

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

PayPal

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

Book Reviews

STORY AND FAITH: IN THE BIBLICAL NARRATIVE. *Ulrich Simon.* SPCK, 1975. 126 pp. £3.95/£1.95.

In a series of short chapters Ulrich Simon, Professor of Christian Literature at King's College, London, examines the forms of narrative in Biblical and later literature, to see how these narratives work and what convictions they express. Gradually there emerges a picture of 'the Christian pattern' (summarised in chapter 21), which characteristically holds together polarities such as God and man, heaven and earth, perfection and degradation, death and resurrection, time and eternity, defeat and victory, love and hatred. The loss of the biblical narrative and the loss of this coherence go together; Simon illustrates modern attempts at 'the conquest of meaningless fragmentation' (p. 111), particularly Kafka.

There are points of connection here with tradition criticism (the biblical work is reminiscent of von Rad), structuralism (the concern with binary oppositions), recent exhortations from James Barr to study the Bible as literature, and the history of culture as many Evangelicals have come to look at it through the spectacles of Schaeffer and Rookmaaker. Rookmaaker has pointed out that whereas art was once concerned both to portray real events and to suggest ultimate meaning, modern art has abandoned this vision. Simon suggests that the Bible seeks the same combination. He thus reminds us that biblical narrative must not be read as positivist history; it is a picture with a meaning, not a mere photograph. On the other hand, it is a picture of real events, and when the blurb speaks of such narrative as an exposure of the human condition *rather than* a description of events, it falls into just the kind of false antithesis that Simon describes the biblical narrative as overcoming.

JOHN GOLDINGAY

HAZOR: THE REDISCOVERY OF A GREAT CITADEL OF THE BIBLE. *Y. Yadin.* Weidenfeld and Nicholson, 1975. 280 pp. £5.25.

Hazor is the latest of Professor Yadin's remarkable books which aim to present the results of modern archaeological research to a general readership. The earlier books were *Masada* (1965) and *Bar-Kokhba* (1971), and *Hazor* repeats their format of lavish production, with photographs and plans in colour and black and white on almost every page, together with the author's compelling text.

Professor Yadin directed the excavations at Hazor, which is in upper Galilee and which has numerous references in the Bible, from 1955-1958, and 1968-1969. In addition to the official reports, the author delivered the Schweich Lectures on Hazor in 1970. In the present book, the author takes great pains to describe the excavations step by step, so that the general reader can follow the unravelling of the problems encountered by the archaeologists. Two features of the description are noteworthy. First, time and again, the excavators reached conclusions about their discoveries only after the most exhaustive consideration of all possible theories, and, where practicable, the carrying out of further digging designed to test hypotheses. Second, not only Hazor, but also Gezer and Megiddo were brought into consideration, with the result that the Solomonic cities of these sites were re-discovered, and previous hypotheses about the sites were corrected. One is struck by the patient and scholarly nature of the excavations, which at the end showed the basic reliability of the biblical statements about the three cities. This is biblical archaeology at its best, and the book is one of the best, if not the best, of serious but popular presentations of the craft of the archaeologist. Much light is shed by it on Old Testament history, from Joshua's conquest to Hazor's final defeat in 732 BC.

J. W. ROGERSON

THE BOOK OF JOSHUA. *J. M. Miller and G. M. Tucker.* Cambridge, 1975. 206 pp. £3.60/£1.60.

For most readers Joshua is one of the most exciting and spiritually challenging books of the Bible. This volume in the Cambridge Bible series, 'designed for use in schools and colleges, and for the minister and layman,' turns the book of Joshua into a mass of contradictory unhistorical tales. With great industry its American authors attempt to unravel the stages in the book's composition and to suggest how this very misleading work came to be written.

The archaeological evidence for the conquest is dismissed very quickly, and I think unfairly. For example, on page 68 they state that the Late Bronze Age ended a thousand years before the Israelite conquest. This howler (the Late Bronze Age overlapped with Joshua) suggests that the authors are not only unsympathetic to archaeological method but not very knowledgeable about it either. In general archaeologists tend to take the book of Joshua more seriously as a historical document than biblical scholars do.

This negative approach to Joshua is not new. It has been common-place in continental scholarship for many years. What is distressing is the way dogmatic scepticism is presented to a popular audience unable to answer back, and with no regard for the faith of the readers. S. R. Driver was often as critical as modern writers, but he did seek to show that his views were compatible with Christian theology. Furthermore this is a soulless scepticism. Whether or not you believe in the historicity of Joshua, it has a powerful theological message; yet this commentary has very little to say about theology except as a means of identifying one of the many authors supposed to have had a hand in its composition. The best features of this commentary are its maps and the gazeteer of place names and geographical terms.

G. J. WENHAM

THE BOOK OF JOB. *Commentary by Norman C. Habel.* CUP, 1975. 250 pp. £4.65/£2.20.

The NEB is at its most striking in the poetry of Job. It flows so idiomatically and meaningfully that a commentary scarcely seems necessary until suddenly a rearrangement of the text or the omission of a familiar line raises a fundamental question. In such a case Dr. Habel comments on the text, but in general he avoids technicalities and concentrates on clarifying the arguments. In a paragraph at the beginning of each main section he sums up the main line of thought. The style of the comments is straightforward; they are short and to the point, subservient to the text and not in competition with it. The introduction to the book has been kept to a minimum (10½ pages). Thus the impression is given that what really matters is the book of Job itself.

Chapter 19: 25-27 is as good a place as any from which to take a sample reading: 'Job's yearnings for a liberator are not a prophetic prediction of a Messiah. Rather they are the cries of a frantic faith welling forth from the abyss of utter desperation. They are impossible dreams from the soul of a destroyed human being.' Dr. Habel is not convinced that the NEB has done justice to the Hebrew in 19: 25-27 and thinks that Job may be expecting to be vindicated after death. The one who vindicates him 'remains a mysterious heavenly stranger, a forerunner of the New Testament Christ'. On the book as a whole the comments are equally restrained and sensitive.

As for the key to the book, Dr. Hamel finds it in the recurring motif of birth and birthpangs. As the Creator takes Job back to primordial creation Job sees death, new birth and new creation as part of God's cosmic plan. Whether or not this suggested key commends itself, without question this commentary makes a worthy addition to the literature on Job, and could transform the study of it in schools and colleges. JOYCE BALDWIN

PSALMS 73-150. Tyndale Old Testament Commentaries. *D. Kidner.* IVP, 1975. 259/492. £3.10/£2.35.

The first volume of Mr. Kidner's commentary was reviewed in *The Churchman* for July-September 1974. The second volume continues the author's approach, in which the Psalm titles are taken seriously, and the Psalms are interpreted Christologically, where appropriate. The scholarship is careful and informed. The commentary as a whole is a conservative, Christian and scholarly interpretation of the Psalms. It is a worthy contribution from the conservative side to the whole Church's appreciation of the Psalms, and it is to be hoped that it will be also appreciated by those whose position within the Church is more liberal and/or catholic. J. W. ROGERSON

THE BOOKS OF JOEL, OBADIAH, JONAH, NAHUM, HABAKKUK AND ZEPHANIAH. Cambridge Bible Commentary. *John D. W. Watts.* CUP, 1975. 190 pp. £3.90/£1.90.

A reviewer approaches this commentary with some sympathy for the commentator. He has been assigned the six remaining of the Twelve Prophets when the 'giants' of the eighth century (Hosea, Amos and Micah) and the post-exilic prophets (Haggai, Zechariah and Malachi) have been 'creamed off' for separate treatment. He has, however, managed to weld his texts into more than an amalgam of unrelated minor prophecies by treating them from the point of view of prophecy in a context of worship, and in particular by tracing the 'Day of the Lord' references as a leit-motif.

The reader will find here the qualities he has learnt to expect of this series—clarity and conciseness of exegesis within the severe limits of the space available. Perhaps slightly more space proportionately is given to Obadiah, to which alone is added a separate section on the teaching of the Book, and slightly less to Joel. The introductory material to Nahum and Zephaniah is attached to the comment on the respective opening verses, while the other prophets have a brief separate introduction. There is also a general introduction of eleven pages.

One might think that these short texts are relatively simple in the comment required, but in fact they are highly complex. The limitations of space have prevented Professor Watts from discussing in detail approaches which differ radically from his own, and the reader should be warned that the views presented of the emergence of the prophetic literature, of prophetic liturgies and the role of Temple prophets, and of the 'Jerusalem royal festival' as the background of the concept of the 'Day of the Lord' are by no means universally accepted. The readership for which this series is intended could also profit from a discussion of the difficulties in the way of regarding Jonah as a historical narrative. But all in all the reader will find here the help he needs and expects.

A. GELSTON

JEREMIAH 26-32. Cambridge Bible Commentary. *E. W. Nicholson*. CUP, 1975. 247 pp. £4.65/£2.20.

This is the second part of Dr. Nicholson's commentary on Jeremiah, the first part of which appeared in 1973 and was reviewed by the present writer. The high standard of comment is maintained in this second part. Dr. Nicholson's caution is illustrated by his decision not to discuss the vexed question of the prophet of the Lachish Ostraka at 26: 20-24, though he does of course refer to the illumination of the Ostraka at 34: 7. On the other hand the reviewer finds it hard to accept the verdict that the prophecy of the new covenant in 31: 31-34 derives not from Jeremiah but from a Deuteronomic author. The denial to the prophet of a passage which Dr. Nicholson describes as representing 'one of the deepest insights in the entire prophetic literature in the Old Testament' suggests rather that the stylistic criteria should be reassessed! But in general the reader will be well served by this commentary.

The reviewer's remarks on the price of volume 1 are even more pertinent in the light of a further two years' inflation! The Introduction is reproduced here from volume 1, and this means that the introduction and the whole of the commentary could have been published in a single volume had the text of the New English Bible not been printed in full, section by section. Anyone who is prepared to pay £2 or more for a commentary on half a book of the Old Testament may be presumed to possess a copy of the New English Bible, and most potential purchasers would surely prefer to have two commentaries for the price of one!

A. GELSTON

INTRODUCTION TO THE INTERTESTAMENTAL PERIOD. *Raymond F. Surburg*. Concordia, 1975. 197 pp. \$8.95.

The book is divided into three main sections. In the first section, the history of the Jews from the exile to AD 135 is presented, largely by means of brief sketches of the principal historical characters. The second section describes the Jewish parties and sects of the 2nd century BC onwards, and contains a thematic presentation of the major theological teachings of the

rabbinic, apocryphal and pseudepigraphical literature. The third section deals with the LXX and the Judean desert discoveries, and gives a brief description of the content and importance of the individual Qumran, apocryphal and pseudepigraphical texts. The rabbinic literature is not treated.

As an introduction at a very elementary level for readers who know little or nothing about the Inter-testamental period, the book will obviously be helpful, although the writer does not avoid the sort of over-simplification that becomes misleading. In the historical section, we have little more than summaries of the accounts of the ancient historians, and although the ample bibliography shows that Dr. Surburg is aware of many discussions that indicate that these ancient authorities are not always to be taken at face value, none of this is allowed to affect the presentation of the history. The overall result in this section is thus somewhat flat and one-dimensional.

However, the book is meant to be an *introduction*, and any reader who goes on from the book to study the primary texts, and the scholarly literature which is recommended, will without doubt learn a great deal about the Inter-testamental period.

J. W. ROGERSON

A SYNOPSIS OF THE GOSPELS: PART II: THE GOSPEL ACCORDING TO ST. JOHN WITH THE SYNOPTIC PARALLELS. *H. F. D. Sparks.* A. and C. Black, 1974. 96 pp. £4.20.

Since 1964 students unable to decipher Huck or Aland have been grateful for Professor Sparks' *Synopsis: Part I*. That volume sets out, side by side, parallel passages in the Synoptic Gospels, with Johannine parallels in a fourth column. In Part II the situation is reversed. The whole of the text of the Fourth Gospel is printed in the left-hand column, and similar passages in the other Gospels are placed alongside in three other columns. In addition to parallel passages printed out in full, a host of cross-references enables the reader to follow up the merest verbal or theological echo of one Gospel in another.

The Revised Version of 1881 is again used as the basic text. Although one reviewer apparently described the RV as resembling 'an interlinear translation' prepared 'for incompetent schoolboys', that is just what one wants for a Synopsis which aims to reflect the agreements and disagreements between the Gospels in Greek.

When confronted with passages such as John 4: 46-54 and 21: 1-14 set out with their Synoptic parallels alongside (Matthew 8: 5-13 and Luke 5: 1-11 respectively), the reader might catch himself assuming that the one passage is somehow derived from the other. This, of course, need not be the case. But this volume will help us all to decide such matters for ourselves. The book is beautifully produced. And if anyone wonders why a two-part Synopsis is necessary at all, he should read Professor Sparks' introduction.

STEPHEN TRAVIS

ENCOUNTERING NEW TESTAMENT MANUSCRIPTS: A WORKING INTRODUCTION TO TEXTUAL CRITICISM. *Jack Finegan.* SPCK, 1975. 203 pp. £5.95.

This is a book that should have been written long ago. Although there have been several excellent introductions to New Testament textual criticism, here for the first time is one which confronts the reader with photographs of actual New Testament manuscripts, and invites him to study and compare

them with each other. And so, in accordance with good educational theory—not to mention common sense—you ‘learn by doing’.

There is a concise introduction to ancient writing materials, the different types of manuscripts, the history of textual criticism and some of its technical terms. Then there appears a photograph of the early second century Rylands papyrus (p. 52). Step by step Finegan explains the process of deducing that it in fact contains fragments of John 18. Next there are photographs of the same passage in two other papyri (p. 66 and p. 60). The differences between the texts represented in the three manuscripts are noted, and their relative merits discussed. Thus the principles by which scholars seek to determine the most authentic text of a particular passage are gradually revealed.

There follows a similar study of a passage in John 6, and then a more complex one of John 1: 3-4 and 1: 18. This time not only papyri are included but also parchments (‘Alexandrian’, ‘Western’ and ‘Byzantine’), lectionaries, ancient versions and readings in the church fathers. A final chapter discusses ‘The Future Task’, and there are detailed indexes.

Jack Finegan’s book will not supersede standard works like that of Metzger, which covers a much wider scope. But his method of presentation enables him to convey the excitement and laboriousness of studying New Testament manuscripts. I doubt whether there is a better book for students to start on.

STEPHEN TRAVIS

PAUL AND THE ANATOMY OF APOSTOLIC AUTHORITY. *John Howard Schütz*. CUP, 1975. 307 pp. £8.25.

This book appears in the Cambridge Monograph Series of books published in collaboration with the Society for New Testament Studies. It is by a Professor from the University of North Carolina. I am afraid I do not know the author personally. Presumably he is of German extraction, although he writes in English, and good English too. I cannot recommend the book as an exciting one to read. The word ‘anatomy’ in the title is well chosen, for the whole book consists of a prolonged dissection of minute details in Pauline statements with the object of identifying and clarifying exactly what Paul meant by his own apostolic authority.

The book opens with a useful examination of the distinctions between authority and legitimacy or legitimation. In the course of this discussion Professor Schütz goes over the famous discussions in modern times concerning what or who an apostle was, including a new examination of the *Schaliach* theory and a useful few pages on Max Weber’s contribution on the nature of authority itself. Weber at least sees the different strands that go to make up the idea of authority, concentrating on the three strands of legality, tradition and charisma. This at least reminds us that authority is a many-sided thing and it is only too easy to pick out one particular aspect of it and then to interpret the whole in terms of the part. The very word ‘authority’ can cover the most varied categories of thought and experience.

It may be most helpful to summarise briefly the conclusions which Professor Schütz arrives at and then to sketch the method which he adopts in order to arrive at these conclusions. His own definition of authority is ‘the interpretation of power’. This seems to treat the reality as being power, and authority some kind of description or interpretation of how and why it works. I am bound to say that I find this a somewhat limiting understanding of the word

'authority' and hence I approach the conclusions of this book with a certain scepticism. There is however a tremendous lot that one can learn from the book and from its conclusions even if one is driven to differ from them here and there.

He brings out very clearly the close relationship between the idea of 'gospel' and the idea of 'apostle'. He sees these two ideas as interlocking, the one with the other. Without the gospel there would be no apostleship, but without the apostle the gospel would be vague and undefined. He rightly stresses the broad area covered by the word 'gospel' in the Pauline writings, showing that it is sometimes a group of historic facts, sometimes one or two concentrated propositions, sometimes a dynamic movement in history, always something looking forward to an eschatological conclusion. The investigation of the word 'gospel' is one of the most valuable parts of the book.

He admits that we cannot define an apostle with any clarity. He sees the historical picture of the twelve as something that grew up after the first years of the Church's life and is prepared to think that apostles may have been no more than missionaries who had seen the Lord. The apostleship of Paul in this book is interpreted as an autobiographical stance in which Paul saw in his own dramatic reversal of belief and practice an embodiment of the basic idea of the gospel, death and resurrection.

Space forbids an examination of all the evidence which Schütz adduces with such meticulous care. Suffice it to say that he examines very many of the classical passages in which apostleship and gospel emerge as fundamental ideas, such as Galatians 1 and 2, 1 Corinthians 15 and Philippians 1. All these and many other passages are examined with meticulous exegetical care and there is much to learn from these various examinations of the text.

It is fairly plain that the driving force behind the thesis is a rejection of anything in the later life of the Church designed to embody what apostolic authority did, at least within the area of the Pauline Churches. The author sees the idea of pneumatic persons or successors in ecclesiastical office both as false developments forced upon the church through the decline of the vivid conversion experience of Paul himself. That great differences did occur (even within the pages of the New Testament) may be true enough, but the writer does not appear to ask himself whether it was right or necessary for authority to find any embodiment in the later organisation of the church. Organisation may be a poor substitute for dynamic spiritual experience on a large scale but without organisation the dynamism will either go off in ineffective charismatic outbursts or shade off into heresies which no longer embody the real truth once embodied in a historic act of God.

I notice that 1 Corinthians 11:16 ('We have no such custom, nor the churches of God') is not mentioned even in the index of passages, while 1 Corinthians 5:3-5 receives only the most marginal consideration. I think perhaps these are Freudian slips. It would not suit Professor Schütz to see even the foreshadowings of an authority of common practice and belief or of juridical authority by an apostle in the earliest days of the church. On the whole, therefore, I would say that all can profit by following the Professor through this exploration but we might hope to discover something a little less one-sided at the end of our pilgrimage. RONALD LEICESTER

A GUIDE TO ROMANS. TEF Study Guide II. *Roger Bowen*. SPCK, 1975. 236 pp. £2.95.

The latest addition to the Theological Education Fund series comes from Tanzania. Roger Bowen has made a virtue of the limitations of the series (that it should be designed to meet the needs of Third World students for whom English is a second language) in that he has put a wealth of theology into a straightforward and readable commentary on Romans. Some brief commentaries degenerate into dogmatic over-simplifications; this one demonstrates the often-forgotten truth that one must go more, not less, deeply into a subject if one is to explain it simply and clearly. Thus the fact that the book is, in English terms, aimed at 'A' level students rather than researchers by no means implies that the latter have nothing to learn from it. The material is set out clearly, and the addition of photographs and anecdotes from a wide variety of sources gives the book colour as well as shedding fresh light on the text. Of particular value are the 'Study Suggestions' at the end of each section; these range from word-studies to searching questions of theology and application, and would be equally valuable for the individual, the teacher and the leader of group Bible studies. While the author's acknowledged debt to various leading Conservative Evangelicals is clear, the student is never presented with pre-digested formulae, but always encouraged to think for himself. It is particularly interesting to see the positive and realistic way in which ch. 13 is treated by a writer from this background.

N. T. WRIGHT

A CRITICAL AND EXEGETICAL COMMENTARY ON THE EPISTLE TO THE ROMANS (ICC): Volume I (Introduction and Commentary on Romans 1-8). *C. E. B. Cranfield*. T. & T. Clark, 1975. 444 pp. £7.00.

It is just eighty years since the first edition of the ICC on Romans (Sanday and Headlam) appeared. Much has happened since then, and the new edition, the first under the general editorship of J. A. Emerton and C. E. B. Cranfield, has been eagerly awaited. A 'firstfruit' appeared in 1965, as an SJT Occasional Paper, giving promise of good things to come. Now at last we have the first volume of the complete commentary.

Let it be said at once that this work deserves a far more detailed study than has been possible in the space allocated for this review. This is a book to be savoured slowly. But one or two remarks may be made from a brief study of it. First, it is evident that Cranfield writes with a scholar's mind but with a pastor's heart. It is most refreshing to find him, time and again, pressing home the relevance of the passage under discussion. Here is indeed a volume for preachers as well as for academics; a commentary from which none will fail to benefit. Cranfield's grasp of the literature on Romans is impressive, and he illustrates his remarks not only from recent discussions but also from wide readings in the Fathers and the Reformers.

The Introduction is remarkably brief. Cranfield believes that the proper place for the usual contents of an introduction is after, rather than before, the detailed exegesis. He therefore limits himself to notes on background, authenticity, date and so forth; leaving theological discussions to Volume Two. Tantalisingly, therefore, the reader is constantly being referred to material as yet unavailable. The Introduction closes with a long and fascinating section on the history of the exegesis of the letter.

The Commentary is based on the text of Nestlé. For each section there is a brief introduction, a translation, and then the commentary proper on the Greek text. Textual variants are fully discussed (generally, but not invariably, in footnotes to the Greek text); and as Cranfield often disagrees with Nestlé, it would probably have been better to have used and translated his own text. The commentary lucidly lays out the various interpretative options, and discusses them extensively. Rarely is any possible interpretation ignored. Although Cranfield occasionally writes more as dogmatist than as exegete, the commentary remains an invaluable aid to the study of this key epistle.

D. R. DE LACEY

I SAW HEAVEN OPENED: THE MESSAGE OF REVELATION. *Michael Wilcock*. IVP, 1975. 223 pp. £1.65.

'To expound the biblical text with accuracy, to relate it to contemporary life, and to be readable;' this is the (very demanding) three-fold aim of the series *The Bible Speaks Today*. Michael Wilcock's book is certainly readable, if (perhaps also because) somewhat repetitive. And the author unfolds the biblical text with very great care, balance and good sense. Because so cautious, he sometimes nearly reduces the message of a particular section to a generalisation but this, surely, is better than indulging in over-fanciful interpretation. Here and there, of course, some will find his exegesis questionable; for example, Revelation's insistence on nearness (of the End? of intermediate events?) appears to be superficially treated; similarly the relationship of divine sovereignty to human freedom (with special reference to the Seventh Letter); the case against the first horseman being understood in terms of the proclamation of the gospel (pp. 70ff.) is unconvincing; the relation of the 144,000 to the innumerable throng seems contrived; the silence in heaven (8: 1) is disappointingly superficial. But these are details. To the overall message of Revelation one could hardly find a saner guide than this.

Perhaps it is in terms of the second of the three aims ('to relate it to contemporary life') that the book is least successful. Mr. Wilcock acknowledges that because of Revelation's peculiar difficulties 'the balance between explanation and application has to be weighted on the side of the former' (p. 19), but in one respect at least this proves specially disappointing. For we are given a lucid explanation of what the text means but little is said about the form in which it is couched. Mr. Wilcock is aware of our contemporary disenchantment with words: 'we live in a post-literate age, which, tiring of words, is beginning to talk again in pictures. . . .' Further, 'God knew all about it long ago; and when his children have had enough of reciting systematic theology, he gives them a gorgeous picture-book to look at . . .' (p. 25). But, if the message of Revelation is not only what it says but also how it says it, will not every attempt to apply it also involve some sort of 'rebirth of images'? We are left simply with the words, the raw material; it would have been particularly helpful if the author (whose qualifications and interests would specially fit him for the task) had begun the translation of this raw material back into contemporary images. It is precisely here that many of us cry most urgently for help. If we are all meant to do it for ourselves (and you cannot have everything for £1.65!) I doubt if the dreary cover picture will get us going—at least, not in the right direction!

ARTHUR MOORE

THE FRANCISCANS IN ENGLAND. *J. R. H. Moorman*. Mowbrays, 1974. 122 pp. £2.25/£0.95.

This small, informal book, written to celebrate the 500th anniversary of the coming of the Franciscans to England, is pleasantly produced, cheap, and without footnotes or index to deter the general reader; and the readable text (occasionally marred by misprints) will encourage further reading from the select bibliography provided. There are, regrettably, no illustrations apart from the cover. The story covers the origins of the Franciscans, their settlement in England and development down to the Dissolution in the sixteenth century, and the later history of the Order, both Roman and Anglican.

The book should undoubtedly arouse interest in the friars. For many people it will provide the first introduction to the history of the mendicant orders. And yet it is not entirely satisfactory. To divorce the Franciscans from the whole movement which led to their emergence in the early thirteenth century is surely unjustified. There is here no general discussion of mendicancy or of the other Orders of Friars, especially the Dominicans, who so often upstaged the Franciscans. England may have been isolated from the rest of Europe in some matters such as heresy; but it nevertheless shared the same intellectual and social climate, especially in the thirteenth century.

Further, Dr. Moorman is too kind to his subject; his book has a strong element of hagiography. The late medieval friaries were not such modest buildings as he would have us believe; nor was the standard of living of their inmates 'far below that of other religious' (the opposite is in fact true). Emotive terms are used throughout the text, and too many allowances have been made. No-one will doubt that there were good as well as bad friars, but it is quite plain that by the end of the Middle Ages, the latter predominated heavily—the story of the Dissolution is clear evidence of degeneration. The impracticable ideals of St. Francis, still being proclaimed, contrasted sharply with the practice of his followers. Perhaps it is this which accounts for the bitter condemnation of a small group of literate middle-class writers (Chaucer, Langland and others) and indeed for Dr. Moorman's excessive apologetic.

Nevertheless, the friars still appealed to both nobility and peasantry as preachers and confessors (the English royal court in the early fifteenth century more often than not listened to friars)—and they intrigue Christians today. Perhaps it is their origins which now appeal more than their later development. Anti-intellectual (despite Dr. Moorman), outside the establishment and devoted to practical social improvement, the early Franciscans strike a chord today which the late medieval scholars and ecclesiastical statesmen fail to do. If Dr. Moorman's book leads his readers to examine his subject as well as his conclusions more critically, then I am sure that he will have felt his work of piety worthwhile. ALAN ROGERS

OUR COMMON HISTORY AS CHRISTIANS: ESSAYS IN HONOR OF ALBERT C. OUTLER. *Edited by John Deschner, Leroy T. Howe, Klaus Penzel*. OUP, 1975. 298 pp. £5.50.

Festschriften are sometimes compendia of unrelated essays of variable value but here a group of international scholars speak to a theme that has been at the centre of Outler's thinking—the history common to all Christians. (The phrase is actually Outler's own.)

The essays fall into three groups. The first reflects recent discussions and developments in which Outler has taken and is still taking part. Skydsgaard takes a central theme of Outler's theology, namely the 'common history' of all the churches. Rupert Davies makes the plea that Methodism should put aside its defects highlighted by ecumenical theology, namely the defects of provincialism, pietism and pseudo-historicism, and regard its special features as something to be held on to for the whole Church whilst at the same time submitting its theology to the criticism of the whole Church. That is acceptable, but the reviewer found less acceptable the concern for social involvement: 'The rights of human beings to justice, freedom, health, the conservation of human resources, and the education of the whole personality are as truly part of the Gospel's content and the Church's mission as the doctrine of justification by faith and the resurrection of the dead' (p. 43). This is not the view of Christ, nor of the New Testament writers: the reviewer would rather be condemned with them than win the approval of the Socialists. Lindbeck's essay on the crisis in American Catholicism faces the problem which belongs to the whole Church: Vatican II has drained the piety and conviction from popular Catholicism, he argues; and where can it, and we, go from here? This is a highly significant essay.

Part II of the book turns to applications in history. Chesnut writes on the debate on the meaning of history which Augustine held with the past of his own civilisation, as represented on the one hand by the liberal Eusebius, and on the other hand the atheist Sallust. McSorley makes a forceful plea for an ecumenical theological approach rather than a status quo approach, rightly arguing that a scholar belongs to the whole Christian community, not to his own specialism. He discusses here Aquinas, Pupper and Luther and documents his statements by weighty scholarship. Paul Minear offers an entrancing case study of J. S. Bach the musician, and his colleague J. A. Ernesti the philologist, viewed as biblical exegetes. Daniel Williams gives a study of Hegel and Whitehead on the contribution of philosophy to the credibility and intelligibility of the Christian faith.

The third section of the book addresses itself to theology. Cushman examines the doctrines of election and universalism, and argues that the Gospel was for the οἰκουμένη. Penzel argues for a *radical*, historical confessionalism. Ogden closes the book with a difficult essay on revelation. He takes the view that *what* Christian revelation reveals to man is nothing new but *that* this revelation occurs does reveal something new. Apart from the blemish of two bad mistakes in the Greek (p. 215, p. 267) it is a worthy *Festschrift* to a worthy theologian.

JAMES ATKINSON

LUTHER ON JUSTIFICATION. *Robin A. Leaver*. Concordia, 1975. 84 pp. \$3.95.

After a short introduction Leaver offers four chapters in which he explains Luther's stress on the word 'alone'; what Luther meant by faith; what 'works' are; and finally, that the doctrine is concerned with salvation by grace, by faith *in Christ only*.

The book is virtually an anthology of Luther's writings and sayings on justification by faith alone.

The book teems with choice quotations from Luther's writings, with modern references in translation where Luther is allowed to speak for himself. It not only offers positive teaching, it removes a great deal of the

misunderstanding which Luther experienced himself at the time, and from which his theology still suffers. For example, Leaver demolishes the notion that faith is to be understood as some kind of subjective condition of the believer, as well as the idea that faith is a form of intellectual assent or understanding—both of which views transmute faith into a work. He sees Luther's view that faith is faith in Christ only, and cannot be understood without its object: that Luther's theology was in practice a Christology. He demonstrates Luther's clear awareness that faith is never without love, in other words without works.

The book is sound in every respect and completely reliable in its views, and is well supported by documentary evidence. It is an authoritative clarification of the issue, based faithfully on Luther's own words. The many happy quotations from Luther give the book an air of truth and authenticity, as well, of course, as the charm and wit of Luther's own language.

If there is one area in which the reviewer might offer criticism, it is that more ought to have been given on the differences on this matter between Protestant and Roman Catholic theologians. The difference between righteousness imputed and righteousness imparted should have had at least a brief treatment, as should the difference between justification by faith alone and justification by faith with love, and also what Rome meant by '*fides caritate formata*'. These distinctions were important at the time and are still significant in the current ecumenical debate. Nevertheless, it is a first-class booklet.

JAMES ATKINSON

THE ATLANTIC SLAVE TRADE AND BRITISH ABOLITION: 1760-1807. *Roger Anstey.* Macmillan, 1975. 456 pp. £10.00.

This book is important to general historians and to church historians alike, and to anyone who prefers the truth rather than propaganda. Ever since 1944 when Dr. Eric Williams, a black historian who is now Prime Minister of Trinidad, published his thesis on Capitalism and Slavery, it has been fashionable to assert that Abolition owed little or nothing to the evangelical humanitarians, but was simply the hasty answer of cynical statesmen to over-production of sugar in the colonies. Professor Anstey demolishes this theory conclusively.

He is well qualified. Professor of Modern History at the University of Kent, he was previously teaching at a university in West Africa. He is also a practising Methodist—which is important because too many other historians whose professional status might be comparable, have allowed their anti-Christian bias to hinder their historical integrity. Dr. Anstey patiently unravels facts, ranging quite widely in the manuscript sources and very widely in printed material.

He begins by studying the Slave Trade itself. Then he explores changing philosophical and theological attitudes, and shows how by the third quarter of the 18th century both had made British consciences much more uneasy than has hitherto been realised, despite the earlier work of Dr. Brion Davies. Dr. Anstey is particularly good in bringing forward the Quaker and Evangelical contribution. In the second half of the book, which describes the course of the campaign through twenty years of erratic progress, he strikes the balance between the influence of personalities, such as Wilberforce, and factors less obvious at the time, such as the political and economic. Some

of the touches about Abolitionists (like the Scottish lord of session who kept a pig in his bedroom) are delicious.

He investigates the composition of the Parliamentary anti-Abolition lobby, something never properly done before. He puts into its proper place, again for the first time in any book, the vital alliance between Stephen, Wilberforce and Grenville which won final victory.

JOHN POLLOCK

WORDSWORTH'S 'NATURAL METHODISM'. *Richard E. Brantley*. Yale University Press, 1975. 205 pp. £5.50.

The title of this book comes from a phrase used by Lamb, and the work is an attempt to present 'biographical and poetical evidence for William Wordsworth's indebtedness to Evangelical Anglicanism'. Dr. Brantley notes the poet's contacts with Wilberforce and he mentions but does not dwell on Cookson of Fornsett, uncle to Wordsworth, who brought up Dorothy and was a definite Evangelical. What is more important, he does not consider the Cambridge influence on Wordsworth at a time when Simeon was in his earliest and most controversial years at Holy Trinity. The book does not make any specific attempt to trace or define 'Evangelical Anglicanism', and as a result the author seems unaware that there were several varieties of the species. Moreover, much of his supporting evidence is derived from Wesley, who was hardly the best source for 'Evangelical *Anglicanism*', and at one stage we even have Isaac Watts dragged in—with the comment 'subscribing, of course, to the Puritan faith common in Scotland'! (p. 131). Dr. Brantley's scholarly inaccuracy is displayed again in the reference to Toplady's 1823 edition of Quarles' *Emblems*. A look at the DNB would have told him that Toplady died in 1778. Then there is note 14 (p. 193) where we are told that 'Clarkson's Evangelicalism can be seen, for example, in his participation with Wilberforce in the fight against the slave-trade'—as if this were an Evangelical monopoly!

But there are more serious things than this: 'Often for the Evangelicals the Volume of Creation possessed as much authority as the Bible itself' (p. 145)—no evidence cited, and a big prize for the first man to find any! Again: 'Through spiritual aid man is capable of making a covenant of good works' (p. 123): this is associated with achieving "holiness on earth", the Puritan goal of covenant-making'. Indeed, the whole of this section on *The Excursion* shows what the author apparently cannot see, namely, Wordsworth's traditional middle-of-the-road, good-works, undoctinal Anglicanism. In other words, what we have always thought him to be. Even where the parallels between Wordsworth and this, that or the other sort of Evangelicalism seem possible, they are not proven and are sometimes unlikely.

One can only conclude that Dr. Brantley is versed enough in neither Anglican Evangelical history nor doctrine for the undertaking he has assumed, and his case amounts largely to alleged parallel without adequate foundation. To see a real Evangelical, he would have done well to read Cowper before embarking on Wordsworth.

ARTHUR POLLARD

THE PRINCIPLE OF RESERVE IN THE WRITINGS OF JOHN HENRY CARDINAL NEWMAN. *Robin C. Selby*. OUP, 1975. 110 pp. £5.00.

Reserve, Newman wrote in his *Arians of the Fourth Century*, is concerned with fostering the reverence due to sacred things, by withholding them, until men are worthy to behold them.

He said that our Lord had given us the principle of reserve in his own words, 'Cast not your pearls before swine,' and exemplified it in his teaching by parables. He added that St. Paul expressly distinguished between the milk which is necessary to one set of men, and the strong meat which is allowed to others. The same principle of reserve certainly may be found in the Fathers and was revived by the Tractarians in the nineteenth century whose enemies used it as a stick with which to beat them.

Just how important is this principle of reserve in Newman's writings? It certainly had a place as part of his reaction from Evangelicalism, in Church's words, 'as a protest against the coarseness and shallowness which threw the most sacred words about at random in loud and declamatory appeals'. It figures in the *Apologia* because the controversy with Kingsley raged around Newman's idea of truth, for had not Newman said that reserve 'may be considered as withholding the truth'? But we must not overlook the fact that after his conversion Newman expressly disavowed the use of reserve and gave up 'economical half-speakings' saying that 'the most damaging folly is to be found out shuffling; and that the first of virtues is to "tell truth, and shame the devil" '.

One reader at least is confused by the use of the two terms 'reserve' and 'economy'—they seem to be almost interchangeable—and one is left with an uneasy feeling that reserve too often differs little from expediency and hardly merits such extended treatment.

ROGER JOB

THE LETTERS AND DIARIES OF JOHN HENRY NEWMAN

VOLUME XXVII: The Controversy with Gladstone, January 1874 to December 1875. 456 pp. £15.00.

VOLUME XXVIII: Fellow of Trinity, January 1876 to December 1878. 478 pp. £15.00,

Edited by Charles Stephen Dessain and Thomas Gornall, SJ. Clarendon Press. OUP, 1975.

Gladstone's *Vatican Decrees in their bearing on Civil Allegiance*, 1874, questioned the loyalty of English Roman Catholics. Newman received very many requests to write an answer and he did so in his vintage pamphlet *A Letter to the Duke of Norfolk*, published in January 1875, shortly before his seventy-fourth birthday. This riposte, though it won over public opinion and scored a success second only to the *Apologia*, did not flow easily from his pen: he was filled with anxiety about its reception. Groundless fears made him write, quite uncharacteristically, 'I felt as if up in a balloon, and till I got down safe, I could not be easy. I might be turned upside down by a chimney pot, left atop a tree, or carried out to sea.' In the event he made a perfect landing and, once more, this monumental edition of Newman's *Letters and Diaries* provides its unique insight into the humanity and greatness of the 'dear Giant'.

Although Gladstone described the Roman Church as 'an Asian monarchy: nothing but one giddy height of despotism', Newman remained friendly with him and deeply appreciated the warm tribute he paid when the hall and library of Keble College were officially opened. He was likewise particularly gratified in December 1877 by the offer of an Honorary Fellowship of Trinity ('so dear to me all my life'); and he remarked justly on 'the great change of feeling in English Society'. Many letters allude to his subsequent visit to Oxford, his first for thirty-two years.

There is much sunshine in these volumes. Newman is revered as never before and 'how many dear friends I have had'. He rejoices in good health. He is as industrious as ever, and as prayerful. But the death of his dear friend Ambrose St. John in May 1875 is a bitter blow, 'the greatest affliction that I have had in my life—but God sends it to me to wean me from this world'.

ROGER JOB

A BASKET OF FRAGMENTS. *Robert Murray M'Cheyne.* Christian Focus Publications, 1975. 194 pp. £2.00.

Minister of St. Peter's, Dundee, M'Cheyne was not quite thirty when he died in 1843, the seventh year of a ministry which moved Scotland deeply. This volume, reprinted from an 1848 publication, comprises thirty-seven sermons and seven hymns (not, however including the best-known: 'When This Passing World Is Done'). They show M'Cheyne to have been a lucid, systematic biblical expositor with the evangelical urgency of a Rutherford, Bunyan or Wesley. His was the intolerable burden of the pastoral heart that could never get used to the sound of Christless feet on the road to hell, his the solemn doctrine that 'the eternal torment of the wicked will be a matter of eternal song with the redeemed'. He warns those who reject God's offer of salvation that, amid the smoke of their torments, 'Jesus will laugh at your calamity'.

While these sermons hit such characteristic sombre notes, it is a pity that the publishers should have presented them with no more than a one-page preface. This preacher needs more adequate introduction so that words can be placed in the context of daily walk, frequent illness, and caring heart that spoke to the condition of his Dundee parishioners, and evoked their love in return. Andrew Bonar, whose *Memoir and Remains* of M'Cheyne gives a more comprehensive picture, says of his friend: 'He cared for no question unless his Master cared for it'. Knowledge of this motivation greatly enhances the benefit to be gained from this reprint. J. D. DOUGLAS

NETTLETON AND HIS LABOURS: THE MEMOIR OF DR. ASAHEL NETTLETON; remodelled in some parts by Andrew A. Bonar. Banner of Truth Trust, 1975. 454 pp. £2.10.

A Connecticut farmer's son, Nettleton was born in 1783, and after conversion at eighteen he combined agriculture with study until entering Yale College in 1805. There never more than an average scholar, he impressed everyone by his Christian spirit and witness. Licensed to preach in 1811, the fruit of his labours was such that colleagues besought him to delay his foreign mission plans and to be an evangelist at home, which vocation was confirmed when his health broke down in 1822. Nettleton's itinerant ministry saw great revivals, many conversions, and galvanised New England Congregationalism. A warm admirer of John Bunyan, his sermons were scriptural, clear and practical. He ministered also in Virginia for two years, and in search of health went to Britain in 1831 for more than a year. Increasingly he became a minister to ministers.

This book provides copious information about a remarkable American half-century of revivals, discusses at some length the controversy about them that arose through the teaching of Charles G. Finney, and does it all with an earnestness and an apocalyptic urgency which rebuke the spirit of the present age in theology.

The publishers might have taken greater care over the book-jacket. They have not only varied the title of the book, but attributed it equally to Tyler and Bonar. The Introduction by the latter should be read so as to make clear the contribution by these two. In addition, the blurb gives 1843 as the year of Nettleton's death; page 428 says distinctly 1844. J. D. DOUGLAS

HAWKER OF MORWENSTOW: PORTRAIT OF A VICTORIAN ECCENTRIC. *Piers Brendon.* Cape, 1975. 270 pp. £4.95.

The Victorian Age was rich in people of strong personality and independent thought whose non-conformity did not follow any recognised pattern. Parson Hawker was certainly in this tradition and will always defy anyone who tries to write a definitive biography. Dr. Brendon has written a careful study, distinguishing fact from legend, to which future interpreters of Hawker's many-sided character will always be indebted.

Dr. Brendon's surprising comparison between Hawker and Frederick Rolfe, otherwise known as Baron Corvo, does not carry conviction. While there are similarities, Hawker developed as a single-minded pastor of fertile imagination and applied himself with extraordinary devotion to a community isolated to an extent which is almost unimaginable today. Rolfe, even in his more charitable moments, was concerned primarily with ideas and their expression rather than with people.

Dr. Brendon says of Hawker that 'such fame as he now possesses is based less on his achievements as pastor and poet than on his life itself, on the totality of his strange, lonely, passionate existence by the sea'. That 'passionate existence' was, however, lived as a pastor and expressed in his poems and can only be fully appreciated in those terms. It is to be hoped that Dr. Brendon's account of his life will stimulate further studies of Hawker as priest, whose Catholic churchmanship defies an exact label, and as poet, whose rich use of imagery can bring illumination to the spiritual darkness of today.

† GRAHAM TRURON

THE TÜBINGEN SCHOOL. *Horton Harris.* Clarendon Press, 1975. 288 pp. £9.50.

The Tübingen School has always been something of a *mysterium tremendum et fascinans*. And like all mysteries, especially those of a dubious character, F. C. Baur and his disciples have laboured under more than a fair share of misunderstanding and misrepresentation. Baur's rejection as inauthentic of all but four of the Pauline epistles (Romans, Galatians, 1 and 2 Corinthians) is clear enough. This is frequently put down to the application of Hegelian dialectic to historical criticism. But was Baur really a Hegelian? His son-in-law and biographer, Eduard Zeller, denied it and claimed that Baur was more influenced by Schleiermacher. Peter C. Hodgson in his brilliant study *The Formation of Historical Theology: A Study of Ferdinand Christian Baur* (1966) presented Baur as a pious, if heterodox, Christian believer. Wolfgang Geiger in his *Spekulation und Kritik: Die Geschichtstheologie Ferdinand Christian Baur's* (1964) saw him as a rationalist and atheist. All of which prompts the question: 'Will the real Ferdinand Christian Baur please stand up?' Horton Harris ventures the hope that as the result of his study the real F. C. Baur will finally have stood up.

But there is a further question: 'Was there ever really such a thing as the Tübingen School?' Hodgson doubts it. Harris not only answers in the

affirmative but says that 'It was *the most important theological event in the whole history of theology from the Reformation to the present day*' (his italics). I myself am far from convinced on either point. This is not to detract from the merits of this excellent study. Rather it is to put my own evaluation on the evidence here set forth. Admittedly, Baur himself accepted the term and wrote in defence of the school. But when all is said and done, the 'school' itself only amounted to eight significant members: Baur himself, Eduard Zeller, Albert Schweigler, Karl Christian Planck, Karl Reinhold Köstlin, Albrecht Ritschl, Adolf Hilgenfeld and Gustav Volkmar. Even at its height it commanded the following of only a section of the Tübingen faculty. Ritschl was an early defector. Harris admits that without Zeller it is doubtful whether the school would have existed. Hilgenfeld never actually met Baur. With the latter's death in 1860 what there was of a school fell apart. All this would tend to confirm the remark of Otto Michel, himself until recently a distinguished professor of New Testament at Tübingen, that the school was really no more than Baur himself and his immediate disciples, and that theological schools in Germany never are more than this.

As Dr. Harris sees it, the school was characterised by four features: (1) the University of Tübingen, where five of its members completed their studies and taught, and where the *Theologische Jahrbücher*, the organ for their views, was published; (2) the founder of the school, F. C. Baur, who taught at Tübingen from 1826, though the school owed probably as much to Zeller and Schweigler; (3) the common concern to provide a purely historical, non-supernatural, non-miraculous interpretation of Christianity; (4) the thesis of the opposition between Paul and the other apostles, based on an alleged conflict between Jewish and Gentile parties in the early church. The degree to which the NT writings reflect this conflict was decisive in the assessment of historicity and authenticity.

In preparing this study the author has made good use of original correspondence. The work falls into two main parts: the first consists in a series of historical sketches of the careers of the several members of the school; the second deals with the Tübingen theological and historical perspective. Inevitably the focal point is a critique of Baur's position.

Baur's involvement with Hegelianism was complex. The author makes the telling point that Baur's erstwhile Hegelianism was later played down when Hegelianism fell out of fashion. There clearly was a period in Baur's life when Hegel impressed him very much. But much more decisive was, as Dr. Harris points out, the anti-supernaturalistic approach to history. From my reading of Baur I would say that he reached his decisive positions before he had studied anything by Hegel. His approach to NT history was not based on the application of a dialectic of thesis, antithesis and synthesis (which, in any case, is less characteristic of Hegel than of Fichte). Rather, it was based on *tendency* criticism by which Baur claimed to detect tendencies in documents which enabled him to locate what has since come to be called their *Sitz im Leben*. It was on this basis that he posited the conflict between the Hellenistic and Jewish parties in the early church. However, when he came to philosophise about history Baur spoke and wrote like a Hegelian. For him history was a matter of re-thinking the eternal thoughts of the eternal spirit in time.

Many of Baur's points have a curiously modern ring (or conversely, a lot of what passes as modern was thoroughly aired well over a century ago).

Perhaps today Baur would be counted as an *avant garde* redaction critic who combined this with the rôle of process theologian. But Baur's immediate influence was much less profound. By the time Baur came on to the scene, biblical criticism with its attempt to read the Bible like any other book was entering upon its adolescence. The Tübingen school did not create it; it was created by it. It was a thorn in the flesh not only of conservatives and pietists but of the majority of those who wished to pursue a more moderate biblical criticism. In the history of ideas it remained an irritant rather than a trail-blazer. To make this point is to query one of the author's contentions, but it is a contention that is thrown out at the beginning of the book and which has no real part in the subject-matter proper, which is a critical exposition of what the Tübingen School was all about. This is handled with an admirable expertise, lucidity and elegance which will establish this study as a standard work in the history of ideas.

COLIN BROWN

HEGEL. *Charles Taylor*. CUP, 1975. 580 pp. £12.50.

In 1865 James Hutchison Stirling published a book entitled *The Secret of Hegel* which provoked the inevitable acid comment that he had kept it remarkably well. Since his death at the height of his fame in 1831 Hegel's thought has suffered mixed fortunes. There was a time, culminating in the early twenties, when certain elder scholars in the older British universities adopted and adapted it as the key to everything. But for over a generation British philosophers have dismissed Hegel as the classical example of confused German metaphysics based on mistaken premises, proceeding by systematic misuse of language and bearing no relation to the world as it actually is. But since J. N. Findlay's *Hegel: A Re-Examination* in 1958 there has been something of a minor Hegel renaissance. This is not entirely due to the fact that nothing in the academic world is ever quite dead and that sooner or later someone somewhere decides that it is worth taking out and dusting. In the field of politics Hegel studies have received something of a boost in view of the influence of Hegel on Marx. And in the realm of religion Hegel's brand of immanentism has been utilised in various quarters as an alternative to theism.

Important recent studies include Walter Kaufmann's *Hegel: Reinterpretation, Texts, and Commentary* (1965) which is perhaps the best introduction for the general reader, with its combination of texts and explanation; and Emil L. Fackenheim's *The Religious Dimension of Hegel's Thought* (1967). Now alongside these, Charles Taylor, Professor of Philosophy and Political Science at McGill University, Montreal, has provided a survey of almost panoramic proportions. He begins with an account which is at once chatty and unhurried of the closing decades of the eighteenth century. Hegel is seen as the child of his age—influenced by the Enlightenment, born into the generation of Romantics and yet consciously striving to transcend both. Professor Taylor sees in both his background and in Hegel himself a pervasive tension between the evolving ideals of individuality and nationality on the one hand, and on the other, a deeply-felt need to recover unity with nature and within society. Hegel was still in his teens at the outbreak of the French Revolution. He lived through the Napoleonic era. He was called to the chair of philosophy at Berlin in 1816. But he did not live quite long enough to witness the break up of his school into a Hegelian right (those who remained faithful to the master) and a Hegelian left (the younger generation

bent on turning the whole thing upside down). In the realm of theology Hegel thought that he was providing the philosophical rationale of the Christian religion. In that of history and politics he thought that he had given an account of the forward movement of civilisation, culminating in the Prussian monarchy. In the event it turned out that he had inadvertently fathered a system which became the most comprehensive system of atheism yet known to mankind, although Hegel could hardly have foreseen the uses to which his conceptual scheme would be put.

In his student days Hegel had read theology with a view to entering the ministry. He wrote various youthful pieces which did not see the light of day until a century later. Some of these bear the imprint of Kant and proclaim a version of Christianity more akin to *The Magic Flute* than the Sermon on the Mount. But Hegel's early Kantianism was left behind in favour of the all-embracing dialectic of Spirit which characterises his published work and posthumously published lectures. Reality is the outworking of Spirit coming to self-consciousness.

The central part of this massive work is rightly devoted to an analysis of the ramifications of Hegel's doctrine of Spirit. The successive main sections deal with phenomenology, logic, history and politics and Absolute Spirit. The latter embraces art, religion and philosophy. Readers to whom Hegel has remained a closed secret will find in Professor Taylor a patient and sympathetic guide. Not the least valuable feature of this study is the way in which he elucidates the idiosyncratic vocabulary and tortuous language of his subject. The general reader will not be overwhelmed by professional expertise. This is not a book which is written simply for other professional philosophers.

At the end of the day Professor Taylor is obliged to pronounce Hegel's central thesis quite dead, but nevertheless his philosophy is still relevant. Modern man can no longer see history as the progressive unfolding of Spirit. He has no time for the pantheism which lay at the heart of Hegel's thought. In the discussion on relevance we are gently led through the arid wastes of Marxist dogmatics only to be told that, promising though Hegel is, the even more obscure Hölderlin might turn out to be a better bet. Professor Taylor has presented a helpful guide into the labyrinth of Hegel's thought which does not shun pausing to chat engagingly about the features of the landscape along the way. But I can't help thinking that Kierkegaard was right after all, or, come to that, the past generation of British empiricists, when it comes to Hegel's use of language.

COLIN BROWN

THE ETHICS OF BELIEF: AN ESSAY ON THE VICTORIAN RELIGIOUS CONSCIENCE. *James C. Livingston*. American Academy of Religion, 1974. 60pp. n.p.

The historian of Victorian agnosticism, A. O. J. Cockshut, has written of them that they 'could not sneer. They cared too much' (*The Unbelievers*, p. 101). The thrust of much of the criticism of Christian belief was that the critics were more *moral* than their religious opponents. T. H. Huxley's famous rebuke of Samuel Wilberforce is a familiar instance. This monograph supplies further examples of this tendency. All the leading figures in the high Victorian debate over belief are handled with a sure touch, from the extreme critics like W. K. Clifford to the wistful semi-believers like Henry Sidgwick. The last twelve pages are an attempt to bring the subject up to

date, and suffer by comparison to the detailed discussion of the earlier section. The Report on Doctrine in the Church of England of 1922 is severely handled, as leading into that land where 'anything can be made to mean anything' (p. 58), but the Doctrine Commission of 1967 are judged to have shown 'great sensitivity to the moral issue' of assent to the articles (p. 60), a cause of much mental agonising to Victorians. The writer ends with an expression of regret at the 'melancholy' indifferentism of modern Christians by comparison to their Victorian forefathers. T. E. YATES

THE REVIVAL OF THE CONVOCATION OF YORK, 1837-1861. D. A. Jennings. St. Anthony's Press, 1975. 27 pp. £0.55.

This is a pleasantly written and well documented monograph. As is well known, convocations in both provinces 'slept' between 1717-1852. A number of factors caused a movement for their revival to be set on foot, among them the desire for an authoritative doctrinal voice in the church after the Gorham judgment of 1850. Whereas Henry Hoare and his friends in the Society for the Revival of Convocation were comparatively quick to realise their aims in the southern province, York delayed longer, owing to the determined opposition of Archbishop Musgrave. Among Evangelicals Dean Close (as he was to become) had written in 1836 of the 'absolute necessity of a revival of our legitimate councils' (p. 2): but convocation became one of the issues where Tractarian views of the Church put Evangelicals out of sympathy with their aims by the 1850's. How far Hoare and others would have desired the continued existence of Convocation once synodical government was established in the church is very doubtful, but this is a contemporary question which falls outside Mr. Jennings' purview. Meanwhile, he persuaded one reader that the single footnote on the York Convocation in Professor Chadwick's *magnum opus* was worthy of further amplification. T. E. YATES

WITTGENSTEIN. Anthony Kenny. Penguin Books, 1975. 240 pp. £0.80.

Two particular problems face any interpreter of Wittgenstein. First, it is generally agreed that it is difficult to summarise or even to paraphrase Wittgenstein's thought without oversimplifying it or reducing its impact. Secondly, many interpretations of specific points in Wittgenstein's thought remain controversial, and it is therefore tempting for the reader to confine himself to the suggestions of Wittgenstein's closest and oldest exponents, namely Norman Malcolm, Elizabeth Anscombe and Rush Rhees. However, Dr. Kenny admirably overcomes both problems. His exposition is always clear, and does justice to Wittgenstein's own thought, whilst his interpretations of particular points are convincing and well-documented with reference to Wittgenstein's writings from all periods.

Dr. Kenny begins, rightly, with a biographical sketch which introduces Wittgenstein to those who may as yet be unfamiliar with his writings. He shows how the main thrusts and concerns, first of the *Tractatus*, and then of the later writings, relate to Wittgenstein's intellectual quests. In the *Tractatus*, propositions show how things are; in the *Investigations*, to understand the meaning of a word is to study it in the language-game to which it belongs. The background to Wittgenstein's earlier thought is first discussed with reference to Frege and Russell. The author includes a discussion of sense

and reference, truth-tables, logical notation and logical analysis. This leads in due course to a fuller consideration of the picture theory and of logical atomism.

Wittgenstein's increasing awareness of the difficulties of his own earlier thought is well expounded in such a way that the reader feels the problems for himself. One of the strongest and most distinctive values of this book is that, as translator of the *Philosophische Grammatik*, Dr. Kenny draws fully both on that writing and also on the *Bemerkungen* in order to show the movement of Wittgenstein's thought during this particular period. For example, the *Bemerkungen* contain some interesting observations about expectation which, as Dr. Kenny notes, are of great importance for the study of the continuity of Wittgenstein's thought. There is a very clear chapter on understanding, thinking and meaning, where the basic point is elucidated that 'the criteria by which we decide whether someone understood a sentence . . . are quite different from the criteria by which we discover what mental processes are going on while someone is talking . . .'.

The chapter on language-games contains a clear discussion of use, training and rules, and this is followed by an excellent treatment of private language. But perhaps the most interesting chapters, to my mind, are those on scepticism and certainty, and on the continuity of Wittgenstein's philosophy. On this last point, for example, Dr. Kenny rejects the notion that 'picture' and 'use' may serve as contrasting slogans for the earlier and later writings: 'The picture theory survived the abandonment of the metaphysics of logical atomism.' The picture theory underwent modification but not abandonment. It remains true that a proposition is true or false in virtue of relation to reality, but 'what its "relation to reality" consists in differs from one language-game to another' (p. 228).

This is an excellent book, and certainly a first-class introduction to Wittgenstein. On my list for students I would place it either at the top or very near it, and it is probably clearer and more adequate than the comparable book by Pears, good and useful as this is. My only deep regret is that Dr. Kenny, with his theological knowledge, refused to be drawn on the implications of Wittgenstein's thought for religion.

A. C. THISELTON

CLASS AND RELIGION IN THE LATE VICTORIAN CITY. *Hugh McLeod*. Croom Helm, 1975. £6.95.

Over the last year or two there has been a considerable spate of books picturing and analysing various aspects of Church life in Victorian England. This is a long and substantial work. Mr. Hugh McLeod has given clear evidence of the unusual amount of pains and trouble which he has taken. The book is furnished, not only with copious references, but with some extremely interesting notes, which come at the end of each chapter.

The book, like a good many others in the same sort of genre, does at times hover between Church history and sociology of religion. The sociologist is liable to make rather too much of statistics, and to put in a great deal of hard work in establishing facts that often appear to be somewhat obvious anyhow.

The student of late Victorian England can learn a great deal from Hugh McLeod as a historian. His knowledge of London is very wide and remarkably deep. His work really does help to explain to the student some of those very extraordinary facets of nineteenth century religion which left such a

strong deposit in the subconscious minds of so many people. This deposit has ever since acted as a pretty strong deterrent to English people from any real encounter with the Christian faith. For example, the author describes at some length the part played by the fear of hell in making people conform; or take the consequences. There was no animus behind a factual description, but it came as a shock to realise that this was recent history. I do not wish to question the effect of this strange phenomenon because I can remember my own mother's description of how terrified she was as a child by the threat of hell-fire.

At first I was irked by the author's references to 'the state church'. On reflection I realised that in late Victorian times the Anglican Church really did bear the aspect of a state church. There is now very little trace of this left but, of course, Anglican Church life really was erastian in character in those days.

The book is a mine of interesting and worthwhile information about social, religious and industrial life during the late Victorian era. The reader can learn a great deal about various aspects of English nonconformity and of Anglican Church life—along with some information about Roman Catholics in England at this time. The reader will gain more from a wise use of these vast stores of information than from the author's main thesis. The difficulty about this whole subject of class and religion, whether in Victorian England or in suburban Paris, is that the conclusions of the authors do tend to conform to a familiar pattern. The reader knows before he starts that the more deprived members of the working classes did not fill the pews, whereas far more members of the solid middle class, of course, did so. However, the author of this book in the course of elaborating this somewhat familiar thesis does provide the reader with a very great deal more interesting information than is the case with many similar works.

This book carries a large number of tables and maps, which illustrate the author's theme, and these too bear witness to the exceptional amount of hard and worthwhile work which has gone into Mr. McLeod's work.

GORDON HOPKINS

DAYLIGHT MUST COME: THE STORY OF DR. HELEN ROSEVEARE. *Alan Burgess.* Michael Joseph, 1975. 279 pp. £3.95.

Though Helen Roseveare's story is well known from her own writings it is nevertheless hard to put down this dramatic retelling of the events of 1964 which made her famous. The book opens on the Simba rebellion in the Congo and a particular truck drive that was to end in execution the lives of the WEC missionary passengers. The women escaped death but, in company with Italian, Spanish and Belgian nuns, were subjected to indescribable brutalities, such as conquerors from time immemorial have inflicted on captive women, but for which modern European missionaries were totally unprepared. Little wonder that primitive, agonising fear drove these women to desperate attempts at self protection, though alas in vain.

From the point of view of Christian theology the book provides much food for thought. It presents an opportunity to see what revolution entailed in an African country which had been the victim of white injustice. It raises questions concerning the preparation of Christian workers: how are they to understand the promises of God—'The Lord shall preserve thy going out and thy coming in'? Can they afford to be as innocent politically as Helen

evidently was? Is it a Christian duty to stay and suffer with the young church or should the Mission have insisted on withdrawal? Was it godly wisdom that deprived Helen of all leadership once a male doctor arrived?

Alan Burgess raises none of these issues. He merely tells this moving story supremely well, and I recommend it for compulsive reading and subsequent theological reflection.

JOYCE BALDWIN

GOD, FREEDOM AND EVIL. *Alvin Plantinga.* George Allen and Unwin, 1975. 112 pp. £1.75.

This book is mainly occupied with two concerns, first to refute the argument that God could not have created a world containing evil, and second to defend the Ontological Argument against objections. In his discussion of them Professor Plantinga relies heavily upon ideas developed in greater detail in his recent work, *The Nature of Necessity*, and especially upon the concept of 'possible worlds'. In fact, the book is warmly to be recommended as a non-Specialist introduction to the logic of necessity and possibility, being clearly written and illustrated with a wealth of examples. As a contribution to religious philosophy, its strength lies in its rigorous argument. Plantinga is concerned to show that the concept of God is coherent, given certain assumptions. Whether we are prepared to make the assumptions is another matter. The first part defends the possibility of evil as a consequence of moral freedom. It requires therefore both that our choices are not determined by external causes and that all evil is the result of someone's freedom—if not man's, then Satan's. For many the existence of the Devil or of gaps in the web of cause and effect will be harder to accept than the existence of God. Similarly Plantinga's defence of the Ontological Argument, as he himself recognises, can be stood on its head. 'No being can be defined into existence; hence, if the Argument itself is flawless, then there must be a confusion concealed in the definition of God as a 'greatest possible being'.

FRANKLYN DULLEY

THE BIOLOGY OF GOD: A SCIENTIST'S STUDY OF MAN THE RELIGIOUS ANIMAL. *Alister Hardy.* Jonathan Cape. 238 pp. £4.50.

Sir Alister Hardy is a zoologist of eminence. During his long career he has been professor of Zoology at Hull, Aberdeen and Oxford, occupying the chair at the latter for 17 years. In his later years he has produced several books dealing with the borderline between science and religion—*The Living Stream* (1965) and *The Divine Flame* (1967) for instance. As a matter of fact these two books represent the substance of his Gifford Lectures, for Sir Alister Hardy joined the famous group of men who have lectured in that foundation in 1963-65, when his subject was Science and Religion. Six years after he retired from his Oxford chair he founded at Manchester College, Oxford, the Religious Experience Research Unit of which he still continues as Director. The present book is in fact an exposition of the ideas on which the Research Unit was founded, and is itself the expansion of a series of Hibbert lectures which the author was invited to deliver in 1969. With both Gifford and Hibbert in its lineage the book promises something interesting.

What is it in fact about? Hardy is a convinced Darwinian; nevertheless he recognises the spiritual frustration to which orthodox evolutionary doctrine seems to condemn modern man. He himself believes, on the basis of well-documented human experience, that there is a spiritual 'something'—

God if you will—associated with life and indeed matter in the universe. Men of religious outlook, both very primitive and highly civilised, testify to a help they receive from a power beyond themselves. The strange story of parapsychology—extra-sensory perception, clairvoyance and precognition—which Hardy accepts as scientifically well-established, adds its support to the same conviction. And certain of the doctrines of psychology, such as Jung's collective unconscious, fit in fairly readily to the scheme. Hardy believes that Darwinian natural selection can be rescued from the implication that it is wholly mechanical by the recognition that mind—the animal mind, that is—can be found a place in it. For instance, an adventurous tit some years ago discovered that milk bottle tops could be pierced with advantageous results. The habit formed by this enterprising bird spread—this is a matter of history—and a situation arose in which mechanistic natural selection could be expected to work to strengthen and establish the milk sampling habit. The significance of this sort of thing, Hardy believes, can be easily overlooked; it lies in the fact that the course of evolution has been altered by the initiative of the evolving animal's *mind*, not simply by the pressures, for example, of the environment. In other words, it seems to give Mind a place in the whole process, and to that extent to rescue natural selection from the stigma of being purely mechanical.

It is difficult to do justice to Sir Alister's thought in a short review. It is not altogether of a piece; his predilection for process theology, for instance, rests on quite a different basis from his attempt to collect and analyse religious experience. This he and his team at Oxford are endeavouring to do on as large a scale as possible. Requests through the press have brought in about 4,000 personal records of religious experience. The book gives some samples of these, and they seem genuine and thoughtful, often moving. Sir Alister hopes to examine these and so, by the inductive method, to arrive at more or less scientific conclusions about the Power behind such things. This in turn he hopes will lead to a more effective use of, or cooperation with, such a Power, to man's advantage. It is the feeling that such a Power has been important in biological evolution, particularly in man's evolution, that he is thinking of in his title, *The Biology of God*. God is something, somewhere, in the scheme of matter and life that has to be taken into account when thinking biologically on the grand scale. He ends his book with these words:

'The systematic study of the experience of God carried out in the spirit of the seeking naturalists . . . can I believe prepare the ground for a religious faith in harmony with the true spirit of science . . . a faith . . . that what men in their different ways have called God, Nirvana, Kwoth and other names is in truth a demonstrable part of the very nature of man—man the religious animal.'

Perhaps that is not very well expressed; but if God is not exactly a 'part of man' in the author's view, he is at least vastly reduced from the stature of the God of Israel. It is, in fact, not easy to say just what the author's conception of God is. The reviewer was left with the uncomfortable feeling that Sir Alister is trying to interpret his facts—the records of experience he has collected—in terms of a shadowy metaphysic he has adopted on quite other grounds. The basis of his faith is therefore hardly, as he claims, experimental (i.e. experience). The question of the grand presuppositions of one's position is important even with physical science (though it is usually neglected); but when one comes to the consideration of life, mind and

personality it is all-important; and here Sir Alister can hardly claim to 'have his presuppositions showing'. One of his presuppositions seems to be that 'by searching' we can 'find out God'; that the Key to understanding is intellectual rather than moral, research rather than obedience. This *a priori* element in his enterprise is very unsatisfactory; it leads him to what appears to the reviewer to be a very unsympathetic and off-hand attitude to what is surely the most important and impressive of all testimonies of religious experience, the New Testament. To dismiss the evidence for the Resurrection as lightly as he does looks as if his presuppositions were strongly at work; and that, for an enterprise of such potentially momentous significance as he has embarked on can be a very dangerous thing.

It is certainly refreshing to find a scientist acknowledging (in fact insisting) that the discovery of a mechanism does not in the very nature of the case disprove what the theist stands for, and to find a man of Sir Alister's calibre and candour emphasising the importance of the spiritual. But the God who stands capable of being found by the inductive method of the Religious Experience Research Unit is *ipso facto* not the One who is unknowable, except by Revelation. And that the true God is unknowable except by His personal self-disclosure is a point which scripture reiterates over and over again (John 1:18; Matt. 11:27). It may be humbling to men, but in the end it offers the seeker a present hope to which no programme of research can possibly attain.

D. C. SPANNER

TOWARD THE FUTURE. *Teilhard de Chardin*. Collins, 1975. 224 pp. £2.75.

One need not be a full-blown Teilhardian in order to learn from what Teilhard wrote. Fresh essays keep emerging in print, some repeating, others amplifying, what has already come from his pen.

The excellent selections in this volume are arranged in chronological order from 1929 to 1954. In making a selection Dr. N. M. Wildiers has included several on Eastern and Western mysticism. In the course of his travels, as well as of his studies, Teilhard was able to put his finger on the strength of Eastern thinking, and at the same time to see where it fell short of the true Christian experience based on biblical revelation. Here he treats the varying approaches of the east, and incidentally shows how he keeps clear of any form of pantheism.

Naturally he sets out his involvement in the world of individual and social man. He writes again of his Point Omega, and points out how Christ in His church takes up the present cravings of mankind for full integration and carries them forward to a complete realisation. (*A Note on the concept of Christian Perfection*, pp. 101 ff.).

I felt that, as an unmarried man, Teilhard did not fully appreciate the marriage relationship in *The Evolution of Chastity* (pp. 60 ff.). But the hardest chapter for me was the long one on *My Fundamental Vision*. I felt like the critic whom Teilhard quotes when he discusses all too briefly the 'necessity' of creation and also the concept of evil as 'the shadow of Creation' (pp. 195,6). However, there are plenty of crumbs from the Teilhardian loaf to satisfy hunger. The translation by René Hague is good and readable.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

THE FLYING COW: RESEARCH INTO PARANORMAL PHENOMENA IN THE WORLD'S MOST PSYCHIC COUNTRY. *Guy Playfair.* Souvenir Press. 320 pp. £3.50.

In reading a book packed with psychic phenomena, one asks three main questions: 1. Is the author a credible observer? Mr. Playfair's credentials are good. 2. Did events occur in the manner he and others describe? Allowing for a percentage of faulty observations, there are too many occurrences here for all to be bogus. 3. How are the happenings to be interpreted?

The book is concerned only with Brazil, and is divided into three substantial sections, which show how the country is blanketed with the psychic and occult. In the first section the author describes several mediums engaged in differing types of work. These are national figures, but make no charges. One, who has produced some 130 books by automatic writing, runs soup kitchens for the poor out of his royalties.

The second section describes psychic surgeons at work, and the author's observations, photographs, and actual operations on himself are more convincing than the bogus pictures on TV from the Philippines. The third section is a mixture, arguing for reincarnation and investigating poltergeists, besides suggesting hypotheses to explain how another dimension can break in on our 3-dimensional world.

I would judge that in a country where the psychic is accepted as normal a tremendous psychic force is built up and shows itself via the unconscious mind in experiences that seem to transcend space and time, and that may emerge on the material plane. The psychic forces may build up into apparent communications from departed spirits, while still drawing on the memories of the living. Black magicians mobilise the psychic forces, but even morally good percipients are distracted from the life in Christ as the New Testament knows it, as this book shows.

One would like to discuss this classic of psychic experiences with other biblically based Christians who are also well versed in the field of parapsychology.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

EXPLORING MYSTICISM. *Frits Staal.* Penguin, 1975. 224 pp. £0.70. '*Parturiant montes. . .*' Classicists know the end of Horace's line about someone's superbook, to the effect that the mountains are in labour, but their baby is no more than a funny little mouse.

Certainly Frits Staal, with his wide knowledge of east and west, is a mountain in labour, and his book is worth buying for his splendid examination of all the approaches that have been made to mysticism; dogmatic, historical, phenomenological, physiological, drugs, religion. One becomes more and more excited as one after another is analysed positively or negatively. What will the mountain bring forth? On the final page of the text the funny little mouse emerges. 'The study of mysticism is at least in part the study of certain aspects of the mind.' One might be wicked enough nowadays to ask 'What is the mind?'

One turns back to the introduction and realises that the title of the book is misleading. The author is not exploring mysticism but the tools you can use if you want to explore mysticism. One longs for the author to take the plunge into the mystical experience so that he can speak as a genuine explorer, since he admits that some forms can be accessible to most people. At least Zaehner, who gets many kicks, made some attempt.

Professor Staal is concerned to show that mysticism can be investigated rationally. I agree. But my idea of rationality is less narrow. What could be more rational than the use of EEC and ECG in investigations (p. 106 ff.)? It is true that these are investigations only of physical changes in the mystic, and not mysticism itself. But ultimately we can discover mysticism only in terms of the mystic's total state.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

KRISHNAMURTI: THE YEARS OF AWAKENING. *Mary Lutyens.* John Murray, 1975. 327 pp. £6.00.

Krishnamurti is one of several Indian teachers who have in recent years made a deep impression on some circles in the west. It is always interesting to read of such a man's development, especially in such a well produced book as this one by Mary Lutyens. Her mother was very closely bound up with Krishnamurti's life and work, and Mary Lutyens was at one time rumoured to be on the verge of becoming engaged to him.

In his early days Krishnamurti was groomed to be the coming Messiah of the Theosophical Society, and much of this book would be required reading for anyone who enquires into the eccentricities of Mrs. Besant or the clouded life of Charles Leadbeater—and even the elder brother of P. G. Wodehouse. Krishnamurti's founding of the Order of the Star in the East in 1911 widened the scope of the Society, although some members, notably Rudolph Steiner, broke away. Ultimately the Theosophist world Messiah detached himself from the Society, dissolved the Order, and became a preacher of truths 'to set men psychologically free', and a keen advocate of unprejudiced education.

It is difficult to disentangle his early visions of gods and Masters from the deep mystical experiences, which became more important after his opening-up crisis at the age of 27. The visions may well have been the projections of his own inner mind. It is interesting to read that in recent times he switches off his powers of clairvoyance in his interviews, regarding them 'as an intrusion of privacy' (p. 283).

One could wish that this man of deep religious experience had taken the further step into the personal knowledge of Jesus Christ. But, strangely for a man seeking the truth, he claims that 'he has never read the Gospels' (p. 149).

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

OPEN SPIRIT. *Ladislav Boros.* Search Press, 1974. 208 pp. £2.95.

To be honest, most of us who have been in the world of theology and church history treat the fathers and medieval writers as subjects for examinations. Very few of us read them for spiritual profit as we might read the writers of today.

Ladislav Boros, a writer of deep spirituality, is a corrective. In this book he confesses his obligation to the men of old, and to one not so old, Teilhard de Chardin. From the nine he selects he has found guidelines for his thinking and experience, and he is able to make these nine come alive. Each name is linked to a vital ingredient of life, especially Christian life, and even in a brief review one must indicate this by listing what he finds. Thus Socrates and honesty; Irenaeus and patience; Nietzsche and bewilderment (Does God demand anything?); Erasmus and the centre (Looking for a Christian existentialism); Gregory and beauty; Aquinas and harmony; Dante and vision; Augustine and appropriation; Teilhard and unity.

Boros introduces the chapters with a brief but relevant biography that helps to draw out the thoughts that he wishes to emphasise. In a sense the book covers all that is of value to the Christian life both in its deep places and on the surface of behaviour. I had not realised, before, the closeness of Irenaeus and Teilhard, and I should suspect that Boros has a special affinity with both.

The translation by Erika Young from the German makes the book read as though it had been written in English.

Correction. In reviewing *Yoga and God* from the same publishers (Jan.-March, 1975) I queried whether the author, J.-M. Déchanet, had renounced his orders. Happily, the publishers tell me, he is still a monk.

J. STAFFORD WRIGHT

ECSTATIC RELIGION: AN ANTHROPOLOGICAL STUDY OF SPIRIT POSSESSION AND SHAMANISM. *I. M. Lewis.* Pelican Books, 1975. 205 pp. £0.90.

One might characterise this informative book as representing a combination of *The Golden Bough* and *Battle for the Mind*. Whilst deeply influenced by William Sargant it remains for the most part a sociological analysis of spirit possession and shamanism, drawing upon fieldwork from many areas. The central thesis is that 'possession is a philosophy of power', whether in the case of sex-linked possession and subordinate female subcultures, or with respect to main line religious movements. Lewis interprets witchcraft as being a corrective to social tension, a kind of legitimate redress for the otherwise socially deprived individual or group. States of possession and the social arena in which they are enacted are viewed as a kind of game similar to the psychodrama of western psychiatry, with the proviso that the shaman is more than a mere psychiatrist in that he deals with 'ordinary neurotic people' as much as, if not more than, with the seriously psychologically disturbed. In another sense the shaman is a priest in that Lewis wishes to classify shamanism and psychoanalysis as religions, in that their basic aims are to maintain harmony between man and man, and man and nature. The passing allusions to Christianity, to Jesus the shaman and St. Paul the hybrid tarantula spider saint, make it surprising that pentecostalism is not considered in any depth. The reader might find it interesting to do this for himself after studying the book; he will not find himself too constrained in such an exercise for while the material presented is valuable as a collection of ethnological reports Professor Lewis' theoretical implications are less clearly developed than they might have been.

DOUGLAS DAVIES

THE PRACTICE OF DEATH. *Eike-Henner W. Kluge.* Yale U.P., 1975. 250 pp. £5.00.

The author's declared purpose in discussing five moral issues to do with death (abortion, suicide, euthanasia, infanticide, senicide), is to cast a cold philosophical eye on the arguments most commonly used by protagonists in these debates. The promotion of his own views is to be no more than a secondary concern; which is a pity, since the truth as Kluge sees it is considerably more interesting than the arguments as he sees them. He advocates absolute protection for 'persons' (defined in terms of the neurological structure necessary for human rational activity; there may be non-human 'persons' among the higher forms of animal life, and human subjects who are not yet, or no longer, 'persons'); and on this foundation argues for full protection

of the fetus after eight weeks (a threat to the mother's life notwithstanding), and against involuntary euthanasia except in the case of the irretrievably brain-damaged. Suicide, with or without assistance, he finds morally unobjectionable.

Kluge has an acute mind, which he uses to good effect. He is in no way bound to fashion, but can be as 'liberal' or 'conservative' as his train of reason seems to require. But the question arises: do sharpness of argument and a dogmatic Kantian absolute alone suffice to clarify these complex moral issues? Might the discussion not profit from greater attention to factual biological information? Or from an interest in case-histories, such as made *On Dying Well* so successful? Can we dispense with historical background as Kluge dispenses with it, for example by criticising Catholic teaching about the soul without reference to its Aristotelian assumptions? Above all, do we not need a fuller account of the contending views than Kluge's technique of listing and labelling the arguments allows us? The 'religious argument', the 'moral argument', the 'biological argument' etc., etc. (all his own titles, though some are said to be 'misnomers'!) are not really to be encountered in such atomic isolation, but are accumulated and deployed within some context of intelligibility, whether religious or metaphysical. Disagreements about life and death reveal the clash of basic convictions about man, the world and God. This Kluge never shows us. He shoots at the *disiecta membra* of opposition, and confounds the gainsayers out of his own mouth. How much more he might have taught us if he had argued things out with a real, three-dimensional opponent!

OLIVER O'DONOVAN

JESUS NOW. *Malachi Martin*. Collins, 1975. 349 pp. £4.25.

'This book is a journey through the quagmire of distortions, deformations and illusions piled round our view of Jesus,' writes the author, a genial ex-Irishman. Each distortion he labels according to the style 'Jesus Caesar' (which particular example signifies the alliance of the Christian religion with political power).

The writer also explores the understanding of man characteristic of the Jews, the Greeks, the Buddhists and others—all in the interest of reinstating the Jesus who brings salvation.

The author has chosen to write in a rhapsodic, breathless manner and to incorporate eyebrow-raising allusions to defecation and orgasm. The result is a book that impresses the reader by virtue of its energy rather than its lucidity; it is at once neat and over-reaching.

JOHN C. KING