

Book Reviews

WRESTLING WITH LUTHER. *John R. Loeschen*. Concordia, 1976. 195 pp. \$9.50.

Theologians fall into two classes: those who understand Luther and those who don't. Loeschen falls clearly into the first class.

He provides two titles to his book, a main title and a sub-title. It is perfectly true that the book is a wrestling with Luther, for both author and reader wrestle with the great theme of 'God with man' in the many ways that Luther handled that theme. The sub-title of 'An introduction to the study of Luther's thought' is not true in the sense that a beginner could start with this book as an introduction to Luther's thought, for it is much too technical and difficult, but it is true in the sense that a student of Luther could be introduced to a pattern of thinking to enter Luther's own thinking. The book certainly evokes an empathy in the reader for Luther's approach to theological issues.

If it is possible to simplify the argument, to tell the reader what he is likely to find in the book, it could be argued that Loeschen finds the key to an understanding of Luther in certain pairs of dialectical terms, for example Law-Gospel, flesh-spirit, *simul justus – simul peccator, regnum dei – regnum mundi*. He takes the tension represented by the phrase *coram deo – coram mundo* and, using this as a kind of magnifying glass, brings Luther's great themes into focus. He discovers that it is faith, always seen as a gift from God as much as the Incarnation was a gift from God, which enables him to understand these tensions creatively: faith empowers him to differentiate and relate, in and through Christ, flesh and spirit, Law and Gospel, God and the world, God and man. Loeschen at this point sheds a great deal of light not only on Luther but on our theological understanding. He shows how we may discern God's hiddenness and at the same moment have revealed to us God's activity in His creation. He further shows how a Christian man may understand his own life as a realisation of faith and see Christ as the realisation of God's purpose in creation.

The book is difficult to read and understand, but it is highly rewarding in that the reader knows he is wrestling with the real knotty problems which life presents to us. The author must have known it was difficult, for after each round in the wrestling match, he pauses for breath, tells the reader

what he has just effected, then what he is next to effect, and finally puts his head down and goes into the next round. It is a significant book. The reviewer awaits the next with interest and expectancy. JAMES ATKINSON.

THE ENGLISH CATHOLIC COMMUNITY 1570-1850. *John Bossy*. Darton, Longman and Todd, 1976. 446 pp. £12.00.

Dr. Bossy has written a most thorough and important study of the English Catholic community, from the launching of the English mission to the re-establishment of the hierarchy. He approaches his subject both as a historian and a sociologist. To quote his introduction, 'In the end, what I have been after is the religious and social experience of the average Catholic.'

This is an area that abounds in myths: about the survival of the pre-Reformation church, the missionary priest and the priest-hole, the later ubiquity of the Irish. All of these Dr. Bossy handles critically. He paints a picture of a stable community, painfully emerging at the end of the sixteenth century and gradually facing up to the reality of the Reformation, expanding healthily for a while, but then becoming too much the domain of an inward-looking gentry, who often employed missionary priests as family chaplains. In the eighteenth century, the clergy emerged from this domestic captivity and by the time social conditions were beginning to change rapidly, a hundred years later, the Catholic community and its clergy were in far better fettle to meet the challenge than the Church of England, and the tale is one of missionary success, the success of a basically English community, much swelled by Irish immigrants.

A number of fascinating themes emerge. For instance, the tension between the Jesuits, trained and equipped for mission, and the secular clergy, who for a long time looked backwards, seeking the stability of the pre-Reformation situation. This was one reason the community was slow to adapt. Another theme is the dependence of the clergy upon the support of the gentry, and the need to break from this before they could minister to the community as a whole. It is also intriguing that Dr. Bossy sees English Catholicism as part of the nonconforming tradition, rather than a body on its own. He draws parallels with the Quakers and Presbyterians.

The particular value of this book is that it is so deeply grounded in local history. It is full of detailed information on the nature, strength and distribution of the Catholic community, and there are splendid vignettes of the life and work of the clergy. Yet I must confess some dissatisfaction. Because of his refusal to 'tell the story' whilst giving so many elements of it, Dr. Bossy has in fact produced a book of essays, held together by certain clearly enunciated themes.

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY.

Churchman

THE GREAT AWAKENING: A History of the Revival of Religion in the time of Edwards and Whitefield. *Joseph Tracy*. Banner of Truth Reprint, 1976. 433 pp. £2.75.

The 'History' of the Great Awakening by Tracy was first published in 1842 and was both the first full history of the whole phenomenon and one of the most detailed and judicious as well. There is a wealth of original material behind it, worked over by a careful and penetrating mind. Tracy himself was a Congregational minister in Massachusetts until 1874 and was also author of the *History of American Missions to the Heathen* in 1840. This work has been the basis of all subsequent history of the Revival since, and provides a wide-ranging account accompanied with documents of the contemporary church life that sets the revival fully in context from the ecclesiastical point of view. There are also comments on the social background but far less than in more recent studies of the Awakening. Although obviously sympathetic to the cause of evangelism and 'vital religion' Tracy offers discriminating assessment of the mistakes and errors that attended the revival, and with the abundance of reference and quotation from many ministerial diaries and records, makes apposite comment upon the varied attitudes and resulting activities of the clergy and churches in the States affected. Whitefield of course is closely studied and comes under the kindly but clear-sighted analysis of his life and work. Edwards is rightly esteemed for his great stature although his part in the revival is not exaggerated to suggest anything other than the wide-ranging aspects of it, with many taking part. There is a valuable final chapter that makes an over-all critique of great usefulness. The Banner of Truth Trust have done well to provide the book once more for easy access, well produced at a modest price. Its reading and pondering will be of wider benefit than simply that of gaining a good historical knowledge of the Great Awakening. There are implied lessons, and some clearly spelt out, of no small value for present edification. G.J.C. MARCHANT.

RELIGION AND SOCIETY IN INDUSTRIAL ENGLAND: Church, Chapel and Social Change 1740-1914. *A.D. Gilbert*. Longman, 1976. 251 pp. £5.95.

This fascinating book aims to show how industrialisation and political and social change have affected the churches in this country from the Industrial Revolution till the first World War. Dr. Gilbert's argument is that Wesley's revival led Methodists, Congregationalists and Baptists to give first priority to 'conversionist endeavours' (i.e. evangelism); to achieve this they resorted to itinerancy and village preaching and relied on the active involvement of laymen. Because of these three factors Evangelical Nonconformity grew more rapidly than the Anglican Church between 1740 and 1840. In Victorian times it was the other way round: Nonconformists began to build

spacious and expensive chapels, to concentrate on increasing their professional ministry, and most important of all, to devote great energy to their Sunday Schools. This meant that they had, consciously or not, come round to the idea that it was better to breed and nurture Christians than to go out into the highways and byways and bring them in. Dr. Gilbert says that a successful Sunday School teacher before 1840 would be withdrawn from his children and sent out into the villages to preach. He contends that the issue over church schools at the time of the Balfour Education Act of 1902 was made more bitter because the same child might attend a Church of England school all week and a Nonconformist one on Sunday; this was particularly in one-school areas.

Another value of the book is to show from which social class, and from which division within that class, the denominations have drawn their members. On the whole Baptist and Congregationalist communities have included a significant number of skilled craftsmen: tailors, carpenters, hatters, masons etc. Primitive Methodists drew more from the unskilled workers. Evangelical Nonconformity as a whole has recruited certain types of artisan: hand-loom weavers, miners, quarrymen and fishermen, but not domestic servants or rural labourers.

In the period after 1840 all the major churches had their peaks and troughs with the exception of the Roman Catholics. With the Baptists and the Primitive Methodists peak years usually correspond to times of revival. The dates Dr. Gilbert gives are 1849, 1859-60, 1874-76, 1881-83, 1904-6. He refers to these as 'short-lived resumptions of the kind of growth which had been normal during the earlier phases of mobility'. The Church of England gained some ground as 'exuberant patriotism' and a national church seemed to belong together; there may have been some jingoistic Methodists and Baptists, but it is not an idea that comes easily to mind. Both Church and Chapel had deceived themselves that they were really reaching the inhabitants of a nation when, in fact, they were reaching children who did not persevere in their religious practice after leaving Sunday School. The chaplains in the first World War were astounded how thinly spread was true Christian knowledge and conviction in the men committed to their pastoral charge.

The book is well supplied with charts and graphs, which makes for clarity. It adds another book to Wickham's *Church and People in an Industrial City*, Inglis' *Churches and the Working Classes in Victorian England*, Soloway's *Prelates and People* and McLeod's *Class and Religion in the late Victorian City*; all of which have produced new insight into the real relationship of the churches with the industrialized working class.

MICHAEL HENNELL.

Churchman

THE CALL TO SERIOUSNESS: The Evangelical Impact on the Victorians. *Ian Bradley*. Jonathan Cape, 1976. 224 pp. £4.95.

William Wilberforce set himself as his objective, in the same year (1787) in which he undertook abolition of the slave trade, 'a public effort at reforming manners' (*Life* I, p. 129). He wrote in his journal: 'God has set before me as my object the reformation of manners.' It is one merit of Dr. Bradley's work to show how remarkably successful he and the other 'Saints' were in achieving their aim. By the period which most occupies him (1830-60) they had succeeded in transforming the *ethos* in which national life, and particularly public life, was lived from an aristocratic code of *honour*, where slighted statesmen fought duels with parliamentary critics, to their own code of *duty*. It was a call to seriousness indeed. To Wilberforce it was morally offensive and irresponsible that, in the crisis conditions of 1798, the life of the king's first minister should be risked in a duel, and it is a sign of how far his susceptibilities became a nationally accepted mood that it impossible to think of a Victorian prime minister like Gladstone putting personal slights above public interest in this way. Duty triumphed.

Dr. Bradley's book is addressed to a wide reading public and because of this is likely to shape the general view of Victorian Evangelicals for better or worse. It is grounded in wide reading, well-substantiated but extremely readable. His chapters cover the important areas, and are well chosen. In tone, he is attuned both to the heirs of Lytton Strachey and the Victorian debunkers and to the reassessment of the remarkable achievements of Evangelicalism by scholars like Kitson Clark and G.F.A. Best. His writing lies somewhere between the heavy irony of F.K. Brown's *Father's of the Victorians* (1961) and the warm, but scholarly, sympathy of Georgina Battiscombe's *Shaftesbury* (1974). His judgements are generally sound and perceptive and well illustrated from the imaginative literature of the day as well as from historical sources and writing. Occasionally, nice judgment is sacrificed to the demands of readability (for example, his remarks on the role of the New Zealand missionaries (p.87) in the annexation of the colony by the Crown are formally correct but give a strongly misleading impression — they wanted Crown intervention not from covert imperialistic motives but to prevent the grasping exploitation of the Maoris by the uncontrolled greed of the European settlers 'beyond the law'), but generally he is to be followed on both fact and interpretation. It is worth asking, therefore, what is his credit and debit balance for nineteenth century Evangelicalism?

First, on the credit side, he holds Evangelicals largely responsible for a greater sense of responsibility in public life. They were not the only force (Thomas Arnold was another) but they were the dominant one: 'Integrity was the principle on which Evangelicals again and again insisted . . . instead

of the false notion of honour' (p. 169). In politics a man must be prepared to set aside his own interest (a novel theory to many eighteenth century practitioners) and even risk his seat for what he believed to be right, as Henry Thornton wrote. This stress on integrity and duty extended beyond parliament, and the ideal of the Christian statesman, to the Civil Service and the professions, as the author shows. The Trevelyan-Northcote reforms of 1854, which gave us the modern entry to the Civil Service by competitive examination, were initiated by an Evangelical in C.E. Trevelyan, a leading supporter of CMS during his period in India, and resulted in a cadre of officials who 'were often from Evangelical backgrounds . . . brought up at home and at school to the disciplines of hard work and regularity, (who) regarded their job as a vocation . . . a matter of absolute moral duty' (p. 163). In the demanding period of urban growth, this devotion to duty stood the nation in good stead. What was true of the civil servants was true of some of the great soldiers like Havelock and Herbert Edwardes, as also of the colonial administrators, like the two Lawrences in India or James Stephen at the Colonial Office at home. The stress on duty and integrity made its impact in banking and commerce: the characteristic Evangelical virtues of 'accountability, regularity, honesty and integrity' 'could have been designed deliberately for businessmen and financiers' although, where risk-taking and tycoonery were involved, they were less advantageous (p. 158).

In his chapter on the Evangelicals' impact on the Church, Dr. Bradley again finds them responsible for a profound alteration. In regard to the generality of Evangelical clergy, he judges the debunkers to have left an unfair picture. After listing the literary portraits in Dickens, George Eliot and others, which often imply cant, hypocrisy and even cruelty, he finds instead that the 'characteristics most generally displayed by Evangelical clergy before 1860 were strong and simple piety, self sacrificing devotion to the service of others and unceasing labour and activity. Few of them showed any intellectual brilliance but they nearly all had a keen and compassionate concern for the welfare, both temporal and spiritual, of the souls committed to their care' (pp. 63-4). On home and family life, he corrects the impression left by Samuel Butler and others: rather than a simple legacy of guilt and fear most children of Evangelical families received something 'very much more positive . . . a rigorous and thorough education, a high degree of self-discipline and self-respect and a strong urge to do good in the world' (p.189).

What of the debit account? First, Evangelicals of the period are found to be guilty of an excessive censoriousness. Rigorous self-examination made it a welcome change to find fault in others, perhaps (p. 31). Even the reigning sovereign was not above such rebuke when he offered a Sunday

Churchman

dinner invitation in 1832. Henry Thornton himself incurred rebuke from his wife-to-be for allowing his proposal of marriage to arrive on a Sunday. As part of this unattractive and Pharisaic quality, they showed, again like the Pharisees, a lack of sense of proportion leading to excessive puritanism – Dr. Bradley notes that James Stephen gave up cigars from sheer enjoyment. His other example is less happily chosen, as Henry Venn's renunciation of cricket on ordination, however deplorable, was prior to his Evangelical period, and it was Venn of Huddersfield who made it, not as Dr. Bradley seems to suggest, the secretary of CMS of his chosen period (p. 28). Finally, Dr. Bradley holds Anglican Evangelicals responsible for divisiveness in the church, both parochially and nationally. He cites clergy who would only associate with the regenerate among their parishioners, and a tendency to litigation in the mid-century churchmanship controversies. This is difficult to deny, although one would hardly choose the Gorham case, as he does, to drive home the charge! (p. 71)

Readers of this review will remember Charles Simeon's description of the portrait of Henry Martyn in his rooms at King's, which seemed to say to him, 'Do not trifle, do not trifle.' We can be grateful to Dr. Bradley for reminding us of the remarkable impact that the call to serious living made on Victorian society, and for the balanced assessment he has tried to give of both the strengths and weaknesses of the 'importance of being earnest'.

T.E. YATES.

JOHN HENRY NEWMAN AND THE ABBE JAGER: A Controversy on Scripture and Tradition (1834-6). *Edited from the original manuscripts and the French Version by Louis Allen.* OUP, 1976. 202 pp. £7.50.

THE THEOLOGICAL PAPERS OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN ON FAITH AND CERTAINTY. *Partly prepared for publication by Hugo M. de Achaval, S.J. Selected and edited by J. Derek Holmes with a note of introduction by Charles Stephen Dessain.* Clarendon Press: OUP, 1976. 170 pp. £5.50.

Professor Owen Chadwick has said that when Newman rose in wrath he could write cleverer pamphlets than anyone in England. Although Newman dismissed the French Abbe Jager as 'the most ignorant of men and the most inconsequent of reasoners' he nevertheless found him formidable and 'inexhaustible' as a controversialist. Jager had agreed to exchange letters on points at issue between the Roman and Anglican Churches with Newman's Oxford friend, Benjamin Harrison, but he proved unequal to the struggle and persuaded Newman to take over from him. There followed three long letters on the relation between Scripture and Tradition. These are now published in English for the first time and the editor has skilfully interposed summaries of

Jager's own lengthy effusions. There is also an excellent introduction emphasizing how much Newman was influenced by Jager. It is made clear how Newman used some of this material in his later work, and it is intriguing that his ideas of the development of Christian doctrine and his gradual rejection of the *Via Media* are partly dependent on this correspondence with the maddening Frenchman who more than once broke his promise to publish Newman's letters in their entirety and translated 'next' by 'ou'. It is more than thirty years since Fr. Tristram expressed surprise that English scholars had done so little work on the Newman-Jager correspondence. The present book fills the gap admirably and casts a valuable light on Newman's developing thought as an Anglican.

The other book consists of hitherto unpublished Theological Papers all dating from Newman's Roman Catholic period. We find him writing in 1885: 'From the time that I began to occupy my mind with theological subjects I have been troubled at the prospect, which I considered to lie before us, of an intellectual movement against religion, so special as to have a claim upon the attention of all educated Christians.' These words are an echo of his Rome speech delivered in 1879 when he was made a Cardinal: 'For 30, 40, 50 years I have resisted to the best of my powers the spirit of liberalism in religion.' These papers are further evidence of this lifelong resistance and of Newman's preoccupation with the meaning of faith and certainty. It must seem strange to us that he was charged with scepticism; we can only agree with his claim that 'I not only asserted, with a strength of words which has sometimes incurred censure, my belief in religious truth, but have insisted on the certainty of such truth, and on Certitude, as having a place among the constituents of human thought; analysing it, discriminating it and giving tests of it . . .' The key definition of Certitude occurs in the most interesting and readable section of the book, the preparatory work for *A Grammar of Assent*, 1865-9. 'Certitude is an assent, deliberate, unconditional, and conscious, to a proposition as true.' As we endeavour to follow Newman's mind at work elsewhere in these papers we may well share his view, expressed in the Lecture on Logic, that 'to enter upon the Study of Philosophy is like entering a labyrinth'. Amen to his complaint in the essay on the Conceivable, that 'thoughts like these make us giddy and dismay us with a sense of the feebleness of our intellectual powers'.

ROGER JOB.

W.R. MATTHEWS: Philosopher and Theologian. *H.P. Owen*. Athlone Press, 1976. 84 pp. £1.50.

The late Dean of St. Paul's is perhaps most widely remembered as a writer for his Saturday column in the *Daily Telegraph*. As an academic theologian

Churchman

he is a somewhat neglected figure, partly because, apart from one major work, *God in Christian Thought and Experience*, much of his output consisted in scattered essays and occasional writings. By way of posthumous tribute, Professor Owen has compiled a survey of Matthews' thought based on these sources, grouping his material under three main headings: 'The concept of God', 'Religion and reason', and 'Christology and ethics', and concluding with a critical assessment of his work.

Despite his Modernist label, Matthews was no radical. As the title of his main book suggests, he took the tradition of faith and practice in which he stood as a datum and sought to make it intelligible to the inter-war generation. He was more successful in some directions than others. At points he shows himself under the sway of an Idealism that was already becoming dated, and his attempt to press Freudian categories into the service of Christology, while natural at the time, begs too many important questions; but his basic loyalty to the Biblical roots of Christianity is throughout apparent.

Perhaps because Matthews was relatively untroubled in his spiritual inheritance compared with some of his continental contemporaries, he never attained major stature. Nevertheless he emerges from Owen's book as a serious Christian thinker of a typically Anglican mould.

FRANKLYN DULLEY.

A BULGAKOV ANTHOLOGY. Edited by James Pain and Nicolas Zernov. S.P.C.K. 1976. 191 pp. £5.50.

THE RELIGION OF THE RUSSIAN PEOPLE. *Pierre Pascal* (Trans. Rowan Williams). Mowbrays, 1976. 130 pp. £2.95.

The life of Sergius Bulgakov has a strikingly modern ring. He reacted early against a clerical background and education, turning from Christianity to revolutionary Marxism. Rather against his natural bent, he studied political economy and wrote substantially upon capitalism and agriculture. His heart, however, was restless and the longing for faith did not leave him. One of the most moving items in this splendid anthology is a vivid account of his conversion in 1908. Ordination followed, but not for another ten years, when the Bolshevik successes challenged the Muscovite professor to a decisive response. For another five years he taught in the Crimea, but was then exiled. In 1925 he went as professor of dogmatics and dean to the new Russian Orthodox Theological Academy in Paris, where he taught and wrote for twenty years, besides being much involved in the ecumenical movement. He died of cancer in 1944.

I can imagine no better introduction to Orthodox theology than these extracts. They are clear and deeply spiritual. They spring from a long tradition of eastern devotion, and yet Bulgakov writes as one who never

forgets the challenge of secularism and pragmatism. The sermons bring out the warmth of his preaching, and his essays stress the positive ecumenical contribution that Orthodoxy has to make: there are clear explanations of the concept of *sobornost* and his own distinctive sophiology, the unitive principle of his theological work. When I had finished reading the book I felt that I knew and loved the man. I also knew why he loved Orthodoxy.

The Religion of the Russian People makes a splendid complement, as Pascal is writing, not about the faith of the *Intelligentsia*, but about the belief and practice of what he calls the 'provincial and rural masses', which, in the Russian context, is quite a different thing. This is the realm where Christian teaching merges with folk-lore to produce an alloy that has shown the most amazing resilience in the face of fifty years' consistent persecution. What are the distinctive qualities of this religion and why has it proved so tenacious? These are the questions that Pascal sets out to answer in this slim volume, which is really part of a larger work on the peasant culture in Russia.

If the thought world of Bulgakov proves surprisingly accessible, the world described by Pascal, a world of apparent superstition and near-idolatrous devotion, could not be further removed from Western protestanism, though not so far removed from the plethora of legendary and apocryphal material in any predominantly peasant society. The Russian experience has been one of the victory of the peasant mentality, which is fundamentally religious, over the proletarian or even bourgeois irreligion of doctrinaire Marxism.

Unfortunately Pascal makes no comment on developments since the War. What we are given is a splendid background study for the reading of anything from *The Brothers Karamazov* to *The Gulag Archipelago*. The style is anecdotal. Pascal writes from first-hand knowledge, and by including the text of 'The Pilgrimage of the Mother of God among the Torments of Hell' he illustrates well the kind of apocryphal writing that captivated popular imagination. It is unfortunate that a book which is relatively expensive has a large number of misprints.

NICHOLAS SAGOVSKY.

SOLZHENITSYN'S RELIGION. N.C. Nielsen. Mowbrays, 1976. 164 pp. £4.95.

One of the most impressive facts which faces the student of the history of the Christian Church is that the Lord of the Church has a remarkable way of producing men and women fitted to meet the recurring crises of the Church's life.

Men's ideals of the Church of England's ministry are at their lowest, and behold, Charles Simeon spends his long life in Cambridge altering the

Churchman

whole picture and sending out into the ordained ranks men whose hearts (and minds) God has touched.

The Church in the West is content, enjoying its art and its culture, and inclined to take it easy in Zion. Albert Schweitzer appears, and in one dramatic gesture of self-abnegation shows the world that he counts all things but loss for Christ, and goes and buries himself in Lambarene. Or again, the world trembles at the sight of the Soviet domination and even the Church utters an uncertain protest. Solzhenitsyn emerges, like some prophetic light in a dark sky, and dares to utter a mighty 'No' to the atheistic tyrant.

Those of us who saw it will not soon forget the television programme in which Solzhenitsyn recently spoke of his fears for the West, whose morale he saw to be broken and enfeebled. There was something infinitely solemn in the sheer integrity of this man's bearing – a man who himself had suffered long years of incarceration in Soviet prison camps for his witness to the truth as he saw it with awful clarity.

This book is by an American who has travelled widely in the satellite countries of the Soviet bloc and who has obviously read deeply in Solzhenitsyn's writings. It has a Preface by David L. Edwards. I have not found it an easy book to read – should I be unkind in styling it a trifle 'bitty'? But it is worth working at, for the author seeks to uncover what it is that accounts for the fearless life and the prophetic note of the great Russian writer. 'Solzhenitsyn,' he writes, 'speaks of his first cell as his first love. Only there did he begin to know his inner life. The Hebrew-Christian warning against idolatry became meaningful; only God is absolute.' 'The Christian understanding of creation, the fall and redemption underlies Solzhenitsyn's writing; he has accepted this analysis.'

Not the least valuable part of this book is Solzhenitsyn's long Letter to the Third Council of the Russian Church Abroad which first appeared in September 1974. It tells us much of the deepest feelings of one of God's great modern servants.

DONALD CANTUAR:

MYSTERY AND IMAGINATION. *R.P.C. Hanson*. S.P.C.K. 1976. 113 pp. £2.25

The Cover picture and the title, as the author tacitly admits in his preface, are not transparent to the subject which is handled inside the cover. The book represents, as the author says, 'what I have come to believe about the Christian faith during fifty years of knowing something about it and thirty years of thinking about it'. It is 'a hand held out towards those who are groping towards Christian belief but have not yet reached it'. Reading the book with that objective in view I found it an extremely useful guide. It begins with a survey of recent theological development in the West. It has chapters on the doctrine of man, on freedom, on faith, on the importance

of history, on Christology and on the dimension of tragedy. These subjects would be part and parcel of any introduction to Christian doctrine but Professor Hanson's book is far removed from the dry as dust treatment that these subjects too often get in the academic lecture room or the academic text book. And this is due in part, I believe, to the fact that the books starts where we are — with the ever pressing problems of identity, of conflict and of violence. I would certainly be happy to offer this book to anyone who is 'groping towards Christian belief' and finds himself alienated from the administrative and dogmatic structures of the Church as he experiences it. He would not have to read very far to identify himself in Professor Hanson's scenario.

Those who have read Professor Hanson's previous books or have heard him lecture will be looking for the usual devastating phrase and rapier criticism. They will not be disappointed. So of the reaction to Barth's work in England, he says 'Very few Anglican scholars found it possible to break the deep peace of their Senior Common Rooms in order to master the vast indigestible tomes of this German Protestant'; of death of God theology he says, 'Some bold theologians have reached the striking conclusion that theology is the art of saying nothing about God'; of Jehovah's Witnesses 'founded as a result of the miscalculation of the end of the world, and called after a misapprehension of the Hebrew name for God'. However, in a book in which, throughout, one feels the vulnerability of man in desperate need of grace, I choose to end with this quotation which so neatly sums up the human condition, 'Indigestion can ruin a poem.'

STUART EBOR:

THE BRINK OF MYSTERY. *Austin Farrer*. S.P.C.K., 1976. 171 pp. £3.95. A book of sermons I suppose serves at least three different constituencies. The hard-pressed clergy addressing themselves to the same congregation week after week use it to replenish their failing stocks. A layman may use it to make up for the deficiencies of his regular Sunday diet. And for others, clergy and lay, it serves as a way of acquiring theological knowledge in a form more palatable than is common in great works of systematic theology. Austin Farrer's style is highly distinctive and I would doubt if any of us could reproduce it convincingly in the pulpit but no parish priest could fail to profit from the highly vivid and imaginative way in which he handles such themes as 'Providence, Mystery and Evil' or 'Predestination' or 'The Silent Christ'. And certainly those who sit in the pew week after week and feel deprived would find enough sermons in this collection to last for nearly a year. But perhaps Austin Farrer's greatest gift was to make theology palatable and exciting. I offer this as an example of his homiletic art from the sermon entitled 'Responsibility for Our Friends'. 'In the year of grace

Churchman

1929 (always allowing that I remember correctly) I dropped my spoon into my soup. I dropped my spoon into my soup, a fault I do not commonly commit: but then the circumstances were peculiar. I was attending an Old Balliol dinner a couple of years after going down . . .' Could anyone in the congregation that morning in Keble Chapel in 1967 have failed to be captured by so remarkable an opening?
STUART EBOR:

INTERPRETATION AND BELIEF. *Austin Farrer*. S.P.C.K., 1976. 210 pp. £5.95.

Any lecturer who can achieve and increase an audience for a 12.00 noon lecture on a Saturday in Oxford is a very remarkable man. Austin Farrer did just that in the years following the second world-war – and many of us who were there still remember those amazing lectures on the Apocalypse of St. John the Divine. And now we have a series of occasional papers from his hand edited by Charles Conti with a foreword by Eric Mascall. They have all the marks of Austin Farrer's famed originality of mind and tenderness of spirit. He was never one to crush the bruised plant or to extinguish the smoking flax. Among the 16 papers exhibited here, I particularly appreciated 'The Mind of St. Mark', an introduction to an incomplete MS on St. Mark found among his literary remains; an essay on 'Infallibility and Historical Revelation'; a reprint from *The Socratic Digest* entitled 'Can Myth be Fact?' But perhaps the most significant papers from my point of view were the two BBC transcripts – 'The Inspiration of the Bible' (broadcast 1952) and 'The Gospel as "Good News"' (broadcast 1963) – significant to me because they show how an original and erudite mind can be made accessible to the general public. I quote from the first one – 'They say the Bible makes good reading, but unless you are concerned for the everlasting salvation of mankind, you will prefer to look for your reading elsewhere . . . If you read the Bible otherwise than as the word of God, you will yawn over most of it' Or this, 'Here am I speaking about God at this moment; if, by a miracle, you could change the wavelength and hear God himself, I take it that you would turn me off'.

I have never had any desire either as a student or subsequently as a teacher of theology to turn Austin Farrer off. Even where I did not understand, I was enthralled by that singularly uncommon blend of wide learning and striking simplicity. You may have been denied the pleasure of attending his Saturday lectures in Oxford, but you can achieve a certain acquaintance with him through this book of occasional papers. I hope that you enjoy them.
STUART EBOR:

THE SIGN OF JONAS. *Thomas Merton*. Sheldon Press, 1976. 362 pp. £3.95. Any reader of *The Churchman* who is considering the possibility of joining the Trappists, ought to read this book first. He will, of course, already be aware that things in monasteries are not as they seem. Monks can be occupied with trivialities like everyone else. Thomas Merton's diary reveals sometimes his concern about the way an alb is worn or irritation at the vocal habits of his colleagues. It reveals occasional bickering and place-seeking. What may surprise the reader, however, is the openness of a so-called silent order to the world and the secular pressures under which at least one distinguished Trappist monk had to live. Guests want to argue about Marx and Freud and Kant. Evelyn Waugh arrives to talk about Hollywood. Picasso is a subject of 'conversation'. Thomas Merton was, of course, an exceptional monk but he was not alone in feeling the pressures akin to those of any executive or hard-worked parish priest. 'In the last two months I do not seem to have done anything else but write business letters and run round in circles.'

The journal is reticent about the traditional ardours of the Trappist order but occasionally they peep through – the dormitory style of life, the unappetising meals, the hard beds, the communal shave. Yet, by way of compensation, for Thomas Merton at least, is his striking and vivid appreciation of the glories of creation by which he felt himself surrounded. 'The low-slanting rays picked out the foliage of the trees and high-lighted a new wheatfield against the dark curtain of woods on the knobs, that were in shadow. It was very beautiful. Deep peace.'

The journal is not just for those who are thinking of joining the Trappists. It is in its way singularly beautiful and highly instructive in the ways of men and of God.

STUART EBOR:

THE POWER AND MEANING OF LOVE. *Thomas Merton*. Sheldon, 1976. 151 pp. £1.95.

This collection of six essays really needs a sub-title, for some are more esoteric than others. It begins and ends with general essays, on the power and meaning of love, and on Christianity and totalitarianism. In between there are writings on Paul Giustiniani, on St. John of the Cross and on the primitive Carmelite ideal, together with a splendid section on the philosophy of solitude.

Yet the works are not disparate. When Merton writes of solitude, he identifies the way in which solitude is at the heart of life. All of us die alone – and if we fill our lives with anything other than the love of God, then our loneliness will never be transformed. Where the love of God is, there must be love for people and for the world. Contemplation and solitude can

Churchman

pathos of Newman's farewell sermon as a member of the Church of England.

Each author has a brief biographical summary and bibliography and each sermon a short introduction touching on its historical circumstances and in some cases, its literary characteristics. ARTHUR POLLARD.

CHRISTIAN COMMUNES. *Andrew Lockley*. SCM, 1976, 119 pp. £2.25. Andrew Lockley's book is the fruit of research sponsored by the World Council of Churches into some of the new Christian communities in Western Europe; one Italian, one German, one Dutch and two English. They present a varied picture, with many differences of approach. They are all, however, 'Christian' (although one or two have shaky foundations) – and they are all an expression of left-wing Christian radicalism. It is a pity that at least one from another stable is not included, for this book will tend to strengthen Evangelical suspicions of WCC. Only one community had any clear concern for evangelism (the Cinisello Community of Milan), and for them it seems to have stemmed from their Waldensian tradition rather than from personal conviction.

But there is much useful material here – and even if some of it is a lesson in how *not* to run a community, learning from one's mistakes is how most communities ultimately succeed anyway. So far as candour is concerned, top marks to the report of the SCM house in Birmingham. I found that chapter quite moving. There is a reality about this book and its 'candid camera' approach. I found the chapter on the Dutch community (Emmaus Community) the most impressive. The two most important lessons for me in this survey were: 1) No community can succeed unless it has a definite work or ministry, however simple, to which all the members are committed. 2) No community holds together and remains decisively Christian unless there is a definite and disciplined devotional life for all its members. MICHAEL HARPER.

HARD QUESTIONS. *Edited by Frank Colquhoun*. Falcon. 140 pp. £1.25 This is a new edition of the book first published in 1967. The number of questions to which answers have been given has been reduced from 50 to 38. Some of the answers have been revised, and there are some new questions.

A wide range of matters are dealt with, and the bulk of the answers have the merit of being simple, clear and biblical. Jim Packer, writing on the uniqueness of Christianity, and John Stott, writing on the death of Christ, do so with their customary clarity. Tony Thiselton's seminal comments on the resurrection body I found particularly illuminating.

The book's virtues are in part its vices. Shortness of space means that some answers are unsatisfying. Even in the interests of conciseness, more

space should have been given to crucial questions. As with all symposia, there is an unevenness of contribution. Making every allowance for the limitations of space, some material is unnecessarily shallow. Hard questions are not best dealt with by soft answers.

Provided the restricted nature of the symposium approach is recognised, however, the book is a valuable tool. It will stimulate further thought and enquiry on the part of those who use it for themselves, and on the part of those whom Christians may be seeking to help. It will also be of use, as the Editor hopes, in providing guidance for young people who are seeking a firmer foundation on which to build their Christian life.

BILL PERSSON.

RELIGIOUS EDUCATION FOR SECONDARY SCHOOLS : THE FIRST THREE YEARS *Edited by David Konstant.* Search Press and Macmillan Education, 1976. 359 pp. £4.25.

The Roman Catholic Church has until very recently shown little interest in the Agreed Syllabuses for R.E., and has concentrated upon provision for its own schools — all of which are Aided schools. David Konstant is Director of the (R.C.) Westminster Religious Education Centre. He edited the Westminster Syllabus of Religious Instruction for Catholic Secondary Schools, first published in 1967, and he now presents what is essentially a lesson book to help the non-specialist teacher as he follows the syllabus. It is the work of many hands, and its writers sometimes have the pupils in mind, and sometimes are writing for the teacher.

The general themes covered are: Creation, God's Message to us, God's Son for us. Each theme is divided into Topics. For example, 'Creation, has two topics: A New Beginning, and Knowing God through Creation. Two or three lessons are allocated to each topic.

The method used is straight-forward teaching by the teacher, who is provided with an outline lesson called 'Developments' (which includes suggested work for the pupils), a Summary, and References for the purposes of illustration. Neither the Discovery Approach nor Group Discussion is contemplated.

The Church of England (e.g. the Sheffield 'Handbook of Suggestions for Church Schools') and the Church in Wales have in recent years provided for their Aided schools handbooks which do not exclude these newer approaches where they seem appropriate. But as these churches have far fewer secondary schools than the Roman Church, their provision for them has been rather inadequate, and it may well be that their non-specialist R.E. teachers, wary of the pitfalls of discussion methods, will find this Roman Catholic production useful. For, though there are references to

Churchman

distinctive Roamn doctrines and to Papal pronouncements, these play a relatively small part and can be easily omitted. The content is generally Christian rather than narrowly denominational. H.J. BURGESS.

READINGS FOR ASSEMBLY. *R.L. Bowley*. Centaur Press 1976. 192 pp. £6.00.

This book for secondary schools is described as containing 'over a hundred readings specially written for school assemblies and class discussions', but there is no apparent pattern in either the choice of subject or the manner of presentation. The few biographical themes, which include T.E. Lawrence, Churchill, Shaftesbury, Eisenhower, Schweitzer, John Bull, Nelson, Thomas A Kempis and William Blake — a variegated assortment! — are sandwiched at random amid a wide variety of other topics such as two 'progressive' schools (Summerhill and Gordonstoun), and discussions about ethical values, spiritual virtues, personal attitudes and moral behaviour.

The only unifying factor seems to be a repeated advocacy of religion because of its practical benefits. To quote: 'A strong religious faith helps because it fosters patience, sympathy, understanding and generosity' (p. 151). Generally, by 'religious' the author means 'Christian', but the Christianity he applauds is commended because it is good for individuals and for society. Christian doctrine gets hardly a passing reference. To quote again, 'to love others as himself is really all religion asks of a man' (p. 148). Exit 'the first and great commandment'! It is all reminiscent of the old liberal protestantism, if not of modern radicalism.

The author is widely read and his readings often contain useful illustrations. One or two hobby-horses apart, his objectives are worthy, but his style and manner of presentation are hardly calculated to hold the attention of a school assembly. The readings will stand a better chance as starters for class discussions, but even here careful selection will be essential. Perhaps the greatest deterrent to a wide-spread use of the book will be its price. H.J. BURGESS.

THE AVAILABILITY OF RELIGIOUS IDEAS. *Ramchandra Gandhi*. Macmillan, 1976. 109pp. £7.95.

This is not an easy book; you would not expect it to be, coming from the pen of a scholar who is at home in both the spiritual tradition of India (he is a grandson of Mahatma Gandhi) and the Western philosophical tradition particularly influenced by Wittgenstein.

His aim is to show, as the title suggests, that a whole range of religious ideas soul, immortality, God, prayer, the mystical, the miraculous, etc. — is available to human beings outside the communities of belief. His thesis is

based on the rejection of the 'immanentist' world-view ('this world is all there is') which he rejects, not because it is a verifiably false position, but on the grounds of its essential unintelligibility.

It is as he discusses morality that he leads us to one of the most fascinating ideas in the book. He argues that there is an adequate non-theistic base for morality within the nature of things, but when faced with 'limit-situations' (e.g. death and suffering) one is driven to what he calls 'an exploratorily communicative seeking' for God — a kind of agnostic's prayer.

His philosophical approach to religion takes the individual to the threshold of asking God, if there indeed is such a being, to help him. He is largely agnostic on the response God makes to such philosophical approaches but finally decides that it must be the gift of faith. He sees the content of this gift largely in terms of the Indian tradition — an intuitive new awareness of the world.

The book offers an original philosophical approach to religion, an originality not just in some of the arguments used but in the rare combination of a Western intellectual approach with an Indian spiritual tradition. To one Western religious man, at least, this made much of his own philosophical tradition more digestible.

DAVID K. GILLET.

THE RELEVANCE OF NATURAL SCIENCE TO THEOLOGY. *William H. Austin*. Macmillan, 1976. 132 pp. £7.95.

It has become common to take the view that science and theology are two disciplines so different in their approach and subject matter that they have little relevance for each other; that scientific theories may come and go, and theological formulations likewise, and the other discipline find little need to sit up and take notice. This little book is a careful examination, by a professor of philosophy, of this position. It does not, in other words, consider whether this or that particular theory has theological implications, nor whether anything similar holds in the reverse direction. Rather it seeks to ask the basic question: How do we view science and theology as human concerns; and viewing them thus can we decide whether theologians need to take note of the work of scientists?

The book is demanding but rewarding. It discusses first the 'instrumentalist' view of science and theology, i.e. the view that scientific constructs (like the electron or gravitational force) are not to be regarded as having real existence (like chains and letter-scales) but are a sort of 'calculating aid'; compared with a loaf they have the same sort of status as a logarithm or square root. Similarly, religious doctrines (like the Resurrection?) are not asserting facts about reality, but are stories helpful in promoting religious experience.

Churchman

From this he turns to the 'two realms' arguments, i.e. to the view that science and religion move in different spheres, so that while they may indeed claim to be making assertions about reality they are safeguarded (like vehicles on a dual carriageway) from coming into collision.

Lastly he discusses the linguistic arguments. These regard science and religion as two 'games' (serious ones, of course). Their systematic formulations are their 'rules'; and of course the players in the two games are fully entitled to write their own rules without interference from the others — always provided they are internally self-consistent.

Professor Austin examines these viewpoints as to the claim that they allow that science and theology can each proceed on its way independently, in essence, of the other. He criticises this claim, to the reviewer's mind, very effectively. Although his discussion is not markedly biblical, his conclusion that science and theology cannot be sundered in this way certainly is. The Resurrection involved an observable happening (the disappearance of the Body); the stars are not changeless (they wax old like a garment); God rules providentially in the commonplaces of nature and history. It is, in fact, Professor Austin remarks, one of the consequences of the attempted divorce between science and theology that the doctrine of Providence finds so little place in modern Protestant theology. Many readers of *Churchman* will think it is time it was reinstated.

DOUGLAS C. SPANNER.

BEYOND SCIENCE. *Denis Alexander*. Lion Publishing, 1976. 222pp. £0.95.

Today is a day of confusion. Men are without an anchor, without a rudder, without a chart and without a compass, and the seas were (one imagines) rarely so rough or the shores so rocky. Few have any settled convictions about where their voyage is leading to, or should lead to; very many wonder whether it has any significance at all, or whether it is not all rather pointless.

Dr Denis Alexander, a research biochemist specialising in the nervous system, sets out to diagnose this situation, and then to commend the faith of the gospel as the way out. He writes with force, lucidity and knowledge of his subject; and the result is definitely one of the better class of books on apologetic. It is difficult to put down once it has been picked up; and when it is finished one is left with the feeling that the Evangelical case has been argued fairly, forcefully, in contemporary terms and with understanding of the times.

Dr Alexander starts with a resume of some of the urgent problems raised by science — genetic engineering, The Naked Ape and the debunking of man, the brain and the computer, determinism and free will, to name but a few. Together, they have played a large part in leading to a situation

where life seems to have lost all point and meaning, where its very humanity seems at stake. So the search begins: but where? Drugs, the occult, sex, oriental mysticism – all are being or have been tried, but all alike are ‘gods that failed’. So we are back to square one, and from this point Dr Alexander presents the gospel as the answer not only to man’s personal problems, but also and as a result to his contemporary social, ecological and political ones.

A book to give the intelligent enquirer, or the well-disposed humanist.

DOUGLAS C. SPANNER.

THE HEBREW KINGS. *Joan Comay*. Weidenfeld & Nicolson, 1976. 168pp +16pp illustrations. £6.00.

Mrs Comay, a staff editor of the *Encyclopedia Judaica* and wife of an Israeli diplomat, here retells the story related by Samuel-Kings and Chronicles lacing her succinct and contemporary precis with varied information on the background of the story. The geographical and archaeological information is well conveyed, and it is here that a distinctive value of the book appears, for Mrs Comay has a resident’s instinctive knowledge of Palestine, which enables her very helpfully to explain the geographical context of events. How meaningful it will all be to someone who does not know Palestine, I am not sure. But this is essentially an Israeli book and would help readers who do know the land of the Bible to imagine the biblical stories in their context; the book will, I suspect, sell best in Israel. Mrs Comay makes some use of conventional literary study: she allows for the possibility that some stories about Saul and David are variant traditions and assumes that material preserved only in Chronicles is generally less likely to be historically reliable than that in Kings. The whole enterprise of paraphrasing books like Samuel-Kings and treating the result as objective, straight history is (like the equivalent Christian enterprise on the Gospels) a questionable one, however. The book, in fact, is an unhappy compromise between history-writing and commentary on a text: it has the outward form of the former, but is really doing more than the latter (while discouraging readers from actually reading the text by précising it).

The illustrations do not seem very relevant.

JOHN GOLDINGAY.

HOLY PLACES OF CHRISTENDOM. *Stewart Perowne*. Mowbrays, 1976. 160pp. £4.95.

I am, I confess, no great lover of ‘holy places’. Does not Christian theology reject the dichotomy between ‘sacred’ and ‘secular’, and with it the idea (expressed by Mr Perowne on p.7) that particular places are specially ‘holy’? And how would the apostle Paul react to the remark that he ‘established

Churchman

more Holy Places than any other apostle, disciple or saint in any epoch' (p.83)?

And yet the book has its own superb attractiveness. 165 colour photographs, and the author's sensitive text, guide the reader through the story of Jesus, the growth of the early church, and the history of Christendom – ending with Bonhoeffer and Coventry Cathedral. Nearly half the book follows the course of Jesus' ministry in Palestine, with photos mostly of Christian shrines, but also some beautiful 'natural' scenes – the 'Shepherds' Fields' near Bethlehem, Lake Galilee, and those awesome ancient olive trees in Gethsemane. The section on Paul includes Antioch, Ephesus and Rome, but not Thessalonica, Athens or Corinth.

The latter half of the book takes us to churches which mark the activity of God in every continent – Hippo, Macao, the monasteries of Mount Athos, Iona, Assisi, Canterbury.

There are one or two errors (e.g. Hebrew 'Gabbatha' does *not* mean 'pavement', p.52) and occasionally Mr Perowne's own fancies obtrude (e.g. the explanation of fire at Pentecost as an electrical storm, p.74). But the whole style of the book encourages deep reflection. Anyone planning a trip to Israel would gain much from studying the first half, and would no doubt want to read it again on returning. STEPHEN TRAVIS.

PAUL: An Illustrated Documentary. *John Drane.* Lion, 1976. 127pp. £1.75. Those of us who got bored at school with lessons on Paul's missionary journeys could have done with a book like this to bring the apostle's thought and activities to life. It is a large-format paperback with clear maps and diagrams, and over fifty black-and-white photos. (Many of these photos appear in colour in the *Lion Handbook to the Bible*, though curiously the photos on pages 556 and 605 of that book appear back-to-front in *Paul*, pages 31 and 74).

Dr Drane writes for the general reader, but has 'O' and 'A' level students particularly in mind. Tracing the course of Paul's life in Acts, he discusses each of Paul's letters in its historical context. More technical discussions of issues such as the authorship of the Pastoral Epistles are separated from the main text. A final chapter summarises very briefly some aspects of Paul's theology and his significance.

One can sympathise with an author struggling to confine himself to a limited number of words, but some omissions surprised me in a book intended for 'A' level students. The section on Paul's background should surely have included something about the Old Testament's influence on him. The Letter to the Romans receives minimal treatment – one seventh of the space given to 1 Corinthians, and only slightly more than that allotted to

2 Thessalonians. The phrase 'in Christ' is said to be very significant for Paul, but is not really explained (p.118). No mention is made, except in the bibliography, of the fact that many scholars dispute the Pauline authorship of Ephesians.

The Septuagint translation was made over a long period of time, rather than 'about 150 B.C.' (p.15). And is it not misleading to classify Gnosticism as a mystery religion (p.22)?

Nevertheless Dr Drane's clarity of expression and the book's attractive presentation make it an excellent introduction to an exciting subject. I wish it well.
STEPHEN TRAVIS.

JOHN MIRK'S INSTRUCTIONS FOR PARISH PRIESTS. *G.Kristensson*. CWK Gleerup, Lund, 1976. 277pp + plates, np.

Almost nothing is known about John Mirk save that he was a canon-regular of Lilleshall in Shropshire and wrote a *Liber Festialis* and a *Manuale Sacerdotis*, and our present work, which is probably the best known English fifteenth century manual of religious instructions. Kristensson does not discuss the theological contents but concentrates here on providing a first class critical text in the *Lund Studies in English*. The Early English Text Society first published Mirk's work in 1868, but Kristensson is the first to provide a proper edition, and that is no mean feat in sorting out the relationship between, and then collating, seven MSS. But a good job has been done with copious notes on linguistic points. Those interested in the theological implications will have cause to be very grateful for such a fine edition.
G.E. DUFFIELD.

THE MATRIMONIAL TRIALS OF HENRY VIII *Harry Ansgar Kelly*. Stanford University Press, 1976. 333pp. U.S. \$15.

This book deals with the legal actions (and their human motivations) by which Henry VIII divested himself of four of his six marriages, the other two being terminated by death.

It is an important book from the point of view of understanding Henry VIII who was, characterwise, a very ordinary person but who lived at a time when the new Tudor monarchy had the power to carry out the sort of things that ordinary people often wish though seldom have the power to bring about. Henry achieved his matrimonial objectives not by his power in parliament (e.g. by acts of attainder) but by selecting from among the intricate medieval legal processes the one which he thought most suited his circumstances and then by leaning on the legal (clerical) practitioners so that the processes yielded the desired result.

The author comes to his subject from a study of medieval canon law

Churchman

and he has made use of hitherto unexplored documentary evidence; for example, the complete record of the important trial convened by Cardinals Wolsey and Campeggio in which the King and Queen were defendants, as well as the record of the trials by Archbishop Cranmer. The existence of these records has been known but only scantily made use of heretofore.

The author shows that Henry's desire for a divorce from his Queen Catherine of Aragon was genuinely based on his conscience. Henry was very ordinary in being subject to superstition and his failure to obtain a male heir from his first two marriages confirmed what he saw as God's judgment foretold in Scripture on the type of marriages he had entered into, for both of which he had obtained papal dispensations. He was ordinary too in his ability to ignore awkward points in the law as well as to argue a thing round to the point of view that he wanted. In the last chapter the author has succinctly summarised the view on divorce which Archbishop Cranmer finally reached, and which was incorporated in the Reformation Legum but which took three hundred years to be adopted by society generally, namely that divorce is permitted for adultery, desertion and cruelty.

Besides providing an account of the details of events which made up the episodes of the four trials the book makes clear the inchoate theology of marriage at that time as well as the impossible complication of the prohibited degrees of consanguinity.

The book is written in an interesting style and is not to be overlooked by the serious student of the important ecclesiastical events of the latter half of Henry's reign.

ST. THOMAS MORE: A HISTORY OF KING RICHARD III AND SELECTIONS FROM THE ENGLISH AND LATIN POEMS. *Ed. Richard S. Silvester.* Yale University Press, 1976. 168pp. US\$3.95.

This paperback makes available to the general reader a selection from the writings of Sir Thomas More which have already appeared or are about to appear in the voluminous Yale edition of the complete works of More.

The History of Richard III comprises two thirds of the book; the rest is divided between selections from the English poems and translations of some of the Latin poems, in equal proportion. The poems are of more interest to a student of More than a reader of poetry and the editor in his selection has allowed More's bawdiness to appear here and there.

More's History of Richard III is important in as much as More's interpretation of that reign and of the king's character has, through Shakespeare's play, become the conventional view. This history, which appeared in 1513, is important in the development of Sixteenth Century English prose but the reader in comparing More's English syntax with that of William Tyndale

whose New Testament appeared twelve years later and which is known to the modern reader through its virtual incorporation into the Authorised version will recognise that modern English owes more to Tyndale than to More, though for reasons easily understood this does not seem to have been recognised as it should in modern English literary studies.

The text is preceded by a short but useful introduction and bibliographies, and is well annotated both with historical notes as well as glossaries explaining the meaning of More's verbiage, and for students interested in English literature in the early days of Henry VIII's reign or interested in Thomas More the man, this paperback from Yale will be very acceptable.

D B. KNOX.

JOHN BALE. *Leslie P. Fairfield*. Purdue University Press, 1976. 240pp. USS9.75.

John Bale was one of the most interesting of the early English Reformers though he has not figured prominently in histories or biographies of the Reformation. A Carmelite Prior who became an Edwardine Bishop in Ireland and an Elizabethan Canon of Canterbury, he led a life full of incident. After his conversion in the mid 1530's his burning zeal was to preach the Gospel, to expose and pull down the anti-gospel elements of the religion of his time and to build up with all his might a Protestant culture in England.

He wrote over ninety works but most have not survived. His dramatic works have been examined from the point of view of the history of English literature and are not treated in this book which is chiefly concerned with Bale's place in English history writing. Bale was an assiduous antiquarian and may be said to have founded the modern British tradition of studies. This book sketches what is known of Bale's life and assesses his work as a writer of history. It is sub-titled 'Mythmaker for the English Reformation' which indicates the author's interpretation of Bale as a hagiographer more than an historian. This is somewhat unfair to Bale whose burning desire was to serve truth rather than create Protestant myth. Bale ante-dated modern historical investigatory method but there is no reason for thinking that he selected or distorted the facts as he knew them in order to give an impression other than that which he knew to be true. His works were inspired by conscientious motives and their perusal leaves an indelible impression of honesty but the author of this book is somewhat out of sympathy with Bale though he acknowledges that he was 'the most learned man in England in his own field' (p.150).

The author is better equipped to assess Bale as an historian than as a theologian. Bale's theology is not in fact expounded at all, and when on page 39, in seeking to minimise Lollard influence on Bale, he quotes Bale's

Churchman

view of the Lord's Supper with the comment 'more Zwinglian than Lollard', the sentiments could be a direct citation from Wycliffe! The truth is that the English Reformers with the exception of Robert Barnes were all Zwinglian because they obtained their doctrine of the Lord's Supper from the Lollards.

This book is well printed and makes a useful contribution to the literature of the English Reformation, bringing together some of the lesser known facts tucked away in the chronicles and literature of the time which go to make up the background of the English Reformers. D.B. KNOX.

A BIBLIOGRAPHY OF CALVINIANA 1959-1974. *D. Kempff*. Brill, 1976. 249pp. 40 guilders.

Calvin students have hitherto relied on the Calvin bibliographies of Erichson and Niesel. Now they are offered a third, sponsored in effect by The Institute for the Advancement of Calvinism at Potchefstroom, S. Africa. The test of any bibliography is how reliable, how well organised and how comprehensive it is. The ground covered here is not just Calvin but, as one might expect from an editor of the Dutch Calvinist school, a lot of subsequent Calvin development, which some would call scholasticism and others legitimate development. Kempff takes 1650 as his rough stopping point, and despite the title dates (which are quite misleading and flatly contradicted in the introduction), the book starts at 1900. The occasional spelling blunder reveals that the editor is more at home in Afrikaans than English, e.g. 'ommitted' as early as p.13. The contents page is in fact 4 pages and tries to be comprehensive but I must confess I found it hard to discover under which division to look for particular books, and the index was much more helpful. One strong point of this book is that it covers unpublished theses (though it is a pity it does not distinguish between trivial MA theses and major research) and very obscure articles, many of them in small Evangelical periodicals, though again it does not distinguish the very slight from the major scholarly. My reaction to this book was mixed: gratitude for further Calvin bibliographical help, but sadness that it was not more properly carried through and that it was not produced with someone who really had a thorough grasp of English. G.E. DUFFIELD.

THE LIFE OF JOHN KNOX. *Thomas M'Crie*. Free Presbyterian Publications, 1976. 294pp. £1.80.

The land for which John Knox did so much now accords him that scant honour which is the traditional prophetic portion. He is dismissed as a gloomy bigot whose legacy to Scotland was a hangover that has inhibited innocent enjoyment and the tourist trade.

Take a sixteenth-century preacher, ignore the turbulence of his times and the need for the revolution he successfully led (while enjoying the fruits of it today), and judge him according to twentieth-century attitudes – and an unfair assessment is inevitable.

For that reason it is timely that the Free Presbyterian Church of Scotland should reprint this biography by one of the country's best church historians, first published in 1813. 'A work of genius and erudition,' said the *Concise Dictionary of National Biography*, a source not always associated with theological acumen.

Here is a judicious account of the man who roused the flagging Reformation forces when all seemed lost. He tackled long-entrenched evils, would not be swayed by fear or favour, broke down the barriers to give the laity greater opportunities for service, and devised a far-sighted educational programme which helped to mould the religious system of Scotland.

M'Crie tells the story without trying to hide Knox's faults. He outlines his sources, and is careful about his facts. In a helpful foreword John M. Simpson mentions briefly more recent work done on the subject, but wisely reminds us that M'Crie saw in Knox's career proof of 'the superintendence of a wise and merciful providence.' No one who gives this account the attention it deserves is likely to disagree.

J.D. DOUGLAS.

THE GODLY MAN IN STUART ENGLAND: ANGLICANS, PURITANS, AND THE TWO TABLES, 1620-1670. J. Sears McGee. Yale University Press, 1976. 299pp. £11.55.

The two tables are those of the decalogue – the first covering our duties to God in the first four commandments, and the second those to our fellow men. Dr McGee's thesis is that Puritans and Anglicans displayed basically different moral and religious values in their priorities here: Puritans agreed with Sibbes that 'the breach of the First Commandment is the ground of the breach of all the rest', while most Anglicans would have supported Thomas Pierce's claim that 'the Second Table is the touchstone of our obedience to the First.' There is no necessary contradiction here, but the different emphasis had serious implications. By Anglicans is meant those who were more or less content with the episcopal organisation and liturgy of the Church of England, and by Puritans those whose highest priority was the dissemination of godly preaching.

Drawing mainly on the sermons and other writings of some two dozen preachers and laymen – men like Sibbes, Winthrop, Farindon and Sanderson – Dr McGee shows how the two traditions had radically different understandings of such concepts as 'charity', 'obedience', 'peace', 'the Brethren', 'idolatry'. Both sides, for instance, defined idolatry as worshipping God

Churchman

according to the opinions of men; but to the Puritans this meant anything not authorised in the Scriptures, while to the Anglicans it implied a presumptuous rejection of the holy mysteries of the Church.

Dr McGee is a sympathetic interpreter of both positions and makes his case effectively, though I think he could have been more concise. He avoids making his distinctions too crude, by reminding us of how much all those concerned had in common, notably their essential Protestantism and their conviction that one's eternal destiny is of overriding importance. It is therefore surprising that he completely ignores Baxter, whose life work was an attempt to reconcile the two traditions. The only error I have noticed relates to a sentence of my own which he misinterprets by completely ignoring the context, but in general a wide range of sources is used with care and sensitivity.

OWEN C. WATKINS.

A SHORT HISTORY OF THE EPISCOPAL CHURCH IN SCOTLAND: From the Restoration to the Present Time. (Revised Edition). *Frederick Goldie*. St. Andrew's Press, 1976. 187pp. £1.40.

'The history of the Episcopal Church in Scotland through the years . . .', writes Bishop Goldie on p.142, 'is not so much the story of Bishops and Councils of Synods, but of the loyalty and devotion of the congregations, priests and their people.' But in fact the 'loyalty and devotion' remains mostly hidden, while Bishops' Councils and Synods dominate the book. Perhaps not too much can be expected of a 'short' history covering over three hundred often tumultuous years, or in fact 400, for the opening chapter summarises the century following the Reformation. But considering how much life is hidden, unread, between the lines, the book is disappointingly dull.

There is a moving account, pages 33-4, describing what happened when Rev David Lindsay of Glenorchy, around 1690, was ordered to surrender his charge to a Presbyterian minister. (But the passage is an extended quotation.) The 'devotion' and grace of Lindsay, (he alone would speak kindly to the wretched man), and the love and 'loyalty' of his parishioners, breathe a New Testament atmosphere. That is the only vividly memorable incident in the book, which recounts instead various dismal controversies over canons, liturgies, and ritualism. The longest chapter of all is simply devoted to 'Bishops of the Church (1792-1900)', yet even the bishops hardly 'come alive'.

Not only the book's dullness is disappointing. The first edition appeared in 1951, since when the Scottish Episcopal Church has changed considerably. It has become far more ecumenically open, far humbler, far freer. It has been a joy to experience this happening even in six years. Some-

thing of this is conveyed in the final added chapter, 'Change and Readjustment (1950-1974)'. A note to the new edition tells us that 'for reasons of economy' the text of the first ten chapters has been little changed. This is a pity, because it reflects the old arrogance, the old anti-Presbyterianism, despite occasional more detached assessments, e.g. pp.26-7. Nothing good, for example, is found in the Covenanters. It is, however, refreshing to read of two very ecumenically-inclined bishops of St. Andrews in the late nineteenth century, pp.122-3. The penultimate chapter, covering 1900-1950, has been 'slightly revised', chiefly so that Bishop Goldie can 'look forward' wisely from the new vantage point of 1975. But slightly is not enough, for repeatedly it refers to 'the present time', etc., meaning 1950. A footnote at very least should have warned us of the need to translate.

Most of the bare facts concerning the Scottish Episcopal Church in recent centuries – 'history' in the dull old school sense – are available in this book, well tabulated, for those who wish them. But if you want to encounter the living church, you will have to look elsewhere.

AIDAN BURN-MURDOCH.

THE WORKS OF ROBERT TRAILL. Banner of Truth Trust, 1976. 2 vols, 1114pp. £7.00.

Born four years after the National Covenant (1638) had roused Scotland, Robert Traill lived into the reign of George 1. Traill's father and mother both suffered for Covenanting views. He himself was forced by Stuart absolutism to flee to Holland in 1667. He joined the theological faculty at Utrecht, and there had scope for those scholarly activities largely denied the persecuted at home.

The half-million words in these two volumes include thirteen sermons on Hebrews 4:16; sixteen sermons of the Lord's Prayer; twenty-one sermons on Hebrews 10:21-24; eleven sermons on 1 Peter 1:1-4, and six sermons on Galatians 2:21.

In 1691, when a theological dispute broke out in London, Traill wrote 'A Vindication of the Protestant doctrine concerning Justification, and of its preachers and professors, from the unjust charge of Antinomianism,' and this is reproduced in forty-five pages of the present work.

In a letter from Holland to his wife, he comforts and counsels her: 'Fret not against unjust men, who . . . have done worse to others than to me . . . I am sure you would rather have me in the banishment far from you, than to have had me at home with you as a Bishop, or a Dean, or time-serving Minister.'

This was, of course, a commentary on the Scottish scene rather than a thrust at episcopacy as such. J.C. Ryle must have thought so too, for he greatly admired Traill's writings. And what other publisher today offers

Churchman

160 pages of first-class theology in hardback for a pound? J.D. DOUGLAS.

WHAT METHODISTS BELIEVE. *Rupert E. Davies*. Mowbrays, 1976. 127pp. £0.75. FIRE OF LOVE: The Spirituality of John Wesley. *Gordon Wakefield*. Darton, Longman & Todd, 1976. 80pp. £0.95.

Both authors are well-known Methodist scholars. Rupert Davies outlines Christian belief, deals with Methodist emphases and concludes with a chapter entitled 'The Way to Unity'. The first section is 'apologetic', and will help thoughtful readers interested in an overall view. It deals with large issues in small space, providing sign-posts rather than destinations, in an admirable economy of words. (Incidentally, 'worldly' on page 32 must be 'unworldly'). The brief treatment of Methodism is less satisfactory. Insights concerning holiness and assurance deserve more space in view of the title of the book. What is said is clear and helpful. I'm not sure what the cover picture of Coniston Water has to do with Methodism or unity. Perhaps it is just a pretty picture.

Gordon Wakefield's book has a different approach. There is a brief history of Wesley's life and Ministry, then groups of quotations from his writings. Selection tells one something about the selector as well as the subject. One's reactions tell one something about oneself. Non-Methodists may be surprised by what they read concerning discipline, catholicity or sacraments. One is struck by the breadth of Wesley's insights and interests. Unfortunately there are too many misprints for a book of this quality and comparative price. DONALD ENGLISH.

J.C. RYLE: A SELF PORTRAIT. *Edited by Peter Toon*; together with a biographical postscript by Michael Smout. Reiner Publications, 1974. 102pp. \$4.95.

JOHN CHARLES RYLE, EVANGELICAL BISHOP. *Peter Toon and Michael Smout*. James Clarke, 1976. 103pp. £3.75.

Both of these books are to be welcomed for two reasons. First, for the general reader in providing a background and commentary on the author of the still popular *Expository Thoughts* on the four gospels, *Knots Untied* and *Holiness*. Second, for the specialist in nineteenth century studies. For far too long we have only had partial glimpses of Ryle in booklets and under-researched bibliography. Now at last we see Ryle 'warts and all'. The publication of the partial autobiography makes it clear that Ryle was human after all. He was humiliated by his poverty, brought about by the failure of his father's bank in Macclesfield in 1841. We see too something of his family relationships, not least with his three (successive) wives.

John Charles Ryle, Evangelical Bishop draws heavily on the auto-

biography, and corrects the numerous accumulated errors contained in previous works. The joint authors admit that this is not intended as a definitive life of Ryle, since this can only be written once more is known about nineteenth century Evangelicalism. We certainly await an adequate scholarly replacement of Balleine.

There are, however, certain features lacking in this work. It is useful to have a section on 'Evangelicals in the Church of England' in the nineteenth century. But surprisingly there is no reference to Simeon, or of his trustees whose efforts secured an Evangelical succession in English parishes. Also omitted is any reference to the work of CPAS or to Henry Venn as the secretary of CMS, 1841-73. Heasman makes it clear that Evangelicals were not simply ecclesiastical politicians. It seems strange too that there is no reference to the unpublished Nottingham thesis by J.S. Casson on Ryle and nineteenth century Evangelicalism, or the brief article on Kyle in the *Banner of Truth*, January 1970.

Joint authorship results in minor inconsistencies. Two editions of Balleine are referred to in the index, and the style is sometimes rather quaint. I personally dislike the American spelling and style used in both books. A real classic is a footnote in the *Self Portrait*: 'Pontefract cakes are candies (sweets) made from liquorice'! It is a pity that there is no index, and no complete list of all of Ryle's works.

I would like to have read more about Ryle's apparent inconsistency, for example, his occasional wearing of a surplice whilst preaching (not mentioned here) and more on his one appearance on the Keswick platform. Nineteenth century Evangelicals were not wholly consistent — cf. Francis Close's public advocacy of the teetotal movement, but his imbibing whilst on holiday on the Continent!

These are, however, small criticisms. Ryle was an outstanding leader of the Evangelicals in the last century, who possessed a remarkable prophetic insight. We need to heed his words today, not least in the whole area of reformed theology. Current Anglican Evangelicalism is in danger of simply floating about without being aware of its heritage and biblical foundations.

ALAN MUNDEN.

EVERLYN UNDERHILL. *Christopher J R. Armstrong*. Mowbrays 1975. It took me a long time to read this book, not because it lacks interest or is heavy-going. But it is, in many respects, exhaustive and repays careful reading. There is a wealth of previously unpublished material from many of Evelyn Underhill's writings, and information about her pilgrimage through psychic research, the occult and theosophy — some of which came as a

Churchman

surprise to me — to a spirituality firmly rooted in Christian theology.

The main thrust of this book is her development, through this tortuous journey, from her uncommitted mystical approach to that place of serenity and faith that marked her as a retreat conductor and spiritual director. Apart from this primary concern of the book, however, there are fascinating biographical details about her childhood and youth, much about her marriage including extracts from her letters to her fiance, and glimpses of her numerous trips abroad. It is a very human Evelyn who comes out as well as the unusual and gifted woman who diffused and interpreted the teaching of Baron von Hugel.

There is an excellent bibliography tabulating in chronological order her very considerable output of writing in articles and books. One chapter that gripped me gives vivid synopses of her novels — hitherto unknown to me and not easily accessible now. The immense detail about Evelyn Underhill's life, thought and work and the numerous quotations from a wide range of writings makes this a book for the specialist rather than for general interest. M.M.

A GIFT OF LOVE. *Gail Magruder*. Oliphants, 1976. 160pp. £2.95. BORN AGAIN. *Charles W. Colson*. Hodder and Stoughton, 1976. 350pp. £4.95. One hopes that the American legal profession learned as much as it earned from Watergate. Justice was finally done, but the process was attended by manipulation, plea bargaining, and some tricks as dirty as those of the defendants in the whole squalid business. From its inauspicious beginnings, as these two books show, Watergate opened up several new cans of worms.

But publishers benefited too; the flood of Watergate books suggests that the whole country was indulging in a masochistic exercise. The books under review concern Jeb Magruder (Gail is his wife) and Charles W. Colson, two of Richard Nixon's men who went to prison for their part in what was tersely termed 'the obstruction of justice'.

Mrs Magruder's concern is to tell how the long drawn-out proceedings affected her family life, not to discuss the allegations made against her husband. Hers is a very human document, an indictment of some aspects of Washington society, intensely moving, particularly in its accounts of visiting her husband in prison. Colson's autobiography is twice as long, and a contribution to the history of Watergate. The professional way in which it is written suggests he had considerable help from the publishers — and he says so.

The books have much in common: the vulnerability of those unversed in the ways of political intrigue, the insensitivity of the media, the appalling conditions in American prisons, the loyalty Nixon inspired from his aides and did not deserve.

Book Reviews

Most notable, each book tells of conversion – somewhat sketchily but no less real in the Magruders' case, in considerable heart-warming detail as it affected the Colsons. *Born Again* is especially vivid in telling how Nixon's former 'hatchet man' changed from 'going for the other guy's jugular' to a profound experience which after release led to a ministry to prisoners. In his conversion C.S. Lewis's *Mere Christianity* had a key part: 'If it's a choice between the two books, it's worth paying the extra for Colson.

J.D DOUGLAS.

MORE THAN CONQUERORS. *Graham Turner.* Hodder and Stoughton, 1976. 224pp. £4.50.

Graham Turner's face (chubbier these days than it used to be) is well known to television viewers. Having returned to the Christian faith in 1970, he has interviewed a variety of people – kangaroo-hunting aborigine, crooked lawyer with a taste for Las Vegas, blind Norwegian skier, Communist shop-steward, work-obsessed Academic Dean of a State University – and recorded the route by which they came to know God. Of the eleven who have overcome personal disabilities or shortcomings of one kind or another, most seem to have turned to the Christian faith. Unusual or extreme situations are the common denominator and, like Graham Turner himself, one is driven to ponder whether losing one's temper with the children is not perhaps as great a disability as the kind of handicap we usually signify by that term.

JOHN C. KING.

THE WAY TO NICEA: THE DIALECTICAL DEVELOPMENT OF TRINITARIAN THEOLOGY. *Bernard Lonergan, S.J.* Darton, Longman and Todd, 1976. 143pp. £5.50.

This book represents the earlier part of a more substantial course of lectures delivered at the Gregorian University at Rome, the only part as yet released for publication by the author. It is not primarily intended as either a historical study or a specialist contribution to Patristics, though it is based upon a profound knowledge of both fields. It is rather the illustration of a dogmatic method as applied to a particular problem. The approach therefore is selective and illustrative rather than cumulative or exhaustive. The book opens with an essay on doctrinal development, a topic more complicated than is sometimes supposed. Dogma is defined as the explication of what is implicit in the biblical witness attended to as true using the best available techniques to achieve the greatest degree of clarity. The period studied by Fr. Lonergan marked the emergence of the idea of dogma as well as the achievement of a dogmatic solution of the doctrine of the Trinity. In a final

Churchman

chapter on the structure of Trinitarian theology the author distinguishes three approaches, naïf realism, critical realism and dogmatic realism. The first is illustrated by Jewish Christianity (in the sense used by Jean Danielou), the abuse of biblical symbolism by the Gnostics, the over-literal application to theology by Tertullian of the Stoic materialistic world view and (I should want to add) the Modalist heresy of Sabellius and his predecessors. Critical realism is the attempt to fix on a determinate world view and to establish proper criteria for the use of the material on which naïf realism drew. This is exemplified by extracts from Irenaeus, Clement and Origen though Fr. Lonergan does not consider the possibility that some writers like Irenaeus and Tertullian may adopt both approaches in different parts of their work. Dogmatic realism emerges at the Nicene period though it may be combined with a naïf realism. Apart from a hint on the last page of the book we are not told whether dogmatic realism and critical realism can be combined. The three approaches certainly exist, though during this period they may represent differences of degree rather than of kind.

Two critical observations may be made. Fr. Lonergan's attitude to the influence of philosophy in the ante-Nicene fathers is somewhat equivocal. He rightly stresses the continuity between dogmatic realism and the biblical witness and illustrates this from the Homousion. He argues cogently against the thesis of Harnack that the alliance of Christian theology with Greek philosophy was a false dawn which refracted rather than truly reflected the biblical witness. Again rightly he finds the philosophical equipment of the ante-Nicene fathers as 'second level thinking, the sort of thing that is possible in a Hellenistic culture'. In his discussion of particular men and movements, however, he gives full weight to philosophical influences, and notes in particular the transition from descriptions of God in terms of his activity to a more ontological approach which coincided with the rise of dogmatic realism. Without capitulating to Harnack or denying the 'low level' character of the technically philosophical equipment of most fathers, this suggests a more substantial contribution of Greek philosophy to dogmatic realism than some passages at least allow. If Greek philosophy was not the primary aim, at least it was the indispensable tool through which the clarity of dogmatic was realised.

The other criticism brings the problem back into the field of the Patristic scholar. The sub-title speaks of the dialectical development of Trinitarian Theology, and no doubt the three attitudes of naïf, critical and dogmatic realism can be regarded as a contribution to this approach. But there still remains room for an examination of the emergence and interplay of emergent traditions in the ante-Nicene period and an assessment of their respective contributions to the doctrine as defined at Nicea and

Constantinople. This would reinforce rather than contradict the author's conclusions. It might serve to bridge the gap noted in the last sentence of the book. 'If we start from the later systematisation by itself, it might be difficult to understand how the ante-Nicene authors could in fact have said what in fact they did say'. The faith of Nicea was not merely attained by a renewed attention to the biblical witness as true but by a process of trial and error between the competing nascent theologies of the earlier period as well.

H.E.W. TURNER.

THE RISEN CHRIST AND THE EUCHARISTIC PRESENCE. *G. Martelet*. Collins, 1976. 252pp. £4.95.

This is a difficult but rewarding book. The author is deeply indebted to the thought of Teilhard de Chardin which he applies to good effect to the doctrine of the presence of the Body and Blood of Christ in or at the Eucharist. He claims that if the Eucharist is understood in the light of the Resurrection the difficulties in older discussions of the subject largely disappear.

The author first sets out his own theological position. The body is more closely bound up with our existence as selves than some older theological systems would imply. The nullity of the body sooner or later leads to the nullity of man. Its non-importance would carry with it the non-importance of human beings. It is the point at which the principle of entropy bears most directly upon us and is the precise point at which its reversal must begin. Of this the bodily Resurrection of Christ is the absolute and decisive moment. The Resurrection then has a cosmic as well as a historical significance which is present for our reception under a sign at the Eucharist. The full reality both for us and for the cosmos must await the Parousia.

The second part of the book is an admirable survey of the doctrine of the Eucharistic Presence from St. Augustine to the present day. The problems relating to the Presence in the Middle Ages and the Reformation arose from a false dilemma, the reification of the Presence on the one hand and the problem of its localisation in Heaven and not here on the other. The author writes sympathetically of F.J. Leenhardt and Max Thurian, and even of their master Calvin who had the merit of reintroducing the Holy Spirit into Western Eucharistic theology, though only to bridge an imaginary gap. He concludes that the cosmic and eschatological dimensions of the Eucharist greatly ease the problem.

Even apart from the reliability of a Teilhardian position in theology some criticisms suggest themselves. The author claims that the definition of Transubstantiation can be interpreted merely as a statement of the

Churchman

objective character of the Presence on the rather dubious ground of the absence of any mention of 'accidents', the traditional 'sparring partner' of substance. This argument sounds like special pleading. While no one would maintain that the Resurrection is irrelevant to the Eucharist, in the New Testament it is related primarily to the Cross and the mention of Body and Blood seems to have a directly Passional context. More awkward however is the question what the words can convey in the cosmic and eschatological context given them by the author. The Reformation riposte to the medieval solution at least had the merit of keeping the Words of Institution firmly in touch with historical realities. This book certainly opens up new ways of understanding the Eucharist. Whether the author has completely made out his case is another matter.

H.E.W. TURNER.