

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](https://paypal.me/robbradshaw)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *Theological Students Fellowship (TSF) Bulletin (US)* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_tsfbulletin-us.php



BULLETIN

THEOLOGICAL STUDENTS FELLOWSHIP

JANUARY-FEBRUARY 1986

Vol. 9, No. 3 \$3.50

EDITOR

Vernon C. Grounds

ASSISTANT TO THE EDITOR

William Mangrum

ADVISORY EDITORS

Clark H. Pinnock, McMaster Divinity College

Paul A. Mickey, Duke Divinity School

Mark Lau Branson, Fellowship Bible Institute

ASSOCIATE EDITORS

Ray S. Anderson, *Systematic Theology*
Fuller Theological Seminary

Stephen T. Davis, *Philosophy*
Claremont McKenna College

Donald Dayton, *News Analysis*
Northern Baptist Theological Seminary

Robert L. Hubbard, *Old Testament*
Denver Seminary

Stephen C. Mott, *Ethics*
Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary

Mark Noll, *Church History*
Wheaton College

Grant R. Osborne, *New Testament*
Trinity Evangelical Divinity School

David Lowes Watson, *Evangelism & Missions*
UMC Board of Discipleship

PERSPECTIVES EDITORS

Keith Bolton Fuller Theological Seminary

Luis Cortes Philadelphia Baptist Association

Thomas F. Stransky Mt. Paul Novitiate

Sze-kar Wan Harvard University

FACULTY CONTRIBUTORS

Bernard Adeney New College, Berkeley

Donald Bloesch University of Dubuque Theological Seminary

Geoffrey W. Bromiley Fuller Theological Seminary

Richard Bube Stanford University

Harvie M. Conn Westminster Theological Seminary

Charles Ellenbaum College of DuPage

Vernard Eller University of LaVerne

Elouise Renich Fraser Eastern Baptist Theological Seminary

David Gill New College, Berkeley

Larry Hurtado University of Manitoba

Susanne Johnson Perkins School of Theology

Richard Mouw Fuller Theological Seminary

Richard Lovelace Gordon-Conwell Theological Seminary

PHEME PERKINS Boston College

Bernard Ramm American Baptist Seminary of the West

Gerald Sheppard Union Theological Seminary

Charles R. Taber Emmanuel School of Religion

Keith Yandell University of Wisconsin

Introducing This Issue

Vernon Grounds

2

Christian Leadership: An Interview With Gordon MacDonald

3

The Resurrection of Jesus as Hermeneutical Criterion (Part I)

Ray Anderson

9

Love as a Moral Norm: The Ethical Thought of E.J. Carnell

Kenneth W.M. Wozniak

15

Donald Bloesch on the Trinity: Right Battle, Wrong Battle Lines

Thomas Finger

18

CONFERENCES: Black Christian Consultation

22

Wheaton Philosophy Conference

26

REVIEW ESSAYS: Pinnock's Major Work on the Doctrine of Scripture

Donald McKim

26

A Critique of Carl Henry's Summa

Alan Padgett

28

Erickson's Three-Volume Magnum Opus

Clark H. Pinnock

29

Book Reviews and Comments

(Itemized on Back Cover)

30

TSF Materials Order Form

(center pages)

Introduction to "Black North American Perspective"

by Jeffrey Gros

For many Christians, the full witness of the incarnation of Jesus Christ is incomplete when the biblical doctrine of the church is not realized. As they look closely at the Acts of the Apostles and Paul's letters (especially First Corinthians), many Christians feel the divisions of denominationalism and sectarianism are an affront to the biblical faith.

For seventy-five years, Christians with this evangelical conviction have been in dialogue with one another through the Faith and Order movement. When the World Council of Churches was formed in 1948, this movement of evangelical Christians joined in that Council to foster biblical and historical studies so that a common understanding of the mission of the church and the relationships of Christians could be found.

Through careful biblical and historical research and dia-

logue among evangelical, Catholic and Orthodox Christians, the World Council of Churches has proposed a vision of the unity of the church grounded in the Bible:

through their visible communion to let the healing and uniting power of these gifts become more evident amid the visions of humankind.

3) The churches would agree on common ways of decision making and ways of teaching authoritatively, and be able to demonstrate qualities of communion, participation and corporate responsibility which could shed healing light in a world of conflict.

The Faith and Order Commission of the World Council has presented a document, *Baptism, Eucharist and Ministry* (Lima 1982), to help the churches explore the second of these three marks of the biblical doctrine of the church. At the present time, study is underway on the first of these marks: a common understanding of the biblical faith handed down from the apostles and confessed in the churches in

For many Christians, the full witness of the incarnation of Jesus Christ is incomplete when the biblical doctrine of the church is not realized.

logue among evangelical, Catholic and Orthodox Christians, the World Council of Churches has proposed a vision of the unity of the church grounded in the Bible:

We believe that the unity which is both God's will and his gift to his Church is being made visible as all in each place who are baptized into Jesus Christ and confess him as Lord and Saviour are brought by the Holy Spirit into one fully committed fellowship, holding the one apostolic faith, preaching the one Gospel, breaking the one bread, joining in common prayer, and having a corporate life reaching out in witness and service to all who at the same time are united with the whole Christian fellowship in all places and all ages in such wise that ministry and members are accepted by all, and that all can act and speak together as occasion requires for the tasks to which God calls his people. (New Delhi, 1961).

In the Upsalla Assembly (1968) the World Council proposed to Christians the vision of the churches in Acts 15, a genuinely ecumenical council, as the hoped-for unity of the church. This vision of Conciliar Fellowship was elaborated on at the Nairobi Assembly (1975), and three basic marks of this biblical doctrine of the church were held out at the Vancouver Assembly (1983):

- 1) The churches would share a common understanding of the Apostolic Faith, and be able to confess this message together in ways understandable, reconciling and liberating to their contemporaries. Living this Apostolic Faith together, the churches would help the world to realize God's design for creation.
- 2) Confessing the Apostolic Faith together, the churches would share a full mutual recognition of baptism, the eucharist and ministry, and be able

worship, creed and life. Drawing on the early confessions of the faith, particularly that promulgated at Constantinople in 381, this study will focus on a common expression of the biblical faith of the apostles today. This early creed, commonly called the Nicene Creed, is a profession of faith in the trinity and in the incarnation, often part of the worship of the majority of Christians each Sunday morning.

However, there are many churches with deep evangelical convictions, who do not deny the trinity or the incarnation of Jesus Christ, or for that matter any article of the Nicene Creed, but who do not share this particular expression of faith in their ordinary worship and confessional life. For this reason, the World Council is proposing a study not only of the creed as a testimony to the faith of the apostles, but of those churches whose contemporary and historical modes of confessing the faith differ from this classical creed. Among these faithful evangelical Christians in the U.S. context are the historic black Baptists, Methodists and Pentecostal churches.

In preparation for a World Council of Churches Commission on Faith and Order meeting in Stavanger, Norway in August, 1985, the National Council of Churches of Christ in the United States sponsored a consultation in Richmond, Virginia in December 1984, in order that the Black churches might relate to this very important Christian dialogue about the biblical faith. The text of this report follows and was presented to the World Council Commission along with consultations from other parts of the world, focussing on the common basis for confessing Jesus Christ today. The study does not intend to be a full blown treatment of the faith of the Black churches, but rather a testimony to unique elements which the Black churches hope will be included in the common explication of this biblical faith in our times. It is a witness to the vitality and the spiritual integrity of the Black churches on the one hand, and a challenge to the orthodox Christian to see that the implications of doctrinal fidelity are often costly in real human life.

Brother Jeffrey Gros, FSC, is Director of the Commission on Faith & Order, National Council of the Churches of Christ in the USA.

Toward a Common Expression of Faith: A Black North American Perspective

Introduction

A special consultation on one common expression of the Apostolic faith from the perspective of Black Christians in the U.S. brought together representatives of several Black denominations at Virginia Union University in Richmond, Virginia, December 14-15, 1984. The consultation included representatives of the Black constituencies of several predominantly White denominations. In some cases the participants were delegated by denominational administrative headquarters; others were representatives of their communions without official appointment. Therefore, the content of this document stands upon the authority of the consultation alone and does not purport to convey the agreements of an ecclesiastical council of Black churches.

This document, moreover, does not pretend to be an exhaustive response to the Apostolic Faith Study or a formal statement of the major themes of the Black theology movement that has evolved in North America in recent years. The Richmond Consultation, sponsored by the Commission on Faith and Order of the National Council of Churches in the U.S.A., attempted to convey to the World Council of Churches and to other interested organizations what we, a group of Black theologians and church leaders from across the United States perceive as a general consensus among us concerning a common expression of the faith of the One, Holy, Catholic and Apostolic Church. In the several working papers we discussed and in this report we seek to add to the worldwide ecumenical study of a common expression of Apostolic Faith the distinctive perceptions and insights that come out of the historic experience of Black Christians in North America.

As Black academics, denominational officials, pastors and lay leaders, we speak out of more than two hundred years of suffering and struggle as "the step-children of church history" who have been ridiculed, ignored and scorned by the White churches of both Europe and North America. The truth of the gospel among our people, that some have sought to suppress or disregard, burns like fire in our bones. In any discussion of one common expression of faith we have no alternative other than to make certain clear affirmations to those churches that directly or indirectly participated in and benefited from the rape of Africa that resulted in the exploitation and oppression of an African Diaspora wherever Black people are found.

We speak, however, from our own particular locus in the so-called First World, where we are less than twelve percent of the population of what is the richest and most powerful nation in the world. But inasmuch as our churches and people have never truly shared that wealth and power, we speak as a marginated Black community with a unique understanding of White racism and with strong affinities with the so-called Third World.

In this document, from an historic consultation in Richmond, Virginia, we make bold to declare that God, our Creator, has condescended through Jesus Christ, our Liberator, by the power of the Holy Spirit, our Advocate and Comforter, to convey, preserve and enhance the faith of the Apostles among the despised and alienated African American people of the United States. We commend to all who may be concerned the fruit of our prayerful reflection on the themes of the Unity, Holiness, Catholicity and Apostolicity of the Church of Jesus Christ as we join with you in search of a common

expression of the faith.

I. UNITY

We affirm that the unity of the Church not only expresses the unity of the Triune God, but is also a sign of the unity of humankind that holds the diversity of all races and cultures together in one family. In the economy of God, each "tribe", each ethnic group and culture, has its own vocation to bring its gift to the full household of faith. Notwithstanding the effort of some White Christians to disdain the contribution of Black folk to the faith and to its impact upon the institutions of the American Church and society, we declare that the meaning of Blackness as cultural and religious experience edifies and enriches the universal message of the Christian faith. Blackness, in the religions of the African Diaspora, is a profound and complex symbol of a diversified yet united experience: servitude and oppression, faithfulness through suffering, identification with the exclusion, martyrdom and exaltation of Jesus as the Oppressed One of God who triumphs over enemies, a passion for justice and liberation, the exuberance of Black faith and life, rejoicing in the Risen Lord in Pentecostal fervor and in service to the "least" of Christ's brothers and sisters.

White Christians have too often treated unity as if it were only a spiritual reality. We believe that unity must not be spiritualized, but manifested in concrete behavior, by doing justice and loving service to one another. The cost of unity in the Church is repentance and affirmative discipleship (i.e., action). Therefore, we have a profound hermeneutical suspicion about any movement for unity that is dominated by North Atlantic attitudes and assumptions. We have observed that when our White brothers and sisters speak of unity, they often mean being together on terms that carefully maintain their political, economic and cultural hegemony. Unity is frequently confused with "Anglo-conformity"—strict adherence to premises and perspectives based upon the worldview and ethos of the North Atlantic community with its history of racial oppression. However, Christian unity is based on the worship of a common Creator who is no respecter of persons, obedience to a common lawgiver and Judge whose commandment to break every yoke is not abrogated by the gracious justification of sinners, and upon participation in the earthly mission of a common Redeemer, the sharing of whose suffering and ordeal makes us truly one, though of many races and cultures.

Blackness is one of God's gifts for the realization of the unity of the Church and humankind at this critical stage of history. It has been preserved by God as a cultural and religious inheritance of the Black churches of Africa, the Caribbean, and North and South America since the mission of the Ethiopian eunuch to the upper Nile Valley after his baptism by the Evangelist. It is rooted in the divine revelation to our African ancestors who lived before the Christian era. It has traditionally celebrated the goodness of the Almighty Sovereign God and the goodness of creation. It has emphasized the humanity of the historical Jesus, i.e., his earthly life, example, teaching, suffering, death and resurrection. It confesses belief in the humanity of Jesus together with the oneness with God, the Creator, and the Holy Spirit, but understands that humanity in non-sexist terms rather than being exclusively of the male gender. It identifies with the shadow of death that

falls upon the Cross as a symbol of suffering and shame, yet crowned with light inexpressible in the victory of the resurrection.

Thus, the meaning of unity is related to the meaning of Blackness for the Afro-American Church and points to its vocation as a church of the poor and oppressed who claim liberation in the Black Messiah of God and want to share the humanizing experience of suffering and joy in struggle with others who want to work for a world of justice and equality for all. Unity is possible only when there is acceptance of suffering under Christ's work of liberation and when there is commitment to his mission.

II. HOLINESS

The Black churches of North America made a unique contribution to the Holiness and Pentecostal movements of world Christianity at the beginning of this century. The Black Pentecostal obsession with the text of Hebrews 12:14: "strive. . . for the holiness without which no one will see the Lord" (RSV), and Black leadership of the interracial Azusa Street Revival of 1906-1908 in Los Angeles, created the groundwork for modern Pentecostalism—the most remarkable religious movement among the oppressed communities of the world since the Awakenings of the 18th and 19th centuries. Although most African American churches did not originate from Pentecostalism or the Azusa Street Revival, most of them have been influenced by the Pentecostal emphasis upon the *ruach/pneuma* of God in their conception of the Person and Work of the Holy Ghost. Their understanding of holiness as a process of moral perfection is rooted in the necessity of a personal encounter with God that is manifested in both the ecstasy of congregational worship and the praxis of social justice.

Afro-American spirituality has to do with self-transcendence and is unembarrassed by displays of sincere emotion, but it is also related to faith and action in the world. The Holy Spirit moves, therefore, in the real world of everyday life, in the sanctuary and the realm of secular affairs. The Holy Spirit is not an abstraction of Trinitarian theology but participates dynamically in what it means to be a human being and to suffer and struggle with the assurance of victory in this world as in the world to come. The distinctiveness of the Black religious experience is that theology is experienced before it is thought. Moreover, holiness in the paradoxical sense of transcendence and existential involvement in the world, must accompany the act of "doing theology". Holiness is a criterion of the Church's theological authenticity. It creates a theology that is "hummed, sung and shouted" in Black churches, and contrary to White fundamentalism, has more to do with how Christians treat one another than how strictly they hold to Biblical literalism or ascetic life styles.

On the other hand, holiness in the Black Church is not coterminous, as in some expressions of White liberalism, with frenetic social activism. Personal encounter with God as a prerequisite of sanctification and commitment to social transformation are both necessary, but the obligation to "give glory to God," and to "glorify the holiness of God" is an essential corollary of the obligation to be engaged in "building the Kingdom" that continues to be frustrated by racism and oppression. The Black Church is sustained by prayer and praise. It exists in and for the glory of God and not the glorification of human institutions. We know that to struggle in the midst of the world is to experience the glory of God that is thwarted by racism and oppression, but we also know that we need to praise God in the sanctuary in order to struggle! One of our Spirituals has the refrain: "Have you got good religion?" The response is, "Certainly, certainly, certainly, Lord!" Good religion is, there-

fore, understood to make worldly things that were formerly dubious better, and *bad* religion ruins the best of all possible worlds where there is no acknowledgement of God's presence. Without holiness no one shall see the Lord.

Ultimately, the holiness of the Church is a work of the Holy Spirit. We affirm that the One, Holy Church cannot exist apart from ministries of justice and liberation. We also affirm that true liberation is inseparable from deep spirituality. The intimate involvement of Christians with the Holy Spirit is expressed first in worship that celebrates the manifest presence, goodness and glory of God and moves from the sanctuary to the streets where it empowers the world to goodness, transfigures its wretchedness and need, and creates the quality of life that is symbolized by the nimbus that encircles the throne of God.

III. CATHOLICITY

Although Afro-American Christians have customarily been denied equal partnership in the *koinonia* of Christ, we nevertheless affirm the universality of the Christian faith. Universality in the Black religious experience has to do with the particular reality of people in concrete situations that are dissimilar but inseparable. Afro-American churches share with all who confess Jesus Christ the conviction of the universality of God's love "from each to all in every place. . .". We recognize solidarity in creation, sin and redemption with all human beings and seek with them to make catholicity visible by overcoming humanly erected barriers between people.

We deplore the fact that the profession of universality has actually meant that the norms of what is considered acceptable to the Church had to originate in the West. For years anything that White Christians in Europe and North America did not interpret as catholic lay outside the realm of true faith and proper order. Such assumptions distorted the truth about Jesus Christ and permitted the gospel to be used to divide people rather than free them to express the fullness of the faith in their own cultural styles and traditions. It also robbed the White churches of the opportunity to correct their own deficiencies.

In the late 18th and early 19th centuries, Black preachers were refused ordination and their congregations were not considered in good order. Not until rebellious White Methodist and separatist Baptist clergy defied custom and accepted them as duly constituted ministers and churches did Black Christianity become legitimate in the eyes of Whites. To this day Black churches have protested any semblance of alienation or exclusion on account of race, class or discriminatory educational qualifications. Unfortunately the struggle for sexual equality has lagged behind in many Black churches and Black women need greater support in their resistance to subordination.

From the perspective of the Richmond consultation, catholicity has to do with faith in Jesus Christ, baptism, and continuing in "the apostles' teaching and fellowship" and in "the breaking of bread and the prayers" (Acts 2:42). No person, group or institution that meets these requirements should be excluded from the visible Church or relegated to an inferior status by human authority, ecclesiastical or secular. The sin of racism, sexism and classism that refuses or discourages the fellowship of African Independent church or Black Holiness and Pentecostal denominations, among others in various parts of the world, must be repudiated as denying the catholicity of the Body of Christ.

Catholicity, in our view, also demands a persistent critique of and challenge to the economic and political status quo; for those churches that benefit from the existing international or-

der too easily assume its normative character and become self-appointed guardians of what is supposedly good for all. Thus, many North American conservatives and fundamentalists speak of American democracy as "Christian" and oppose Christian socialists as irregular at best and heretical at worst.

Similarly, the "Moral Majority" in the U.S. supports "constructive engagement" with apartheid in South Africa as consistent with universal reason and the welfare of "all people of good will". In this view anti-communism becomes the test of universal Christian ethics and those who do not fall into line are considered sectarian, ignorant and contrary to the mainstream White American tradition which is regarded as the universal faith of the Church.

Jesus Christ challenged the assumption that faith in God or salvation was limited to the scribes and the Pharisees, or the rich and powerful. Instead he empowered sinners, the poor, strangers and women. His demonstration of catholicity was to open his arms to all who would be saved. His Church today can do no more or less.

IV. APOSTOLICITY

We affirm the Apostolic tradition that recognizes the transmission of authentic faith down the centuries by all those who have faithfully lived it, whether or not they have been officially designated as apostles. We believe that "What does not teach Christ is not Apostolic, even if it was taught by Peter or Paul; again what preaches Christ, this is Apostolic, even when preached by Judas, Annas, Pilate and Herod." We recognize, therefore, the apostolicity of what we have received from our slave ancestors who, though "unlearned and ignorant" men and women, reinterpreted the distorted Christianity they received from the slavemasters and passed down to succeeding generations of Black believers the story of Jesus who was "the strong Deliverer", "the rose of Sharon, the bright and morning star," "the king who rides on a milk-white horse," "the dying lamb," "the Lord who's done just what he said", "the Balm in Gilead," and "the help of the poor and needy, in this lan' . . ." But we acknowledge the importance of the Apostolic tradition being engaged and not merely passed on. Apostolicity must be lived out in the context of contemporary events. It is not the recitation of past formulations, but the living of the present commandments of the Risen Lord.

In the final analysis the test of apostolicity is the experiencing of the life, death and resurrection of Jesus Christ in our daily struggle against demonic powers that seek to rob us of our inheritance as children of God redeemed by the blood of Jesus Christ. Our deeds, more than our creeds, determine whether we have fully received and acted upon the faith of the apostles.

Jesus said, "If you continue in my word, you are truly my disciples, and you will know the truth, and the truth will make you free" (John 8:31, 32). Afro-American Christians look to the words and acts of the Jesus of history for the Apostolic teaching as well as to the mystery of the Christ of faith. We take seriously the life, ministry and teaching of Jesus as the One who identified with the margined of society and continues to identify with them. It is in the Black Church's historic identification with marginality that Jesus is appropriated as the Black Messiah, the paradigm of our existential reality as an oppressed people and the affirmation of our survival and liberation.

Finally, for Black Christians, the search for an expression of the Apostolic faith must be multi-racial and multi-cultural rather than captive to any one race, sex, class or political ideology. The Church and the ecumenical movement must no longer submit to domination by social, economic or intellectual

elites. The faith once delivered to the apostles by Jesus Christ is for the whole world and must be capable of being transmitted and responded to by all.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The Afro-American Christian tradition, embodied particularly in Black Baptist, Methodist and Pentecostal Churches, but continuing also in other Black-led Protestant and Roman Catholic congregations, has been and continues to be an indigenous expression of the faith of the apostles in North America.

2. The Richmond Consultation affirms the World Council of Churches study "Towards the Common Expression of the Apostolic Faith Today" and is committed to work with the WCC and other ecumenical bodies toward the unity we seek.

3. We invite the other churches participating in the Faith and Order movement to give greater study and recognition to how God has maintained the continuity of the Apostolic Faith primarily through the oral character and noncreedal styles of the African American tradition expressed in worship, witness and social struggle.

4. We urge the other member churches of the National and World Council Commissions on Faith and Order to take note of the unity of faith and practice that the Black Church has historically emphasized and to engage the Faith and Order movement in greater involvement in the struggle against racism and all forms of oppression as an essential element of the Apostolic confession.

5. We call upon Black churches in North and South America, the Caribbean and in Africa to confess boldly the faith we received from the Apostles, despite every effort made to distort and falsify it, and joining with us who were a part of this historic consultation in Richmond, to intensify their involvement in the Faith and Order movement by sharing the "gift of Blackness" with those of other traditions.

6. Finally, we urge that this report be published and widely disseminated by the Commission on Faith and Order of the WCC as a study document and that Black Christians all over the world be encouraged to initiate interracial discussion groups for the consideration of its content and implications for the ecumenical movement; and that the result of such dissemination and discussion be reported back to the Commission on Faith and Order by cooperating national councils.

Co-Chairs of the Consultation: David Shannon and Gayraud Wilmore.

Participants: Vinton Anderson, John Brandon, Oree Broomfield, Herbert Edwards, Willie Dell, Jacqueline Grant, Vincent Harris, Thomas Hoyt, Donald Jacobs, Miles Jones, John Kinney, Craig Lewis, Leonard Lovett, Fred Massey, Deborah McGill-Jackson, Pearl McNeil, Henry Mitchell, Ella Mitchell, C.J. Malloy, Albert Pero, Channing Phillips, Herbert Plummer, James DeOtis Roberts, Cornish Rogers, A.M. Spaulding, Olivia Stokes, Darius Swann, Robert Taylor, Richard Thompson, John Satterwhite. Commission on Faith and Order: Jeffrey Gros and William Rusch.

Full Documentation and related papers: *Midstream*, Volume XXIV, No. 4, October, 1985. Order from The Council on Christian Unity, Christian Church (Disciples of Christ), P.O. Box 1986, Indianapolis, IN 46206; Cost \$4.50, Single Issue. Cornish Rogers, "The Gift of Blackness", (*Christian Century*, June 5-12, 1985) Gayraud S. Wilmore, "The Disturbing Ecumenism of the Black Church in America", (*Ecumenical Trends*, Vol. 14 No. 8, September 1985).