

REVIEWS OF BOOKS.

THE ENGLISH CHURCH AND THE PAPACY. By Z. N. Brooke. *Cambridge University Press*, 1931. 10s. 6d.

Mr. Brooke—one of the Editors of the *Cambridge Medieval History*—has brought his expert knowledge of European history in the eleventh and twelfth centuries to bear upon the story of the relation between the English Church and the Papacy from the Conquest to the reign of John. He begins with a thorough investigation, which had not been attempted before, of MS. collections of law, drawn up in the eleventh and twelfth centuries, and surviving in the muniment rooms of our ancient cathedrals, colleges and national libraries. With this very thorough inquiry Mr. Brooke supplements the great work achieved by Fournier on early French and Italian collections in the field of Canon Law. This book easily places its author in the same category as his great predecessor. It is a masterpiece of historical investigation, acute historical penetration, and impartial historical synthesis.

The study of the English Canon Law books lead Mr. Brooke to the conclusion that the famous phrase in *Magna Carta*—"quod Anglicana ecclesia libera sit"—implies not the freedom of a national Church to go its own way independently of King and Pope alike, but freedom to obey the Pope without royal interference. In the second part of the book Mr. Brooke traces the development of this freedom from 1066 to 1216, and supplies a new and most illuminating treatment of English Church history from that standpoint. He contrasts the attitude of Lanfranc with that of his successors. While the general programme of Church reform was maintained by the first Norman archbishop, unlike his successors, he did not support the papal policy of interference with the royal action in relation to the Church. We may add that the tendency from Anselm onwards was always to restore and intensify the relation which had existed between the English Church and the Papacy in Saxon times, as Troeltsch and Dufourcq have shown. Consequently the era of Lanfranc and the Conqueror was an interlude which had something of the character of a reaction. This must be remembered by readers of Mr. Brooke's book.

Two or three details of criticism may be offered. On page 23 Mr. Brooke says that "in the eleventh century there was nobody in England, or elsewhere, who . . . denied that it (the Church) was under papal headship." Mr. Brooke had forgotten, for the moment, the anonymous Yorkist writer, whose theories he adequately appraises later (157 ff.). While accepting the main conclusion of the present reviewer, that Lanfranc was not guilty of the forgery of certain letters (cf. *Lanfranc, His Life Work and Writing*, Oxford, 1926), he asks why, if the documents used by Lanfranc proved his case, there was need for forgery later? Has

he noticed that I attributed this to the need for a larger body of evidence, which arose in view of the growing number of the Yorkist privileges? (Cf. *Lanfranc*, p. 281.) Again, "the great champion of orthodoxy against Berengar" was not Lanfranc, but Cardinal Humbert (cf. my *Berengar*¹ especially p. 129 ff.). But we do not wish to close a very brief review of this brilliant book on a note of criticism. It is the most masterly contribution to the study of English Church history ever made by a British scholar, and has sketched definitively the right perspective for the study of the period. No student can afford to overlook this book. After Mr. Brooke's work only stupid wrong-headedness will be able to maintain that the medieval English Church did not become an integral part of the papal system.

A. J. M.

THE SOCIAL TEACHING OF THE CHRISTIAN CHURCHES. By Ernst Troeltsch. Translated by Olive Wyon. 2 vols. *Geo. Allen and Unwin*, 1931. £2 2s.

The translator has done a splendid service to English readers by making available Troeltsch's massive study, which appeared in 1911. Readers who are irritated by footnotes, will find them unobtrusively placed at the end of each great section of the work. For the scholar these offer a thorough survey of the literature covered by the author. Volume One sketches the rise of Christian Social theory in the Early Church, and traces its relationship with Greek and Roman ideas; it then covers the medieval period. The attention paid to medieval sects enhances the importance of Mr. Bett's recent book on *Joachim of Flora* (Methuen, 1931). Troeltsch makes no reference to the Berengarian movement, or to the different types of Berengarian thought in the late eleventh and early twelfth centuries. The beginnings of the "sect-type" are surely to be found here. Due allowance is made for the influence of Platonism and Stoicism and medieval social theory, and Dr. A. J. Carlyle's extensive work on *Medieval Political Theory in the West* receives well-merited attention. The paragraphs on the Canon Law should now be supplemented by the writings of Fournier, Z. N. Brooke, and Fliche.

Volume Two is devoted to an exhaustive examination of Protestantism from the Reformation to the end of the eighteenth century, and will therefore be of special interest to readers of THE CHURCHMAN. It closes with a sketch of social theory in the nineteenth century. The Anglican Church receives practically no treatment, possibly because Troeltsch, as a Lutheran, could not decide whether it belongs to the Catholic or Protestant type of ecclesiastical organization. But a very good estimate of the Free Churches, and their fundamental differences, is provided. The last section of the book must be supplemented by the new Barthian theology, but even without this additional study, Troeltsch's work

¹ Longmans (1930).

shows how much Barth and Brunner owe to original Reformation ideas. The whole work forms a fascinating inquiry for the historian as well as the sociologist, and constitutes a more reliable, as well as more thorough investigation into social religion than Mr. Gerald Heard's recent book.

A. J. M.

THE RELEVANCE OF CHRISTIANITY. By F. R. Barry, M.A., D.S.O.
Nisbet, 1931. 10s. 6d.

If this book is an account of contemporary life and thought in relation to Christianity it tells us a good deal. If, on the other hand, it is examined from the standpoint of the Word of God coming into the world, not much inspiration or illumination is to be obtained from it. For this reason the Barthian theology is passed over, and also because, as he has confessed elsewhere, the author is not acquainted with this movement. Yet no serious account of Christianity today can afford to overlook the new spiritual and evangelical message coming from Switzerland. Mr. Barry's system is humanism, Christian humanism it may be, but it hardly reaches yet the height of a theology. He is very good at diagnosis, and some of his observations on the remedy for political and international difficulties are helpful. On the sex question he is not satisfactory. He desires "to have it both ways"—the ideal of the Christian law, and yet a relaxed standard of a marriage for hard cases, and to assist young people. But a choice must surely be made. Mr. Barry has read widely, but not very deeply, consequently he nearly always circles round the point of solution, and seldom thrusts in to the centre. Yet there are signs that he has been influenced by the Barthian message. He has realized that the "Jesus of History" was not sufficient. The Bible is "not a book about ethics but a book about the Christian religion." The New Testament *is* an other-worldly book—"a book about God and Christ's revelation of the Father." The concern of Jesus "was not so much to affect the relationships of men and women to one another; rather it was to redeem the relationship of all men and women to God." Christ's "significance lay in the eternal and supernatural order." The Kingdom of God "is the invasion of human history by the sovereign holiness of the living God." Christ is "not confined within the sequence of history." Having lifted these fragments from the Barthian theology, this book would have been greatly strengthened if Mr. Barry had gone on with the good work.

A. J. M.

JOHN OF SALISBURY. By Clement C. J. Webb, M.A., D.Litt.,
F.B.A. *Methuen, 1932. 6s.*

This book is the third of the series entitled "Great Churchmen of the Middle Ages," edited by Dr. Elliott Binns, and it is an admirable contribution to the collection. It is still widely held that humanism did not reappear in Europe until the time of the

Renaissance. Much has been done to dispel this idea by Rand and Laistner in America, and this book continues the *éclaircissement*. Humanism never died in the Middle Ages. There would be no Latin scholarship, and probably no Greek scholarship, to-day if it had done so. In the twelfth century the leading humanist in England was John of Salisbury, secretary and confidential adviser of Archbishops Theobald and Thomas à Becket, and finally Bishop of Chartres. During the quarrel between Becket and Henry II, John of Salisbury was an exile, but although he remained consistently loyal to Becket, he by no means approved of that prelate's provocative utterances and conduct. A supporter of Alexander III against Barbarossa and a friend of Eugenius III, John was frequently in Rome, and he does not spare the worldliness and ambitions of the great churchmen of the day. His philosophical writings, the *Policraticus* and *Metalogicon*, had a great vogue in the Middle Ages, but to-day our interest lies rather in the *Historia Pontificalis*, his continuation of the History of Sigebert of Gembloux, and in his letters. The former supplies valuable information on the Becket dispute and on current political topics, especially so far as they concerned England; the letters preserve many details of the social life of the times. No other biography of John of Salisbury has yet appeared in English, and the distinguished and learned author, who some years ago edited the *Policraticus* and *Metalogicon*, has filled a gap in our historical literature. Although brief, the book is sufficient; the sources have been thoroughly digested, and the story of John of Salisbury's active life is told in an engaging manner. The calm, successive sentences which lengthen out Dr. Clement Webb's long rolling paragraphs, form a not unwelcome contrast with the more terse historical prose of the present day.

Professor Webb estimates fairly the services rendered by the Papacy to the Church and to European civilization, yet not with the surrender of a critical balance of judgment. He says that "it is arguable that in her maintenance of the principle of a Christian Church, visibly and effectively one, Rome, by her *intransigent* attitude toward all developments of Christian thought and life which do not consist with an acknowledgment of her infallibility, has sacrificed and is sacrificing spiritual interests of Christendom at least as sacredly and intimately bound up with the example of the Gospel as that principle itself."

A. J. M.

A HISTORY OF THE CHURCH IN BLACKBURNSHIRE. By John Eyre Winstanley Wallis, Vicar and Rural Dean of Whalley. S.P.C.K. 1932. 7s. 6d.

Blackburnshire forms the north-east corner of South Lancashire, along the Yorkshire border, south of the Ribble; it was the extreme end of the ancient diocese of Lichfield. Its chief places were in old days Blackburn, Whalley with its Abbey, and Clitheroe with

its Castle. Other places of more recent growth include Accrington and Burnley. In old times the name "shire" was in the North given to an area of considerable size, composing a number of townships supporting a central town; latterly it became the equivalent of a "hundred." A marked feature in the North as distinct from the Midlands or South is the existence of huge parishes with distant ancient chapelries; thus Blackburnshire long consisted of the two parishes of Blackburn and Whalley, though Canon Wallis shows the probability that Burnley, Colne, and some other chapelries were originally independent parishes. The ecclesiastical history centres round these two churches and Whalley Abbey; maps are given of both ancient parishes, and a plan of the remains of the Abbey, which now belong to the Blackburn Diocesan Board of Finance. John Paslew, the last Abbot, was executed for his share in the "Pilgrimage of Grace" (1537). The tangled history of the medieval rectors is carefully worked out and the account of the medieval rural dean is of special interest. A full account is given of church building and development during the last 150 years, culminating in the formation of the Bishopric of Blackburn in 1926. The ancient Blackburnshire comprises now nearly 120 parishes. Industrial Lancashire has a long history behind it.

H. S.

FREDERICK THE SECOND. By Ernst Kantorowicz. Translated by E. O. Lorimer. *Constable*, 1931. 27s.

The growing interest in medieval history among English-speaking people is illustrated by the fact that Messrs. Constable, like Messrs. Methuen, are engaged upon the production of a series of medieval biographies. This series is entitled, "Makers of the Middle Ages," and the publication of this magnificent volume of nearly 700 pages was a striking event in the world of letters last year. This biography should easily have been given a place among the "Books of the Week." Never again will it be possible to say that a medieval biography cannot be as enthralling as any modern character. In this case an absorbingly interesting personality has been treated by a masterly hand. Professor Kantorowicz has an erudite knowledge of the history of his period; he has more, he has the gifts of a literary artist and of the born biographer. The shining qualities of his work have been faithfully reflected by his translator, and Mr. Lorimer is to be congratulated on a great achievement. This book will rank among the great biographies of English as well as German literature.

It is not a mere piece of portrait-painting, it presents a thorough account of the history of Frederick II's graphic period (1194-1250). The influence of this forerunner of the Renaissance princes upon literature, art, music, architecture and natural science is fully described. The life of the Italian Court and of the magnates of those days is vividly sketched. Frederick II was also the last of the great Germanic-Roman Emperors, in some ways their most com-

plete representative since ancient Roman days. Yet he achieved his triumphs over the Papacy with a minimum of assistance from Germany, and with the aid of Italian, supported by Saracen forces. This was something new in the history of the conflict between Papacy and Empire. Innocent III, Gregory IX and Innocent IV do not come well out of the story. Indeed, the two latter Popes ruined Frederick's attempt to found a united Italian kingdom administered by Roman law, an attempt which was not again effectively made until the days of Victor Emmanuel II, and not fully achieved until the appearance of Mussolini. Yet Frederick dealt decisive blows at the corruption of medieval Church life, and his political work was inherited by the magnates of the city-states of the Renaissance era. With armies which never mustered more than 15,000 men, and usually only reached a third of that number, he secured the flight of Innocent IV to Avignon, and was able to resist all the efforts of that Pope to have him assassinated. Frederick's power was derived from his personal influence over men, but in the absence of sufficient military force, and with little recognition of the art of war, that supremacy failed him in the end. One after another of his trusted lieutenants betrayed him—even Piero della Vigna fell away—and so slightly grounded was Frederick's dynasty, that every one of his numerous sons and their descendants rapidly came to a tragic or an obscure end. Brilliance and thundercloud, light and shade, happy fulfilment and treacherous defeat, are all vividly portrayed in these pages. The book is an epic of the last great effort of Roman imperial majesty to assert itself, but with the aid of mere communal support; and when the last page has been read there remains the picture of the Hohenstaufen and his sons singing in the hour of defeat, and smiling on the morning of their doom.

A. J. M.

THE HOLY AND THE LIVING GOD. By M. D. R. Willink, S.Th.
London: George Allen and Unwin. 10s. net.

The title of this scholarly and elaborate compilation would most likely be more intelligible to the average reader if the two first words were printed in inverted commas, for as yet it is improbable that many are familiar with Otto's treatise on "The Holy," to which the author acknowledges her indebtedness—although she began to sketch this book in 1911. Similarly "the hallows," i.e. things and persons related to the holy, and ideograms, i.e. pictures of ideas—in which she takes the greatest interest—are still unfamiliar to most English readers.

Miss Willink endeavours to re-interpret the old symbolical pictures, actions and words in terms of to-day's thinking; and to that end makes an exhaustive study of the Old Testament religion (aided by reference to Robertson-Smith) illustrated by Fraser's pagan examples, and leading on to New Testament teaching. The awfulness of the Holy God, the danger of approaching any "hallow,"

the developing sense of sin and the need of propitiation and mediation, are themes here discussed, leading up to the Gospel of Christ and His Church. Eternal Life in conflict with Death, symbolised by light, by fire, by the Wrath of God, is characterised as the reaction of holiness on the disharmonious ; evidences of the working of this energy are accumulated from Bible and Church history. To take one aspect of this reaction, many instances may be produced of the punishment of sacrilege, i.e. the unlawful treatment of places or things appropriated to God. We surely need (as many wise men now tell us) a deeper sense of the Majesty and Holiness of God, and this thoughtful treatise should help us to gain it.

TARA : A PAGAN SANCTUARY OF ANCIENT IRELAND. By R. A. S. Macalister, Litt.D., LL.D., F.S.A. *Scribners*. 10s. 6d. net.

Professor Macalister, Professor of Celtic Archæology, University of Dublin, President of the Royal Irish Academy and of the Royal Society of Antiquaries of Ireland, has re-written the interesting volume which he now presents from a *Study of the Remains and Traditions of Tara*, which he read before the Royal Irish Academy and was afterwards published in the *Proceedings* of that body ; and he tells us that many things in the earlier book have been modified and others pruned away, while he has introduced some new material.

Tradition credits Tara with being the most august place in Ancient Ireland. There the Druids' High Priests sat, and there Ireland's Kings were crowned. Many tales and ballads have been written about what was undoubtedly the centre of religious worship and later of kingly power in Ancient Ireland. The author, an outstanding authority on Irish archæology, presents us with a fascinating and well-documented history which will commend itself to those interested in the subject. Some excellent illustrations are given from photographs taken by the Air Force of the Irish Free State and others.

THE WORTH OF PRAYER, and Other Essays. By Edward Grubb. *James Clarke and Co.* 5s.

This collection of essays and addresses seems to indicate that the "spiritual religion" of the Society of Friends is seeking an intellectual justification from the current theories of science, whether in theology, physics or psychology. They cover a wide ground, including Prayer, Revelation, the Christian idea of God, and other points of doctrine. There is nothing very new or striking, but the author's points are clearly and persuasively brought out. The difficulties and apparent contradictions in parts of the Christian religion must (as the author says) "wait for a synthesis—the call is to patience and perseverance."

CHURCH BOOK ROOM NOTES.

WINE OFFICE COURT, FLEET STREET, E.C.4.

The Prayer Book.—A new work on the Prayer Book by Dr. Dyson Hague will shortly be published entitled *The Prayer Book: An Exposition*, price 3s. 6d. It will be a useful companion to the author's excellent book, *The Story of the Prayer Book*, the second edition of which is now published at 3s. 6d. In this work the author endeavours to interpret the spirit as well as the letter of the Prayer Book, to explain the origins and contents of all its services, and, in short, to give an exposition of the subject-matter of the Prayer Book from cover to cover. It might be entitled "Through the Prayer Book," or as one has suggested, "Know your Prayer Book." It is intended to help not only the clergy, the student, the Sunday School teacher, but that large body of churchpeople who want to know more about their Prayer Book.

Protestantism.—The Verbatim Report of the 105th Islington Clerical Conference has been issued under the title of *Protestantism* (9d. paper boards, 6d. paper covers). It contains, in addition to the papers read at the Conference, a foreword by the Bishop of Norwich and an epilogue by Bishop Knox. Following the Islington Conference, the London Meeting of Lay Churchmen took for its subject this year "The Menace to Protestantism—from the West and from the East." In this issue of THE CHURCHMAN Professor Beresford Pite's opening address to the Conference is given.

The Reformation. It may be of interest to mention the following books and pamphlets which deal with this subject and which were mentioned during these Conferences: *The Defence of the Reformation*, by G. G. Coulton (5s.); *The Inquisition* (6d.) and *The Black Death* (6d.), by the same author; *Protestantism*, by Dean Inge, (6d.). This is a little pamphlet which was first published in 1927, and has been through several editions. It gives the meaning of Protestantism, and takes us through the transition to Catholicism through the early Protestant revolts down to present-day Modernism and Catholicism; Professor Alison Phillips' useful historical retrospect, *The Protestant Reformed Church of England* (3d.), gives material in regard to the Protestantism of the Church of England, while his larger pamphlet, *What Happened at the Reformation* (6d.), goes more fully into the subject and is a paper which originally appeared in THE CHURCHMAN in October 1925; Dr. Sydney Carter's pamphlet, *The English Church: Catholic, Apostolic, Reformed, Protestant*, which is now issued at 1d., is also a very serviceable and useful pamphlet, and is suitable for general circulation. Lastly we would mention *The Protestantism of the Prayer Book*, by Canon Dyson Hague, which has just been re-issued at 1s. 6d., but some copies of the second edition can still be had at the Church Book Room at 1s. At a time when the assumption is made that the Prayer Book is Catholic and therefore cannot be Protestant, it is well to have at hand a book which shows so clearly that the Prayer Book is only Catholic because it is so completely Protestant. It is the habit of the pseudo-Catholic to omit, if possible, any reference to the Prayer Book of 1552. In his desire also to convince himself that there is continuity of doctrine between the medieval Missal and the English Prayer Book he has acquired a habit of closing his eyes to the essential changes that were made in the English Communion service. Such points as these, and many more to which we have not space to refer,

will be found treated with clearness and considerable fulness by Canon Dyson Hague.

Holy Communion.—Mention may be made of Canon Meyrick's work, *Doctrine of the Church of England on the Holy Communion* (2s. 6d.), a sound and positive exposition of the actual doctrine of the Church on the Lord's Supper, and one that will interest and instruct the average Churchman as well as the clergy and the scholar. Bishop Harold Browne writes in his preface to the first edition that such "a clear exposition of primitive doctrine, and of the doctrine of that Church which glories in reverting to and taking hold of primitive faith, must be useful to puzzled consciences and may assure those who are in doubt. . . . I venture to commend the treatise which has gathered into a small compass and expressed in simple language the results of intelligent study, of patient thought, and of extensive learning." Canon Meyrick's other books will also repay perusal, viz. *Scriptural and Catholic Truth and Worship*, or the Faith and Worship of the Primitive, the Medieval and the Reformed Anglican Churches (fourth edition, 1s. 6d.), and *Old Anglicanism and Modern Ritualism*, a few second-hand copies of which can still be obtained at 1s. 6d. His other book, *Sunday Observance*, is particularly useful just now when so much is being said in regard to this subject. Second-hand copies of this book can also be had at 1s. 6d.

The Fourth Gospel.—Readers of THE CHURCHMAN will remember the little book by the Rev. T. W. Gilbert, D.D., entitled *The Miracles in St. John's Gospel and their Teaching on Eternal Life*, the first edition of which was published a few years ago at the price of 2s. 6d. The present edition, which has been corrected and revised, is now issued at 1s. The book contains a set of lectures given to the Church Tutorial Classes in Oxford, and is a most helpful and suggestive study, showing how, from the demonstration of our Lord's power over nature in the first miracle at Cana of Galilee, to His bestowal of Life in the raising of Lazarus, there is a gradual progression in the revelation of His divine nature. The two concluding chapters on Upper Room Teaching and Confession bring the teaching of the miracles into close relation with human life and its needs in a general way. The whole study is most suggestive, scholarly and stimulating.

The Nicene Creed.—Some copies remain in the Church Book Room of *The Nicene Creed* by the late Chancellor Lias. The book was originally issued at 7s. 6d. and the remainder copies are now offered at 1s. Chancellor Lias, during his life, studied deeply the fundamentals of our belief. The main value of this treatise lies in its lucid and full exposition of the vital articles of our Creed, and in the firm hold on those principles of Anglicanism which have been the very warp and woof of the web of English Church life.

Historical Tales.—For some years Miss Deborah Alcock's famous story, *The Spanish Brothers*, has been out of print, and we are glad to be able to announce the immediate publication of a new edition at 3s. 6d. Those who have already read this particular story will welcome the new edition, and those who have not, it will interest as presenting a tale of Spanish life, giving a true and vivid picture of cruel and stormy times during the period of the Inquisition. In the same series two other books of Miss Alcock's have been re-issued; *Dr. Adrian, a Tale of Old Holland*, a brilliant and powerful historical tale, giving a vivid description of the stirring days in Antwerp, of the Prince of Orange and heroic Sea Beggars; and *Under Calvin's Spell*, which contains some very useful historical material, and an accurate description of the times.