh: Bertelsmann, 1932), p. 41; L. H. Köhler, *Theologie des Alten Testaments* (Tübingen: Mohr, 1936), p. 110; Pedersen, *Israel*, vol. I, pp. 235, 249f.

16. The typical situation in classical drama where the hero can maintain his honour in spite of the world's calumny, is nonsensical from the Old Testament viewpoint.

17. Cf. G. Bornkamm, 'Lobpreis, Bekenntnis und Opfer,' in *Aphorreta: Festschrift für E. Haenchen* (Berlin: Töpelmann, 1964), p. 47.

18. Pedersen, *Israel*, vol. I, p. 235; cf. G. Harder, *Paulus und das Gebet* (Gütersloh: Bertelsmann, 1936), pp. 132, 204; Schneider, *Doxa*, p. 63.

19. Cf. Martin Dibelius, *Die Geisterwelt im Glauben des Apostel Paulus* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1909), p. 185.

20. Cf. E. Kautzsch, *Biblische Theologie des Alten Testaments* (Tübingen: Mohr, 1911), p. 160; Werner, *IDB*, III, 457.

21. Ps. 42:8 is the only exception; but the present text seems to be corrupt.

gion that would denounce the temple and all its works. Amos' words, 'Take away from me the noise of your sings; to the melody of your harps I will not listen' (5:23; cf. Is. 1:15) have been taken as a summary rejection of sacred music in the name of inward religion.

But in actual fact this saying, and others similar to it, do not disprove the importance of cultic music, as we established it earlier. The fact that Yahweh rejects the music of a rebellious people serves only to confirm his acceptance of the same from an obedient congregation. He does not refuse music as such, but only on the part of his unfaithful people. In other words, the condemnation of worship music belongs in the context of the prophecy of doom. In these prophecies, the end of music forms a constant feature (Hos. 9:1; Is. 24:8; Jer. 48:33; Ez. 7:7). Music has been an integral part of the people's life, a reflection of Yahweh's presence in their midst. But where God executes judgment, there 'the old men quit the city gate, the young men their music ... our dancing has been turned to mourning' (Lam. 5:14-15). The only difference between the message of Amos and that of other prophets is that, while he speaks of present condemnation, they speak of future judgment. And this alternation between warnings and predictions is after all characteristic of all prophets.²² Angry warnings go always hand in hand with dismal predictions of the End. And not everything the prophets had to say on music was on the negative side. Prophecies of doom were balanced by hopeful predictions of salvation. And in the latter, music played a vital role.

Jeremiah (31:4), anticipating another redemption of Israel, said: 'Again I will build you ... Again you shall adorn yourself with timbrels and shall go forth in the dance of the merrymakers' (cf. Isa. 12:4 ff; 30:29). Deutero-Isaiah (42:10) coined the word for this hope: *shir hādāsh*, the song that will renew Miriam's exodus jubilus.²³ And Trito-Isaiah envisioned the temple music restored with even the heathen to join in it (56:7; 60:6). If judgment implied the end of music, salvation must necessarily involve its restoration.

When at last the exiles were able to return to Jerusalem and to restore the temple with its cult, they felt that this and other prophecies were being fulfilled.²⁴ Accordingly, the psalms of the second temple call on the worshipper to join in the New Song for Yahweh (cf. Ps. 33:3; 40:3; 96:1; 98:1; 144:9). A mood of 'realized eschatology' pervades these psalms. The music of the second temple sought to fulfil and surpass the ancient office of praise. The Chronicler, with his long lists of levitical singers and musicians, documents the high esteem in which the music of the cult was held. As P credits the

22. Cf. Köhler, *Theologie*, pp. 212, 214; Hugo Gressmann, *Der Messias* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1929), pp. 88ff.; Hans Schmidt, *Die grossen Propheten* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1915), pp. lxiv ff.

23. Cf. J. Behm, in *Theologisches Wörterbuch zum Neuen Testament*, III, 451; for a different view cf. Werner (*IDB*, III, 463), who takes the term 'new song' in the sense of 'newly composed.'

24. Cf. Eichrodt, *Theologie*, vol. I, p. 263.

artistry of the artisans who built the tabernacle and its furniture, to the Holy Spirit (Ex. 31:1-5; 35:30-34), so the Books of Chronicles view the levitical music of the temple as a gift of the Spirit.²⁵ The singers are called *nebiim* (1 Chr. 1:3) or *hozanim* (1 Chr. 25:5; 2 Chr. 35:15), while their office is characterized as *nibba'* (1 Chr. 25:1-3).²⁶

While the prominence of music in the context of temple worship is beyond question, its role in the synagogue service is much less clear. Doubtlessly prayers, benedictions, and lessons were chanted. Rabbinic tradition demanded Scripture to be chanted, not read.²⁷ The ecphonetic signs of the Masoretes served this purpose. There is evidence for the psalms having been sung in the synagogue.²⁸ Levitical singers from the temple are reported to have assisted in the Jerusalem synagogue.²⁹ Elsewhere a precentor may have taken their place.³⁰ The congregation responded with Alleluia or another acclamation.³¹ Finally, new hymns or psalms seem to have been in use.³² The Apocrypha (e.g., Song of the Three Young Men, Sir. 51; Jud. 16; Tob. 13), Psendepigrapha (e.g., syr. Bar. 48. 54; Psalms of Sol.; Syb.), and Dead Sea Scrolls (Hodayot) contain as many poetical portions as the canonical books of the Old Testament, or even more. Admittedly it is difficult from the text alone to draw sharp lines between prayers, benedictions, doxologies, and hymns proper.³³ All of these use the poetic structures and idioms of the canonical psalms, *parallelismus membrorum*, and frequently also the rime.³⁴ But it is unlikely that the *Sitz im Leben* for any of them was anywhere other than in the worship of the synagogue.³⁵ The responsorial and antiphonal singing of the

25. Cf. Ed. König, *Theologie des Alten Testaments* (Stuttgart: C. Belser, 1932), p. 186; Paul Volz, *Der Geist Gottes ... im Alien Testament* (Tübingen: Mohr, 1910), 85; Eichrodt, *Theologie*, vol. II, p. 29; Aubrey R. Johnson, *The Cultic Prophet in Ancient Israel* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 1962), pp. 69ff.

26. Cf. S. Mowinckel, *Psalmstudien*, reprint ed. (Amsterdam: P. Schipper, 1961), vol. III, p. 26; H. Gressmann, *Musik und Musikinstrumente im Alten Testament* (Giessen: J. Ricker, 1903), 14; Imm. Benzinger, *Hebräische Archäologie* (Leipzig: E. Pfeiffer, 1927), p. 252; Volz, *Geist*, p. 137; Otto Eissfeldt, *Einleitung in das Alte Testament* (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1934), pp. 123, 126f.

27. Cf. Eric Werner, *The Sacred Bridge* (London: Dobson, 1959), pp. 103, 110.

28. Cf. Eric Werner, 'The Doxology in Synagogue and Church,' *Hebrew Union College Annual*, 19 (1945-6), 325.

29. Cf. Egon Wellesz, *Ancient and Oriental Music* (London: Oxford University Press, 1947), p. 302; W. O. E. Oesterley, *The Psalms in the Jewish Church* (London: Skeffington, 1910), pp. 147f., 151.

30. Cf. Egon Wellesz, *A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1961), p. 35.

31. Cf. Wellesz, *Ancient and Oriental Music*, p. 302; Oesterley, *Psalms*, pp. 120ff., 130ff., 143, 149.

32. Cf. G. Margoliouth, 'Hymns (Hebrew-Jewish),' in *Encyclopedia of Religion and Ethics*, VII, 44; Egon Wellesz, *Ancient and Oriental Music*, p. 301.

33. Cf. Eric Werner, 'The Doxology in Synagogue and Church,' 275ff. *passim*.

34. Cf. Karl Georg Kuhn, *Achtzehngebet und Vaterunser und der Reim* (Tübingen: J. C. B. Mohr, 1950), pp. 6ff.

35. Cf. W. O. E. Oesterley and G. H. Box, *The Religion and Worship of the Syna-*

Therapeutes, mentioned by Philo, is probably illustrative of musical practices in Qumran and elsewhere in Judaism.

But, on the whole, Judaism failed to maintain that sensitive appreciation of the religious meaning of music which the Old Testament documents. *Orthodox* mainstream Judaism, while it continued to employ music as a vehicle of prayer and praise, was too much concerned with midrashic niceties and practical questions of *torah* morality to appreciate the unique significance of song. The spirit of prophecy was believed to be extinct, and the fulfillment of the ancient promise of a 'New Song' moved again into the distant future.³⁶ The rabbis speculated on the question of whose merit it would be by which Israel would be enabled to sing the New Song.³⁷ Some cited the merit of Abraham, others the eventual victory of the Messiah. But all agreed that it would be sung only once – on the Last Day and in honour of the Messiah. Clearly the high enthusiasm of the returnees from Babylon had faded.

Sectarian and Hellenistic Judaism, on the other hand, was led to a highly speculative and mystical understanding of the role of music. In the thinking of apocalyptic Judaism, the music of the angels gained new prominence.³⁸ Of course, the heavenly assembly and its liturgy of praise had always been part of the biblical cosmology. But under the influence of Greek, Babylonian, and Persian ideas, angelology received increased attention. Since the angels were identified with stars, their music could be connected with the so-called 'harmony of the spheres,' supposedly produced by the planets, and thereby with the numerical proportions that related the courses of the stars to the seasons, the points of the compass, the elements, the temperaments, the ages of man, the colours, and, last but not least, to the intervals of the musical scale, to the eight modes and the musical instruments.³⁹ From here it was only a short step to the idea of angelical languages. Supposedly every sphere of the heavens had its own language, spoken by the angels and revealed to rare individuals in mysterious visions. The seer of apocalyptic vision felt himself transported into

gogue (London: Pitman, 1911), 38; Svend Holm-Nielsen, *Hodayot* (Aarhus: Universitetsforlaget, 1960), pp. 341, 343, 344f.

36. Cf. H. Gunkel, *Die Wirkungen des heiligen Geistes* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1888), p. 55; Volz, *Geist*, pp. 141ff.; Bousset-Gressmann, *Die Religion des Judentums* (Tübingen: Mohr, 1926), p. 394.

37. Cf. H. L. Strack and P. Billerback, *Kommentar zum Neuen Testament aus Talmud und Midrasch* (München: Beck, 1922–28), vol. I, p. 8; vol. III, pp. 200, 801.

38. Cf. D. S. Russell, *The Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic* (London: SCM Press, 1964), pp. 47, 237, 240f.

39. Cf. Jules Combarieu, *La musique et la magie* (Paris: A. Picard, 1909), pp. 189ff.; Robert Lachmann, *Musik des Orients* (Breslau: Quelle & Meyer, 1929), pp. 14ff., 97; C. Sachs, *Vergleichende Musikwissenschaft* (Heidelberg: Quelle & Meyer, 1959), pp. 65ff.; Alfred Jeremias, *Handbuch der altorientalischen Geisteskultur*, vol. II (Berlin: W. de Gruyter, 1929), pp. 182ff.; E. M. von Hornbostel, 'Die Massnorm,' in W. Koppers, ed., *Festschrift für P. W. Schmidt* (Vienna: Mechitaristen-Congregations-Buchdruckerei, 1928), pp. 304ff.; Eric Werner, 'Musical Aspects of the Dead Sea Scrolls,' *Musical Quarterly*, 43 (1957), 21–37; D. S. Russell, *Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic*, pp. 194–202; Eric Werner, 'The Doxology in Synagogue and Church,' 326.

these angelic spheres. His soul journeyed into heaven. And here he joined the angels in ecstatic song (1 Enoch 14:8; 71:1; Apoc. Abr. 17; Asc. Is. 8:17; Sib. III, 295, 489; v, 263). The words of his song belonged to the angelic language, mysteriously revealed to him, but unknown and unintelligible to other mortals. (1 En. 40; cf. 2 Cor. 12:4).⁴⁰

So prophetic inspiration survived in the circles of the apocalyptists (even though they hid their identity under the names of ancient worthies). But it no longer benefited the actual music of the worshipping congregation. The seer alone could repeat the tongues of angels in detached unintelligible syllables. Or else he might even condemn himself to maintain sacred silence in the presence of God.

The latter option was chosen by Hellenistic Judaism, especially where the influence of Greek philosophy made itself felt. Here a spiritualized concept of God and of worship led to the idea that audible music was unworthy of the deity.⁴¹ The true *pneumatic* would express his inspiration in inaudible hymns. According to Philo, the mystic, uniting with God, participates in the music of the spheres. However, it is not his created voice that is singing, but the invisible *nous* which has purified itself of everything earthly. God alone can hear this music.⁴²

Other passages do not go quite so far, and are content with allegorizing musical instruments so that, for example, the soul becomes a 'well attuned lyre' (Philo) or 'the flute of the lips' is summoned to praise the Lord (1QS X, 9). But they too serve to tone down and spiritualize the Old Testament picture of merry music-making. Unfortunately the church fathers were only too willing to follow Hellenistic Judaism on this path of allegorizing every Old Testament reference to musical instruments.

The meaning of music in the Early Church was determined by a two-fold conviction – namely, by the belief that the End had come, and by the experience of the Spirit operative again in the believers. Realized eschatology led to a notable emphasis on song. For song was accepted as a regular feature of the time of salvation. The Palm Sunday crowds, with their Hosannahs, expressed the faith that the Messiah had come and with him the time for the New Song. When the Jewish leaders remonstrated against the Hosannas of the children (Mt. 21:15f.), Jesus pointed them to Psalms 8:2. This psalm was understood as messianic prophecy, and the chant from the mouths of babes was an accepted feature of eschatological fulfillment.⁴³ As a singing congregation, the

40. Cf. Russell, *Method and Message of Jewish Apocalyptic*, pp. 166f.

41. Cf. J. Quasten, *Musik und Gesang* (Münster: Aschendorf, 1930), pp. 12f., 16f.; 18f.

42. Cf. Quasten, *Musik und Gesang*, p. 18; G. Harder, *Paulus und das Gebet* (Gütersloh: C. Bertelsmann, 1936), p. 60; H. Abert, *Die Musikanschauung des Mittelalters* (Halle: M. Niemeyer, 1905), pp. 37ff.; E. R. Goodenough, *By Light, Light* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1935), pp. 117, 213.

43. Cf. Harder, *Gebet*, pp. 86ff., 203. For a similar concept in the ancient Orient, cf. J. Jeremias, *Jesus als Weltvollender* (Gütersloh: Bertelsmann, 1930), p. 18, 41f.; J. Quasten, 'Carmen,' in *Reallexikon für Antike und Christentum*, II, 907f.

church knew itself to be the *Qahal* of the End. The 144,000 of Revelation were those privileged to learn and sing the New Song (Rev. 14:3), which would renew and fulfil Moses' song at the Exodus (Rev. 15:3).⁴⁴ While rabbinism insisted that men ought to talk of the *torah* whenever they met, Paul advised his readers to 'address each other in psalms and hymns and spiritual songs' (Eph. 5:19; Col. 3:16).⁴⁵

We do not know what kind of songs the writer tried to describe in these three categories.⁴⁶ But it is significant that he was able to cite so many of them. Probably the 'New Song' was not necessarily an original piece of music or poetry. Even the psalms of the Old Testament assumed new significance as they were being sung in this hour of eschatological fulfilment (Mt. 26:30 par.; 1 Cor. 14:26).⁴⁷ Some of the original hymns in the New Testament were formed in close dependence on the forms and idioms of Old Testament poetry (Luke 1:46-55; 68-79; 2:14, 29-32). Others seem to reflect the influence of acclamations as found in the context of pagan worship (Phil. 2:5-11; Eph. 5:14; 1 Tim. 3:16; 1 Pet. 3:18-22; Rev. 5:12, 7:12, 15:3-4, 9:5-8). The latter are hymns to Christ and may have been developed in connection with the worship of him as the *Kyrios*.⁴⁸

The propensity of early Christians to break into song received further impetus from their assurance of Spirit possession. They accepted the gifts of the Spirit as evidence for the nearness of the End. To them the outpouring of the Spirit was a fulfilment of eschatological prophecy. And the gift of song was counted as one of the gifts of the Spirit. Zacharias was filled with Holy Spirit before intoning the Benedictus (Luke 1:67; cf. 41) and Paul mentions *ōdai pneumatikai*, spirit-inspired odes (Eph. 5:18; Col. 3:16).

Apparently the early Christians experienced the impulse of the Spirit in different ways. It could inspire them either to a wildly ecstatic, unintelligible imitation of the tongues of the angels, or it could result in rational intelligible song for the edification of others. Glossolalia is an example of the first. Usually we call it 'speaking' in tongues. But Paul uses not only *lalein*, but also *krazein* (Rom. 8:15; Gal. 4:6), *stenazein* (Rom. 8:36ff.), *proseuchesthai*, *psallein* (!), *eulogein*, and *eucharistein* for the same phenomenon. Evidently it was as much a 'shouting' or 'singing,' as a 'speaking' in tongues.⁴⁹ And since the

44. Cf. W. Bousset, *Die Offenbarung Johannis* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1906), pp. 379ff., 392ff.; J. Kroll, *Die Christliche Hymnodik* (Königsberg: 1921), p. 44.

45. Cf. J. Leiboldt, *Der Gottesdienst der ältesten Kirche* (Leipzig: Dörffling & Franke, 1937), p. 36; Strack-Billerbeck, *Kommentar*, vol. II, p. 185; vol. III, p. 610.

46. Cf. the standard commentaries *ad loc.*; Harder, *Gebet*, pp. 59f.; Kroll, *Hymnodik*, p. 5.

47. The synoptic quotation probably refers to the Passover Hallel. The passage from 1 Cor. may refer to an Old Testament psalm, but could also relate to a newly created or to an improvised song.

48. Cf. W. Bousset, *Kyrios Christos* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 1926), p. 286; J. Kroll, *Hymnodik*, pp. 14ff.; Ernst Lohmeyer, *Kyrios Jesus* (Heidelberg: C. Winter, 1928), pp. 4ff., 63ff.

49. Cf. Gunkel, *Wirkungen*, p. 21.

words were unconnected in any rational intelligible way, it is not unlikely that melodic associations replaced grammatical ones.

But the prompting of the Spirit was not limited to the tongues. Sober odes for the edification of others were also held to be spirit-inspired (Col. 3:16). Probably such songs were sung to the accompaniment of the *kithara* (Rev. 5:8; 15:2), for the *kithara* was the guitar of antiquity and was used with quiet, rather than ecstatic, songs.

At any rate, the New Testament is full of songs which found their way into its pages, because they had enjoyed prior use in the assemblies of the early Christians. The rousing hymns and acclamations in Revelation give a vivid portrait of the important role of music. And the Christians in Bithynia, whom Pliny examined, gave as the only, and apparently most important, feature of their worship the fact that they sang a hymn to Christ antiphonally (Epist. I, 96, to Trajan).⁵⁰

As *kabod* and *tehillah* belonged together in the Old Testament, so *doxa* and *hymnos* (or *psalmos*) were closely linked in the New. For as the epistles frequently assert, what the believers had been called for was the praise of God (2 Cor. 4:15; Eph. 1:6, 12, 14; Phil. 1:11; Col. 1:12). In this sense, music was indeed the most basic expression of their faith.

50. Cf. J. Quasten 'Carmen,' *RAC*, II, 906f.

4 BRUCE CAMPBELL

Can Prayer Be Humanizing?

Person and Prayer in the Thought of Gabriel Marcel

Can prayer be humanizing?

The question springs from two observations and a hope. The two observations are: (1) that it is becoming increasingly difficult to retain (or recover) our authentic human qualities in this increasingly over-administrated, depersonalized, technological, concrete and prefabricated, homogenized, one-dimensional, manipulated super-society; and (2) that belief in, and the practice of, prayer are declining: the Christian come of age is putting away 'the things of childhood,' including prayer. My hope is that I may be able to show that there is a mutual relation between person and prayer. How and whether a man prays depends on how he conceives of himself as a person and, reciprocally, praying (or not praying) partially determines who he is, as every act (or omission) is part of making the person.

I propose to examine the relations between person and prayer by reference to the work of Gabriel Marcel, a contemporary philosopher who analyzes the effects on persons of forces operating in our culture, and who writes occa-