REVIEWS OF BOOKS.

THE DEVELOPMENT OF RELIGIOUS TOLERATION IN ENGLAND. By W. K. Jordan, Ph.D. Allen & Unwin. 21s.

In view of the appointment by the Church Assembly of a committee to enquire into the relations of Church and State, this book has made a timely appearance. It should be read by those who wish to be properly informed on that important question. Dr. Jordan's impartial survey covers the period from "the beginning of the English Reformation to the death of Queen Elizabeth." Its calm and measured judgment is reminiscent of the great works of Troeltsch and A. J. Carlyle. It shows a somewhat defective knowledge of the influence of the Middle Ages, and of continental political and religious movements upon the Elizabethan programme. These are only the lacunae in the knowledge of a young writer, who, on his own field, reveals a masterly grasp of his subject. There are some points of harshness in his American diction which might well be removed from a second edition, for example, "pled" for "pleaded"; "factual" for "actual"; "gingerly."

English thought down to 1558 was more uniformly intolerant than continental thought on the question of heresy, although a change of attitude began under Edward VI. The tendency to simplify dogma assisted the development of toleration, and the Reformation finally destroyed the logical basis for the theory of persecution, although this did not become apparent until its second stage, when the reformed churches abandoned an attitude of intolerance. While in the first year of Elizabeth's reign no general analysis of the problem of toleration was made, the Government kept the way open for its development, and indeed, important advance was made. After 1568 the Government was compelled, by the appearance of militant Roman Catholicism to modify its policy in defence of the throne and of the public peace. Moreover, it found its action harassed by the growing opposition of the Puritans to the religious settlement of 1559.

After 1576 the repression of Roman Catholic Recusants became necessary, but there was no hatred and no zeal in the policy of the Government. If there were a few acts of injustice, these were far outnumbered by acts of leniency and by a refusal in many cases to take notice of offenders. Although the Puritan spirit was intolerant, yet by setting up the principle of private judgment, it contributed to the development of toleration. Jesuit influences prevented Roman Catholic thought from making any definite contribution, although, if the English secular priests and Roman Catholic laity had been left to themselves, the need for repression would never have arisen. The necessity for civil supervision of conflicting religious bodies, and of Roman Catholic propaganda is clearly made out. Lay thought, especially Unitarian, was always ahead of ecclesiastical during this period.
REVIEWS OF BOOKS

The work contains useful summaries or "conclusions" of the argument at the end of the several sections, which make it a useful handbook for the busy reader.

A. J. M.

ARNOLD OF BRESCIA. By G. W. Greenaway, M.A. Cambridge University Press, 1931. 8s. 6d.

This scholarly yet readable little book offers for the first time in English a life of the Brescian reformer of the twelfth century. Mr. Greenaway has searched every possible source of information for the life and work of Arnold. He arrives at the interesting conclusion that Arnold's aim was rather reform of the Church than reform of political conditions. His association with the commune, first at Brescia and then at Rome was due to expediency. The civic democrats of those cities offered him support for his ecclesiastical programme. In the end the Roman democrats abandoned him to his fate under Pope Adrian IV.

In a preliminary sketch of conditions in Italy Mr. Greenaway adopts the prevalent English estimate of Gregory VII. This we may pass over, but surely we ought not to continue to allege that Hildebrand was responsible for the Election Decree of 1059. That was the work of Humbert.

This volume illustrates yet once more the discontent with spiritual and religious conditions even at the very centre of the administration of the medieval Roman Church. Three centuries before the Reformation broke out Arnold of Brescia gave his life in the interests of religious reform.

A. J. M.

THE SIGNIFICANCE OF KARL BARTH. By John McConnachie, M.A. Hodder & Stoughton, 1931. 6s.

Unlike Mr. Birch Hoyle's more philosophical and comprehensive book (The Teaching of Karl Barth, Student Movement, 2nd Edit.), which devoted much space to Brunner and other writers of the Barthian circle, Mr. McConnachie confines himself to Karl Barth, and deals with him only as a theologian. Indeed, Mr. Hoyle and Mr. McConnachie might have exchanged the titles of their books, with advantage to the reader. However, here we have a plain statement of Barth's teaching which makes a serviceable contribution to the interpretation of the Swiss preacher to the British public. The few writings of Barth so far translated convey a very indifferent impression of his message, but with the happy union supplied by the philosophical insight of Hoyle and the theological zeal of McConnachie, a real Barthian repast for the English reader has been supplied.

The Scottish divine surveys the whole of Barth's writings to date. He does useful service by drawing attention to the necessity for learning Barth's terminology. Fortunately this is no difficult
matter on the whole, and where it is obscure, Mr. McConnachie renders aid, for example, in his explanation of the phrase "existential." He deals in a helpful way with current criticism of Barth, and draws a useful comparison between Barth's teaching and that of Jeans. This we had already observed, but it is good to have it emphasised. The writings of Barth are well summarized in this book. The strength of his teaching on the Holy Spirit; on the contact of God and man and nature; his refining down of the sharpness of Calvin's doctrine of election, and other matters on which Barth is supposed to be deficient, are well stressed. But Mr. McConnachie repeats the widely current notion that Barth's teaching sprang from the crisis of the war. It did not—as may be clearly proved from Mr. McConnachie's own sketch of Barth's career. It sprang from the preacher's crisis when faced with the necessity of teaching his people. The great commentary on the Romans was being preached to his Swiss parishioners before the war broke out. The effect of the war on Barth was to widen the range of his outlook, so that he was able to pour the deluge of a torrent, already in being, over wider fields. Thus, whether a preacher was active during the war period or not, Karl Barth strikes a note which cannot fail to enlist his sympathy and attention, and Mr. McConnachie has done good service in bringing the Barthian theology within the range of the ministers of all the English-speaking churches.

A. J. M.


This is the first volume, from the pen of Professor McGiffert, of a history of the origin and evolution of Christian thought. The second volume is already in the press, while a third, and possibly a fourth volume, is proposed. The present volume covers the period from Jesus to John of Damascus, from the beginning of Christianity to the Eastern Church in the Middle Ages. There are chapters dealing with the Apostle Paul and his theology, the Gnostics, the Montanists, the doctrine of the Trinity, the Nicene Council, etc.

Professor McGiffert has produced a scholarly and thoughtful contribution to a fascinating study. It is carefully written, with the emphasis rightly placed, and made as readable as such a work could well be. He gives for the student, with each chapter, a valuable bibliography, made more valuable by a concise appreciation of the merits and limitations of his authorities.

Not all will agree with his statements and opinions, or find adequate his view of particular teaching and belief. Least adequate, as we see it, is his view of the teaching of our Lord. "There is no evidence that he (Jesus) went beyond his countrymen in emphasising the divine fatherhood or that he interpreted it in a novel way." That is not our view.

F. B.
REVIEWS OF BOOKS

THROUGH THE PRAYER BOOK. By Dyson Hague. Longmans, Green & Co. 3s. 6d.

Dr. Dyson Hague’s name is well known both in this country and throughout the Dominion of Canada for his works in liturgiology. In this new book from his pen he excels himself by writing in a somewhat different vein from that which obtains in his previous publications. In his Story of the Prayer Book, his Protestantism of the Prayer Book, and his History of the Reformation he is known as a strong writer with very definite views, which he asserts with considerable polemical ability; but in this new work his style is quite different, and there is nothing polemical in the exposition of the teaching and language of the Prayer Book which he gives us here. We have in these thirty-six chapters, which occupy nearly 400 pages, a happy combination of scholarly accuracy with that freshness and enthusiasm which carry the reader easily along, and Dr. Hague is to be congratulated on this new achievement, which serves as a very admirable climax to his previous well-known publications.

We have here the origins and contents of the various services enthusiastically explained, and there are informing notes through the various chapters written with all the freshness which comes from a constantly-renewed youth, concerning the respective merits and peculiarities of the Canadian Prayer Book, the Prayer Book of the Church of Ireland, the Scottish Prayer Book, and the last chapter contains some very interesting references to the "Deposited Book," lately rejected by the English Parliament.

One or two examples of Dr. Dyson Hague’s treatment will give the reader a fair idea of what he may expect in this volume. On page 67, dealing with the Absolution at Morning and Evening Prayer, he writes: "There has been no little speculation amongst scholars as to the sources of the Absolution. Where did the compilers get the idea of it? Where did they borrow it from? . . . Cranmer may have got a phrase or two or a possible idea from Bucer, or Pollanus, or Quignon, but as a whole the General Confession and the Absolution are really owing to Englishmen, to the spiritual genius of Cranmer and the first compilers of our Prayer Book." Or again, take his opening section on the Lord’s Prayer, page 69: "One of the most significant signs of the ecclesiastical times is the increasing tendency of the non-Episcopal churches to use forms of prayer. As a rule they all innovate with the same thing. All begin by using the prayer which was called 'the prayer of the faithful,' and abandon their long protest against so-called formal prayers by employing that very form which our Blessed Saviour introduced as a cure for formalism. We hail this tendency with Christian pleasure. If the Methodists universally were to use the liturgy which John Wesley abridged from our Prayer Book for their Church services, and if the Presbyterians universally were to do what the Church of Scotland did from 1557 to 1564, and use the English Book of Common Prayer of 1552, we should have in a measure at least the fulfilment of the dream of Cranmer in compiling
our Anglican Prayer Book. To alter slightly the words of his letter to his friend John à Lasco, the desire of his life was 'to present to posterity a true and explicit form of worship, agreeable to the rule of the Sacred Writings, so that there may not only be set forth among different nations an illustrious testimony respecting our doctrine, but that all posterity may have a pattern to imitate.'"

There is an admirable index to this book, and it will be found of abiding helpfulness and service to clergy, students, Sunday-School teachers, and also to the men and women in the pew. The publishers are to be congratulated on the printing, paper and entire production.

R. M. W.


A more useful memorial to his life and work would have been secured by the late Professor Warfield if he had left the endowment, on which some ten volumes of his own writings are being reprinted, for the production of new work. At a time when publishers are compelled to refuse valuable original work, on the ground of high modern costs, it is distinctly a work of supererogation to reprint writings, no matter how valuable, which are already accessible. Perhaps some justification for this reissue lies in the fact that all of the articles first appeared in American journals.

The present volume, the fifth of the series, contains chapters on John Calvin and his work; his doctrine of the knowledge of God; the doctrine of God; the doctrine of the Trinity; the doctrine of creation; a general account of Calvinism, and an account of the literary history of the Institutes. These papers are written in a dull, heavy and somewhat obscure style, but they contain a reliable appreciation of the theology of the great Reformer, which is of the utmost value to-day when a revival of interest in Luther's and Calvin's work has been created by the Barthian movement. Both Barth and Brunner are getting students together for the study of Calvin, and we shall do the same here, if we are to obtain a proper understanding of the modern dialectical theology. English students have ample material in this book for months of study and discussion. Calvin's doctrine on the Holy Spirit is of special interest to-day.

A. J. M.


A series dealing with "Medieval Churchmen" must of necessity include a volume on Hildebrand, who has frequently been described as "the greatest man who ever sat upon the throne of the popes." As a constructive politician he has been accounted one of the greatest minds of Western civilization. For the writing of such a volume Dr. Macdonald has special qualifications. He has already given to the world careful studies on Lanfranc, Berengar, etc., and in so doing has delved deep into the history of this particular period.
Further intensive study of the correspondence between Hildebrand and his arch-foe, Henry IV, has enabled the author to present a picture of the great pope, more accurate probably in its lights and shadows than those hitherto accepted as authentic.

Let it be said at once that Hildebrand's own high moral character has never been seriously questioned. Equally beyond dispute was his zeal for the reformation of the clergy, strengthened probably by the influence of Cluny. Simony, concubinage, immorality of the clergy, misuse of Church property, the appointment of unsuitable clergy—all these rampant evils found in him a determined enemy, even before he found himself in high place. His unceasing attempts to remedy them after his enthronement brought difficulties innumerable and raised up against him enemies on every side. His campaigns against the marriage of clergy, a practice approved, in many cases, by long custom, met with sustained opposition. His attempts to ban intercourse with the excommunicate likewise brought him into rough water.

It must be accounted a tragedy of history that one who might, in other directions, have achieved great things for the quickening of spiritual religion, and the reformation of life and morals, should have been seized by one overwhelming ambition, and even in pursuing that should have been so lacking in the imagination and vision, the statecraft and policy that alone could have brought success. To have the ball at one's feet only to kick into touch is hardly a sign of outstanding greatness.

Hildebrand was born into a world in which the dominant sovereignty was the Church expressed through the papacy. In very early life his imagination had been captured by the glamour of the papal institution and all its inherent possibilities of power. It later became his passionate ambition to make the chair of St. Peter the final source of all sovereignty and to bring within the range of its authority all Western nations and peoples. That was the pulsing passion that throbbed through his designs and activities: it was the rock upon which his own career finally shattered.

Every proffered opportunity to extend the temporal and spiritual power of the papacy was seized. To France, Spain, England, Denmark, Scandinavia, Poland, even to Constantinople, Gregory's messengers carried his imperious claims and offers. "The foundation of the vast appellate jurisdiction of the medieval Church was being laid down."

It was to be expected that such extensive claims should sooner or later bring him into collision with princes and rulers and particularly with King Henry IV, claimant of the imperial crown, and with it privileges and rights in things ecclesiastical which Gregory would concede to none. The clash came with little delay, and ended only with the Pope's death. Reading Dr. Macdonald's detailed and careful account of the struggle, one's sympathy is summoned to the side of Henry IV. Again and again he extended the olive branch. With "words full of sweetness and obedience, such as we cannot recollect either he or his predecessors have ever
sent to the Roman Bishops’” (Hildebrand’s own words), Henry sought an agreed solution of difficulties that pressed. Gregory temporized, summoned to his aid Normans and Lombards, and encouraged Henry's rebellious subjects and neighbours. At one time he beguiled with smooth promises, at another he flourished “the sword of general anathema.” So events led to Canossa where Henry, barefoot in the winter snows, waited, a penitent, upon the Pope’s pardon. If it appeared to be a spectacular and triumphant end to Hildebrand’s dreams and schemes, it had within it the seeds of complete disillusionment. Tricked and defrauded, as he conceived himself to be, Henry ere long appeared before the gates of Rome to persist until Gregory VII was deposed and excommunicated, Clement III enthroned in his stead, and Henry and his queen invested with the imperial crown. Gregory’s ally Guiscard, with his army of Normans, arrived to succour: they stayed to sack and burn, and left the imperial city in ashes. And yet, almost to the very last an honourable accommodation between Henry and Gregory had been the former’s steadfast desire.

A year or two later Gregory died, a discarded pope, an exile from Rome, doomed by his own lack of wisdom and charity, his schemes apparently buried beneath the ashes of Rome: but the principles for which he fought remained and became the foundation of the power of the medieval papacy, an “ignis fatuus,” luring Gregory’s successors into morasses of trouble.

Dr. Macdonald has told a great story in a scholarly fashion and in a way that carries conviction to the reader. There are minor blemishes which might well be removed in another edition and there are suggestions which might with advantage be expanded, but these are small details in a book of real worth.

F. B.

**Jesus Came Preaching.** By Dr. Geo. A. Buttrick. [xii + 239 pp.]
*Charles Scribner’s Sons.* 8s. 6d.

The author of Parables of our Lord has once again placed the Christian public under a debt of gratitude for a volume of real merit. Designed especially for preachers, it can, with profit, be read by all. Its language, its wealth of illustration, its deep insight, its suggestiveness are as choice as they are refreshing. The difficulties and objections which teachers and preachers encounter are kept constantly under review. The chapter entitled “The Preacher’s Place to-day” alone makes the book an acquisition. This is only one of many excellent chapters.

The art and science of preaching Christ to the minds of people to-day, in the social order, and to the individual, furnish some of the themes in these lectures on preaching.

Like the wine at the feast, the choicest comes at the end. “The preaching of the Cross” is the product of a soul that has searched deep into the mysteries of Divine compassion and love, having first known the awful sinfulness of sin. “We preach Christ and
REVIEWS OF BOOKS

Him crucified. God forbid that we should glory save in the Cross of Christ our Lord"—fittingly ends such a book.

If only it were possible to place this book in the hands of all engaged in preaching Christ's Gospel, the world would be the richer.

F. B.

CHURCH SERVICE SOCIETY ANNUAL, MAY, 1931-32. Blackwood. 2s. 6d.

This periodical of the Higher Church School of the Kirk of Scotland begins with a description and photographs of the new St. Andrew's Church at Jerusalem. There are articles on preaching, liturgical services, the behaviour of the minister in worship, etc. It is gratifying to Anglicans to find that so many of their forms of prayer are recommended, particularly as regards intercessions. Ancient and modern liturgies are largely quoted, and the future of the public worship of the Kirk is discussed, with pleas for reverence, dignity and beauty in the services.


A glimpse into the future life from the pen of one who was—quite early in life—called upon to look through life's windows into the life beyond. Like other preachers he has found that no congregations have been more crowded than those which have come together to hear sermons on this question. The chapters on the Resurrection and on Heaven and Hell, etc., will be read with the keenest interest.

THE SAINT OF TOULOUSE. A Study of a great religious Personality. By Helen Clergue. London: Mitre Press. 3s. 6d.

The Saint of Toulouse, as the Capuchin monk Pere-Marie Antoine, was from his early youth, and still is called, was one of the notable men of modern France, for he lived into the present century. He was endowed with rare gifts and qualities and his career was striking and abnormal. He was a great character in the Roman Catholic Church; indeed, efforts are now being made to secure his canonisation.

MYSTICAL STUDIES IN THE APOCALYPSE. By the Rev. H. Erskine Hill, D.D., Provost of St. Andrew's Cathedral, Aberdeen. London: Elliott Stock. 7s. 6d.

The author's viewpoint is somewhat unusual. He believes that the Apocalypse was "never intended to be an obscure and cryptic narration of concrete earthly events," but that it is rather an unveiling of what earthly events look like when seen from heaven. He regards it as a complete and intelligible whole, embodying a progressive revelation deliberately given by our Lord through the agency of Angelic beings impressed on the inner consciousness of
the seer. This negatives the theory that the book belongs to the whole body of apocalyptic literature about which the late Archdeacon Charles, of Westminster, wrote so much.

**Catholicity.** By Herbert H. Kelly, S.S.M. *S.C.M.* 4s.

"Catholic" and "Evangelical" will read this book with some surprise. The "Catholic" because it is so evangelical and the "Evangelical" because it is so truly Catholic. The author claims to be a member of the Catholic Party, though his "early religious life was narrowly evangelical." His main contention is that while there can be a Catholic party yet no party can be Catholic. A party stands only for part of the truth but is entitled to the name of that aspect of the truth for which it stands.

"There are people who seem to think that they possess the Catholic faith, but that is absurd. No one man, no one nation can be Catholic."

On the Roman claims the author is trenchant. "Is Romanism Catholic? By any definition I know how to frame, a unity by agreement is a denomination . . . that the Pope is the Vicar of Christ . . . seems to me an appalling doctrine. I do not in the least believe that God is absent, nor that any man, or system of men, can be in any way a substitute for God. It makes the faith of the Holy Spirit meaningless."

The following quotations are interesting as coming from an extreme High Churchman: "I do not think we can understand Confirmation at all, unless we realise that it was not a sacrament by itself; it was part of baptism." "I have heard people talk as if God could not act outside the Sacraments. . . . I do not think they really meant it." "It is plain that the Act of Baptism no more takes the place of Conversion or ensures a Christian life than the act of marriage ensures or takes the place of love and faithfulness." The author refuses to quarrel with those who differ from him and readers will find it difficult to quarrel with one who is so large-hearted and humble.

**The Renewed Church of the United Brethren, 1722–1930.**

G. W. Addison, Ph.D. [228 pp.]; *S.P.C.K. for the Church Historical Society.* 12s. 6d. net.

As Dr. Addison points out this book is not intended to be a history of the Moravian Church. It is rather an account of the renewed Unitas Fratrum followed through two centuries of development, keeping in view the main ideal and intention of the "Re­newer," Count Zinzendorf, namely, the ideal of assisting the move­ment from a "plurality of churches" to "the unity of the children of God." Dr. Addison fulfils his purpose admirably well. He brings to his task that sympathy, understanding, and appreciation which is essential in one attempting such an account.

Zinzendorf was a remarkable character, as may be evinced from the fact that as a young student of nineteen his chief concern was
with the state of the Christian Church. His aim at all times was not separatism but real unity. His own life was marked by a deep devotion to the person of Christ and a passion for the realization of His desire "that they may be all one." This ideal he kept before him to the end, despite difficulties and opposition and even when sometimes, separation seemed to be inevitable. His ideal was to foster within the various Protestant Churches groups drawn together to converse on things spiritual and bound together by their desire for richer fellowship in the Gospel of Jesus Christ. The result, as he saw it, would be revival within the Churches and the paving of the way to that union of Christians which he so greatly desired.

The author pays particular attention to the English province, centring round the Fetter Lane Society, following it through Parliamentary recognition and towards devolution. He traces through a hundred and forty years the growth of provincial independence and the breaking down, almost inevitably, of Zinzendorf's ideal of non-separation. The final chapter is concerned with the Renewed Unitas as a possible via media for reunion, and traces up to 1930 the various negotiations, in this connection, between the Moravians and the Church of England.

This scholarly book is based upon a thesis presented for the doctor's degree at the University of London. For its publication we are indebted to the Publication Funds of the University of London and of the Church Historical Society.

F. B.


This edition of "necessary doctrine and erudition for any Christian man" is reprinted by photographic process from Bishop Lloyd's edition of Formularies of Faith put forth by Authority during the Reign of Henry VIII (1825). The volume was prepared for publication, with an introduction, by the late Canon Lacey, and is issued through the generosity of Viscount Halifax, partly as a "modest memorial to a great Churchman and scholar."

Canon Lacey claims, as against Gairdner, that The King's Book is much more than a revision of The Bishops' Book issued six years earlier. He shows that whole sections were omitted and new work introduced. He gives some interesting examples of marginal comments made by Henry VIII on the bishops' answers to posed questions.

F. B.


We are grateful to the "scholarly friend" whose suggestion inspired Mr. Allison to attempt this little treatise. It is not so
much a dissertation on English learning as individual portraits of learned and pious men of the seventh and eighth centuries, men of Kent, Northumbria and Wessex chiefly, men not perhaps of learning equal to that of Bede, but worthy followers or fellow-labourers. It is obvious that there was throughout the seventh and eighth centuries a "succession of men eminent for piety and sometimes for learning, of which any Church might well be proud."

Mr. Allison has done a real service by putting into print the result of his researches.

F. B.

A Traffic in Knowledge—an International Symposium on the Christian Message. S.C.M. 2s. 6d.

The Students' Christian Movement seems to be seeking a basis of truth for students of all countries to rest upon, and a method of co-operation in Christian work; but are not both these already provided by the Holy Spirit in the creeds of the Christian Church?

The Editor, Dr. Visser 't Hooft, introduces us to writers expressing various national aspects of the approach to Christianity. The French point of view (Pierre Mauray) is, of course, logical and orderly, and looks to our Lord as the revealer of truth. The American (Reinhold Niebuhr) is concerned with social and industrial problems, and regards Him as the reconciler of men. Morality is, of course, the chief concern of the Chinese writer (P. C. Hsu); he finds in Christ the only one who can save the Chinese character from the destructive effects of Western science and modern nationalism.

All these incomplete presentations of the Person of our Lord produce a very chilling effect on the reader, who is glad to find some warmth in the Russian Orthodox essayist (V. V. Zenkovsky), who directs us to Christ as the Saviour of mankind: only He can satisfy men's needs and men's ideals; the Church is the organ of Christ's Spirit, through which grace and truth come to us.

These varied ways of approach (and there are many others) make us realize the "fulness of Christ," towards the fulfilment of which every nation and every civilization must bring its contribution.


Here is a collection of experiments and experiences in parish work. Mr. Wickham is one of the many parish priests who discern in our system a growing tendency towards "Congregationalism" and the breakdown of the old parochial system, and he discusses, very freely and fully, new conditions. Marriage, Confirmation, Recreation, Church Finance and other practical subjects come up for consideration. Those who like the author are called upon to minister in populous parishes will find the book full of suggestions that will help them to evolve methods such as his own parish bristles with. The little volume would certainly be a florin well spent.