

Book Reviews

A COMMENTARY ON THE SECOND EPISTLE TO THE CORINTHIANS. *C. K. Barrett*. A. and C. Black, 1973. 354 pp. £4.75 (hardback), £2.75 (paperback).

This is the third of Dr. Barrett's contributions to the Black series of commentaries (he has previously written the volumes on Romans and 1 Corinthians). He acknowledges this unusual privilege by saying that the triple task has taken up 'what I suppose I must consider most of the best years of my life as a student of the New Testament; and I do not regret a minute of it' (p. vii). Nor will his readers. These are among the greatest of New Testament writings and Barrett is among the greatest of present day commentators. He has put us all very much in his debt with his earlier works and this latest volume does nothing to diminish our gratitude.

That is not to say that everyone is going to agree with all Barrett says. The problems confronting the student of 2 Corinthians are too controversial for that. What will arouse most interest in his fifty page introduction is Barrett's refusal to go along with partition theories of 2 Corinthians. He agrees that there is a break between chapters nine and ten, but he sees the whole of the earlier part as one epistle. He differs from most commentators by regarding chapters 10-13 as part of a later letter, not an earlier one. Barrett thinks that Titus took chapters 1-9 to Corinth, but that this friend of Paul's had misjudged the situation there and was quite unable to solve the problem. So Paul wrote chapters 10-13 and later visited Corinth himself.

But the strength of the commentary is not in its contribution to the solution of the literary problems as much as in its exegesis. Here we have Barrett's meticulous scholarship shedding light on the text at every turn. And as the difficulties in this epistle are not inconsiderable his work will be widely useful. A feature of his approach is the citing of authorities, so that the student can go on to make use of other relevant discussions. It would have been even more helpful had Dr. Barrett made fuller use of the works of Conservative Evangelicals. He does not, for example, list R. V. G. Tasker's Tyndale Commentary in his bibliography. Granted that this is not on the same scale as Barrett's work, it should not be ignored. But it would be ungracious to end on a note of criticism for what is omitted when so much is

included. This book will take its place as a standard work and will enrich our studies for years to come.

LEON MORRIS

HERESY, CRUSADE AND INQUISITION IN SOUTHERN FRANCE 1100-1250. *Walter L. Wakefield.* George Allen & Unwin, 1974. 288 pp. £5.25.

The Albigensian Crusade of the thirteenth century, in itself an important episode in the history of France and of the medieval church, has achieved a peculiar, and perhaps exaggerated, reputation on account of the fascination which the Albigenses continue to exercise over lovers of the romantic and the occult. In this study Dr. Wakefield displays a professional historian's distaste for rhetorical exaggeration. The Albigensian *Perfecti* were virtuous men, but hardly the spiritual masters of Languedoc. The Catholic Church was incompetent rather than dramatically corrupt; there were good priests and laymen, though the Cathars and Waldenses had the initiative in religious propaganda. The Midi in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries was not noticeably more cultured than Northern France, and there is no solid evidence of any particular sympathy—apart from general tolerance—shown by the troubadour poets for heresy. In the fighting, neither side had any monopoly of savagery. There remains the fundamental abomination of persecution in the name of Christ with its terrible legacy to later ages, which Dr. Wakefield describes dispassionately but not unfeelingly. Significantly, the methods of the inquisitors aroused opposition from many persons who had no heretical inclination. On the other hand, the proportion of death sentences, as opposed to lighter punishments, seems to have been lower than is commonly supposed. Despite its sombre theme this book, by an acknowledged authority on the subject, is eminently readable and may be commended to students of the Middle Ages and of the history of religion.

GERALD BONNER

ENGLISH SCHOOLS IN THE MIDDLE AGES. *Nicholas Orme.* Methuen, 1974. 369 pp. £7.25.

The involvement of the Christian church in education is a matter of immediate interest and concern today, and this study of the way in which the medieval church in England helped to extend educational facilities throughout the country is timely in that sense.

Let it be said at once that the story told here has few really new features. But nevertheless what it has to say is very well said indeed, and it is unlikely that the results of Dr. Orme's study will be gainsaid for a very long time. Here is a general and authoritative study of Christian education in England from the twelfth century to the Reformation. A first chapter which outlines the growing need felt by different sections of English society for more formal education is followed by a discussion of life in schools and teaching methods—written with a human touch which makes for a most pleasing result. Then follows a third section, on the historical growth of the numbers and types of schools. Although Dr. Orme claims to redress the balance of earlier studies by re-emphasising the place of monasteries in providing schools, in fact his study clearly shows that their contribution was much smaller than that of the secular clergy, especially the collegiate churches and secular cathedrals (he does, I think, under-estimate the nunneries in this context). His story is carried on to a re-assessment of the effects of the Reformation

on schools, in which he sees Henry VIII's noble but ineffective plans as not materialising under that king's successors. Throughout the story there are some most pleasing side-lights, such as the practice of teacher-licensing at Oxford, and the general lack of interest among writers in childhood until the Renaissance period.

But there are some doubts left by the book. It is, as its title proclaims, concerned with schools rather than education. Hence private patronage and individual tuition are underrated—the approach is too institutional. Nor is much said about whether or not there were many writings on education *per se*, on teaching methods and objectives, apart that is from textbooks. The growth of lay involvement in education in the fifteenth century is also perhaps under-estimated. And above all, the study is too insular, as the extensive bibliography shows. The medieval English Church in this respect, as in most other respects, was part of the whole Western Church; and more light might have been thrown on the subject by some comparisons.

But nevertheless what we have here is a splendid overall survey of English schools during the Middle Ages. The book is most pleasing to handle and is well and significantly illustrated—altogether a good buy, even at the price!

ALAN ROGERS

CONCLUSIONES SIVE THESES DCCCC ANNO 1486 PUBLICAE DISPUTANDAE SED NON ADMISSAE. *Pico della Mirandola*. Edition critique avec des notes et un commentaire par *Bohdan Kieszowski*. Librairie Droz, Geneva, 1973. 124 pp.

In the middle of October 1486, Pico della Mirandola, then 23 years of age, informed his friend Ermolao Barbaro in a letter that he intended shortly to go to Rome: 'From there,' he says, 'maybe you will hear what your friend Pico has achieved by contemplation in his sequestered and sedentary existence.' The reference is to his ambitious scheme of defending publicly no less than 900 theses, as an introduction to which he had composed his celebrated *Oration on the Dignity of Man*. The next month he wrote to his friend Thaddeo Ugolino: 'I am hurrying off to Rome where I am about to put my learning to the test.' On his arrival in the capital he posted copies of his 900 Theses in prominent places and also circulated them through all the universities of the land, offering to debate them in public with all comers and undertaking to pay from his own pocket the expenses of any who came from a distance. The scope of the 900 Theses was, characteristically, universal, as the paragraph prefaced to them indicated:

John Pico of Mirandola, Count of Concord, will debate in public the accompanying 900 opinions—dialectical, ethical, physical, mathematical, metaphysical, theological, magical, cabalistic: his own as well as those also of the Chaldean, Arabian, Hebrew, Greek, Egyptian, and Latin sages.

The date he proposed for the event was Epiphany 1487. But Epiphany 1487 came and passed without the great debate taking place. Hostile voices were raised against certain of the theses charging that they were heretical, and in February 1487 the Pope felt compelled to appoint a commission to examine the charge. Subsequently the commission reported that thirteen of Pico's propositions were heretical or savoured of heresy. Pico hurriedly wrote a spirited *Apologia* which was published at the end of May. Then, early in August, Innocent VIII issued a bull inhibiting the 900 Theses, and Pico set off for France, pursued by papal officers with letters authorising his

arrest. Not until the spring of 1488 did he manage with the help of friends to slip, in disguise, back into Italy; and he had to wait another five years for the death of Innocent and the clearing of his name by a certificate of acquittal granted by his successor Alexander VI. Pico himself died an untimely death the following year (1494).

This new edition of the 900 Theses, eruditely introduced and annotated by Bohdan Kieszkowski, is most welcome. The theses testify to the extensive range of Pico's studies, though in the nature of the case, as bare propositions for debate, they are in many instances tantalisingly cryptic and uninformative. At this stage of his brief career Pico's over-all purpose was to demonstrate the unity of all knowledge and the harmony of all philosophy and theology—a hopeless task, as he was later to perceive when he came to a better understanding of the Gospel. It is of particular interest to discern in the 900 Theses an independence of thought in an apparent questioning of certain beliefs and traditions that had long been entrenched in the church, for example in connection with the doctrine of the eucharist. Kieszkowski may well be right in suggesting an influence of Wycliffe, who is in fact mentioned by name in one of the propositions, but in a totally non-committal manner. A strong contemporary influence on Pico was certainly that of Savonarola. Such religious or evangelical influences seem, however, to have borne fruit mainly in the last years of his life, when he had determined, once the literary works he had in hand were completed, to devote himself entirely to the exposition of Holy Scripture and the propagation of the Gospel.

Of all the 900 Theses the most notorious and, not surprisingly, the least comprehended, especially on the part of his hostile critics, was the one which declared: 'Nulla est sciencia, que nos magis certificet de divinitate Christi, quam magia et cabala' (number 9 of *Conclusiones Magice numero XXVI secundum opinionem propriam*—the orthography is that followed by Kieszkowski). This cannot be discussed here; but Pico's cabbalistic studies were undertaken with the conviction that the secrets uncovered would demonstrate the arcane approbation of the cardinal doctrines of the Christian faith by the learned scholars of Judaism. It was, of course, a wild goose chase; but it had this good effect, that, thanks to the infection of Pico's enthusiasm, it led to a renaissance of the study of the Hebrew language.

The present volume, which is No. 131 in the collection *Travaux d'Humanisme et Renaissance*, is enhanced by the inclusion of a bibliography extending to a dozen pages. In the form of two appendices the texts are given also, with brief introductions, of a retraction made before the faculty of theology of Paris in 1364 by Pierre de Candia (later to become Pope Alexander V), a manuscript of whose commentary on the *Sentences* of Pico Lombard Pico possessed, and of the Theological Assertions of the Spaniard Pedro Garcia (subsequently Bishop of Barcelona), who was a member of the commission of sixteen appointed by the Pope to examine Pico's 900 Theses for heresy and who wrote these Assertions in 1487 (the year is wrongly given as 1478 both in the heading of the appendix and also in the table of contents) in opposition to the thirteen condemned propositions of Pico.

The volume is excellently produced and is yet another fine contribution in the service of precise scholarship from the press of Librairie Droz of Geneva.

PHILIP EDGCUMBE HUGHES

ANDREAS BODENSTEIN von KARLSTADT. *R. J. Sider*. Brill, 1974. 318 pp. n.p.

Number XI in the Brill *Studies in Medieval and Reformation Thought* series is an admirable and thorough volume by Professor Sider of Messiah College, Philadelphia. Karlstadt has been very little studied in print in English, though there are unpublished Karlstadt PhDs in the USA and some smaller studies in print in English, but to Professor Sider we are all indebted for the first major overall study of what Karlstadt, Luther's older and senior contemporary at Wittenberg, actually believed. Broadly speaking Karlstadt started as a lover of the Schoolmen, was indignant when Luther started to challenge, from Augustine, their authority and confidently said he would vindicate them and refute Luther. But he soon found himself convinced by Luther's case. He moved through various stages of Augustinianism, Lutheran views to eventual Anabaptist ones.

Thus much for general interpretation, but once one presses for detail, he is variously described as a spiritualist, a legalist, a mystic and so on. Dr. Sider has worked right through Karlstadt's earlier writings, with ample documentation, to contemporary and modern works, and his conclusion is that Karlstadt did not lapse into a medieval works-righteousness, nor was he really a spiritualist though he did extend the role of the Spirit to direct communication with man, nor did he advocate any earlier version of a Puritan legalism. Sider rejects the charge that he reduced the role of Christ to example only or mainly, and as regards mysticism he used its language (compare for instance Calvin's fondness for Bernard of Clairvaux) rather than adopted its tenets. Sider has studied the development of Karlstadt to 1525 in some detail, and he finds regeneration its keynote. He adopted Augustinian views of grace and sin, as Luther did, but Sider also sees this as Karlstadt's answer to his own erratic personality which reflected an inferiority complex.

Altogether an admirable book, this first major English language book on Karlstadt in recent times, a sympathetic study though not of course hagiographical. Whether German Luther scholars will react to it remains to be seen but for the moment it must be the standard work on Karlstadt's early theology. G. E. DUFFIELD

ISAAC WATTS REMEMBERED. *David G. Fountain*. Henry E. Walter, 1974. 112 pp. £0.75.

Some time ago Mr. Fountain, minister of an Evangelical church in Southampton, set about writing a book about Watts for the tercentenary of his birth this year, and he has had the satisfaction of having it form part of the official celebrations in Southampton, where Watts was born. The result is an attractive paperback which is excellent value at 75 pence. We are given a pleasantly written account of Watts's life with concise reference to the relevant issues of his day, and the book is copiously illustrated with photographs and with very attractive line drawings by Michael Underwood. Appendices reprint 20 of the most popular of Watts's 700 hymns as well as short extracts from his other writings on a number of crucial matters. The text also includes useful extracts from Watts and some of his biographers.

Mr. Fountain quotes Philip Doddridge's evaluation of Watts's achievement in four fields of work. In two of these—his writings in philosophy and

in religion—he had many able predecessors, but in the other two—in his writings for children and in reviving public worship through a new style of hymn—he introduced ideas and practices which have had a lasting influence. As an educationist, I was impressed with what we are told about Watts's concern to help children both understand the gospel and realise their human potential; he seems to have been both enlightened and realistic in his approach, and I think Mr. Fountain will succeed in his modest aim of arousing more curiosity about this.

My only criticisms are quite minor ones: more detailed references to quoted sources and the appendix passages would have been welcome (a few more footnotes are all that is needed), also rather fuller discussion of what lay behind the bitter opposition to Watts's hymns in his own day. And I could not find any reference to how Dr. Watts came by his DD!

Mr. Fountain brings Watts to life with details of his relations with friends and admirers. Physically Watts was very unprepossessing and his health was always precarious, but he never lacked good friends and on occasion could show a flash of mischief that might surprise anyone with too stereotyped a view of a learned divine; I suspect that his sense of humour not only endeared him to his friends but was intimately connected with the warmth and fluency and lightness of touch that have caused so many of his hymns to be loved for so long.

OWEN C. WATKINS

SPG PAPERS IN THE LAMBETH PALACE LIBRARY: CALENDAR AND INDEXES. *William Wilson Manross.* Clarendon Press: OUP, 1974. 230pp. £11.50.

This Calendar, which is a complement to the author's calendar of the American Colonial Section of the Fulham Papers in Lambeth Palace Library (1965), includes the minutes of the Society for the Propagation of the Gospel from 1701 to 1750, and financial records, correspondence and papers covering Great Britain, Europe and Asia and, particularly, North America to 1800. With *The Fulham Papers* it provides a key to the early history of the Anglican Communion in North Africa and the West Indies; but it also gives a picture of the early administration of the SPG, with pleasant glimpses into eighteenth-century missionary activity, like the proposal of one Samuel Weale who, on August 25th, 1707, wrote to the Secretary of the SPG, John Chamberlayne, saying that he was prepared to present a plan for raising money, following this with a memorial of February 20th, 1708 in which he 'does not reveal his plan, but says he will disclose it if a committee will wait upon him in Fleet Prison, where he is confined'! In his introduction, Professor Manross pays tribute to the four men who principally directed the activities of the SPG in its formative years: Archbishop Tenison of Canterbury; Bishop Compton of London; John Chamberlayne; and John Hodges, its first Treasurer. Two indexes of writers and topics, and of names mentioned in the documents provide a comprehensive guide to the collection, which will unquestionably be an essential tool for church and colonial historians of North America.

GERALD BONNER

PALEY: EVIDENCES FOR THE MAN. *M. L. Clarke.* SPCK, 1974. 161 pp. £2.95.

If it is true that Pelagius is the characteristic British heretic, it is equally true that Paley must be the characteristic British theologian. Both placed their

emphasis on practical matters rather than those of belief and doctrine. Paley was a Yorkshireman with the pragmatism of his county. His *Principles of Moral and Political Philosophy*, in spite of its title, has more to say about everyday behaviour than about abstruse moral principles. His *Natural Theology* is based on empirical observation, and even the famous *Evidences of Christianity*, till 1920 prescribed for 'Little-Go' at Cambridge, was largely a condensation of Nathaniel Lardner. He is remembered, if at all, nowadays for his theological characterisation of God as the Almighty Watch-maker. Comprehensive if not profound, Paley should, in fact, be remembered for more than that. He gathered together the strands of the age at whose end he stood. His defence of the scriptures as revelation, his predominant concern with moral behaviour, his establishment of faith upon reason are all characteristic of English theology in the eighteenth century.

He deserves to be rescued from oblivion and in this short study Professor Clarke has done this task very capably. He divides his study between Paley's life and his works, omitting, however, to say anything about *Horae Paulinae*. For the rest his main interest lies with Paley as a thinker about social morality, producing evidence of his progressive, even socialist, views. The book ends with a summary of comments about Paley, for whom Professor Clarke makes claims no more excessive than those by Leslie Stephen in his often critical DNB article which paid tribute finally to Paley's 'admirable lucidity and his shrewd sense'.
ARTHUR POLLARD

THE MITRED EARL: AN EIGHTEENTH-CENTURY ECCENTRIC. *Brian Fothergill*. Faber & Faber, 1974. 254 pp. £3.75.

The extraordinary character, who is the subject of this biography, certainly presents an extreme example of what might be termed 'the unacceptable face of Hanoverian churchmanship', even by eighteenth-century standards. A Whig magnate in a bishop's apron, Frederick Hervey, Earl of Bristol, acquired little reputation for piety. His frequent absences from his diocese of Derry, often made on excuses of ill-health, resulted in numerous acquisitions of works of art, and the indulgence of his great wealth through travel, and the building of vast mansions in Derry and Suffolk. Friend of Sir William Hamilton, and enemy of Horace Walpole, his notorious political intrigues in Ireland and throughout Europe, caused him to be viewed with grave suspicion by all parties. A staunch Whig, Bristol was in advance of his time in proclaiming the rights of Roman Catholics and Presbyterians to complete emancipation.

He left Derry for the last time in 1791, and spent the years till his death in 1803 in travelling on the continent. He strove to gain advantageous matrimonial alliances or political appointments for his children, while treating his own wife with studied neglect or contempt. Regarded as a 'freethinker', and by some, though unfairly, as an atheist, he certainly displayed few Christian virtues.

This fascinating and well-written study, the result of considerable research, reveals a character for whom one can feel little respect, but rather a growing astonishment that any clergyman, let alone a bishop, could pursue with such zest and enthusiasm until well over seventy, a life so completely self-centred as that of any irresponsible adventurer.
COLLISS DAVIES

JOHN ELIAS: LIFE AND LETTERS. *Edward Morgan.* Banner of Truth, 1974. 417 pp. £2.10.

The Great Awakening in Wales dates from 1735, when two of the chief leaders, Daniel Rowland and Howell Harris, were converted. Both belonged to the Church of England, but thought of the church rather in terms of people with life and power than of structures with form and order. This resulted in course of time in men arising without university education or privileged status, who became leaders by the sheer force of their spiritual convictions expressed through their preaching and teaching gifts. Among these third generation leaders, John Elias (1774-1841) must hold an honoured place.

This book is a reprint, edited and annotated by Gomer Roberts and S. M. Houghton, of a former biography of Elias by Edward Morgan, first published in 1844, together with Elias' *Letters and Other Papers*, which appeared in 1847. These two books are here printed together for the first time. Elias' life and work were mainly confined to Anglesey and the Caernarvon peninsula. Brought up in a devout family, he gradually came to a personal faith in his late teens, and soon began to exercise a powerful preaching ministry. This might have appeared precocious in one so young, but a notable feature of his life at this stage and throughout was his humility. Conscious of his own gifts, he yet always revered those of greater knowledge and experience. Many were converted among the thousands who gathered to hear his astonishingly effective presentation of scriptural truth. His letters reveal his concern for his family in spiritual matters, while his own bereavements enabled him to support those in similar distress. It is good that the publishers should remind us again of this comparatively unknown figure, from whom we can gain inspiration and encouragement in facing the problems of our own day with renewed faith.

COLLISS DAVIES

THE AUTOBIOGRAPHY OF WILLIAM JAY. *Edited by George Redford and John Angell James.* Banner of Truth, 1974. 586 pp. £1.95.

Those whose work or pleasure takes them into early 19th century church history have long known what a mine of information is this book, for William Jay was pastor of Argyle Street chapel in Bath from 1791-1853 and knew everybody. It is therefore both useful and delightful to have a facsimile reproduction (without any new material or notes) of a work first published in 1854 and long lost in the remoter ranges of libraries. The price is extraordinarily reasonable.

Jay was a stonewriter from Wiltshire, converted as a youth and trained by Cornelius Winter who himself had been trained by Whitefields, several anecdotes of whom creep into these pages. At only twenty-three Jay began his long ministry in the chapel founded by the Countess of Huntingdon. The book is a typical Victorian hotch-potch, beginning with autobiographical letters to his children. There follow additional material by them, then the charming 'Practical Illustrations of Character in a Series of Reminiscences', of well-known Christians such as Hannah More, Newton, Wilberforce, Rowland Hill, and several long buried by history whose names mean nothing today.

William Wilberforce and Jay were great friends, and Jay was hurt by his total exclusion from the official *Life* by the high church sons who disapproved

of their father's familiarity with dissenters (the one mention, out of context, is allowed to imply an entirely different attitude) and the description of Wilberforce is important to full understanding of the great liberator.

The last part of the book consists of letters, mostly of no great interest, but the bulk of the compilation is a happy hunting ground for the historian and a place where the general Christian reader may browse.

JOHN POLLOCK

TWO CLASSES OF MEN: PLATONISM AND ENGLISH ROMANTIC THOUGHT. *David Newsome.* John Murray, 1974. 169 pp. £3.75.

Those who have enjoyed David Newsome's earlier books will find this one tougher going. The 'two classes of men' are the Platonists and Aristotelians in nineteenth century England. It is Mr. Newsome's contention that the Romantics were Platonists, particularly Blake, Wordsworth and Coleridge. Coleridge's philosophical writings influenced a number of eminent Cambridge men, Augustus Hare, Maurice, Hort and Westcott, though the latter claimed to have reached his Platonism via Browning. The Aristotelians were to be found at Oxford with Newman as the seminal mind. In the Greats course Aristotle predominated and it was only because of Jowett that the course was widened to include Plato. The fourth chapter is on Coleridge and Newman; both, Newsome maintains, were Romantics. Though the ground of their reasoning is different there are many similarities to which he draws attention, including Newman's debt to Plato through the writings of Clement and Origen. The final chapter has a superb passage which goes a long way to explain why the Incarnation and not the Atonement was at the centre of the theology of *Lux Mundi*.

We find it all in Holland's florid, nostalgic prose-summings when the sun was always shining; long leisurely days when there was time to savour books and walks beside the river. . . . In short, these were not the times, and this was not the world, of a theology of the Cross.

The book is difficult because it demands not only knowledge of the life and thought of the nineteenth century church but also of literary criticism and philosophy including Greek philosophy; but the insights of this piece of intellectual history are fresh and invaluable. The actual lectures only occupy ninety pages of print, six appendices occupy another thirty pages and another thirty-five are devoted to notes, bibliography and index. It is a pity that the publishers charge almost £4.00 for this handsome book. Perhaps they only anticipate an elitist readership, which is a pity. To end on a positive note of the appendices, those on Maurice's Platonism and on Westcott and the 'Holy Party', are particularly rewarding.

MICHAEL HENNELL

HELL AND THE VICTORIANS. *Geoffrey Rowell.* Clarendon Press, OUP, 1974. 242 pp. £4.85.

The purpose of this book by the Chaplain of Keble College, Oxford is summed up in the sub-title 'A study of the nineteenth century theological controversies concerning eternal punishment and the future life'. Dr. Rowell has obviously examined the vast body of Victorian literature on this subject very thoroughly and yet manages to present his conclusions in a concise and highly readable manner. After briefly tracing the development of certain themes in Christian eschatology to the beginning of the nineteenth century, the author describes the endeavours of the early Unitarians to refute

the 'orthodox' doctrines of the immortality of the soul and everlasting punishment. There follows a chapter on the controversy over the meaning of the word 'eternal', concentrating on the contributions of Coleridge, F. D. Maurice and Erskine of Linlathen but surprisingly omitting mention of George MacDonald and his 'Unspoken Sermons'.

Many of the issues investigated by Dr. Rowell still arouse debate at parish level. Thus the discussion whether 'eternal' means 'everlasting' or 'a state of being' i.e. living either 'in the love of God' (eternal life) or 'in self' (eternal death), is still relevant today. The rest of the book describes the famous dispute between F. W. Farrar and E. B. Pusey which in 1877 brought the whole controversy to the notice of the masses, and then analyses the influence of Darwinism and the revival of interest in a demythologised purgatory.

This fine book should ensure that no student of eschatology will henceforth be able to ignore the massive and often profound contribution of the Victorian theologians.

HAIGH D. ETCHES

IDEAS OF ORDER: THE MID-NINETEENTH CENTURY RENEWAL OF ANGLICAN THEOLOGICAL METHOD. *H. F. G. Swanston.* Van Gorcum & Comp. B.V. Assen, Netherlands, 1974. 244 pp. 38.50 Dutch Florins.

This book is a study of the general theological method, not theology, of R. D. Hampden, H. L. Mansel, F. D. Maurice, and Benjamin Jowett. To benefit from it one needs to be conversant with the contents of Butler's *Analogy* and Paley's *View of the Evidences*. The use of, or reaction against, the contents of the former is one of the main themes. Put simply the argument is that Hampden sought to modernise the inductive procedures of Butler, that Mansel attempted to bring theology into commerce with psychology, and that Maurice used literary paradigms and an updated version of Butler's doctrine of conscience. Swanston is most impressed by Jowett who 'set himself to the demonstration of the roughness in all the experience of the divine even that recorded in Scripture, so that men should no longer be kept in awe by impressive systems'. I feel that the author would have given us a better book had he set his work in a larger context. For example, several judicious footnotes could have told us who, apart from Hampden, were impressed by inductivism as a theological method. The book has much the same format (including a paper cover) as the doctoral theses which have to be printed before submission in Holland. Unfortunately it has a lot of printing errors some of which appear on the cover. The price (approx. £5.50) will ensure that the book is only purchased by specialists in this field.

PETER TOON

BETWEEN SCIENCE AND RELIGION: THE REACTION TO SCIENTIFIC NATURALISM IN LATE VICTORIAN ENGLAND. *Frank Miller Turner.* Yale University Press, 1974. 273 pp. £5.60.

It is well known that the 19th century witnessed a very thorough sifting of the evidence, especially the Biblical evidence, on which was founded the historic Christian faith. The process had begun much earlier as can be gathered from Bishop Butler's *Analogy*; in fact ever since the Enlightenment, Professor Turner remarks, one of the chief features of European intellectual life had been a search for alternatives to Christianity as a basis for personal

and social life. But the nineteenth century, with the rise of the higher criticism, and the rapid advance of the sciences, especially biology, had seen a much more serious development of the struggle. In recording how the foundations of the historic faith were then assailed, one factor, it may fairly be claimed, does not receive the attention it deserves. One of the most powerful viewpoints which was put forward as an alternative to Christian faith is often called Scientific Naturalism. Its protagonists in the Victorian age were a heterogeneous group which included Huxley, Tyndall, Spencer, Clifford and Galton united in their opposition to 'supernaturalism' and in their emphasis on Science as the saviour of the future. Men who stand in the vanguard of such a movement, revolutionary in its implications, are almost of necessity vociferous and hard-hitting; but others who likewise have parted with the old but nevertheless have serious doubts about the new are commonly more restrained and by comparison unadventurous, at least in debate. Their contribution is a factor which takes time to emerge; and it is this factor which Professor Turner (who is Assistant Professor of History at Yale) helps to bring out.

His book is about six leaders of Victorian thought who having lost faith in Christianity realised only too clearly the inadequacy of naturalism. Two, Alfred Russel Wallace and George Romanes, were eminent biologists; two others, Henry Sidgwick and James Ward, were outstanding in philosophy; Samuel Butler and Frederic Myers were men of letters. It is impossible in a short review to do justice to the lucid and perceptive accounts of the formative influences and terminal convictions of these six men given by the author, and a few remarks centred around one of them must suffice. Sidgwick was a Professor of Moral Philosophy who counted among his friends Arthur Balfour. His formal departure from the Christian faith was connected with his inability to accept the doctrine of the Virgin Birth—in this he forms an interesting contrast to William Temple). But his profound study of ethics (his *Methods of Ethics*, 1874 was called by Professor Broad 'on the whole the best treatise on moral theory ever written') left him with the conviction that this fundamental element in human life (which in all honesty he could not ignore), was quite incapable of being based on naturalistic principles. 'Evolutionary ethics' was obviously absurd. Rejecting revelation as he did, to what could he appeal? Turner gives us a touching picture of a great and honest mind groping for an answer. To the end he held to two non-empirical assumptions as both rational and necessary; the existence of a Deity, and the immortality of the soul. Like two of the other subjects of this study he earnestly sought, through psychical phenomena and séances, to find an empirical basis for the second of these assumptions; but alas, he was never satisfied. Nevertheless he remained convinced that were these two assumptions not grounded *somewhere*, the cosmos of duty would fall into a chaos. Unlike some moderns, he was unwilling to allow that this would do justice to the facts.

This is a valuable book. It might well be given to an honest and educated seeker finding obstacles to acceptance of the 'faith once delivered'.

D. C. SPANNER

PIT-MEN PREACHERS AND POLITICS: THE EFFECTS OF METHODISM IN A DURHAM MINING COMMUNITY. *Robert Moore*. CUP, 1974. 292 pp. £5.30. This study of four Durham mining villages in the Deerness Valley, between

1870 and 1926, traces the political influence of Methodists and offers sociological insights into its causes and subsequent decline. Theologically their concern was individual salvation expressed in service to the world, with heavy emphasis upon moral issues. Politically they were liberal, attracted to Gladstonian individualism, economic laissez-faire and high moral tone. They believed in negotiation, avoided class conflict and won respect from fellow-workers and employers. Yet the decline of political liberalism, the disruptive effect of the first world war and the traumatic experience of 1926 found them institutionalised too inflexibly to face changed circumstances. They largely succeeded in holding the community together, and significantly the growing political labour influence remained liberal rather than socialist. But their communal concern prevented them from taking sides decisively; negotiated settlements were mocked by the economic severity, and individualism seemed unable to cope with large-scale problems.

Careful sociological study of this kind is a welcome move from broad generalisations about Methodist political influence. It also teaches much, in passing, about the method involved in such work. There is stimulating application of categories from Weber and Lensky. In the former one could have wished for the 'mystical' element to be included; in the latter sustained reflection on the role of the minister, linking 'associational' and 'communal' loyalties, might have proved fascinating. One gladly commends this book.

DONALD ENGLISH

C. S. LEWIS: A BIOGRAPHY. *Roger Lancelyn Green and Walter Hooper*. Collins, 1974. 320 pp. £3.50.

For two men jointly to undertake the writing of the biography of such a man as C. S. Lewis was on any count a risky venture. I believe that it was a venture worth taking and that it has succeeded.

The reviewer knew C. S. Lewis, though not intimately. He had read his books, though not all of them. But he put down this biography feeling that he knew him much better for the reading of the book—and knew him in his many-sidedness. What a man he was!—English scholar of wide erudition, philosopher, atheist turned Christian apologist, Oxford don turned Cambridge professor, splendidly earthy man of God.

One of the two authors of this book (R. L. Green) was Lewis's friend for many years and his own suggested biographer. The other (Walter Hooper) was his close friend and secretary and editor of his posthumous works. Together they have given us a portrait of the man as he was, not only in the academic life of the two universities which he served so well, but also in the intimacy of his home-life. I almost wrote 'the tragedy' of his home-life; for the extraordinary relationship over many long years with Mrs. Moore must have marred some of his work—or was it the steel on which God sharpened His tool?—and the blissful experience of his late marriage with Helen Joy Davidman, culminating in her death by cancer, while it 'surprised' him 'by Joy', nearly prostrated him by grief (see *A Grief Observed*). There were other relationships as well—that with his father and the close and deep one with his brother Warren Hamilton Lewis, and those with his readers, some of whom having not seen he nevertheless loved.

The book gives a competent review of Lewis's work as an English scholar and writer—he early discovered that that was to be his life-work rather than philosophy, though he tutored in the latter subject when he was finding his

feet as a don at Oxford. Later in life he was to become an able broadcaster. This means of widening his influence and expounding his faith came at a time when he found himself somewhat disillusioned with the Oxford which he was about to leave (though he continued to reside at The Kilns) for Cambridge—students who 'demanded more and more to be supplied with a training rather than an education, to leave armed with certificates rather than culture' proved a trial to a man of such genius as Lewis. But the years at Magdalene, after the much longer years at Magdalen, were happy ones—in spite of only one glass of port after dinner! DONALD EBOR:

THEOLOGICAL INVESTIGATIONS: Vol 10. K. Rahner. Darton, Longman & Todd, 1973. 409 pp. £5.50.

This is the second volume of Rahner's papers published from 1965-1967. They are again well translated by David Bourke. They show Rahner working over the Decrees and Constitutions of Vatican II with a meticulous care to explore and elaborate every possible opportunity for the development of doctrine in terms that will set Roman Catholic teaching free from the scholastic traditions of the past and enable it to speak to the modern world in ways that sound intelligible to contemporary thinking. It is remarkable to note that at the very time Rahner was writing these papers and giving them as addresses to different audiences, Ronald Preston wrote in the well-known series of essays *Vindications* (1966): 'One of the difficulties in the Roman Catholic position has been the large amount of what there is to be believed solely on the authority of the Church, since there is no empirical evidence on the matter. One thinks, for instance, of all that is involved in the doctrine of purgatory. It is possible that in due time the Roman Catholic Church will find different ways of putting these matters' (p. 16).

In this volume Rahner tackles one of the outstanding difficulties in R.C. doctrine and practice, that of indulgences, and extricates it from the old traditional understanding of their use in terms of the treasury of the merits of the saints, to involve it in terms of sanctifying grace and the prayer of the church. In this there is a good deal of exposition to be accomplished, not least for R.C. thinkers in the old style. For others the question might well be asked, whether the new terms Rahner uses would have led us to think in terms of indulgences as an outcome unless they had been existent matters arising from the other origins, and needing some defence. Before all this, there is a section of six chapters on the new image of the church, which is mainly for internal R.C. interest. Wider issues emerge in two later sections; on Eschatology, when Rahner is taking full measure of Marcel, Bloch, Metz and Moltmann, to work out in four chapters fascinating features of immanent and transcendent dimensions of hope and consummation of the world. Then the section on Church and World opens up the theme of secularisation, now sounding a little dated in the light of much else; and issues of social involvement and pacifism.

One very valuable chapter earlier in the book on 'Marriage as a sacrament', while not altogether convincing on the theme of its title, has some profound and important exposition that all could profit from. Once again, this volume is important in clarifying the fresh terms of Roman Catholic theology today; there are chapters here needing to be known and pondered by all engaging in inter-confessional dialogue, of which we are likely to have more in the future.

G. J. C. MARCHANT

LIFE AS EUCHARIST. *Norman Pittenger.* Eerdmans, 1973. 104 pp. \$1.95.

Dr. Pittenger tells us that he has given the material in this book as lectures to Roman Catholics, Congregationalists, Presbyterians, Disciples of Christ, and Episcopalians in the United States, and they all agreed with what he has written. He believes therefore—and with good reason—that the sacramental theology set forth here is that most likely to gain ecumenical support and so assist in the attainment of church union. Certainly, in the light of the recent ARCIC Statement and those in the SPCK Symposium *Modern Eucharistic Agreement*, as well as what seems to be implied by various denominational eucharistic rites, he may well have given lucid and convenient expression to what many of all denominations may wish to go along with as their eucharistic doctrine.

The heart of the matter comes in chapter two—'The Eucharist: Divine Action in Human Action.' 'First of all, we offer. . . . The Eucharist is . . . a memorial in which we re-present . . . all that his (Christ's) life and death and rising again have done for the world . . . before we can get we must give' (p. 25). It is to plead the value, the undying significance of Christ's sacrifice by those who are incorporated into Christ's Body, as 'in Christ', and so to offer themselves to God in Him; and this implies also their work, and the world itself. Thus it is also to receive; but, oddly enough 'ourselves, our souls and bodies' vivified anew by his divine life brought to us in sacramental sharing. But there is also, the bread and wine 'in, through, with and under' which, Christ comes to us and nourishes us.

The book is based on the theme of being 'in Christ' which is most comprehensively affirmed and expressed in eucharistic fellowship; the chapters on the Priesthood of the People of God; Eucharist and the Christian man (as to individual spirituality); Eucharist and Social Awareness; and Christian Action; expound the life and service of Christians seeing their involvement in the world as those in Christ, centred in the Eucharistic act and fellowship. There is a 'Theological Appendix' which discusses various ways of understanding 'presence' and concludes in terms of divine love, cosmic and universal, being made an inner reality through the instrumentality of the elements. There is therefore nothing particularly new in the book; it simply expounds more largely the statement in the Report of the Lambeth Conference 1958 (2: 81) on the Holy Communion. And of course, the same criticisms apply to it as to that; notably, that it lands up with a trend in the doctrine of the Holy Communion, particularly with its sequence of what it means, or what we do, that finds little justification from the New Testament.

G. J. C. MARCHANT

UNITY, FELLOWSHIP AND ECUMENICITY. *Henry P. Hamann.* Concordia, St. Louis, 1973. 48 pp. \$1.95. **THE LORD'S SUPPER TODAY.** *Werner Elert.* Concordia, St. Louis, 1973. 47 pp. \$1.95.

These two booklets are published in the *Contemporary Theology Series*, a series of 50 page booklets produced by the Concordia Press, dealing with current ethical, theological and sociological issues. Each monograph is designed to supply scholarly, theological background information by way of analysis and commentary, designed to help clergy and laity in the contemporary debate.

Hamann writes from a strict Lutheran point of view, as one to whom the Scriptures are the Word of God and the sole test of all teaching and teachers,

and to whom the Lutheran Confessions offer a true interpretation of the Scriptures. He acknowledges the success of the ecumenical movement but will not accept that as any criterion or proof of divine favour. He brings everything indifferently to the bar of Scripture.

In true German fashion he begins with an analysis of the history and meaning of the terms unity, fellowship and ecumenicity. He then turns to an examination of the history of the ecumenical movement. His best chapter is the fifth, where he offers a very sharp critique of ecumenism from a conservative Lutheran point of view, and sketches a Lutheran doctrine of the church in the world of the twentieth century. He discusses why ecumenical activity is prosecuted mainly by church leaders rather than church folk, and asks the haunting question whether in the face of unbelief and doctrinal confusion unity is after all our main concern. He makes a plea for the preaching of the Gospel given us by God. It is a sober and searching piece of work within the limits of its size and demands careful attention.

Werner Elert's work is more well known and is to some extent dated, particularly in his criticisms of Roman Catholic theology. Roman Catholic scholars have now passed the views he rightly criticised on the sacrifice of the mass. The booklet is excerpted and translated from his *Der Christliche Glaube*, Hamburg 1956, and is a fine discussion of the meaning of sacraments, the institution of Holy Communion, John's and Paul's understanding of Holy Communion, and the dogmatic conception of Holy Communion. He is precise and illuminating in his analysis of the meaning of the terms and what they do not mean: always biblical. It is again strongly Lutheran in its temper. Particularly refreshing is his emphasis on baptism as an acceptable ecumenical basis on which to work, not only for ecumenical ends but for personal, spiritual growth. His chapter on the Holy Communion as Synaxis is striking, since he emphasises that it is not we ourselves who get ourselves together but God who calls us together, and that together we hear and receive the one Lord. It is strong Lutheran stuff, but in a de-theologised world Lutheran men rightly recall us to the Word of God and the Gospel as the criteria by which to judge the ecumenical movement. JAMES ATKINSON

THE DUST OF DEATH: A CRITIQUE OF THE ESTABLISHMENT AND THE COUNTER CULTURE, AND A PROPOSAL FOR A THIRD WAY. *Os Guinness*. IVP, 1973. 416 pp. Paperback £0.95.

When I was an ordinand I received a booklist of suggested commentaries and theological works each of which was prefaced by one of a table of hieroglyphics indicating the relative worth of the book for sound Evangelicals. A select few carried a brand mark which being interpreted meant 'Sell your shirt to buy this'. There have been only a small number of books which I have read in recent years to which I could award this accolade, but I do so unstintingly for this first born from the pen of Os Guinness.

This is not to imply that the book has no blemishes, either in content or style. With respect to the latter I expect others will share my irritation at the American timbre which runs throughout—the transatlantic spelling of harbor, favor, honor, leveled, traveled, counseled; the use of movies, blacks, trash, acid, etc. All of this may give the impression that the book is largely relevant to the situation in the United States, which is unfortunate since it has a great deal to say to the Counter Culture in Britain today. It is also rather

odd to learn that the successors to the Canaanites in the Promised Land were the Israelis—a telescoping of history indeed.

Generally, however, Guinness' style is very readable, punctuated with quotations, illustrations and occasional flashes of humour. The Biblical references are NEB which may cause doctrinal coronaries for devotees of the AV. There is a refreshing lack of resort to the exclamation mark which bedevils much Evangelical writing, and those who fear from the author's background that he is going to reproduce the entire vocabulary and syntax of Francis Schaeffer can breathe again. The beloved term epistemology does appear, and Guinness has certain jargon words of his own—symbiosis, scenario, hexed, hassle—but except when he is grappling with specific philosophical concepts the contents make fairly straightforward reading.

The book is a goldmine for anyone seeking relevant quotations from wellknown figures, but one can also drink one's Guinness straight. He often produces pithy, colourful phrases of his own, as the following selection may indicate: On the dilemma of modern atheism (p. 21): 'Some religious thinkers may be endlessly reporting the death of God (almost as their contemporary credal confession), but the fact no longer seems heroic to the perceptive atheist. If the city of God has been razed, who is in need of a home now? Who feels the chill most keenly?'

On Humanism (p. 50): 'What is the criterion of "humanness"? Is there a difference to man, and does it make any difference? The answer to these questions is beyond the reach of post-Christian humanism. Even standing on its tiptoes it cannot reach, let alone untie, this suspended Damoclean sword.'

On revolutionary violence (p. 170): 'The nineteenth century spirit was mainly nationalistic, so it was normal for the bishops to bless the cannons. The twentieth-century spirit is mainly revolutionary, and today the bishops are blessing the guerillas.'

On occultism (p. 278): 'Only a short time back any belief in such a world as the astral, the supernatural or the occult would have been relegated to the ridiculous. Such spine-tingling stories, like horror films, were modern man's surrogates for his loss of belief in hell.'

The cultic heroes of the Counter Culture and their illustrious progenitors pass across the stage in review, plus references to their creations in art and literature. Hegel, Nietzsche, Marx, Darwin, James, the Huxleys, Russell, Marcuse, Ginsberg, Leary, Bergman, Goodman, McLuhan . . . all are there. Tolkien and *The Lord of the Rings* are about the only significant absentees. The contribution of each to the different streams within the Counter Culture is noted, as also are the observations of certain of its critics like Roszak and Ellul.

The ten chapters with their suggestive titles fall into three sections. Chapters one to three cover the various factors and movements during the two decades after the last war which provide the background to the rise of the Counter Culture. Chapters four to eight deal with its salient features—the New Left, the growth of violence, Eastern mysticism, the drugs scene and occultism. In the last two chapters Guinness attempts a Christian critique and offers some practical suggestions for a Third Way as distinct from an alignment with the Establishment.

The first section is to a considerable extent a survey of already familiar ground, and some may feel that the treatment of Humanism is rather superficial. Likewise chapter four dealing with the rise of technocracy and the New Left will inevitably suffer by comparison with Roszak who has written

definitively on the subject. It is the next section where Guinness is at his best, due certainly to his firsthand experience in America and Europe of the strongholds of the Counter Culture and his upbringing in Asia. Chapter five on 'Violence—Crisis or Catharsis?' is a fascinating study which draws heavily on Ellul. The implicit condemnation of Christian involvement in military enterprises will cause some fluttering in the dovescotes among conservatives of an older generation. It is not common in Evangelical publications to read adverse criticisms of Cromwell and Martin Luther in their attitudes to war. Guinness' attempt to distinguish between violence and 'force' may not carry everyone with him, though for this reviewer it is a legitimate and convincing one.

His treatment of Eastern Religion and Drugs is incisive and noteworthy for two reasons. The first is his avoidance of hysterical language about drug-taking, especially cannabis-smoking, which is a salutary counter to the stance often adopted by 'fringe' Christian movements working among drug addicts. Secondly, and more significantly, is his insistence on the legitimate place of true mysticism and experience for the Christian believer (see pp. 270-271). Likewise the chapter on Occultism, the most lucid in the book, avoids sensationalism whilst punching home the sobering reality of the realm of supernatural evil. Anyone who imagines that the L'Abri emphasis on rationality excludes the possibility of visions should read the incident recorded on p. 299.

Guinness is strong in his critique of the contemporary church, whether the theology in question is liberal or conservative, and his comments on the Jesus Revolution and its oblivion to social involvement ought to ring bells in many a Christian Union. (Though I think he is wrong on p. 330 in ascribing the origins of 'Jesus Christ Superstar' to the movement.) However it should not pass unnoticed that whilst warning against the growth of a contentless, nonrational religious experience he recognises that there is a valid spiritual exercise of tongues, prophecy and healings. What is more debatable in this chapter is his contention that Christianity can be verified—or rather, how it can be verified. He uncovers the Achilles' heel of A. J. Ayer and the verification principle, but I doubt if everyone will be convinced by the apologetic he erects against it.

The last chapter, setting forth a Third Way between the polarity of the Counter Culture and the Establishment has much which is valuable. The section dealing with the components of Christian compassion—understanding, outrage and identification—is a purple patch which deserves to be read audibly after a meal on the next houseparty we are asked to conduct. It is a pity the book does not end there: the last few pages are an anticlimax after what has gone before.

The overall impression with which one is left is that confronted by a situation in which the dominant mood of society oscillates between the poles of realistic pessimism and romantic optimism the believer can rejoice in the sheer superiority of Christianity rightly so called. No-one after reading this book need feel ashamed of the Gospel. But most of us in the churches need much more knowledge of and sensitivity towards the Counter Culture than we exhibit at present. For all who still regard its adherents as simply disturbed, delinquent and decadent this book should be compulsory reading.

PATRICK DEARNLEY

ENGLISH SONG FROM DOWLAND TO PURCELL. *Ian Spink*. Batsford, 1974. 312 pp. £5.50.

Song writing is central to the musical tradition of England. In a beautifully produced book with fourteen photographs and copious musical illustrations, Dr. Spink, Reader in Music at the Royal Holloway College, has made an exhaustive survey of English song from Dowland to Purcell.

Part I deals with the gentle intimacy of lute songs, which, in many cases, were written for dances and others in the style of the simple hymn-tune. Dowland himself is portrayed as a sad, disappointed musician, 'In darkness let me dwell'. In the author's estimation Campion has been very much overrated; he was a better poet than a musician.

Part II covers the period of the court air. The loofly charming Nicholas Larnier is sensitive to the feelings of poetry. The style of Henry Lawes's songs belong neither to the air nor to the recitative. His brother, William is a more glamorous personality and is known foremost as an instrumental composer, although he did compose the ever popular 'Gather ye rosebuds while ye may'.

Part III describes the popularity of the catch and the glee amongst the middle-class merchants and shopkeepers, who paid the piper and therefore called the tune. The catch was bibulous and humorous, the canon (non-ecclesiastical) was moral and sober, and the round had its grass-roots in folk-song.

Part IV concerns songs of the Restoration Court and Stage, which were accompanied by the lute, guitar, or the harpsichord. The composers of this period are Humphrey, Locke, Farmer, and King, all of whom belong to the world of polite mediocrity, since they are hemmed in by the conventions of gallantry and pastoral insipidity. Next, the author describes how songs were used in the public theatres for quietening audiences and for creating atmosphere, apart from indicating the idea of time and the division of events within the same scene. Songs were sometimes utilised as sedatives as well as to portray madness and supernatural phenomena.

Part V outlines Purcell's development as a song writer over a period of some twenty years. He avoids the trivial view of love and life, and endeavours to emulate the brilliant *coloratura* style of the Italians, though he never quite divorces his songs from the native English tradition. It is by using the recitative within the cantata form that Purcell manages to explore new territory. He not only relates both rhythm and melody to the rhetorical and emotional sides of his texts, but brings into play ornament and dissonance. His recitatives are written in a flamboyant, yet declamatory idiom; and his use of the ground bass adds dimension to his Odes and Welcome Songs. Furthermore, the author maintains that Purcell achieves maturity as a song writer in his pastoral compositions for the theatre. His celebrated Lament (1689) reveals that full extent of human anguish; it is undoubtedly one of the most moving laments in all opera, though its first performance was in the hands of a group of schoolgirls from a School for Young Gentlewomen in Chelsea!

It is a pity Dr. Spink has not provided biographical information concerning these composers. I should have personally liked him to have included a more serious study of Purcell's Six Sacred Songs and his Scena 'In Guilty Night'.

PAUL CHAPPELL