

Book Reviews

STUDYING THE OLD TESTAMENT

HENRY McKEATING

Epworth Press 1979 223pp £3.25

ISBN 0 7162 0339 1

To judge from the remarks of our students who attend his lectures on Israelite history, religion, and literature, Henry McKeating, my colleague in the University of Nottingham (I wouldn't have accepted the invitation to review the book without first having a good look at it to make sure I could be positive about it!), enjoys goading students out of any simplistic views they may have regarding the OT, and these same students look surprised when I tell them that he is very interested in the OT's theological value. I shall be pleased now to be able to refer them to this book, concerned to help preachers to move on from 'what the Old Testament *meant* in its own time . . . to ask what the Old Testament *means* for our time', and written in the conviction that 'through the words of the Old Testament God is still speaking' (p 10). Aimed, according to the blurb, at 'Methodist local preachers on trial' (now, that is taking hermeneutical offences seriously), it is a companion to David Stacey's *Groundwork of Biblical Studies*. It includes brief résumés on questions of origin and date, which I presume are amplified in this other book, but concentrates on running theological commentary on the bulk of the OT.

It is written straightforwardly and attractively: Lot is 'the Bible's best example of the fifty-one per cent believer, the man who has *just* enough faith to be saved' (p 19); Ezekiel shows how 'God from of old has given his preachers licence to overstate their case where they think necessary' (p 138); 'Job's comforters have offered him theology; but Job craves the meeting with the living God, without which their theology is only so much verbiage' (p 178). Preachers of experience, as well as beginners, will profit from it.

St John's College, Nottingham

JOHN GOLDINGAY

TRADITION AND INTERPRETATION: Essays by Members of the Society for Old Testament Study

edited G. W. ANDERSON

Clarendon Press : OUP 1979 xxi + 462pp £10.50

ISBN 0 19 826315 5

One of the first books I bought as a student was *The Old Testament and Modern Study*, edited by H. H. Rowley; it was the kind of volume one kept on one's shelves next to *Peake's Commentary* and Guthrie's *New Testament Introduction* as means of salvation when essay deadlines crept up on one. *Tradition and Interpretation* is OTMS twenty-five years on, comprising thirteen chapters by senior members of the Society for Old Testament Study (thus mostly Britishers—though only a minority of them English!) on major areas of scholarly OT study: textual transmission (B. J. Roberts), philology (J. Barr), archaeology (J. Gray), the Pentateuch (R. E. Clements), historio-

graphy (J. R. Porter), the prophets (W. McKane), apocalyptic (E. W. Nicholson), the Psalms (J. H. Eaton), Israelite history (H. Gazelles and P. R. Ackroyd), Israelite religion (W. Zimmerli), and theology and interpretation (F. F. Bruce).

To attempt a summary of these surveys would be impracticable, and to attempt an evaluation of them would be to risk making a fool of myself, since the contributors are the scholars who set the standards; they are not meet for cool dissection by a junior reviewer. I do, however, have one or two reflections on the volume as a whole, as I compare it with its predecessor. First, it is a sign of the times (whether you like it or not) that archaeology is put in its place by being reduced from two chapters to one—though this change is counterbalanced by the introduction of the two chapters on Israelite history. Secondly, even when I have made maximum allowance for the fact that my own interest focuses in these areas, I am perplexed that 'theology and interpretation' receives a similar reduction (particularly in the light of the volume's title), given the intense activity in the areas of OT theology, OT hermeneutics, the canon, and post-biblical interpretation of the OT, which has characterized the period covered by this volume. That apart, however (and when allowance has been made for the fact that the essays were actually written about six years ago), a new generation of students should find this very useful volume heaven's answer to many of their own essay problems, and an older generation of ex-students may also value it as an updating.

St John's College, Nottingham

JOHN GOLDINGAY

STUDIES IN THE PATRIARCHAL NARRATIVES **WILLIAM MCKANE**

The Handsel Press 1979 262pp £5.50

ISBN 0 905312 0 31

One of Professor McKane's contentions in this book is that a piece of literature can only be properly appreciated when its genre has been determined. The book itself admirably exemplifies the thesis. If read as an attempt to interpret the stories of Genesis themselves (as the title leads one to expect), it will disappoint and frustrate, because its definite conclusions are few and scattered. But if it is seen as an exercise in the history of scholarship, as a summary and evaluation of some major studies of the patriarchal narratives between 1900 and around 1970, its value, at least to the specialist, will be clear.

Some of its theses deserve wider attention and discussion. First, McKane makes the timely point that a preoccupation with the historicity of the stories in recent years has diverted attention from their theological and literary qualities. It must be said that this has been particularly true of evangelical scholars, who, one might have thought, would have been particularly alive to the dangers of an obsession with historicity when dealing with texts whose theological richness has been so widely recognized. Second, leading on from this, McKane warns more generally against a tendency in scholarship to be so preoccupied with current trends and fashions that the work of earlier generations is ignored. 'Other men have laboured and we have entered into their labours.' This salutary reminder provides the rationale for the book's emphasis on the history of research. One might quite legitimately extend its scope to embrace much earlier periods of the history of biblical interpretation. Third, it appears to be McKane's view that it is the traditio-historical method as developed by Noth which provides the key to both the origin and the theological meaning of the patriarchal narratives. Noth was without doubt

CHURCHMAN

a very great scholar. But his ideas are frequently so adventurous and speculative that they are more of a stimulus to thought than a firm foundation on which to build a theological interpretation. In this respect those scholars would appear to have more to contribute who, like von Rad and Wolff, have focussed their attention on the theologies of the different written sources or strata of the Pentateuch.

School of Divinity, Cambridge

G. I. DAVIES

THE JUST KING: Monarchical Judicial Authority in Ancient Israel JSOT Supplement Series 12 KEITH W. WHITELAM

JSOT Press, Sheffield 1979 320pp £8.95 (US \$18.40) ISBN 0 905774 18 3

Here is a book on kingship that is *not* about the enthronement festival. This one explores the role of the king in the administration of justice, and the question of whether in practice, if not in theory, the king was regarded as being *extra legem*. Thus Whitelam is largely concerned with the tension between the *ideal* of the Just King as guardian of the law, and the *actuality* that emerges from the study of the historical books of the OT. Nor is the picture simply of the frequent but straightforward failure of the monarchy to uphold the principles of justice (cf. the grievances that precipitated Absalom's rebellion, 2 Sam. 15:1-6); more deviously, the king's judicial functions could be exploited as a way round awkward situations. Here the careers of Saul, David and Solomon supply much of the raw material. Cases in point include Saul's trial of Jonathan (1 Sam. 14); David's execution of the news-bearing Amalekite (2 Sam. 1) and Ishbaal's murderers (2 Sam. 4); his failure to indict Joab for Abner's murder (2 Sam. 3); and Solomon's ruthless treatment of Adonijah, Joab *et. al.* on his accession (1 Kings 1,2). Throughout the period of the monarchy, argues Whitelam, there was a growing risk that political capital could be made out of royal judicial authority as increasing powers, of promulgating as well as administering the law, became vested in the king.

This is an intriguing book that sheds much unexpected light on familiar OT stories. The problem, as the author admits, is the scantiness of the evidence. Until much more is known about the judicial functions of kings in the ancient Near East generally (where his observations are wisely cautious), Whitelam's conclusions must be regarded as provisional. Not everybody will unquestionably accept all of his literary analyses (Gunn's recent work has illustrated what a state of flux opinion on the 'Succession Narrative' is in at present). And the book has the unsettling *tendenz* of not allaying our fears that there were rogues on the throne of Israel in those days. But for all this, Whitelam's work must be regarded as a very substantial contribution to our understanding of the monarchy.

Salisbury and Wells Theological College

MICHAEL SADGROVE

THE NEW TESTAMENT INTERPRETATION OF SCRIPTURE ANTHONY TYRRELL HANSON

SPCK 1980 237pp £12.50

ISBN 0 281 03702 7

One aspect of the continuing discussion about the relationship between the

two testaments is the exploration of the role the OT played for the writers of the NT and of the ways in which they used their Scripture. Professor Anthony Hanson of Hull University has shown a keen interest in this aspect and written a number of books on it. His latest offering attempts to exploit the techniques of modern scholarship in order to take soundings at several points in the NT's interpretation of the OT.

As it turns out, about one third of the book is devoted to an extremely detailed study of the use of the OT in one rather obscure passage in Paul's letters, 1 Corinthians 2:6-16. Three of the other five much shorter chapters deal with aspects of John's use of the OT. One of these reproduces an earlier article on Exodus 34 as the background to John 1:14-18. Another discusses three passages (John 1:51, 2:17f, 12:1-8) in which, Hanson believes, use of OT material contributes to John's theme of Christ as the true temple. The third more general discussion catalogues the different techniques that can be seen in John's use of Scripture. A further chapter of the book deals with the scriptural background to the doctrine of the *descensus ad inferos*, a doctrine which Hanson, unlike many others, insists is to be found in several places in the NT. The scriptural influence, which he has discovered, comes through messianic interpretation of Psalms 16, 68, 88 and 89 and typological interpretation of Jonah. This reviewer's overall impression of these chapters, which make up the bulk of the work, is that in them has been amassed a wealth of interesting data about, for example, the various possible versions of a text that the NT writer may have used, or other rabbinic or early Christian interpretations of the OT text; but that the exegetical results achieved from such painstakingly erudite comparisons are often idiosyncratic. To those familiar with Hanson's earlier work, it will come as no surprise that again and again he believes the NT writers to be referring to the pre-existent Christ in the OT, but those previously unconvinced are likely to find in this work that Hanson has read such a notion into far too many texts. Also, few are likely to be convinced by the sort of exegesis which, for example, holds that Haggai 2:6-9 as background transforms John 12:3 ('and the house was filled with the fragrance of the ointment') into a reference to Christ as the true temple. In his discussion of John, Hanson claims that what is most distinctive in John's use of the OT is a group of passages where scriptural allusions have influenced the narrative in a subtle and unobtrusive way. Again, readers might be tempted to conclude that these allusions are so subtle and unobtrusive that this distinctive use of Scripture is more Hanson's product than John's.

Whether or not one agrees with many of the results of his exegesis, the sort of work Hanson attempts is potentially of great importance in illuminating the work of the NT writers. Hanson himself supplies some reflections on the broader significance of his endeavours: not, as one might have expected, as a way of summing up his findings at the end of the book, but rather as his introductory chapter. It is this part of the work that will be of most interest to someone who is not a specialist in this area. Here the author mentions some factors which bear on contemporary hermeneutical discussions. He rightly emphasizes that the NT writers used an *interpreted* Bible. Their Scripture did not stand by itself but already had its own history of interpretation, and inevitably they approached their Scripture through Jewish exegetical traditions and techniques. Hanson goes on to argue from this that 'it is a delusion to imagine (as apparently some of the Reformers did) that Scripture is self-interpreting.' At the same time, he insists that we are in a different position from the NT writers since we now have their writings as our NT, and this means that we should 'so adjust the relation of Scripture to tradition in our theological system that Scripture can act as norm.' In this opening chapter there are reflections which remind us that detailed scholarly work on this topic can have important repercussions for theology and which should pro-

voke us to further comparison of the NT writers' hermeneutical situation with our own.

St John's College, Nottingham

A. T. LINCOLN

THE ORIGINS OF THE GOSPEL TRADITIONS
BIRGER GERHARDSSON

first published in Sweden 1977

SCM Press, UK and Fortress Press, USA 1979

95pp £2.50

ISBN 0 334 01193 0

The Swedish NT school, led by such specialists as Harald Riesenfeld and Birger Gerhardsson, is well known for its criticism of form-criticism. In two earlier, technical volumes Professor Gerhardsson himself challenged the assumption, made by many of those who have investigated the original layers of the Gospel traditions, that the early church created (instead of colouring) the materials concerning the words and works of Jesus reported by the synoptic evangelists.

Now, in the present book, Gerhardsson has given us a popular version of his previous work. Translated from a Swedish edition, it is based on lectures given to theological students in Germany. As such it is an eminently readable and balanced account of Gerhardsson's refreshingly unscceptical position. This asserts that in principle the material in the first three Gospels 'comes from the earthly Jesus and the disciples who followed him during his ministry'; but that full justice must also be done to the interpretation which this material has undergone in the course of its transmission (pp 89-90).

It might seem that Professor Gerhardsson wishes to have the best of both the historical and theological worlds in the crucial matter of the reliability of the Jesus tradition. But his basic (and now, perhaps, modified) plea is that history and theology should *both* be taken seriously in any consideration of Gospel origins. Moreover, Gerhardsson's insistence on the historical basis of the sayings of Jesus (and these receive particular emphasis) is strengthened by his scholarly research into the Jewish background to the oral stages of the Christian tradition, and his conclusion that such techniques as memorization, repetition and recitation were fundamental to the teaching patterns characteristic of rabbinic schools; and that these guaranteed accuracy in handing on the message.

Some critics of this latest work by Professor Gerhardsson (as of his other books) may feel that his assessment of the authenticity of the synoptic witness to Jesus is over-optimistic. But no serious reader can doubt that this book is a valuable contribution to the ongoing debate about the way in which the Gospels came to birth; and it is good that it is being made available to a wider audience.

Could the author now turn his attention to this question with reference to John?

Coventry Cathedral

STEPHEN S. SMALLEY

POVERTY AND EXPECTATION IN THE GOSPELS
DAVID L. MEALAND

SPCK 1980 136pp £3.95

ISBN 0 281 03706 X

The relationship between deprivation and wealth in a Christian context is an

issue of crucial contemporary relevance, and one which has received scant attention in British scholarly circles. Mr Mealand's study breaks new ground, and is a brave attempt to fill this gap. It combines creatively a socio-economic approach to the NT with a rigorously critical treatment of the text itself; if not always to a clear end!

After surveying the economic background to the (chiefly synoptic) Gospels, Mealand carefully examines the theme of poverty and expectation as it can be recovered from the various stages in the transmission of the Gospel tradition: the evangelists and their sources; the oral tradition; and the teaching of Jesus (in relation to the demands of the kingdom). The author's conclusion is that the Gospels contain diverse pronouncements on this subject, related to the changing economic climate of the first century: the turbulent period which accompanied the ministry of Jesus; the famine of AD 47-48; and the more settled years (reflected in the redactions of Matthew and Luke) following the Jewish revolt. A postscript considers the topic of poverty in the modern world in the light of this historical investigation.

The trouble is that this book (which started life as an MLitt. thesis) attempts too many tasks in too short a space. The result is an uneasy mixture of the reasonably popular and the highly technical, which does full justice to neither approach. Moreover, Mr Mealand constantly raises searching questions, involving social and ethical dimensions of NT teaching which are vital in today's society. For example, *are* riches wrong in themselves? *Are all* Christians called to renounce possessions? *Are the poor really* 'blessed'? But these queries remain virtually unanswered.

A less tantalizing and more positive result might have been achieved if the writer had either given us a full-scale account of this subject (ranging over the *whole* of the NT) in frankly academic terms; or dealt with the topic in a thoroughly practical way, related directly to the needs of a world in which most people are impoverished.

Coventry Cathedral

STEPHEN S. SMALLEY

LENT WITH ST JOHN MICHAEL RAMSEY

SPCK 1980 47pp 75p

ISBN 0 281 03747 7

This Lent Book is, indeed, as the author says (p 5) a 'little' one; but 'little' only in physical volume. In its effect, it is as heartening, challenging and thought-provoking as its Gospel source, which is here presented once again for the prayerful attention of Christians who want to discover 'how the death of Jesus can mean more to us than ever before, and how the risen life of Jesus is something in which we may actually be sharing,' (p 7)

With this aim in mind, Dr Ramsey has selected short passages from St John's Gospel, for reading and considering every day from Ash Wednesday to Easter Sunday. Each passage is illuminated by two or three concise paragraphs of comment, in which the essential meaning of the text is drawn out and its relevance for modern Christian discipleship is helpfully indicated. In addition, there are suggestions for prayer and meditation on the leading themes of the selected readings—suggestions which might usefully be studied by groups as well as by individuals, and not only in Lent!

This is, however, intended primarily as a 'Lent Book'; and, as such, it concentrates rightly on preparing its readers to commemorate the death of our Lord, and to realize that 'in the terrible suffering, cruelties and evil of our time' (p 7) Jesus still suffers. But the author does not leave us there. 'Love is one and indivisible, and the love which will suffer and die on earth is

the same love which reigns eternally.' (p36) For Christian faith, now as in the first century, the Easter message is clear. 'There could be no lingering at the tomb. The resurrection brings a new order. The disciples are sent on their mission to the world, as Jesus himself had been sent by the Father. The command to Peter is "Follow me". So all are to look forward.' (p46)

In writing this book, Bishop Ramsey has achieved a work of considerable delicacy. He has allowed the text of the Fourth Gospel to speak for itself, while at the same time adding unobtrusive but constructive footnotes to aid the reader's understanding, imagination and devotion. His scholarly skill and pastoral care will be greatly valued, here as heretofore.

Coventry

SUSAN J. SMALLEY

THE EPISTLE OF ST PAUL TO THE PHILIPPIANS

JEAN-FRANÇOIS COLLANGE translated A. W. HEATHCOTE

first published by Delachaux and Niestlé, France and Switzerland 1973

Epworth Press 1979 159pp £5.00

ISBN 0 7162 0270 0

This commentary is excellent value, and I welcome it on to my bookshelf. Its author is a young assistant at Strasbourg University, plainly a man not only of great erudition and wide reading, but also of literary sensitivity and exegetical gifts.

The comments are accompanied by a new and lively translation of Philipians by A. W. Heathcote, but they are actually based on the Greek, which is transliterated throughout. This would make it difficult for readers not acquainted with Greek to use this book. But those who are will find constant profit from 150 pages which contain not a wasted sentence. I am very impressed with the imaginativeness, care, and thoroughness of the comments.

He has three 'excursuses' at appropriate points: on 'bishops and deacons' (1:1), 'with Christ' (1:23), and the Christological hymn (2:5-11). This last is by far the longest (14 pages + 14 more of accompanying exegesis), and he picks his way through the mountainous literature and exegetical reefs with great success, taking a sane and, for the most part, convincing line. He upholds the Pauline authorship of the hymn, and—a rarity indeed—leaves the reader with a wondering sense of Paul's unsurpassed theological insight.

On matters of introduction, he holds that the epistle is a composite of three originally separate letters. Like others who take such views, he says nothing to justify the likelihood of their conflation. He has an interesting theory to account for the strange fact that Paul, though imprisoned (in Ephesus, rather than Rome), seems to be able to 'choose' whether he will live or die (1:22): Paul, he contends, decided after initial uncertainty to secure his release by revealing his Roman citizenship to the authorities. He feels that this also accounts for the strange attitude of those who wanted to add to Paul's affliction (1:17): they felt he was taking the easy way out, and should have faced martyrdom bravely. This theory would be more convincing if he had supported it with detailed reference to Roman legal procedure.

His analysis of the 'dogs' of ch. 3 is most helpful: he maintains that they are out of the same stable as Paul's opponents in 2 Corinthians—'super' apostles who denied the cross as a daily fact of apostolic (and Christian) experience.

The book is excellently printed, but the stitching became suspiciously loose as I handled it. However, I do not hesitate to commend it warmly for the preacher's library.

Oak Hill College, London N14

STEPHEN MOTYER

MYTH AND HISTORY IN THE BOOK OF REVELATION

JOHN M. COURT

SPCK 1979 200pp £12.50

ISBN 0 281 03700 0

Dr John Court, lecturer in theology at the University of Kent, has produced a fresh and scholarly study of the interrelation of myth and history in the Apocalypse. Lest this use of the term 'myth' should cause eyebrows to rise, it may be said that if readers would prefer to substitute the phrase 'pictorial symbolism', that will serve almost as well. Old Testament psalmists and prophets used the ancient Leviathan myth to portray God's creative act in the beginning, or his victory over his people's enemies at the Exodus; John takes it up afresh in Revelation 12 to depict the devil's attack on Christ and his followers, and their conquering him 'by the blood of the Lamb and by the word of their testimony'. So, in John's hands, even myth can be the vehicle of history.

Dr Court selects seven themes in the Apocalypse to illustrate the interplay of history and myth: the letters to the churches, the sequences of plagues, the interlude of the two witnesses, the woman clothed with the sun, the seven-headed beast from the abyss, Babylon the Great, and the New Jerusalem.

The letters to the churches, with their plentiful allusions to local features, lend themselves most readily to the historical interpretation. Dr Court has made good use here not only of the well-known work of Sir William Ramsay but also of the extremely valuable but still (unfortunately) unpublished thesis of Dr Colin Hemer. Of the three plague-sequences he finds that the seals are closely related to the apocalyptic tradition in the synoptic Gospels, while the trumpets and the bowls have their antecedents in the plagues of Egypt. The first five seals are found to make reference to matters of concern for the churches of Asia in the time of Domitian.

The interlude of the two witnesses presents peculiarly fascinating problems. It appears to draw together the situation during the siege of Jerusalem and the martyrdom of Peter and Paul against a composite OT background in which Moses and Elijah figure along with Zerubbabel and Jeshua (Zech. 4:11-14). (In the reviewer's opinion it also draws on a document which Josephus knew and reinterpreted in his own way in his history of the Jewish War.)

Dr Court betrays none of the uneasiness which so often comes to expression when NT scholars contemplate early Christian apocalyptic. He recognizes in John's Revelation, in its history and mythology alike, the authentic NT message. Nor does he find anti-Jewish sentiment in the book; rather he recognizes sympathy with the tradition of Israel and indignation against those 'who say that they are Jews and are not, but lie' because they have sold their birthright and collaborated with the imperial cult.

He acknowledges that many questions remain unanswered, but he has given us a fine example of the patient attention to detail, in the light of everything that can be discovered about background and context, which points the way to the establishing of further answers.

Buxton, Derbyshire

F. F. BRUCE

A SYSTEM OF CHRISTIAN DOCTRINE

DAVID CAIRNS

The Saint Andrew Press 1979 218pp £3.75

ISBN 0 7152 0434 3

This publication is best understood as a contribution to the field of the history

of Christian thought. It consists of collected papers of Principal D. S. Cairns, who died in 1946. The material has been edited by his son David Cairns, and the foreword is a lecture by Dr A. C. Craig delivered in honour of D. S. Cairns.

The outline of the book is that of the creeds: the nature of faith, God and the world, Christ's person and work, the Holy Spirit, church, eschatology. It is perhaps an outline of Christian doctrine rather than a system, for the bones of consistency are not laid bare, and there is no theological discussion of the significance of the outline that is used, of its advantages or disadvantages.

The publication of material that is over 35 years old aids our understanding of the past. Its presuppositions and contents speak of a bygone age, and so does its fulsome rhetorical style. It is worth reading to gain an impression of a former age's orthodox Protestantism in liberal shape, unclouded by issues of Third-World theology, Catholic neo-modernism, the death of God, Bultmann or indeed any post-war German debate. Its liberal Protestantism is attractive. It is open-minded, generous but acute, broadly based but perceptive. I must confess a certain weakness for Cairn's rhetoric, and for his choice of quotations (e.g. 'Final causes, said Lord Bacon, "like the Vestal Virgins, are sterile"' p47). His style is vital and warm: he must have been a marvellous preacher. But all this means that the book illuminates the past rather than the present.

D. S. Cairns wrote for the intelligent layman, and his ideas are simple without being superficial. I imagine him as a northern Charles Raven! This book provides an attractive impression of the Christian tradition which it represents.

St John's College, Durham

PETER ADAM

JESUS: An Experiment in Christology EDWARD SCHILLEBEECKX

first published in Holland 1974

Collins, UK and Seabury Press, USA 1979 767pp £9.00 ISBN 0 00 215377 7
Like Watership Down, this book gets easier after the first hundred pages or so. Sadly, the parallel stops there: 'Schillebeeckx's lifework', as the blurb calls it (despite the book's promise of a sequel, and of a further book on grace) is often hard going and creates a lot of puzzles where one had hoped for illumination. There are plenty of rewards in store for the patient, and the massive learning cannot but impress; but there are also important questions that need to be asked, and not only by the pope's official orthodoxy-testers.

I was surprised, and a bit disappointed, to discover that the book is largely a study in the synoptic tradition (the next volume will be on John and Paul), preceded by a hundred pages on method, and followed by a hundred or so in which we suddenly jump from the first to the twentieth century, landing up in some difficult and inconclusive Christological musings, with scant mention of the Fathers or the Reformers, a brief look at some mediaeval writings, and a very selective treatment of modern Christology, particularly in Holland. (A pity, incidentally, that English versions of secondary literature could not be cited where they are available.) But the main thesis of the book is contained in the two long central sections, which argue that Jesus' unique 'Abba-experience' caused him to see himself, not as the Davidic Messiah, nor as the divine son of God, but as the eschatological prophet; and which interpret the synoptics and (parts of) Acts in terms of the growth of Christian ideas and reflections from this point outwards. Jesus proclaimed the kingdom of God,

i.e., that man's cause is God's cause; and he gave his life (in both senses) to a demonstration of this salvation-in-action. There is much valuable material here, though much of it becomes vague at crucial points, often (I believe) because God's purposes for *Israel* are bypassed in the search for relevance to man-in-general.

Actually, the main thesis is eventually modified to include 'Davidic' ideas via the device of a distinction between (Davidic) Wisdom Christology and (Davidic) 'dynastic' Messianism, the former being all right and the latter suspect. In fact, the recent arguments of B. F. Meyer in his little-noticed book (*The Aims of Jesus*) make this distinction very difficult, and Schillebeeckx severely under-emphasizes (for instance) the events of Palm Sunday and their Davidic significance. It would seem better to assert—as he does in the case of 'prophet' Christology—that Jesus took on, but fundamentally reinterpreted, Davidic Messiahship in all its variety, rather than that he adopted one Jewish idea and ignored another one. As for 'prophet-Christology' itself, Schillebeeckx has made out a good case for this as a central aspect of Jesus' self-consciousness, with more interesting ramifications than is usually thought: but to set it up as *the* main theme, and then to play it off against others, goes well beyond and, indeed, against the evidence. It ignores, for instance, the distinction between the prophets and the Son in the parable of the wicked husbandmen.

No doubt Schillebeeckx would reply that this parable reflects a later development in the tradition (I do not remember that he discusses this parable, and in the frustrating absence of a biblical or topical index one cannot easily check). The book leans very heavily on old-fashioned source- and form-criticism, and those who find themselves unable to swallow subtle Christological developments *within* the 'Q' community (so-called: if only people would remember that this remarkable group of Christians exists as a hypothetical construction to explain a hypothetical construction to explain a problem many people see differently) may shake their heads over several tortuous discussions. At the same time, he occasionally does a good hatchet job on extreme historical scepticism, and one of the strengths of the book is the application of a *historical* 'criterion of dissimilarity' (my phrase, not his) which recognizes the period of the ministry as being *sui generis*, and certain types of event as belonging there and nowhere else. This principle, unlike its cousin which deals with *logia*, could and should be extended. In particular, I shall often go back to the splendid analysis (pp 272-318) of the reasons—historical, political, religious—for the crucifixion.

One lacuna betrays a fundamental weakness. Throughout the long and detailed discussion of the Christology of the synoptic tradition, during which it is often contrasted with the supposedly 'higher' Johannine view, the transfiguration is not even dismissed (with Bultmann) as a misplaced resurrection-story: it is never even *mentioned*. Yet it is clearly of fundamental importance for each of the synoptists (in their different ways); and any 'synoptic Christology' which does not take it seriously must itself be challenged, especially when it concludes by casting doubt on the evangelists' sources' intention to portray Jesus as considerably more than a prophet, even than *the* 'eschatological prophet'. The old wedge driven between Johannine and synoptic Christology can only be kept in place by ignoring or explaining away significant pieces of contrary evidence.

The most serious flaw in the whole book is the treatment of the resurrection, and I am frankly not surprised that the author is under suspicion of heterodoxy at this point (not to mention his very negative treatment of the virgin birth). He even admits the charge (p 710), and pleads rather pathetically that his view is at least still a Christian one. Briefly, it seems that the resurrection 'appearances' were in fact the result, not the cause, of the

disciples' new-found faith, itself the work of God's grace reaching out and saving them after their defection and despair of a few days earlier (summarized, p 391). 'Seeing' the risen Jesus is a metaphor for this new realization of death-defying grace, and this realization is itself the fruit of meditation on the significance of Jesus' earthly life: so, where for Bultmann the resurrection is a metaphorical way of speaking about Jesus' death, for Schillebeeckx it is a metaphorical way of speaking about his ministry. The 'third day' is a biblical way of talking about the crucial moment of God's saving action (Joseph, Hezekiah, Esther, Jonah and of course Hosea 6), not a reference to an event which took place sixty or so hours after the crucifixion. I cannot read (e.g.) pages 336 ff, 380 ff without feeling that, for Schillebeeckx, the 'resurrection' is quite compatible with Jesus' corpse being there in the tomb (it is significant that he professes not to understand Pannenberg at this point). And it is simply not true to the texts (Thomas, Mary, the Emmaus Road story) to insist that the risen Jesus is only 'seen' where there is already faith. In a curious reversal of the usual form-critical assumption, Schillebeeckx maintains that the synoptists, or their sources, took words of the historical Jesus and put them into the mouth of the risen Lord (p 354).

This view, claiming to avoid a false empiricist objectivism (p 644), falls into just that mistake itself—the regular elephant-trap, thinly covered over with pretensions to 'scientific method', into which radical Protestants fall. For this school, on whose exegetical work Schillebeeckx and his favourite authors rely so heavily, the search for 'objectivity' is in fact the pseudo-scientific search for an *enemy*: Christian experience is to be its own ground, is to be self-authenticating, must not be contaminated (*vide* Lessing) with hard facts. Many of the troubled waters in this book are best explained by the incoming tide of radical Protestantism meeting the outgoing stream of traditional Catholicism. There is no doubt which is the stronger: and if in the closing chapters Schillebeeckx manages, *malgré lui*, to use traditional Trinitarian language, it is only having reinterpreted it in an entirely functional, experience-centred manner. Claiming to guard against docetism, he simply and explicitly refuses to use at all the idea of Jesus' divinity (p 671). This is just the sort of thing of which Catholics always used to suspect Protestants, as Schillebeeckx must know very well. Even if his arguments were sound, he is not in a position to complain if his church eventually decides that he no longer teaches what she, and traditional Christians elsewhere, regard as fundamental truths.

Downing College, Cambridge

N. T. WRIGHT

THEOLOGICAL INVESTIGATIONS KARL RAHNER SJ

Vol. 16 Experience of the Spirit; Source of Theology

translated D. MORLAND OSB

Darton, Longman and Todd 1979 275pp £9.50

ISBN 0 232 51247 7

THE SPIRIT IN THE CHURCH KARL RAHNER SJ

Burns and Oates 1979 104pp £2.25

ISBN 0 86012 068 6

These two recent publications, in translation, of work by the Roman Catholic theologian Karl Rahner have a fair amount in common, inasmuch as there is in each a considerable attention given to the work of the Holy Spirit and the experience of the Spirit. They are based on original writings, lectures and addresses produced mainly in the 1970s, and now collected with a more or less obvious intention of contributing to the discussion of the charismatic

movement in the church. Indeed the introduction to vol. 16 of the *Theological Investigations* refers to other writings, parts of which are given in *The Spirit in the Church*. But Rahner's treatment in both books will surprise many who might expect something of the discussion which we are used to in this country. Rahner is not, of course, unaware of the matters in debate regarding both the experiences and manifestations within Pentecostal circles in the churches, and the way these are related to the doctrine of the Spirit and to sanctification teaching. He has them much in view, particularly in a chapter in the *Theological Investigations* entitled 'Enthusiasm and Grace'. On the whole, the actual teaching of charismatics as to the necessity or implication of specific expressions of the activity of the Spirit is less to the fore in Rahner's treatment than the expressions of 'religious enthusiasm', which he then seeks to understand in terms of Roman Catholic teaching on the Spirit, on grace, and on the spiritual life.

Thus the first part of the *Theological Investigations* vol. 16 is called 'Faith and Spirit', two of the five chapters of which deal with 'Experience of the Spirit and Existential Commitment', and 'Faith between Rationality and Emotion'. Part two of the book takes up the theme of spirituality and sanctification in the overall theme of 'Spiritual Theology in Christian Tradition', in which two chapters provide valuable historical reviews of teaching on 'the spiritual senses' in Origen and in medieval writers, leading on to an exploration of the teaching of Ignatius Loyola. As a Jesuit, Rahner sees this as providing fresh insights that contribute valuably to present discussions and spiritual needs. In all this, the second half of the sub-title—'Source of Theology'—reflects his treatment; experience of the Spirit and spirituality are seen to give to and receive from the human situation so that one becomes aware of a transcending dimension of one's being which is itself a gift of grace. That gift becomes centrally explicit in Jesus Christ and in the great historically based events of God's self-communication to man in the gospel. Rahner gently side-steps the popular way of thinking about the gifts and experience of the Spirit, by taking the life of man in nature and grace away from superficial discussion of 'experience'—psychological, spiritual, or in terms of comparative religion—and seeking to understand and respond to its fundamental participation in the created terms of its existence, with the whole of man's being finding life and meaning only as boundaries are transcended and seen to point to those horizons that call for response to the transcendent ultimate who is God and who is Spirit. Hence in the book *The Spirit in the Church*, although the titles of its distinctive parts (based on separate writings) suggest to English readers more or less familiar contents—'Experiencing the Spirit', 'The Charismatic Element in the Church', 'Some Criteria for Genuine Visions', and 'Prophecies'—in actual treatment there is not only the more philosophic background—his 'ontological anthropology' (cf my review article in *Churchman* 93:3, 1979, pp 253-60) being highly influential—but also the important material of Roman Catholic teaching and the way Rahner sees its contemporary relevance and application. The result is to ground spirituality in the variety and everyday challenge of the widespread life of the church; and, in further depth, in the fundamental context of mankind's typical existence. Thus volume 16 ends on a note struck by four chapters that deal with the significance of Jesus Christ for all men, and with reflections upon the mystery of God.

One can well imagine that many who debate the various aspects of the charismatic movement, and even more those who have found release and enrichment by means of it, will not immediately recognize in these two books that which speaks to their condition or concern; but perhaps future attempts to provide a proper theological support and interpretation of the movement might give careful attention to these writings inasmuch as the direction of

their thinking raises more far-reaching questions than anything yet attempted seems to have recognized. Apart from that wider area of interest, this volume of *Theological Investigations* has important studies on the hope of the final vision of God ('The Hiddenness of God') and on the significance of the person of Christ for man's search after God ('The One Christ and the Universality of Salvation'), while three chapters on the use of Holy Scripture suggests that there might be useful contributions made to internal Roman Catholic debate from those which have been going on in this country and in the USA. A word of congratulation must be given to the translator, David Morland OSB, for providing a lucid English rendering of the text.

Archdeaconry of Auckland, Co. Durham

G. J. C. MARCHANT

THE ANSWER IS THE SPIRIT R. E. O. WHITE

The Saint Andrew Press 1979 164pp £1.75

ISBN 0 7152 0417 3

Justly called the neglected person in the Trinity up to about fifteen to twenty years ago, the Holy Spirit now seems to be the most talked about topic in Christian circles, doubtless due mainly to charismatic renewal. Of the making of many books about him and his work there is at present no end, and Principal White of the Scottish Baptist College, Edinburgh has joined in with another, to add to his two dozen or more published books.

This one is a fairly popular paperback, suitable for the intelligent layman, in which he goes through the NT teaching on the Holy Spirit book by book, competently and readably. Since others have done this well before him, the reader may wonder what justification there is for another run through the material. The reply would be that White is convinced, and concerned to demonstrate in this book, that the NT teaching on the Spirit is never given in a vacuum, but always developed in the face of the intensely practical needs, situations and problems of people and churches. To all these, White shows, 'The answer is the Spirit'. Whilst this refrain at the end of each chapter sounds a little contrived and irritating after a time, the basic point is a good one, and the treatment clear and usually helpful.

In the process of his study, White points out how in its NT development the understanding and experience of the Holy Spirit are universalized, moralized and personalized. White's anti-charismatic strain appears at several points, and occasionally leads him to an incomplete reading and sifting of the evidence. But his conclusion at one point is well worth noting by all: 'Our experience of the Spirit will be commensurate with the size of the problems we tackle . . . no less and no more . . . The use made determines the power received . . . The fuse is at our end!' This study, together with Michael Ramsey's *Holy Spirit*, would form a good basic introduction to the NT doctrine of the Spirit, but for a more positive and sympathetic treatment of some of the dimensions recovered through the charismatic renewal movement, readers might also need to look elsewhere.

Newick Vicarage, Sussex

JOHN P. BAKER

AGENDA FOR THEOLOGY: Recovering Christian Roots THOMAS C. ODEN

Harper and Row 1979 176pp £4.25

ISBN 0 06 066347 2

This book is about the prodigal theologian coming home. The author has been

for many years in the far-country of what he calls modernity: 'the overarching ideology of the modern period . . . which assumes that recent modes of knowing the truth are vastly superior to all older ways.' Now he charts his return to a confident acceptance of the 'ancient ecumenical consensus of Christianity's first millenium.'

His writing is essentially polemical. He is a convert from theological 'faddism', from the belief that 'new is beautiful' in theological reflection. Therefore he is extremely harsh on what he considers the modern theological sell-out to the illusion of secularism. He makes many incisive thrusts against modern theology's failure of nerve and loss of identity, illustrating his points from his own previous experience.

The context in which the author writes is that of the new political and theological conservatism displayed by the latest generation of theological students in the USA. His book assumes a certain familiarity with the North American church scene over the last few decades, for example the sub-culture of fundamentalism and the impact of Niebuhr's particular brand of neo-orthodoxy. However, this context certainly does not make the arguments irrelevant to Christians living elsewhere under the domination of a monolithic, modernistic theological outlook.

The book is highly readable (if one ignores its rather generous spattering of 'americanisms'), including an imaginary discussion between the author and his former 'modernistic' co-conspirators. In very many places it will warm the heart and sensitize the minds of evangelicals who have always believed that the historical, biblical faith is immensely relevant to 'a rapidly deteriorating modern ethos that has lost its moral power.'

I would certainly recommend this book to all those depressed by the spectre of modern theology continuing to sell its birthright for the mess of pottage of acceptability and accommodation. It certainly throws the burden of proof upon those who wish to barter orthodoxy for the acclamations of a humanist dogma.

At the same time, I have one or two queries I would like to see the author discuss at greater length. Is his return to what I would call 'conciliar orthodoxy' too related to a present conservative upsurge? Is his proclamation of the neglected, central truths of the creeds for the sake of a more biblical radicalism, or simply to counteract a non-biblical radicalism? Could he show us how orthodox Christian faith can be made relevant to our secular world without losing its inner coherence and identity? Is there a danger that a new theological orthodox consensus could lead to a different kind of theological authoritarianism? These and other issues are raised in my mind by reading this interesting book.

St Paul's Church, Robert Adam St, London W1

J. ANDREW KIRK

BELIEF IN REDEMPTION D. WIEDERKEHR

translated JEREMY MOISER

first published in Germany 1976

SPCK 1979 109pp £2.95

ISBN 0 281 03678 0

One could characterize the purpose of this extended essay as an attempt to redesign the meaning of Christian salvation in such a way as to be meaningful to modern alienated (German academic?) man. It assumes the basic premise of philosophical hermeneutics that there is a significant difference between the biblical text and modern man's understanding of himself and his world.

Taking for granted, then, that traditional soteriology is no longer an adequate response to contemporary secular society, the author explores different possibilities of reformulating beliefs so that they may produce an echo in those estranged from Christian culture and language. He is particularly interested in the modern existential and political dimensions of salvation to which he devotes a chapter apiece. He also surveys recent writing on the relationship between soteriology and eschatology, and soteriology and praxis. As a lead-in to the contemporary debate, the author discusses the OT notions of salvation, the salvific meaning of Jesus' death and resurrection, and some former attempts to understand salvation, such as those of Anselm, the Anabaptists and the Christian socialism of Kutter and Ragaz.

The fundamental concern of this book is with the task of looking afresh at the meaning of salvation from the perspective of a particular understanding of the modern world. There are some valuable insights and, as an overview of contemporary (mainly continental) literature, it is quite helpful. However, it suffers from two serious drawbacks. Firstly, it makes the unwarranted general assumption that it is possible to speak neatly and definitively about modern man's consciousness. Many theologians make the quite appalling pastoral mistake of extrapolating from their very limited experience and intellectually-conditioned background to the world in general. The result often is not so much a meaningful contextualization of the Christian faith in the market-place of most people's lives, as a reduction of the gospel to fit into a highly abstract reality. I am afraid this book on the whole confirms my worst fears about the highly speculative nature of much western theology. The problems discussed are those of other theologians, rather than those of identifiable segments of the population outside the universities. Secondly, the language and arguments are abstract and unnecessarily pedantic. I feel that probably only people with some considerable theological training would persevere beyond the first pages.

Though I would not want to deny the urgency of reflecting on the significance of biblical salvation for the modern European scene, regrettably I have to conclude that, with regard to this attempt, I can think of many better ways of spending three pounds.

St Paul's Church, Robert Adam St, London W1

J. ANDREW KIRK

PATTERNS IN HISTORY DAVID BEBBINGTON

IVP 1979 211pp £3.75

ISBN 0 85110 595 5

This book sets out to assess various answers to the question: What is history? Do all its lines converge on anything? Do they all work together for good? The vision of definitive history has faded, for historians of equal integrity can persist in holding opposite interpretations of what actually happened. Moreover, some argue that history is a literary activity against those who hold that it is solely scientific.

Not unnaturally, schools of philosophy have developed, and Dr Bebbington examines five of the most important. First there is the cyclical, or rhythmic, like the seasons in nature: next, the linear, or Judaeo-Christian, with a beginning and an ending or goal—the last things. The third, which arose through the Enlightenment movement of the eighteenth century, has progress as its central concept. The fourth, historicism, arose in the same century, and had its source in Germany. This abandoned the linear belief largely held in Britain and France, and instead took the idea of history as the study of distinctive national cultures. The fifth school is the Marxist,

which adopts for its premise historical materialism. All these are analysed, and their strengths and weaknesses considered. The author proceeds to touch on the debate between determinism and freewill. He points out that if Calvin exalts divine sovereignty and John Wesley champions the freedom to accept salvation, yet Wesley also clearly believes in divine sovereignty and Calvin does not reject human responsibility. Calvinism and Arminianism each share a world view in which both God and man are agents of history. Strangely, Kant's philosophical investigations led him to the identical conclusion that the mind wishes to affirm both that man is determined and that he is free. But on a Christian view, human behaviour is moulded by circumstances and freely undertaken by individuals. For positivists, man is a creature of circumstance; for idealists, he is capable of heroic activity. In attempting to draw together all these different strands into a coherent pattern, Dr Bebbington returns to the Christian view that the keynote of hope is grounded in the twin beliefs that God is guiding history forward in a straight line, and that it will in due time reach his goal—the ultimate victory of Jesus Christ.

This book should be of particular value to the committed undergraduate, who cannot at times see the wood for the trees; and to the research student, who may need to be reminded what his study is all about before plunging into his own specific thicket of exploration. All will benefit from this map of the whole vast forest which we call human history.

Wycliffe Hall, Oxford

COLLISS DAVIES

CONCERNING SCANDALS JOHN CALVIN

translated JOHN W. FRASER

The Saint Andrew Press, UK and Eerdmans, USA 1978

119pp £3.50

ISBN 0 7152 0404 1

It was a pain to Calvin that he was driven from his native land, an exile on no charge other than his evangelical faith; and when other Frenchmen suffered the same grief, Calvin was most sensitive to the plight of these spiritual and intellectual refugees, and did all he could to help and encourage these outcasts. The writing of this little book was an expression of this concern. Calvin dedicated the book to the family lawyer, Laurent de Normandie, a man who had been tried and tormented for his faith, yet whose evangelical theology enabled him not only to withstand these trials but to come through them victorious, with faith strengthened and Christian character enhanced.

This was the precise purpose of this little book: to make the believer aware of the obstacles Satan sets in the path of the believer; to explain how these obstacles may be discerned, met and overcome; and to show how these stones of stumbling may be converted into stepping-stones to spiritual perfection.

Calvin first shows how Christ himself was a rock of offence and a scandal, and why he must always remain so; and then, by examination of each and every scandal, promises to the weak and ignorant the discovery of strength for themselves to overcome the scandals, and to the ungodly the grounds for reversing their hostility to the gospel. He divides the scandals into three kinds. First, those of the intrinsic kind; i.e. those which arise from the foolishness of the gospel in the eyes of the wise of this world, and from the demands which the gospel makes on a believer. Secondly, and largely arising from this first, the obstacles of strife, disunity, sectarianism, pride, immorality, faint-heartedness and the like. Thirdly, the extrinsic kind, which are of the nature of outside attacks on believing men.

It is all strong, stern, salty stuff, Calvin argues that no one can be called Christian unless he emerges from these struggles, and emerges *victorious*. Calvin's fine and effective Christology shines through these essays, and though couched in sixteenth-century thought-forms for sixteenth-century men facing sixteenth-century problems, the searching and keen biblical mind of Calvin is uncannily contemporaneous for the church today, whose witness on both faith and morals is so pathetically halting.

University of Sheffield

JOHN ATKINSON

THE LETTERS AND PROSE WRITINGS OF WILLIAM COWPER Volume 1 1750-1781

edited JAMES KING and CHARLES RYSKAMP

Clarendon Press : OUP 1979 598pp £20.00

ISBN 0 19 811863 5

Lovers of hymnody, historians of the evangelical revival, and literary men will alike welcome the first volume of the scholarly edition of Cowper's prose and letters. It brings delight not only for its illumination of one of England's greatest poets and hymnwriters but of his friend John Newton. Naturally Cowper did not write to him when they were neighbours at Olney, but once Newton had moved to London, Cowper wrote frequent, affectionate and amusing letters, as well as to other correspondents.

There have been a number of published collections of Cowper's letters. In the first, published in 1803, three years after the poet's death, William Hayley suppressed and edited in such a way that he was largely responsible for the myth (quite untrue) that Newton was the principal cause of Cowper's later insanities. The letters as actually written show, on the contrary, Cowper's warm affection and gratitude to Newton both as pastor and delightfully human friend.

The North American editors deserve congratulation for the scholarship, care, and the background information they provide. James King is associate professor of English at McMaster University and is working on a biography of Cowper. Charles Ryskamp is director of the Pierpont Morgan Library, New York. He owns quite a few of the originals. They express their indebtedness to the work of two Cowper scholars now dead: Professor Hannay, an American, whose great collection, now at Yale, is the main source for the volume; and Kenneth Povey, an Englishman who listed a vast number of scattered Cowper letters.

In addition, this volume transcribes the most reliable—and fairly recently discovered—manuscript of Cowper's *Adelphi*, the account of his conversion and that of his brother. His holograph is lost, and this version is an early copy by Maria Cowper of a copy made by Newton within a year or two of Cowper's original. It is an evangelical classic.

The bulk of the volume consists of the letters, transcribed either from Cowper's holograph or, if that is undiscovered, from the earliest copy. Here, for instance, is his immediate account, now correctly dated and exactly reproduced, of how he wrote 'O for a closer walk with God'. There are many glimpses of life at Olney, and a few of Newton. Sadly, the letters come to a complete stop between November 1772 and May 1776 when Cowper had lost his reason; but when he recovers, though never quite dropping his sense of doom and alienation from God, he resumes his writing without any loss of descriptive power. And since, as he says, he only writes to amuse himself and his recipient, the letters have a charm and spontaneity which carry the reader back to the joys, sorrows and trivia of an age long gone.

Rose Ash, Devon

JOHN POLLOCK

THE SCOTS KIRK IN LONDON GEORGE G. CAMERON

Becket Publications : Mowbrays 1979 272pp £5.95 ISBN 0 7289 0009 2

In his first sermon as minister of St Columba's, Pont Street, London in 1902, The Rev. Archibald Fleming thus explained the Kirk's presence in the metropolis: 'Here in London there is a Scottish population equal to that of a great city. And our chief business is with them. We are not a Presbyterian Mission to Englishmen. We are at peace and in sympathy with the great National Church of this southern kingdom. . . . We are neither Nonconformists nor Dissenters . . .'

This is just one of the many informative passages found in a work by the former associate minister of St Columba's as he tells something of the extent of the Kirk's contribution and outreach in areas such as education, social welfare and medicine. Crown Court Church, Covent Garden, claims to have founded the first Ragged School in London. It also claims as a past minister the Rev. John Cumming, once a disciple of Edward Irving, who rather lost credibility in the congregation when, two months before the date in 1867 he had prophesied would see 'the end of all things', he renewed the lease of his house for 21 years. Another long-time minister of Crown Court, Dr Joseph Moffett, referring to the coming and going of Scots in London, likened it to 'preaching to a procession'.

This book fills a gap, but it has an irritating tendency on occasion to get things slightly wrong. The Revolution Settlement was in 1690 (p 27); Thomas Boston died in 1732 (p 232); the World Council of Churches was founded in 1948 (p 221); it was the Queen who laid the foundation stone of the new St Columba's (p 213); Dr Scott's initials were R.F.V. (p 219) and his only degree was an honorary one (p 211); there is now only one Church of England congregation in Scotland (p 219); and page headings in Appendix X (pp244ff) five times nonsensically print 1970 instead of 1760 as the year when the first Scottish presbytery was established in London.

St Andrews, Fife

J. D. DOUGLAS

LIBERAL CATHOLICISM, REFORM CATHOLICISM, MODERNISM: A Contribution to a New Orientation in Modernist Research THOMAS MICHAEL LOOME

Matthias-Grunewald-Verlag, Mainz 1979 452 + vii pp, DM86
ISBN 3 7867 0660 3

This is the most important new book for students of Roman Catholic modernism since the publication of Emile Poulat's masterly study in 1962. Professor Loome calls his work a 'handbook for modernist research'; not a history of modernism, but an examination of the preconditions for such a history. It has four parts: a critical and interpretative essay with special comment on Tyrrell, Bishop and von Hügel; extended bibliographies; a catalogue of unpublished sources; and a selection of unpublished texts. His major concern is to establish a longer perspective on the crisis that occurred around the turn of the century and the work that was condemned by the encyclical *Pascendi* in 1907.

First, a number of minor points. Loome has collated an immense amount of scattered information, but the problems of keeping up to date are evident. On Tyrrell alone, it should be noted that a large number of letters to Wilfrid Ward have now been deposited at St Andrews, as have ten letters to Os-

borne; and that the letters to Bremond are no longer in the hands of Père Blanchet, who died several years ago. Of the discrepant references to O'Connor's article in the *Downside Review* (pp 15, 282), the first is correct. There are other minor inaccuracies to be tidied up in a second edition.

More disturbing is the method. Loomé holds out the ideal of the impartial historian, and makes the assumption that he cannot be found because all historians of the period are 'Catholics' and take sides: 'That such impartiality is seldom attained to by an historian is all too understandable. He too, after all, is a Catholic . . .' (p 126). Actually, the philosophical understanding that was developing at this time would lead one to expect partiality in the historian and to welcome it as a hermeneutical tool. Backing off from the writing of history does not solve the problem.

What Loomé says about Tyrrell (which is the part of the book I feel most qualified to judge) is stimulating and illuminating, especially when he brings out Tyrrell's predilection for calling himself a liberal Catholic rather than a modernist, certainly until 1907, and his concern to establish his intellectual pedigree. The result is that we need not see Tyrrell's career as a series of 'U-turns', and I am sure this is correct. In my own research on Tyrrell I shall use this handbook frequently, but with care.

St Edmund's House, Cambridge

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY

THE FATE OF THE ANGLICAN CLERGY: A Sociological Study

ROBERT TOWLER and A. P. M. COXON

The Macmillan Press 1979 248pp £8.95

ISBN 0 333 25632 8

This thought-provoking book is written by two men who met as students at the Hostel of the Resurrection in Leeds, both intending to be ordained. Neither of them was. Instead, Robert Towler is lecturer in sociology and associate lecturer in theology and religious studies at Leeds University, and Tony Coxon is professor of sociological research methods at University College, Cardiff.

The period under review is the decade of the 1960s. The authors began their work in the early sixties and ended before that decade was through. Their work, done with great care, deserves to be examined critically and their conclusions tested empirically by all who are engaged in the selection and training of ordinands. Members of ACCM and its committees should study the book, and I can see it as being a useful work for group study by staffs of theological colleges of all 'colours'.

I found myself wishing—vainly of course—that there had not been almost a decade between the termination of the authors' research and the publication of their findings. For the decade of the 1970s was one of great significance for all institutions of learning, and not least for theological colleges. The 'temper' of the closing years of the seventies was very different from that of its opening period, and this might have affected some of the conclusions reached.

The influence of the charismatic movement on some of the theological colleges was considerable during the last decade, an influence which seemed to transcend—almost to bypass—considerations of churchmanship; but this is only very briefly mentioned in the book.

Five colleges were taken for special 'sample' studies: St Chad's, Durham, Oak Hill College, Westcott House, Mirfield, and Queen's College, Birmingham. I suspect that results might have been different if, among the evangelical colleges, a less conservative college such as Wycliffe Hall, Ridley

Hall, or St John's College, Nottingham had been chosen rather than Oak Hill. As it is, according to the index, Ridley and Wycliffe are mentioned but once, and St John's, Nottingham not at all. (The first two celebrated their centenary three years ago, and St John's, born in 1863, is one of the biggest in the country. All three are full.)

One of the issues pinpointed in the book and calling for the most careful consideration is the trend which takes colleges away from a closed model of training and towards an open model—men living outside the college, their training no longer firmly within it. The book points out that the consequences will be far-reaching. They will indeed. For good, or ill?

'At the moment', say the writers in a final chapter which looks briefly at the 70s, 'numbers are rising very slightly, but we believe this to be only a temporary phenomenon.' Why?

A book to make us ask questions, and therefore to be welcomed.

Sissinghurst, Kent

+ DONALD COGGAN

MARRIED TO A MINISTER GILLIAN SIMONSON

Epworth Press 1979 159pp £2.75

ISBN 0 7162 0342 1

Combining vigour with penetrating insights, Gillian Simonson shares with us a very personal story of her life before she married, and then her experiences of marriage, honeymoon and of being a Methodist minister's wife. With a background of public school, and father a high-ranking naval officer, she had been involved in travel and the 'round of cocktail parties and dinner parties'. Her rebellion from this background took her to teach in a difficult school in a deprived area of London, and when she married Geoffrey she adjusted happily to his 'working class, socialist, pacifist, Methodist Chapel people.'

Gillian's account covers two churches, one in the Midlands and one near London, and then ends with service abroad with the Methodist Church Overseas Division. The book is easy to read; Gillian could be sitting and chatting to you. It is delightfully feminine: while telling us about her honeymoon we are suddenly sent back a few years to her joining Kingsway Hall, and then back to her unique honeymoon.

Social justice and social issues run right through the book, which make her efforts to start a school for gipsy children, and also her visit to America, fascinating reading. Her asides at the end of one chapter, as her husband walks into the room to see how her book is progressing, are delightful. Her attitude to money, to accepting old furniture from someone in the congregation, to buying at a jumble sale for her family, were without any feelings of self-pity.

Those of us who are clergy wives will enjoy the tensions and the humour in the book, but for those who are married to a man in training for the ministry, for theological college wives' groups, it would make an excellent discussion book. As I read this book I gradually warmed to this very human wife, who happily questions much that we take for granted, is willing to put new ideas to the test, and yet gives her husband her full support.

London W1

MYRTLE BAUGHEN

ALL TRUTH IS GOD'S TRUTH ARTHUR F. HOLMES

first published by Eerdmans, USA 1977

IVP 1979 147pp £2.50

ISBN 0 85110 599 8

If I hesitate in my criticism of this book, it is for good reason. First, it is a

timely treatment of a very significant subject, reason and faith. Some evangelicals are under the impression that anti-intellectualism has been laid to rest. Would that that were so! Apologetics still remains strangely unpopular in the United Kingdom.

Secondly, it contains a passionate rejection—as it should—of the secular/sacred dichotomy. This continues to trouble evangelicalism, despite recent improvements. The real problem is that there is still no 'Christian mind', so involvement in the secular is seriously handicapped.

The author begins by outlining the loss of the very concept of truth in modern western society, a theme which echoes Francis Schaeffer's in *Escape from Reason*. The first chapters are then devoted to clarifying what the Christian view of truth is, and what it implies for our involvement in the world. 'The Christian witnesses by the breadth and depth of his involvement in God's creation.' (p26)

All this is excellent, and the last chapter returns to the theme. Christians must *emphasize* truth, for example in education: 'If man is to be man and to live life whole in God's world, then the loss of truth in education must be reversed. The Christian should be the first to see this and act accordingly . . .' (p129) In the arts and in society: 'The Christian's concern for truth in society need not always take a negative and critical form. We must do more than take exception. We must take initiative, with creative plans and proposals that can help reshape society, at least in part.' (p139) The author deals with the subject helpfully and with a restrained passion, the book having great value for chapters 1, 2, and 8 alone.

Thirdly, the book is well written. Although the subject matter is explicitly philosophical, it seems difficult only occasionally, and there are many helpful, though brief, analyses of well-known philosophers or trends in philosophy. The third chapter, for example, gives a history of how reason and faith have been related to one another in previous generations: Augustine, Aquinas, Anselm, Descartes, Kierkegaard, etc. The student will find such insights invaluable; as also the treatment of inductive and deductive reasoning in chapter 6.

Fourthly, there is a reminder that truth is not always easy to grasp. In a chapter entitled 'All Those Errors', Holmes challenges a simplistic reading of Scripture. Quite correctly he points out that Scripture is not exhaustive; and the task of interpreting it is sometimes complicated. Given the debate on inerrancy today, however, the commitment to Scripture should have been more clearly stated.

Fifthly, and most importantly, the book emphasizes that man's knowledge is *personal* and not just intellectual. Man relates to the truth not just as a brain, but as a whole person. Here is the 'heart' of the book. Echoing writers like Polanyi and Dooyeweerd, he insists that along with 'metaphysical objectivity' (that things are true 'out there') there must go 'epistemological subjectivity' (personal faith and commitment) (p6). In a sense this is obvious, but it needs to be stressed in the recovery of a Christian epistemology today.

It is in this connection that he criticizes Francis Schaeffer, whose emphasis upon the objective aspect of truth and the place of the mind, Holmes says, is 'as much an echo of Enlightenment rationalism as a renewal of biblical insight.' (p47) This is a curious and revealing comment. If Schaeffer has become known for anything in recent years, it is for his stand on the necessity of revelation. Man's epistemology, Schaeffer insists, must be rooted back in the objective existence of the personal God of creation and in God's revealed truth in Scripture. Could anything be less like an echo of Enlightenment rationalism? One can agree that Schaeffer may have expressed himself unguardedly at times. In his desire to recover the biblical emphasis upon objective truth—truth which can be seen in the 'form of the universe' and

'the mannishness of man', etc.—one can argue that he has not stressed sufficiently the subjective elements present in an individual's *approach* to the truth. Such criticism is understandable, but only then on the basis of a very partial and severe reading of Schaeffer's work. The corpus of his work clearly indicates that the subjective element is not only present but highlighted, e.g. in *True Spirituality*.

It is suggested that the point at issue lies elsewhere. Holmes says that 'Schaeffer does not clearly distinguish between reason as *understanding* and reason as *proving* universally true propositions. The former of course is essential to any Christian view of reason, but not necessarily the latter.' Intriguingly, he goes on: 'Yet the kind of reason from which modern man has escaped following Kant and Kierkegaard is more the latter than the former.' (p47) But, we may ask, ought modern man to have been allowed to escape like this? Is it not at this point that the church has failed so miserably? For the apostle Paul states explicitly that man is intellectually inexcusable in rejecting God's truth (Romans 1); it is in this area that God's judgement is first revealed, because men suppress the evident truth. Consistent with this, we find him arguing with Jews and Gentiles to convince them of the truth. His attitude is: 'We destroy arguments and every proud obstacle to the knowledge of God, and take every *thought* captive to obey Christ.' (2 Cor. 10:5) This NT emphasis is noticeably absent throughout the book. The arguments put forward for 'justifiable beliefs' in chapter 7, valuable as they are in many aspects, need to be read against this background. Much on the positive side is helpful: that we can conclude through the mind the rational coherence, empirical adequacy, and human relevance of our faith. But there is little if anything on the negative side: e.g. the use of such reasons or evidences against unbelief—to *demand* assent. At this point Schaeffer is more biblical.

One fears that Holmes' legitimate desire to recover a whole personal approach to knowledge and faith has led him to a weaker view of reason than is necessary. Why this is so is not altogether clear from the book. Yet when he states that his preference for the whole-personal approach 'reflects the post-Kantian emphases on the primacy of the practical over theoretical reason' (p104), he exposes a serious weakness. (It may be significant, in fact, that he refers, in the same context, to Robert Blaikie's *Secular Christianity and the God Who Acts*, for Blaikie has a similar, though more drastic, critique of Schaeffer. See on this Carl Henry's excellent comments in *God, Revelation, and Authority*, Volume III, pp 243-7). Holmes is not, as Blaikie, challenging antithesis or espousing a dialectical epistemology. Yet the dangers of a 'preference for the practical', can be readily seen in Blaikie. To avoid such dangers there needs to be an unequivocal commitment to the principle that, since all truth is God's truth, all error and unbelief—in the major issues at least, where the Scripture speaks authoritatively and finally—is culpable. Such emphasis, as has been said, is strangely lacking. This, along with the criticism of Schaeffer as an 'echo of Enlightenment rationalism', gives rise to a degree of uneasiness. This is unfortunate, for otherwise the book has great merit.

L'Abri Fellowship, Greatham, Hampshire

RANALD MACAULAY

**THE LURE OF DIVINE LOVE: Human Experience and
Christian Faith in a Process Perspective**
NORMAN PITTENGER

The Pilgrim Press, USA 1979 \$6.95

USA ISBN 0 8298 0370 X

T. & T. Clark 1979 193pp £3.35

UK ISBN 0 567 29100 6

Norman Pittenger has for a number of years been a popular exponent of

'process theology'. This present work consists partly of printed lectures and partly of a reprint of his 1967 book *God in Process*. As in all 'process thought', there is a constant stress on development, both of ideas and persons, and most characteristically of God himself. Such an approach has become big business in North America but has so far found few followers over here. Philosophically, process theology marks a return to the evolutionism of Samuel Alexander, Lloyd Morgan and Jan Smuts, but more recent stimulus has come from the writings of A. N. Whitehead and Teilhard de Chardin. Perhaps its most rigorous exponent is Charles Hartshorne.

On this view, theology is a construct of human experience which is a part of an evolutionary, cosmic process. For this reason, no conclusions are ever conclusive. But most of the injunctions which form the first half of Pittenger's book are neither entailed by, nor entail process theology. This is so particularly in the case of educational principles in which the persuasiveness of love and the need to be educated for the future are stressed. But this lack of connection is hardly surprising, since 'process' is such a vague word. Who would be so churlish as to deny that there are processes?

But the claimed implications of process thought for the body of Christian theology are much more serious. The point to watch here is that the process 'perspective' has been welded on to the older liberal idea that Jesus Christ came to give a vision of pure unbounded love. Divine judgement is regarded as an exercise in tyranny. The incarnation was Jesus energized by God in a supreme degree which in some sense made him one with God. We are to appreciate that in calling Jesus God, the apostle John and Athanasius were doing their best with the language that was available to them. (It's funny how when certain writers say that some theological expression is 'only symbolic', you know what is coming next.)

Again, the idea of 'process' seems neither to entail nor to be entailed by such a view of Jesus. But if this is in fact what a process perspective on Jesus gives us, the implication is clear enough.

University of Liverpool

PAUL HELM

**YOU'VE GOT TO START SOMEWHERE . . . when you think
about education** CHARLES MARTIN

IVP 1979 127pp £1.35

ISBN 0 85110 410 X

I enjoyed reading this slim volume by Charles Martin, though the rather matey, paternalistic style jarred on occasion and made me feel like a somewhat rebellious sixth-former again! The author seeks to fulfil the needs that a Christian student of education has when faced with daunting arguments from those philosophers, psychologists, sociologists *et. al.* who seek to belittle the Christian faith. His synthesis of seven commonly held views about mankind, ranging from the view that 'man is a machine' to 'man is a bounding leap', is masterly in its readable simplicity, and the chapter ends with a stirring exhortation to put on the specs, to bring the blur into focus . . .

Unfortunately, the scope of the book is very limited and the reader may be left asking questions, feeling stimulated but unsatisfied. There is a need for books written in the same intelligible and reasoned way as this, but at far greater length and depth. Then and only then will the average education student have any idea of how to use his Christian faith to think through some of the difficult questions that current educational theory poses.

London NW1

GILLIAN HYLSON-SMITH

**GOD'S PEOPLE IN GOD'S WORLD: Biblical Motives for
Social Involvement** JOHN GLADWIN

IVP 1979 191pp £2.95

ISBN 0 85110 596 3

This volume is about biblical motives of convinced Christians for social involvement.

At one of the early meetings of the council of the Shaftesbury Project in 1969, it was agreed that top priority should be given to enable an evangelical theologian to develop an authoritative scriptural case for Christian involvement in society. This is the result. The council was not to know that John Gladwin would be the director of the Project by the time it was published, but in choosing him they clearly have a man who has conviction undergirding his energy.

The author starts by showing that this subject is not new in Protestant thinking. He goes on to suggest that some evangelical theology has too often ignored reality and, as such, that some courses of action suggested have proved unworkable. When this happens, he argues, the theology which explains the belief is wrong!

The following three chapters ground the reader in the doctrines of creation, redemption and man. He states that 'the tragedy of so much of our Christian life today is the wretched way in which we have divorced the truths of Christ from their power in human life.' A chapter on the biblical meaning of the world, and another on corruption (particularly in politics), set the scene for the more complex part of the book: that on the kingdom and the state, and their relationship with the church.

When the author turns to the question of practical policies which Christians might pursue within and outside political parties, he suggests that the Bible does not allow us to waffle in generalities and universals: 'Scripture encourages us to be specific . . . it gives us a framework within which to develop our political responses.' He goes on to show how the decalogue helps us 'to see the shape of righteousness in human life'—a theme Sir Fred Catherwood and other laymen have been expounding.

In these chapters some important issues are discussed (e.g. Marxism, culture, the social services) and it is therefore a pity that there is no index. Nevertheless, this book is a milestone in biblical thinking about Christian living in the community. It is a book that Christians in positions of leadership can confidently recommend to younger Christians who are concerned about being involved in a secular society.

London EC4

SIMON WEBLEY

CHARISMATIC RENEWAL AND SOCIAL ACTION:

A Dialogue Malines Document 3

CARDINAL SUENENS and DOM HELDER CAMARA

Darton, Longman and Todd 1980 98pp £1.95

ISBN 0 232 51468 2

This short book is a united affirmation, by two eminent and respected Roman Catholic leaders, of the integral connection between spiritual renewal and social action. It has an authority out of proportion to its brevity, because each participant exemplifies personally the case that he is making. Cardinal Suenens is a man spiritually rooted in his relationship to God in Christ who, for that very reason, finds that he must be concerned for the poor of the world and for the eradication of the unjust social structures which cause their poverty.

Archbishop Camara of Brazil, on the other hand, is equally the exemplification of the man whose passion for social justice drives him again and again to prayer as its only sustaining and purifying source of strength. Cardinal Suenens speaks for both when he says, 'When we peremptorily accuse the "spiritual" Christian of pietism and the "socially committed" Christian of materialism, we are, in fact, doing an injustice to both. . . . The gaze of the crucified Christ is fixed on the Father, and his heart is penetrated with love for all men: the cross is at once vertical and horizontal.' (p 9) Dom Helder spells out challengingly and specifically what that involves. It is fascinating to see how two eminent Catholics address themselves to these questions with which we are all having to grapple. Cardinal Suenens neither dismisses nor accepts uncritically the liberation theology of South America, but insists that spiritual salvation and political liberation must neither be separated nor identified. To grasp clearly how the two are related would require a discussion of the eschatological dimensions of God's purpose in Christ and its relationship to the present world order, which the scope of this book does not allow. Archbishop Camara's plea for both prayer and action, and the way he presents it, raises in a new context hoary questions about the relationship of God's grace and man's action. If we stress the latter, we tend towards synergistic activism; if the former, to grounded hope.

St John's College, Nottingham

THOMAS A. SMAIL

DECISION MAKING IN MEDICINE: The Practice of its Ethics

edited GORDON SCORER and ANTONY WING

Edward Arnold 1979 211pp £6.50

ISBN 0 7131 4342 8

This is an excellent book, aimed at doctors (rather than theologians), in which the editors (who contribute one chapter each and one section jointly) have collected contributions from sixteen acknowledged experts in their field. The text is easy to read and cohesive, so that it is not apparent that so many different authors are writing. Each subject is handled in a way which is comprehensive but concise, clear and convincing.

Subjects covered include introductory chapters on moral values, law and religion, and the doctor's freedom under authority. There follow problems arising from genetic advances (with a helpful introduction to genetic counselling), contraception and sterilization, termination of pregnancy, sex education, child deformity and handicap, decisions about dying and death, and the use and misuse of drugs. Problems in clinical psychiatry are discussed with a helpful (though brief) section on attitudes to, and treatment of, sexual deviations, and the subordinate role of drugs in treatment to helping patients 'resolve or accept their problems in a clear, undrugged state with a sympathetic listener alongside.' Then follow chapters on the ethics and safeguards of research (particularly upon human subjects) the influence of financial constraints on patient care (with comparisons between different countries) and professional remuneration, and preventive medicine (in which such issues as water fluoridation and immunization are discussed). There is a final helpful chapter on the doctor himself.

Throughout the book there is a mature discussion of differing views but beneath the surface is a clear (and unashamed) commitment to the 'Judaeo-Christian heritage', and in particular to the example and teaching of Jesus Christ.

As might be anticipated in such a multi-author book, the prominence given to the specifically Christian viewpoint (where there is one!) varies. Thorny

issues are carefully balanced. For example, the chapter by Rex Gardner on 'The Termination of Pregnancy' clearly and honestly surveys the differing views of doctors today. He rightly draws attention to what your reviewer regards as the key issue—when does the fetus become a living individual? We do not know. If a few cells growing soon after fertilization already have a soul, then abortion is a much more serious thing for the Christian than if the child has his spirit breathed into him as he breathes air into himself. The poignancy and difficulty of rigid rules for management are well demonstrated; there is no easy answer. The hazards of termination of pregnancy in teenagers, in terms of subsequent fertility and emotional problems, are clearly faced. After all this Gardner concludes: 'For those in the Christian tradition, the religious understanding of the value of unborn life will always lead them to be very reluctant to interfere except on firm diagnosis of a serious condition and after all discussion with paediatrician and the parents.' (p 71)

A further indication of the painful dilemma in which doctors are sometimes placed is given by Antony Wing in his chapter on 'The Impact of Financial Constraint'. Writing as an expert and practical physician, he shows how the funds available for treatment, particularly for the more expensive kinds such as renal dialysis, must influence his treatment and thus must involve ethical considerations. If all cannot receive treatment, who is allowed to die? There is no easy answer; nor, it appears, is there a particularly Christian answer. But the Christian has a particular responsibility in his use of, and attitude to, limited resources, as Wing shows: 'If doctors do not develop a method and ethic for choosing priorities in the face of economic pressures, then others will take the decision for them.'

Chapters conclude with a list of references and, in places, a guide to further reading. At the end of the book there is an appendix listing twelve codes of medical ethics, some being much more comprehensive than others.

Your reviewer gets the distinct impression from this book that if more thoughtful people who speak or write about the ethical aspects of medical care in Britain today were to read it, they would be a lot wiser and more sympathetic to the poignant problems faced by the conscientious doctor doing his best for his patient.

The editors, contributors and publishers alike have done a good job and are to be congratulated.

London NW2

DAVID H. TRAPNELL

THE WOUND OF KNOWLEDGE: Christian Spirituality from the New Testament to St John of the Cross
ROWAN WILLIAMS

Darton, Longman and Todd 1979 193pp £4.75

ISBN 0 232 51425 9

This is a truly remarkable book, which both gives depth to the current interest in spirituality and indirectly provides very salutary and searching comment on many of the fashionable theological issues of today. It originated in lectures given to ordinands at Mirfield and Westcott House, and it is extremely heartening to know that students in at least two theological colleges have benefited from teaching of such depth and quality.

Rowan Williams himself describes the book as 'an introduction to the ways in which a succession of Christian saints have attempted to articulate their vision of their Christian calling, the diverse ways in which they responded to

the call towards wholeness.' He considers in turn the spirituality of Paul, John, Ignatius of Antioch, Irenaeus, Clement of Alexandria, Origen, Athanasius, Basil, Gregory of Nyssa, Gregory of Nazianzen, Augustine, Luther and St John of the Cross. In every case he brings profound insight and illumination, but what emerges as a thread of burning gold is the centrality of the cross as the embodiment in human flesh of the love of God ever active and embracing creation to redeem it; the cross which Christians are to experience if they are to 'live with the baffling plurality and diversity of God's manifested life—law and gospel, judgment and grace, the crucified Son crying to the Father', and to discover that 'in the midst of the fire we are heated and restored—though never taken out of it.' Yet because the need to die in order to live is seen as a sharing in the life of God who is Love—a sharing of the divine *relation* of the Son to the Father—the note of celebration and joy is never absent.

I was fortunate in being able to study this book during a period of sabbatical leave, for study is what it demands and deserves. It is beautifully written but with a precision and a realism which disturb and invigorate. As a bishop, it has always been my practice to encourage pastors of the flock, whatever else they may read, to have one solid book on hand to which they can turn over a period for nourishment and stimulation. If they choose *The Wound of Knowledge* for this purpose they, and thereby their parishioners, cannot fail to be deepened in their understanding of their faith, but, what is more important, also be renewed in the vision which will inspire them to know God as Love more fully through obedience.

Lis Escop, Truro

+ GRAHAM TRURON:

HOLINESS AND THE WILL OF GOD: Perspectives on the Theology of Tertullian GERALD LEWIS BRAY

Marshall, Morgan and Scott 1979 179pp £6.95

ISBN 0 551 05593 6

This book is intended as a contribution to the current debate on the Christian life by means of a study of Tertullian. It is enjoyable to read, and can be studied with profit by the theologian, the minister, and by the layman who is determined not to be rattled by the occasional esoteric argument.

The life and teaching of Tertullian are re-evaluated, and the church's reaction to him reassessed. His teaching on holiness, his attitude to authority in religion, and his moral directives, receive particular attention. It is a consistently radical book: everything is questioned. Those whose picture of Tertullian is that of a Christian writer who was a professional lawyer, became a Montanist, and had a weakness for believing absurdities, will emerge from the book chastened men—how could they have believed so much on so little evidence! Dr Bray demonstrates that reliable evidence about Tertullian is scarce: perhaps every man makes Tertullian in his own image! Is this because Tertullian is such an elusive character?

It appears that the significance of Tertullian for Dr Bray does not lie in his particular ideas on moral issues. His importance lies in that he believed that 'Christianity was a complete intellectual system independent of pagan philosophy. Its base lay in historically verifiable objective truth', with a plausible claim to be based on 'an authentic divine revelation accurately transcribed in a book' (p 153). It is Tertullian's intellectual attitude, and his attitude to the Bible, which is of value.

So do not read this book looking for easy directives to holiness! The message of the book is of the need to adopt consciously an independent intellectual stance governed by Christian presuppositions. This should result in loyalty to the gospel: will it also result in a Tertullianesque rejection of the present world? If we follow Tertullian's example, how will we avoid his mistakes?

St John's College, Durham

PETER ADAM

THE KINGDOM OF LOVE AND KNOWLEDGE: The Encounter between Orthodoxy and the West A. M. ALLCHIN

Darton, Longman and Todd 1979 214pp £3.95

ISBN 0 232 51437 2

Canon Allchin, one of the leaders, on the Anglican side, of the movement for Anglican-Orthodox dialogue, has produced a book of essays—most of which have been published before in journals such as *One in Christ*, *Theology*, *Christian* and *Sobornost*—all of which have a common theme. He argues that it is the divorce of systematic theology from prayer, silence and worship, going back to the centuries before the Reformation, which lies at the heart of western Christianity's problem: presenting a God who can be believed in. This divorce has obscured the reality of God by making theology an intellectualized pursuit, aimed at achieving a definition of God, and spirituality something separate from the outward structures of the church and of belief—a separation characteristic in different ways of Catholicism and Protestantism alike.

From this basic premise, Canon Allchin pursues two integrated themes. The first, that Eastern Orthodoxy can aid the West in reintegrating theology and spirituality, because Orthodoxy has achieved a balance between tradition and experience, between the outer and the inner. In his view, Orthodoxy can make life-giving, as opposed to death-dealing affirmations about God, because, in its theological tradition, it has refused to define or confine the Deity in words. It begins from the basis of the utter mysteriousness of all that can be said about God, and precisely because the start is made here, it is possible for man to be liberated and enabled to enter into 'the operations of God's grace which transform and fulfil man's nature.' This first theme is then worked out in studies of three differing theologians: Symeon the New Theologian, Ann Griffiths, and N. F. S. Grundtvig.

The second theme is that Anglicanism has a latent and unrealized closeness to Orthodoxy. He examines the Trinity and incarnation, the liturgy, episcopacy and comprehensiveness in the Anglican tradition, to show how Anglicanism has always claimed to have no specific doctrines, sacraments or church order of its own, but has simply sought to maintain what it has received from the whole Christian tradition. Another group of three theologians are then discussed: F. D. Maurice, Evelyn Underhill, and Vladimir Lossky, to whom the work is dedicated, and whose influence permeates the whole book.

The book is well written, and is an important contribution to Anglican-Orthodox understanding.

Ridge Vicarage, Potters Bar, Herts

JOHN SIMPSON

SHAPING THE COMING AGE OF RELIGIOUS LIFE

LAWRENCE CADA et al.

The Seabury Press, USA 1979 197pp

USA ISBN 0 8164 2207 9

distributed in UK, Eire & W. Europe by SPCK £2.95

'The major experience in the last ten to fifteen years of religious life', write the five authors, 'has been that of breakdown and disintegration, an experience too little understood in its personal and collective implications. Breakdown and disintegration seem to be the major way the Lord prepares persons and communities for a deep and thorough transformation.'

This book is their response to the crisis many religious communities in the USA are facing. For some years they have been searching for understanding about the renewal of the religious life. The five of them have worked within their own communities and also together as leaders of workshops and conferences on renewal. It is out of this experience that they write.

Their method is to offer three models designed to provide insight into the key questions for understanding the present upheaval in religious communities. The first is a historical model, an overview of religious communities from the third century to the present day. This leads them to identify a series of major transitions, each marked by a change in the dominant image of religious life, which take place at the same time as major cultural shifts in society. They argue that religious communities are now in the middle of such a transition.

Their second model focuses on the life-cycle of religious communities, and suggests that each one at some stage goes through a period of breakdown, after which it either becomes extinct, or survives at a minimal level, or becomes revitalized. It points out the sober fact that three-quarters of men's religious orders founded before 1500 have now become extinct.

The third model offers guidelines for transformation, and indicates what may be expected during the periods of breakdown and conflict, and of darkness and exploration, that precede the development of a renewed community in which traditional understandings and new insights are integrated. I found much in this description that resonated with my own experience in working with a religious community in this country.

Without agreeing with all the authors are saying, the book gave me a sense of their basic soundness in understanding what is happening and so offering guidelines to those in the throes of this process. I hope it will be widely read among religious communities, and also that those concerned with transformation and renewal in other parts of the life of the church will learn from the authors' experience.

St Paul's Vicarage, West Bromwich

DAVID DURSTON

THE PASTORAL NATURE OF THE MINISTRY

FRANK WRIGHT

SCM Press 1980 89pp £2.50

ISBN 0 334 01212 0

The starting point for this discussion of ministry is the question 'What is the pastor for?' Frank Wright recalls that in the 'hints and tips' era of pastoral theology, the question was not often raised. Now, after various excursions into different forms of professionalism to find meaning in the pastor's role, new work has been done in pastoral theology and more creative answers to this fundamental question can be explored.

Frank Wright works out his answer in terms of 'vision'—vision of God, vision as awareness of others and self-awareness, vision to inspire spiritual growth, and vision in education, pastoral care and social action. He encourages attention to all manner of sources to stir imagination and sharpen vision.

The picture of ministry he constructs in pursuing his theme is one that is open in style, sensitive, imaginative and flexible. It is centred in God, yet marked by a well-earthed humanity, by availability and vulnerability. It is a ministry that is deeply committed to others for their own sake, and costly to the pastor himself. This seems to me to be an accurate portrait. Spirituality is the key-note of ministry. The essential aim of enabling others to grow and to find their destiny in God, is rightly emphasized. The role of small groups is properly highlighted. The book contains a very brief but interesting discussion of the difference between Christian approaches to growth and fulfilment, and secular self-fulfilment movements.

Inevitably such a short book offers limited treatment of some significant issues. A more thorough definition of pastoral theology—the discipline rightly seen to be fundamental to the whole pastoral enterprise—is needed. I do not think the issue of biblical interpretation is handled very well. The book does not offer a big enough vision of the relevance or creative character of Scripture. I was also left wondering whether such a wide view of what constitutes vision could lose touch with biblical revelation and cease to be properly Christ-centred. Liturgical renewal is taken as something of an 'Aunt Sally'.

All in all, however, I found this a readable, worthwhile and imaginative book. It is one amongst few that attempt to deal with the subject. It asks a vital question and gives a generally satisfying and challenging answer. There is room for more reflection, but this is a book that pastors and would-be pastors must read with profit.

St John's College, Nottingham

PETER ASHTON

ON HYMNS AND HYMN-BOOKS

NORMAN P. GOLDHAWK

Epworth Press 1979 127pp £2.25

ISBN 0 7162 0333 2

Up to about fifteen years ago, a significant new hymn-book in English appeared perhaps every five years. In the last decade no less than 33 have appeared, of sufficient significance to be listed and, in most cases, commented on in this useful little book. The reasons for this outburst are no doubt similar to those responsible for the comparable luxuriation of new versions of the Bible—rapid social and linguistic change, the emergence of a pop culture, the wider span in age and background of our congregations. Everyone concerned with worship now has problems and opportunities in the choice of hymns. This thoughtful, practical and informative little book should prove very helpful.

The author has considerable relevant experience as chairman of the committee of the Methodist Church Music Society, and is now grappling with the problem of revising the Methodist Hymn Book which he discusses in some detail. He writes with warm appreciation of the value of hymns in public worship and private devotion, to evoke a sense of the divine presence, to express Christian doctrine in memorable words, to invite sharing in deep spiritual experiences, to open our eyes to God and the world around us, and to unite us in thankfulness and praise. He begins with a short historical sur-

vey which brings out the pivotal importance of Watts and Wesley and, on another plane, of the appearance of A & M! (An unfortunate error, but the only one I have found, is that Hymns A & M Revised, which appeared in 1950, has been twice dated in 1972.)

A useful chapter follows on the types of hymns we sing—objective and subjective, scriptural and social, evangelistic and personal—and an informative review of the contemporary scene. A chapter on hymn-books deals with problems of arrangement, language, theological changes, transience, and the possibility of an agreed ecumenical hymn-book, which he considers to be somewhat remote! The best chapters for me were the last two: on what to look for in a good hymn (and its tune) and how to use hymns in a service of worship; these are packed with shrewd analysis and wise advice.

The book shows sympathy with a wide variety of hymns, but the author especially values those with scriptural roots, and clearly exposes the strengths and weaknesses of modern trends both in lyrics and music. Hymns, he reminds us, can both set forth the gospel and express our individual and corporate response to it. Their selection is a high enterprise which should be the co-operative responsibility of president and organist. Their path will be greatly illuminated by a study of this book.

Kendal, Cumbria

H. MARTYN CUNDY

THE MUSIC OF THE ENGLISH PARISH CHURCH

Cambridge Studies in Music

Vol. 1 447pp £30.00

ISBN 0 521 22045 9

Vol. 2 213pp £15.00

ISBN 0 521 22046 7

NICHOLAS TEMPERLEY

CUP 1979

Here at last is an adequate, fully researched account of English parish music. There have been other smaller studies, such as C. H. Phillips, *The Singing Church*, London 1945, and E. Routley, *A Short History of English Church Music*, London 1977, which have attempted to give some account of parish music, but they have given more attention to the cathedral music tradition and, consequently, offer but cursory accounts. Nicholas Temperley, professor of music at the University of Urbana, has given us a pioneer study which will long be the standard work on the subject.

Following the Reformation there were two musical traditions which developed in the Church of England: the cathedral tradition, which has been subjected to numerous historical surveys; and the parish church tradition, which, until this study by Temperley, has almost entirely been ignored. It is a masterly piece of work which not only deals adequately with the music itself—of which generous examples fill the second volume—but also with the social, political, theological and ecclesiastical climates in which the music was produced and performed. Temperley takes us through the various periods of decline and revival, noting the irony that when parish music declined it was largely due to the indifference of the clergy, and when there was a revival it was usually more for cultural than religious reasons—the exceptions being the Reformers, Puritans, Evangelicals and Tractarians, who had theological reasons for the parish music they promoted.

Temperley gives somewhat scant attention to the reforms of the later years of Henry VIII's reign—for example, Coverdale's *Goostly Psalmes* are dismissed in just six lines—and his study really begins with the reign of Edward VI. He offers a well-rounded survey of the general situation, as it is known, of

the place of music in worship during these years of reform. However, his suggestion (pp 8 & 13) that in most cases organs, noted in the church inventories of 1552, were generally dismantled, is misleading. Admittedly, in some churches all organs were removed, but the reforming movement had a limited rather than a rejecting influence. If, for example, the inventories for London parishes are examined it will be discovered that many churches had two organs. Their locations in the churches are not recorded in the inventories, but it was usual to site one on the rood screen and the other in the chancel. The inventories show that where there were two organs only one was generally dismantled—undoubtedly being destroyed along with the rood screen—but the other was retained for use. However, Temperley comes into his own when he discusses the origins of English metrical psalmody. He reveals the important recent discovery of an English metrical psalter, printed for use of the exiles in Wesel in 1556 [STC 2426.8, Houghton Library, Harvard University]. This psalter clearly shows that some of the metrical psalms and hymns were written earlier than has been thought hitherto. It also provides evidence that Sternhold's metrical psalms had already become well known and therefore may have been widely sung in England in the reign of Edward VI. (See further Temperley's article, 'The Anglican Communion Hymn: 3' in *The Hymn* [Published by the Hymn Society of America] Vol. 30 No. 3, July 1979, pp 178-86).

Temperley suggests that the early English psalm tune may well be the remnant of an early popular music tradition: as these melodies lack firm rhythmic and melodic form, the author suggests that this lost tradition, unlike the unison counterparts of other European countries, was essentially a *harmonic* one. This is certainly a fascinating suggestion, but it needs more evidence before it can be accepted.

Of major importance is Temperley's description and explanation of 'the old way of singing'. It lies at the heart of the study and is indeed the reason for its existence. In America in recent years the local, somewhat rustic, church music traditions and composers (esp. William Billings) have been thoroughly investigated (see, for example, R. Stevenson, 'Protestant Church Music in America', in F. Blume, *Protestant Church Music*, London 1975, pp 637-90). At first it was thought that this was a distinctive North American phenomenon. But various pieces of evidence have come to light which show that its origins are to be found in this country. However, when Temperley tried to trace the tradition back across the Atlantic, he found the area virtually un-researched and therefore had to begin this study of his own. By 'the old way of singing' is meant the curious modifications the melodies underwent as they were passed on from generation to generation. Other scholars have accused psalm-tune editors, such as Playford, of modifying the original forms of the melodies. But Temperley demonstrates that these editors simply noted down how these tunes were then being sung: it was not the psalm-tune editors who modified the tunes, but the oral tradition of the people across the generations. First, there was the tendency to sing the tunes slower and slower until they almost stopped altogether. The once more spirited tunes gradually became transformed into ponderous pieces in which each note was held for several seconds. Temperley suggests that the unaccompanied tradition of singing was to blame. But such an answer is too simple when one takes note of the fact that the same process also took place in Holland and Germany, countries where organ accompaniment was customary. The second feature of 'the old way of singing' was the tendency to modify the melodic line: as the tunes were sung slower and slower, improvised grace-notes were introduced which eventually were considered to be part of the tune itself. Again, it is surprising to find no reference to continental practice. For example, in Scandinavian countries there was a similar tendency to modify

older melodies (e.g. see the hymn-book produced for the Swedish Royal Chapel in Paris [*Hymnes, Psaumes et Cantiques Spirituel*, Strasbourg, 1758] and a Danish hymn-book of 1764 discussed by Carl von Winterfeld, *Zur Geschichte heiliger Tonkunst*, Vol. 2, Leipzig, 1852, pp 87-112).

The evangelical movement of the eighteenth century is carefully and sympathetically discussed. Speaking of the barrenness of the previous century, Temperley writes: 'The clergy washed their hands of parish music, and, with honourable exceptions, remained aloof until the evangelical movement roused their consciences from a long slumber.' (p 88; cp. pp 99, 242, etc.) Even though there are small lapses—for example, Romaine's conservatism with regard to metrical psalmody has nothing to do with his supposed belief that only the Old and New Versions were legally permitted for use in the Church of England (p 208), but everything to do with his belief in the doctrine of the inspiration of Scripture—here is a significant account of the early Evangelicals and their concern to end the silence of congregations by encouraging them to sing hymns, and, surprisingly, to chant the prose psalms as well—an evangelical innovation, as Temperley notes (see also *Churchman*, Vol. 93 (1979), p 378f).

The author is similarly revealing with regard to the Tractarians and their successors. Contrary to popular belief, they were not the originators of chancel organs, surpliced choirs, choral services, and the rest. All these things had been introduced before the Tractarian movement began. Paradoxically there was much in common between Evangelicals and Tractarians with regard to church music. As Temperley explains: 'Both had as their ideal the full and hearty participation of the congregation in all parts of the singing . . . Both were prepared to sacrifice aesthetic matters to this higher aim . . . both were willing to admit hymn tunes of secular origins and inferior musical quality, if these would induce the congregation to sing.' (p 275f) But although both wings made their contribution, the Church of England was not radically changed by their efforts. Temperley concludes: 'So it was that the middle ground of parish church music was won by an originally high-church form of service that was nominally congregational, but in which the choir and organ tended in practice to monopolize most of the music. In the new arrangement of churches, the choir was set apart from the people by its physical position, its apparel and formal appearance, and in many cases by its processional entry and exit. All these features tended to associate the choir with the clergy and to separate it from the people. To the congregation, the service was perceived as a performance provided for its benefit, in a separate part of the church set before it like a stage.' (p 276)

This is the Anglican parish-church tradition—a sort of scaled-down version of the cathedral tradition—which we have inherited. Where we go from here lies outside of the scope of Temperley's study, but he does express his own opinion in his overview of the twentieth century. Two of his conclusions seem somewhat reactionary. First, he regards the Victorian hymn tune as the true, popular religious music of the people which must not be lost: 'There is no pressing need for new hymn tunes at the present time.' (p 348) Second, he is convinced that the introduction of speech-rhythm psalters has been a disaster for the congregational chanting of the psalms: only well-trained choirs can really sing from a speech-rhythm pointed psalter; the old *Cathedral Psalter*, and others like it, may well have produced an inartistic result, but congregations could at least sing from them tolerably well. Personally, I would defend him on his second conclusion and oppose him on the first.

Unfortunately there are one or two factual errors that have crept into the text. For example, Clemens non Papa was not the editor of the early Dutch psalter, *Souter Liedekens*, 1540 (p 18), and the hymn *Ride on, ride on in majesty* was written by H. H. Milman, not Heber (p 263). But these are

minor blemishes in a most useful piece of work, which ought to be read and carefully studied by everyone concerned with or interested in the worship of parish churches.

Cogges Priory, Oxon

ROBIN A. LEAVER

OTHER BOOKS RECEIVED

Asgill Press *Five Griefsongs over a Fallen City*, Gordon Jackson, £1.00 (limited edition of 400)

Christian Focus Publications *The Days of the Fathers in Ross-shire*, John Kennedy, £3.75, first published 1861; *The Beauties of Boston: selection of the writings of Thomas Boston*, Samuel M'Millan, £5.95, first published 1831

Christian's Library Press USA *The Elders Handbook: a practical guide for church leaders*, Gerard Berghoef and Lester De Koster, US\$12.95

Collins Liturgical *Baboushka: a musical legend*, Donald Swann and Arthur Scholey, £4.00; *Known upon Earth: a study guide to the Old Testament*, Mary Lenaghan, £1.80, first published in New Guinea 1977; *Life Forever: a study guide to the New Testament*, Mary Lenaghan, £1.00, first published in New Guinea 1977

Cruse *Selected Poems*, Margaret Torrie, £1.50

Falcon Books *Body Building Exercises for the Local Church*, Eddie Gibbs, £1.10

Falcon Books: Kingsway Publications *Good News to Share*, Gavin Reid, £1.25

Fowler Wright Books *The Making of a Hospice*, Mary Champion, £1.95

Geoffrey Chapman *Priest in the Village: experiences of African community*, Aylward Shorter, £6.95; *Becoming Catholic even if you happen to be one*, James J. Killgallon, M. M. O'Shaughnessy OP and Gerard P. Weber, £2.95, also published by ACTA Foundation USA

Gowan USA *Operations of Increasing Order*, John Curtis Gowan, US\$5.00

Hellenic College Press USA *Three Byzantine Sacred Poets*, ed. Nomikos Michael Vapouris, US\$3.25

Hodder & Stoughton *My Personal Prayer Diary*, Catherine Marshall & Leonard Le Sourd, £1.75, first published in USA 1979; *The Soldier's Armoury: the Bible reading plan with daily commentary July-December 1980*, ed. Clifford W. Kew, 80p, published with the Salvation Army

JSOT Press *A Biblical Guide to New Testament Research*, ed. R. T. France, £1.45

CHURCHMAN

Kingsmead Press *The Story of Hymns*, Doris M. Hodges, £3.50

Kingsway Publications *A Bouquet of Love*, Meg Ashley, £1.10, first published by Tyndale House USA 1979; *Vision for Unity*, Eric Houfe, 95p

Mowbrays *Parish Evangelism*, Michael Turnbull, £1.50; *Preaching Through the Acts of the Apostles*, D. W. Cleverley Ford, £3.25; *Preaching Through St Paul*, Derrick Greeves, £3.25

Paternoster Press *John Wesley: his life and theology*, Robert G. Tuttle Jr, £6.50, first published by Zondervan USA 1978; *The Peculiar People*, Mark Sorrell, £6.00

Pickering & Inglis *Uganda Holocaust*, Dan Wooding & Ray Barnett, £1.50, also published by Zondervan USA

St Andrew Press *An Introduction to the Reformed Tradition: a way of being the Christian community*, John H. Leith, £4.25, first published by John Knox Press USA 1977; *The Prophetic Line: the genius of Hebrew religion*, John Baker, £1.95

SCM Press *Religion and Theology 5: a select book guide*, ed. SCM, £1.25

SPCK *Consider your Call: a theology of monastic life today*, Daniel Rees et al., £6.50 (paperback), first published (hardcover) 1978; *Young Readers Bible* (RSV), £4.95; *Hearing Confessions*, Kenneth Ross, £3.50, first published 1974; *Wind on the Sand: the hidden life of an anchoress*, 'Pinions', £1.50

Unwin Paperbacks *The Way of Transformation: daily life as spiritual exercise*, Karlfried Graf von Dürckheim, £1.95, first published in UK 1971, in Germany 1962

Yale University Press *The Discovery of Dura-Europos*, Clark Hopkins, ed. Bernard Goldman, £12.60