

THE JOURNAL
of the
UNITED REFORMED CHURCH HISTORY SOCIETY

(incorporating the Congregational Historical Society,
founded in 1899, and the Presbyterian Historical
Society of England founded in 1913).

EDITOR: Dr. CLYDE BINFIELD, M.A., F.S.A.

Volume 4 No. 7 October 1990

CONTENTS

Editorial	xxx
Continuity and Controversy: Before and After Calvin and Sadoletto by <i>R. Buick Knox, B.A., B.D., Ph.D., D.D.</i>	xxx
The Passing Show of A.G. Matthews by <i>Alan Argent, B.Sc., M.Th, Ph.D.</i>	xxx
Leslie Weatherhead: Preacher and Pastor, 1893-1976 by <i>John Travell, B.D., M.Th.</i>	xxx
Reviews by <i>Alan P.F. Sell, Keith M. Brown, J.H.Y. Briggs, John H. Taylor, Clyde Binfield, Stephen Mayor</i>	xxx

EDITORIAL

From this issue the Journal will have a *Review Editor*. He is Dr. David Cornick and all correspondence about reviews should be directed to him at 38 Baker's Close, Bishop's Hull, Taunton, TA1 5HD.

Two of our contributors are new to the Journal. John Travell is a Congregational Minister, now living in Dorchester, who has ministered at Penge and Christ Church and Upton Chapel and whose Christian formation has owed most to Leslie Weatherhead's ministry at the City Temple. Keith Brown is a Baptist who is at the University of St. Andrew's.

Two of our papers - those by R. Buick Knox and John Travell - have been delivered to meetings of the Society at Hengrave Hall and Mansfield College.

Leslie Weatherhead and A.G. Matthews represent two poles of ministry in Congregational churches, types of that catholicity encompassed by R. Buick Knox in "Continuity and Controversy".

CONTINUITY AND CONTROVERSY: BEFORE AND AFTER CALVIN AND SADOLETO

John Calvin claimed that the only sound basis for the reform of the Church was a restoration of the faith and order prescribed in the New Testament. Yet he was well aware that in the centuries between himself and the New Testament times the Church had survived persecutions, preserved its Scriptures, defined its doctrines and developed its forms of teaching and worship. He also knew that he was indebted to that legacy and could not ignore it. He admired the martyrs, studied the Scriptures, accepted the doctrinal definitions hammered out in the controversies in the early Church, quoted its teachers with respect, and prepared orders of service for use in the observance of the Lord's Supper. These orders showed parallels to the order of the Mass. There could be no simple return to what was done in the time of the Apostles; he said arrangements had to be made to "meet the circumstances of the times".¹ The continuity and change from early times was inescapable.

When Luther had issued his call for reform he too drew upon the heritage of the centuries and he was a master in the use of Latin which had been the means of transmitting that heritage but he broadened his appeal by a vivid use of his Saxon language. His call was met by rejection and excommunication. He had hoped for a reform within the Church but he was driven to lead a programme of reform outside the old framework. He never doubted that this reformed Church was part of the true catholic Church but he also recognized the common ground he shared with the old Church and the debt he owed to it. When Anabaptist movements arose and demanded a drastic severance from all of the developments since New Testament times Luther was unusually strident in his affirmation of the links with the Church of Rome:

We confess there is much that is Christian and good under the papacy; indeed, everything that is Christian and good is to be found there and has come to us from this source. We confess that in the papal Church there are the true holy Scriptures, true baptism, the true sacrament of the altar, the true keys to the forgiveness of sins, the true office of the ministry, the true catechism in the form of the Lord's Prayer, the Ten Commandments, and the articles of the Creed... I contend that in the papacy there is true Christianity, even the right kind of Christianity, and many great and devoted saints.²

This appreciation did not silence his criticism of the papal Church or moderate his attacks upon its moral decay and upon what he held to be its unscriptural

-
1. J. Calvin, Reply to Sadoleto, *Calvin's Theological Treatises*, Library of Christian Classics, XXII, 232; see also Letter to Protector Somerset in *Letters of John Calvin*, Banner of Truth, 1980, 99.
 2. M. Luther, *Works*, American Ed., Vol. 40, 231-32.

teachings, and it did not weaken his loyalty to the cause of reform.

Calvin, like Luther, disowned any intention to divide the Church. His aim was reform and it grieved him when he saw the reform in Germany leading to civil war between one League of princes and cities supporting Luther and another League loyal to the papacy. He saw this as a deplorable opportunity for the Islamic Turks to encroach further into Europe, and this was a menace of a different kind from the row between papal and protestant leagues. He said he always sought for the unity of the Church for which Christ prayed but this could only be sustained provided God's truth was made "the bond of concord".³ He had no wish to "rush into dissent on slight grounds" but he was sure of "the truth of our doctrine" and of his commission to stand by it even if it meant the splitting of the Church.⁴ His mastery of the issues at stake made him a formidable leader of reform in Geneva. Though not a citizen of the city he prepared a plan for the reform of its church life and this was intended to cover all citizens and to give the ministers a decisive voice in disciplining the people. His assurance about what the Bible taught and what the life of the city should be was too much for the turbulent citizens to accept and was also frowned upon by Berne which had a strong influence in Geneva. So, three hundred and fifty years ago, Calvin was expelled from Geneva and from 1538 to 1541 he ministered to a congregation of French exiles in Strasbourg.

The rift between Calvin and the city of Geneva seemed to be an opportunity for Cardinal Jacopo Sadoletto, the bishop of Carpentras, to issue an appeal to the city to return to the papal fold. Sadoletto was a man of great erudition. He had entered the service of Leo X, the Medici who was pope at the time when Luther issued his challenging theses. Sadoletto had a part in drafting the various papal documents denouncing Luther and in 1517 he became bishop of Carpentras. He grasped the point of Luther's attack upon the corruptions of the Church and he was eager to reform his own diocese. However, his skill as a scholar and diplomat led to frequent calls to return to Rome and in 1536 he was made a cardinal. His closer contacts with the corridors of power increased his conviction that there was need for a cleansing of the life of the Curia, the bishops and the clergy, and also for a healing of the divisions caused by the reform movements in northern Europe. He too regarded these divisions as a deplorable weakening of resistance to the Turkish menace. He was at Carpentras in 1539 when he heard of the rift in Geneva and though it was over one hundred and fifty miles away he felt he had a duty to practise his policy of conciliation.⁵

In his appeal to Geneva he admitted the need for reform, but he attacked Calvin's policy and asserted that the Church of Rome was the custodian of the truth of the Gospel and that therefore Geneva must return to the fold.⁶ He failed

3. J. Calvin, Reply to Sadoletto, *op. cit.*, 248-49.

4. *Ibid.*

5. R.M. Douglas, *Jacopo Sadoletto, 1477-1547*, Harvard, 1959.

6. J. Sadoletto, Letter to the city of Geneva, in J.C. Olin, *A Reformation Debate*, N.Y. 1966; *Calvini Opera* V, 385-416.

to grasp the intensity of the revolt against the old order and the extent to which Calvin had awakened among the people of Geneva a desire to get to the heart of the Christian faith. The Council in Geneva made several attempts to find someone competent to reply to Sadoletto but it soon realized the outstanding gifts of the exiled Calvin and it sent the letter to him and asked him to reply. Sadoletto's appeal had thus the opposite effect to what he intended and it made even clearer the wide gap which had opened up in Europe. This was the outcome of several of his attempts at conciliation. Contarini, a distinguished cardinal and also an advocate of reform, gave him the sad but salutary advice that he should cease his efforts, since such approaches, "however pious and irreprehensible", would always be misunderstood.⁷

Calvin took the appeal seriously and in six days in August 1539 he wrote one of his finest pronouncements. He began by paying tribute to Sadoletto's learning and said he was one of the few who were revered by "students of the liberal arts". It was with reluctance that Calvin entered into controversy with one who "deserved so well of literature" and was worthy of "love and honour".⁸ Calvin agreed with Sadoletto that eternal life with God is the incomparable goal of human life and that this can be missed through "a perverse worship of God", but he challenged the claim that the only way to lay hold upon salvation is through obedience to the pope and the Church of Rome. Indeed, says Calvin, it is within the papal system that true doctrine has been set aside and the true discipline has well-nigh broken down so that only vestiges of the true Church are to be seen. Calvin said there were indeed vestiges and that he did not deny that "those over whom you preside are churches of Christ"; "the faithful soul is never so destitute as not to have a straight course to salvation".⁹

Calvin then defined the Church as "the society of all the saints spread over the whole world and existing in all ages and yet bound together by the doctrine of the one Spirit of Christ". This is the mother Church in which Calvin and his supporters wished to remain and he was sure that "our agreement with antiquity is far closer than yours" and that it was a travesty to say that the reform had torn up what had been held by all the faithful for fifteen hundred years. Rather, the true Church had been "distorted and stained by illiterate men of indifferent character and almost destroyed by the Roman pontiff and his faction". Study of the Scriptures had been deadened by the sophistry of the Schools and preaching had degenerated into "not unamusing speculations".¹⁰

Instead of building up confidence in the divine mercy there had been introduced the practice of auricular confession which nourished "a perpetual anxiety".¹¹ Instead of rejoicing that the saints in heaven continually pray for the completion of Christ's kingdom, innumerable superstitions had grown around

7. R.M. Douglas, *op. cit.*, 150.

8. Reply, *op. cit.*, 221-22.

9. *Ibid.*, 241-44.

10. *Ibid.*, 231-33.

11. *Ibid.*, 239.

the practice of invoking the saints.¹² Instead of grasping the mystery of the presence of Christ in the Lord's Supper, people had been taught to "gaze stupidly at the visible sign".¹³ Instead of being a biblical ministry, the system of bishops and priests had become a parade of "dumb statues, active only in robbery".¹⁴

Calvin drew his reply to a conclusion with a confident assertion of "the truth of our doctrine" which he was ready to defend before the tribunal of God. He was sure he was entrusted with "the torch of Thy Word" and he has sought to carry this through the Church to "recall them to their posts". In a final plea to the defenders of the Church of Rome he asked them to consider with "what fidelity they fed the Christian people". He still regarded them as Christian people.¹⁵

Calvin made his reply. In 1541 Geneva summoned him back to consolidate the reform and for the next ten years he laboured in the face of opposition from patrician families, from turbulent mobs and from provocative critics to shape the life of the city and its church. He was tireless in preaching, teaching, counselling and writing, and even after the opposition had been routed in 1551 he continued his labours until his death in 1564 at the age of fifty-five. He left his mark not only in Geneva but also upon Reformed Churches from Scotland to Italy and eventually in a world-wide family of Reformed Churches wherein there are elements of his theology and his plans for the order of the Church.

In reaction to this movement of reform the Church of Rome began to put its house in order. This was the remit for the Council of Trent which met in 1545. Like Calvin, the Council knew that the important issues were more than corruptions, serious as these were, but were matters of doctrine. Therefore, while the Council made decisions aimed at clearing up the worst abuses, its main efforts were devoted to the definition of doctrines and in almost every instance the definitions were such as to widen the gulf between the Church of Rome and the Churches of the Reformation. The status of Tradition as an authoritative source of doctrine alongside Scripture, the teaching authority of the Church and of the pope, and the teachings around the seven Sacraments were reaffirmed and declared to have been ordained from apostolic times and to be permanent in the life of the Church.¹⁶ The following centuries saw the promulgation of the doctrines of papal infallibility, of the immaculate conception of the Blessed Virgin Mary and of her bodily assumption into heaven. These further widened the gulf. The declaration of the nullity of Anglican ministerial orders in 1896 and, of course, the assumed nullity of the ministry in non-episcopal Churches sustained the rift. Frequent papal claims for the exclusive papal magisterium,

12. *Ibid.*, 239, 247.

13. *Ibid.*, 238.

14. *Ibid.*, 240-43.

15. *Ibid.*, 248-253.

16. H. Jedin, *Crisis and Closure of the Council of Trent*, 1967; A.G. Dickens, *The Counter Reformation*, London, 1968.

notably by Pius XII (1939-58), and the discouragement of any sharing in prayer with those outside the Roman Catholic Church prevented any rapprochement until recent times.¹⁷

However, Pius XII did countenance the wider study of the Bible by Roman Catholic scholars and, while defending the normative position of the Vulgate text, he made room for textual and critical input from the study of the original languages and for issues arising from the history of the canon and the interpretation of Scripture. This brought Roman Catholic scholars into touch with other biblical scholars and led to a fresh realization of the Bible as the basic and authoritative tradition from which the Church's teaching needs to be drawn. This paved the way for the Second Vatican Council summoned by John XXIII. This led to contacts between the Church of Rome and various confessional families, Orthodox, Anglican, Methodist and Reformed. Out of these meetings came a number of reports dealing with the present state of relations between the Church of Rome and other Churches, the continuing obstacles to accord, the probable misinterpretations of each others positions, and the possible steps to clearer understanding, common worship and practical co-operation.

The dialogue with the World Alliance of Reformed Churches led to the report, *The Presence of Christ in Church and World*, which appeared in 1977.

There is much in this report which merits serious consideration. The Churches in the World Alliance of Reformed Churches recognize that the Church of Rome is a Christian Church and that there is need of a clear understanding of the present relationship between the Reformed and Roman traditions and of the relations which ought to exist between them in the future. The climate of the report is obviously very different from that of the letters of Sadoletto and Calvin. Its aim is to stress the common ground, and it says that in the course of dialogue there came to light "unexpected perspectives of common insights and tasks which have been buried under conflicts lasting for many centuries".¹⁸ The report recognizes that there remain "differences of a substantial nature" but those involved in the dialogue held that their remit was not simply to reflect things as they are but to set a new tone, to show to both traditions what their standards really are and to pave the way for a realization in both traditions of what is central to the Faith.

The report begins from the agreed basis that the fulness of God is embodied in Jesus Christ through whom he has imparted "his unfathomable riches" to his people in all ages. This people, the Church, is in the world as a witness to what God has destined for all people.¹⁹ The Church receives its commission from Christ and is only entitled to preach in his name when it listens to his Word. However, it is here that division has been found. The Church of Rome has claimed that it knows that Word through both the Bible and the

17. D.L. Edwards, *The Futures of Christianity*, London, 1987, 75-86, 394-416.

18. *The Presence of Christ in Church and World*, paragraph 11.

19. *Ibid.*, 13-14.

accumulated tradition of teaching in the Church; the Reformed Churches have claimed that the Scriptures are a self-contained source of truth and yield their teaching through the witness of the Holy Spirit bringing the truth home to believers who diligently read and study them. The Vatican Council took a major step when it stated that the Bible is the basic stratum of the teaching among the Jews and among the early Christians and therefore has a special dignity because in it the apostolic preaching has been given uniquely clear expression.²⁰ The report says the Reformed Churches welcome this trend to give a unique position to the Bible and they themselves have come to see that there is diversity within the Bible and that the conditions of life to-day are different from those of the early Church and therefore the application of the teaching of the Bible requires guidance from past experience as well as through present discernment. The Reformed Churches trust that the Holy Spirit who was at work in the compilation of the Scriptures will enlighten present and future readers to enable them to hear the Word from the Bible.²¹

Further division has arisen over claims for papal infallibility. These claims have led to triumphalist assertions in many papal declarations across the years, but, even in the most sober and tempered definitions and with all prescribed safeguards and qualifications, the teaching of that Church is that when the pope in company with the bishops pronounces on questions concerning faith and morals he announces infallibly the teaching of Christ, and even more so when this is done in the setting of an ecumenical council.²² In the Reformed Churches this claim is rejected; the record of history shows how often Churches and Councils have erred and how often movements of renewal have taken place in the face of official opposition. The limitations of human knowledge and the consequences of human decisions are always prone to margins of error or at least of imperfection, and human pronouncements do not escape this possibility. Reformed Churches have often spoken about the infallibility of Scripture but this has not preserved them from numerous divisions; since there are variations of texts, translations and interpretations, there have been many controversies about how the Scriptures are to be understood and, though some positions are clearly more correct than others, the Rules of Faith in the Reformed Churches leave room for the rights of conscience and for openness to receive light from any quarter.²³

Since God is the "source, guide and goal of all that is" his activity is not confined to the Church. Therefore, while the Church is commissioned to take Christ to the world, the report stresses that the Church must be ready to see his presence which is already in the world. He is there even in "one of the least" to whom is given the cup of cold water as well as in movement of the human spirit which, unaided by the Church and sometimes opposed by the Church,

20. *Ibid.*, 25.

21. *Ibid.*, 26-28; cf. J.McIntyre, *Faith, Theology and Incarnation*, Edin. 1987, 166-68.

22. *The Presence of Christ in Church and World*, 41.

23. *Ibid.*, 42; see, e.g., *The Rule of Faith of the Presbyterian Church in Ireland*.

establishes measures of justice and compassion. The report says the Roman Catholic Church and the Reformed Churches are at one in confessing the duty of Christians to be in the world as a witness to the world of judgement and grace, and to serve Christ in the needy people of the world.²⁴ Sometimes Christians have to live in a country where a hostile government drives them to live segregated and suffering lives. At other times they are often caught up in the imperfect features of their environment and have to make choices which often seem to be the lesser of two evils. The report admits that situations "differ according to country and circumstances" and it adds that the Church will be judged by the way it lives, no matter what it says to the contrary.²⁵ The report holds out the spacious view of the Church not just as an inward-looking people on pilgrimage through a hostile world but as a people witnessing to Christ as Lord of the whole world. That witness depends upon the work of all the members in the diverse fields where they have expertise and opportunity.²⁶ The report realizes that to talk so broadly about the presence of the Church in the world assumes a unity which at present does not exist and there is not yet agreement on what would be necessary for such a unit to exist, but any attainable unity will "not demand uniformity nor the death of pluralism."²⁷

In the life of both the Church of Rome and the Reformed Churches there is the Lord's Supper. The report lays down what the members of the dialogue held to be an agreed starting point: Christ is present at the memorial and fellowship meal but the New Testament does not deal with the question of how this comes about. What is important is his presence and not how he is present; he whose body was broken is present in his risen power among his people. The Lord's Supper is not an event which takes us back into the past but it is an event which lifts us into Christ's presence in the present and up into hope for the future "till he come". "The whole saving work of God has its basis, centre and goal in the person of the glorified Christ"; Christ completed his work here on earth and because of his sacrifice he is "our sole advocate in heaven". Now as then "he accepts sinners and eats with them" and brings them renewal, draws them into unity and sends them out in mission.²⁸

The report ends with the recognition that there are still many open questions and differences which have to be faced and clarified if the Church is to be "a fit instrument for Christ's service in the world".²⁹

The dialogue between the Alliance and the Church of Rome has continued. It was reported at the recent meeting of the General Council of the Alliance in Seoul in South Korea that the conversations had dealt with the theme of the Church and that the findings would soon be published. These, it was stated,

24. *The Presence of Christ in Church and World*, 48, 55-60.

25. *Ibid.*, 60.

26. *Ibid.*, 63.

27. *Ibid.*, 66.

28. *Ibid.*, 67-101.

29. *Ibid.*

“show a surprising degree of agreement in the understanding of Christ’s unique mediatorship but point at the same time to continuing disagreements in the understanding of the Church”. The findings would conclude that despite these disagreements a new relationship has become possible.

The first report was sent out for consideration within both traditions.

The Church of Rome has made no official response to the report. It may be waiting for the full report before making its response. However, the legacy of claims to infallibility makes it difficult for the Church of Rome to change its stance so as to meet the concerns of the Alliance, even if there were a desire to do so. It is possible that some doctrines could fall into disuse without formal renunciation and it is probable that no further doctrines will be defined under the heading of infallibility, but such developments are not yet in evidence. Though the Church of Rome is far from being a totally monolithic body and though its relations with other Churches vary from country to country, there is in all its parts an acknowledgment of papal authority which is far more central than appears in this report and which raises many objections within the Reformed Churches. Even Michael Walsh, the Roman Catholic correspondent of the *Church Times* says he is appalled by what Pope John Paul has done to change the course of the Roman Catholic Church and to reverse the work set in motion by John XXIII. Walsh claims that a new generation of hierarchs is being imposed upon the Church.³⁰ Observers have noted this trend in the recent appointments to the archbishoprics of Cologne and Salzburg where the Pope has appointed men of his own outlook contrary to the hopes of many of the local leaders of the Church. Cardinal Hume has also given a chilling reminder of the claims of the Church of Rome:

I would fail in my duty to unity and to truth if I did not draw attention to that aspect of Catholic teaching which is uncompromising and uncomfortable. Recognition of God’s gift in other Churches in no way diminishes or denies the Catholic Church’s claim to uniqueness. The [Vatican] Council document on ecumenism is at pains to state: ‘The Catholic Church possesses the wealth of the whole of God’s revealed truth and all the means of grace.’ It is unable to concede a similar status to others.³¹

Responses to the report have come from Assemblies and Councils of Reformed Churches and these have ranged from cautious welcome through queries about some of its points to reservations and objections about others.³² The pacifying and bridge-building survey which is present in the report often seems to many in

30. *Church Times*, July 29, 1988, 5.

31. Basil Hume, *Towards a Civilization of Love*, London, 1988, quoted in *Church Times*, December 30, 1988, 7.

32. *The Reformed World*, 37, 1982, Nos. 1 and 2, 70; see also “The Ecumenical Commitment of the World Alliance of Reformed Churches” in *The Reformed World*, 38, 1985, 263.

the Reformed tradition to be remote from what is taught and practised in their local situations. In particular, the expansive definition of sacramental doctrine set forth in the report goes beyond their own belief and practice where the emphasis is upon the memorial aspect of the Lord's Supper, though it must be noted that such an emphasis is also far from the teachings of many Reformed Confessions and Catechisms which assert that communicants are, "not after a corporal or carnal manner, but by faith made partakers of his body and blood with all his benefits to their spiritual nourishment and growth in grace."³³ On the other hand, for most of those in the Reformed tradition the reference in the current Roman Catholic Missal to the offering of a sacrifice to God is an alien detraction from the uniqueness of the once-for-all offering of Christ upon the Cross. In the worship of the Reformed Churches the worshippers offer themselves and their worship to God and plead that the merits of Christ's sacrifice may make them acceptable.

Parallel to or following upon the central dialogue between the Reformed Alliance and the Church of Rome, conversations have taken place in some countries between the Reformed Churches and the Roman Catholic Church in those countries, though as yet only a small proportion of Reformed Churches have been involved in such contacts.³⁴ These have led to greater or lesser degrees of understanding, particularly on mixed marriages and baptism which are issues affecting the lives of many members and liable to produce severe tensions. In several areas, misrepresentations and prejudices are reported to have been removed and wide areas of common faith defined. In several agreed statements the trends to greater understanding are said to be "significant" but there is considerable haziness about what it is of which they are "significant". All statements note "remaining differences" which are often assessed as "deep", and the path of dialogues has been and is likely to be rough and difficult.

In Australia there has been growing appreciation of "the rich resources in both traditions", a recognition of the Scriptures which "bear decisive witness to the faith we hold in common", and a mutual acceptance of baptism within both traditions. In France, where the differences lie deep in the history of attempts to eliminate the Protestants by execution and banishment, there has been much emphasis that what unites is far more extensive than what divides and that in a society where so large a population of the people do not adhere to any form of the Christian Church there is need for a common witness, but "notable differences" remain. In Holland, there has been mutual acceptance of baptism and also much emphasis upon what is held in common, but there are areas where it has been impossible to reach a consensus and "there has been a drastic deterioration in the overall ecumenical climate" and in some areas of discussion

33. *The Shorter Catechism*, Answer 96.

34. Lukas Vischer and Andreas Karrer (eds.), *Reformed and Roman Catholic in Dialogue*, W.A.R.C., 1988. This work is summarized in the following paragraphs. A further report of the central dialogue was due in 1988 but it has not yet appeared. See also *Annual Reports, 1988*, of The Presbyterian Church in Ireland.

“nothing concrete has been achieved” and the dialogue seems to have reached a deadlock. In the United States of America, discussions have produced a plethora of verbose papers and it is claimed that unexpected areas of agreement have been discovered and that there may be occasions for sharing in the Communion, but there are still remaining painful differences, and, in spite of euphoric aspirations, there is a recognition of the rough potholes in the way but there is also the claim that this way is “the road toward Christian unity as sisters and brothers of our two traditions”. In Hungary, the Reformed leaders have met the Roman Catholic bishops and the Reformed leaders have said they were glad to see that “the enmity marking our past centuries is being replaced by a brotherly rapprochement and neighbourly love”. In Switzerland, chilly relations have been thawed by a mutual acceptance of baptism and by regulations concerning mixed marriages which are now almost two-thirds of all marriages in the country; under these regulations there are situations where married people both attend the Communion alternately in the two traditions but this has aroused some Roman Catholic criticism on the ground that attendance at a Protestant service is not regarded as a fulfilment of a Roman Catholic’s Sunday obligation.

In view of the heavy sufferings of the Waldenses at the hands of the Church of Rome and its Inquisition the Waldensian Church in Italy has shown a remarkable readiness to credit the Vatican Council with seeking for “a Christian Church worthy of its name which is the name of Jesus Christ” but it also sees the catholic-protestant disagreement as the most serious in the twenty centuries of Christian history and “we will consider the papacy, whoever the pope, as an insuperable obstacle on the way for Christian unity”; “the hierarchical and pyramidal concept of the Church seems to us in evident contrast to the directions the Gospel gives to the Church”.

In Scotland, there has been a mutual recognition of the one baptism in both traditions, a statement of *Agreements and Disagreements*, and an agreed report on the doctrine of the Church. In 1986 the General Assembly of the Church of Scotland dissociated itself from the assertions in the *Westminster Confession of Faith* which declared the pope to be “Antichrist, that Man of Sin and Son of Perdition”, and the Mass to be “most abominably injurious to Christ’s one only Sacrifice”.

The Presbyterian Church in Ireland has produced a long and careful statement of the areas of agreement and difference between itself and the Church of Rome and this has been sent to presbyteries for study and comment and will likely after revision be issued for study in the Church. For the Irish Church the tension within the Church of Rome is a constant reality. The tension with that Church, compounded as it is with historical, ethnic, political and economic issues, is part of the cause of the divisions which have produced so much murder and misery across the years and is still a matter of life and death. Perhaps nowhere in the world is an improvement in relations more urgently needed and nowhere so difficult to achieve.

The United Reformed Church has been absorbed in shaping its own life since its formation in 1972 and its relations with the Church of Rome have occurred mainly through its membership of the British Council of Churches which has constant contact with the Church of Rome. There are many contacts at local parish and congregational level but the United Reformed Church has not been involved in separate dialogue with the Church of Rome, and its Doctrine and Worship Committee has not made any response to the report on the conversations between the Reformed Alliance and the Roman Catholic Church. Indeed, few ministers or elders seem to be aware that such a report exists.

Nevertheless, in this world where to-day those adhering to non-Christian religions or to no religion at all far outnumber those professing to be Christian, those who bear the Christian name can scarcely be unaware of how much they share in common and of their continuity with the life of the Church across the centuries. Nor can they be unaware of their duty to live in charity with one another and in hope of the advance of God's purpose in the world. Neither can those in the Reformed tradition be unmindful of what still divides them from the Church of Rome or be unready to witness, even in controversy, to the understanding of the Faith which has been transmitted to them and which they have made their own.

R. BUICK KNOX

THE PASSING SHOW OF A.G. MATTHEWS

The welcome reissuing in 1988 by the Oxford University Press of A.G. Matthews's *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* (first published in 1934 and 1948 respectively) provides an opportunity for reflection on the life and career of this retiring Congregational minister and precise scholar. Indispensable as these two volumes remain, Matthews, with his meticulous scholarship, would have demanded some improvement (with the addition, for example, of cross-references and corrections). By 1963 AGM was regarded as the "most distinguished Congregational historian" of his time, principally because of the achievements revealed in these companion volumes.¹ Although he was obviously "an accomplished historian of seventeenth-century ecclesiastical history" and recognized as an "authority on the life of the clergy in the Commonwealth and Restoration periods" his death in December 1962 was not considered significant enough to warrant an obituary notice in either *The*

1. *The Congregational Year Book 1963-1964* (1964) 436-7, G.F. Nuttall "A.G. Matthews" in *Transactions of the Congregational Historical Society* (May 1963), XIX no. 4, 176-8. Matthews was known as Mat to his intimates and AGM to a wider circle of acquaintances. I should like to thank Drs. G.F. Nuttall and D.T. Jenkins, Mr. W. White, Rev. R. Robinson, Mr. F.H. Lamb, Rev. W. Boyd, Rev. C.B. Nuttall, Mrs. M. Miles, Mrs. E. Coldbreath, and Miss A. Milford for their help in the preparation of this article.

Manchester Guardian or *The Daily Telegraph*. *The Times* and even *The British Weekly* only afforded him brief notices.² Again, the *Dictionary of National Biography* has excluded Matthews from its ranks of the distinguished and successful. Thus Matthews's reserved character and his early retirement from the active ministry rendered him a peripheral figure, by choice removed from involvement in denominational affairs and even, despite his scholarship, from much informed public attention.

AGM was born on 7th August 1881 at East Barnet, the younger son of John Matthews, pastor of the Congregational church at High Barnet. John Matthews had grown up in Devon as a Bible Christian but had trained for the Baptist ministry at Regent's Park College. He was minister at Wokingham near Reading (1873-79) and moved to New Barnet in 1879 where in 1882 he changed his views about baptism. A letter of reference from the New Barnet Baptists speaks of his "fine spirit, high character and superior pulpit efficiency". He became a member of the local Congregational Church whose minister, George Twentyman, introduced him to the neighbouring fellowship at High Barnet which in turn invited him to become co-pastor with its elderly minister, Henry Griffiths. John Matthews remained at High Barnet from 1882 to 1896 where his ministry was attended "with much success" and he displayed "much intellectual and spiritual power". In 1897 he became secretary of the Metropolitan Free Church Council and from 1898 until 1901 he served as pastor at Princes Street Congregational Church, Gravesend. In 1901 failing health caused his early retirement and he died later that year. He was forty-five. John Matthews published *Many Versions But One Bible* (1882), *The Apostle Preacher, Ward Beecher* (1887) and an essay on evolution. He left his wife and sons well provided for, with stocks and shares in English, colonial and foreign railways, banks, land companies, mining and industrial companies, and property in High Barnet, Old Kent Road in south London, and in other places.³ John Matthews, therefore, was an able man although the changes in his religious allegiance indicate a certain instability. Thus AGM was impelled towards a close relationship with his mother to whom he was devoted. His most considerable book, *Calamy Revised*, he dedicated to her. He never married and lived with her until her death in 1943. Mrs. Matthews's influence is evident in the choice of her boys' school - Mill Hill. AGM's maternal uncle, E.M. Skerritt, had attended the same school during the 1860s and had enjoyed a distinguished academic career in medicine, becoming a vice-president of the British Medical Association. Skerritt's family had a house in Wokingham which may be where John Matthews and his bride-to-be, Mary, first met.⁴

2. *The Times*, 11th December 1962; *The British Weekly*, 13th December 1962.

3. *The Congregational Year Book* (1904), 182, Dr. Williams's Library, New College Archives, ms 188/61, *Christianity and Evolution* (1887), ed. F. Hastings and A.F. Muir 129-141. John Matthews's will, probate London, 23rd December 1902 (Somerset House).

4. *The Medical Directory* (1906), 922, E. Hampden-Cook *The Register of Mill Hill School* (1926), 115-6.

AGM followed his brother, Oswald John Matthews, to Mill Hill in 1888 where he was awarded the French and History prizes, played in the first Rugby fifteen, served on the school magazine staff and gained the drawing prize. Indeed his interest in art remained keen throughout his life. He left school in July 1900 with a scholarship to New College, Oxford. He did not do very well in his first university examination, taking a third class in classics in March 1902. After that, however, his work improved. In March 1904 he won a prize for modern history collections (a college examination to test progress) and that summer he was awarded a first class in modern history. From 1904 to 1907 AGM trained for the Congregational ministry at Mansfield College and in 1905 he won the Junior Hall Greek Testament prize, a university prize worth £30. At Oxford he made many lasting friends. AGM's elder brother, Oswald, had left Mill Hill in 1896 with the history prize, and to train as an accountant. AGM was himself later appointed a life-governor of his old school.⁵

AGM's years at New College coincided in part with the post-graduate studies there of Norman H. Baynes. Baynes's father was for more than thirty years general secretary of the Baptist Missionary Society and his grandfather served as a Baptist minister for over forty years in Wellington in Somerset. His mother was also the daughter of a Baptist minister and after his father's death in 1914 Baynes, like AGM, continued to live with his mother until she died in 1935. He too remained a bachelor.⁶

At Oxford Baynes worshipped in Mansfield College Chapel - Mansfield and its neighbour, Manchester, were then the only nonconformist colleges in the city. His path and that of AGM would have crossed there, as well as at New. Baynes showed early promise as a historian in winning the Marquess of Lothian's Prize in 1901 and the Arnold Essay Prize in 1903 with papers on the Emperor Heraclius, and reforms in the armies of Diocletian and Constantine. He practised as a barrister until the First World War during which he decided to devote himself to the "teaching of history", becoming in 1931 Professor of Byzantine History at University College, London. Baynes was not a prolific writer partly because of "his careful, even fastidious, approach to scholarship" and partly because he gave much time to the many personal claims on his energy. AGM's own painstaking approach to scholarship owed much to Baynes, the professional academic, who strove always to instil in researchers "the principles of exact scholarship and of elegant presentation".⁷ Baynes, however, was a gregarious man "with a genius for friendship" and his wide circle of friends included many who looked to him for advice on questions of all kinds. Contrastingly AGM was shy and reserved with few close friends but, like Baynes, valuing those friendships highly. In 1942 on his retirement from

-
5. *Ibid.*, 216-7. New College, Oxford Archives. My thanks are due to Caroline Dalton, the college archivist, for supplying details of AGM's undergraduate years.
 6. J.M. Hussey, "Norman Hepburn Baynes", *Proceedings of the British Academy* (1963), vol. 49, 365-373.
 7. *Ibid.*, 369, 371.

professional academic life Baynes received an appreciative address together with a bibliography of his writings. The list of those paying tribute to him reads like a roll-call of the most distinguished British scholars of their day - Norman Sykes, F.M. Cornford, J.H. Clapham, R.H. Tawney, V.H. Galbraith and C.H. Dodd - yet it also includes significant names for this study. H.C. Carter, T.F. Kinloch, A.G. Matthews, F.M. Powicke and John Whale are there too. Baynes was deservedly praised. "One of the most stimulating things he gave his younger colleagues was the flood of talk about what men were working on from Danzig to Vienna and Rome. It was from him that one heard of Barth and others, not Byzantinists or even historians, but men who were stimulating contemporary thought anywhere within the range of his learning". Thus "he has loved to gather men about him".⁸

AGM's exact contemporary at Mansfield College was Wilton Rix, notable for his long and successful ministry at Ealing Green Congregational Church which he served from 1922 to 1939. Rix came from a long line of nonconformist ministers - Rixes, Wiltons and Parkers - and became well known for his pioneering work for the children of his Ealing church, especially with the building his "Little Church" there.⁹ AGM's friendship with Rix resulted in their holidaying together and with their mutual friend, Kenneth Parry and others. At the opening of Little Church at Ealing in July 1926 AGM was one of the speakers, talking on the subject, "Moods for Prayer".¹⁰ Wilton Rix had previously served churches at Morley in Yorkshire (1907-11), Benson, Oxfordshire (1911-13), and then Oxted, Surrey where he followed Parry in 1913 and was succeeded by AGM in 1922.¹¹

Parry, a slightly younger man, overlapped with Rix and AGM at Mansfield in 1906 and 1907. Leaving Oxford in 1909 he went to his first pastorate in Oxted where he remained until 1913. AGM moved to Oxted's ministry in 1922 and lived in Oxted's congenial atmosphere until his death forty years later. Parry married his first wife, Hope Blakeley, at Oxted, and his sister also settled there, marrying Harry Stewart, an architect and later to be secretary of the Congregational church. Parry served churches also at Lion Walk, Colchester, (1913-21), Chorlton Road, Manchester, (1921-33), and Highbury Chapel, Bristol, (1933-54) after which he retired but remained in membership at Highbury until his death in 1962. Unlike AGM, Parry wielded much influence within the Congregational Union. For many years he served on the Council and Board of Education of Mansfield College, and was also Chairman of the Council of Western College, Bristol, of which he was acting principal from 1939 to 1941. He was Chairman of the Congregational Union in 1942-43, Chairman

8. *An Address Presented to Norman H. Baynes with a Bibliography of his Writings* (Oxford 1942), 21. Baynes left a large number of books on Byzantine history to Dr. Williams's Library, London.

9. *The Congregational Year Book* (1960), 435.

10. J.C.G. Binfield, "Freedom through discipline: the concept of little church" in *Monks, Hermits and the Ascetic Tradition* (Oxford 1985), ed. W.J. Sheils, 438.

11. *The Congregational Year Book*, *op.cit.*

of the Board of Directors of the London Missionary Society in 1941-42, and moderator of the Free Church Federal Council in 1956-7.¹²

Parry's father had been an engineer to the Liverpool Corporation and Parry himself gained a BSc from Liverpool University before going to Mansfield and turning aside from an anticipated "first-class scientific career".¹³ He inherited from his mother (who was the daughter of John Ambrose Lloyd, the Welsh composer) a strong interest in music and he was an authority on hymnology. Parry was chairman of the committee which produced *Congregational Praise* in 1951 while AGM was its editorial secretary. Parry wrote the preface to that volume and edited the *Companion to Congregational Praise* (1953) to which AGM was persuaded by his friend to contribute the first essay. Parry's involvement in contemporary developments led him to become "a passionate advocate of Church Unity, and a prominent member of the British Council of Churches".¹⁴ On Parry's frequent visits to London (in preparation for the publication of *Congregational Praise* and other projects) he would invariably visit his sister's family in Oxted and the group would there be joined by AGM.

AGM's first pastorate was at Tettenhall Wood in Staffordshire where he was formally described as an assistant minister to the Congregational church at Queen Street, Wolverhampton, which maintained an interest in its daughter churches. Matthews's ministry at Tettenhall Wood (1907-22) overlapped with that of another old Millhillian and Mansfield man, Henry Child Carter, six years his senior, and minister of Queen Street from 1901 to 1910 at which later date Carter began his long ministry at Emmanuel Congregational Church, Cambridge, (1910-44). AGM was befriended by Carter whose hospitality and legendary friendship were later to sustain generations of Cambridge students. Carter was an influential figure in denominational affairs. He was chairman of the Congregational Union in 1932-3, displaying then a concern for the smaller Congregational churches with their poorly paid ministers, which contributed in time to the pressure for a Home Churches Fund. Carter was also a keen advocate of the London Missionary Society of which he was chairman in 1917. In addition he served as a trustee of Homerton College from 1912, a governor of Mansfield College from 1916, and of Cheshunt College from 1918. Carter's friendship with AGM manifested itself in AGM's being enlisted to contribute a chapter for the volume commemorating two hundred and fifty years of Cambridge Congregationalism.¹⁵ Carter also was a convinced pacifist and openly described his opposition to the First World War.¹⁶

In addition to Carter, AGM met in Wolverhampton Thomas Fleming

12. *Ibid.*, (1962), 469-470.

13. *The Guardian*, 24th January 1962, obituary.

14. *The Congregational Year Book*, op.cit. For John Ambrose Lloyd (1815-74), see *The Oxford Companion to the Literature of Wales*, (Oxford 1986), ed. M. Stephens, 361.

15. *The Congregational Year Book* (1955), 509-510; *Congregationalism through the Centuries* (Cambridge 1937).

16. J.C.G. Binfield, *So Down to Prayers: Studies in English Nonconformity 1780-1920* (1977), 245.

Kinloch, minister of Merridale Road Presbyterian Church. Kinloch was also one of AGM's travelling companions and spoke fluent French, German and Italian. He was a graduate of Bristol and Glasgow universities and a Fellow of the Royal Economic Society. Kinloch began his ministry in Stockport and moved in 1901 to Wolverhampton where he ministered until 1926. He served the Wolverhampton Education Authority as adviser on religious education in the 1930s and published books on this subject, the historical background to *The Church Hymnary*, and Joseph Hall, the Bishop of Norwich in the mid-seventeenth century, among other topics. The Presbyterian, non-Oxford Kinloch was as much a part of AGM's intimate circle as the others. His *Pioneers of Religious Education* (1939) was published with a foreword by John Whale, the President of Cheshunt College and the son-in-law of H.C. Carter, and his biography of Hall was dedicated to Norman H. Baynes.¹⁷

Significantly the withdrawn A.G. Matthews found himself a common link between this disparate group of talented men, distinguished in various walks of public life. Also interesting is that unlike Matthews they were all outgoing and gregarious. Kinloch "had a remarkable range of friendships". Carter was held in high esteem by hundreds while "friendships and quiet grace marked all his many contacts". Rix exercised a "wide ministry" and had "many friends". Parry was "at all times... a much loved pastor and friend and his influence was widespread". Above all Baynes with his "unbounded charity" and his "keen interest in the activities of his wide circle of friends" was an adviser and a stimulus to scholarship. This cultivated, educated group did not consist for the most part of professional scholars. Apart from Baynes they were gentlemen scholars, amateurs with high academic standards, for whom the first call was to the ministry.

In addition to these intimates, Maurice Powicke, son of F.J. Powicke, was also a friend and Oxford contemporary. He was at Balliol College, graduating in 1903, and he too worshipped at Mansfield College chapel and attended the Nonconformist society. Later he became an elder at St. Columba's, Oxford's Presbyterian Church. His father was not only a Congregational minister but a notable historian (especially of Richard Baxter, the seventeenth-century ejected minister) and the younger Powicke married the daughter of T.M. Lindsay, principal of the United Free College, Glasgow, and the sister of his friend A.D. Lindsay, the future Master of Balliol. F.M. Powicke was to become Regius Professor of Modern History at Oxford (1928-47) and President of the Royal Historical Society (1933-37). Like Baynes, Powicke wielded great influence on younger scholars, encouraging them to pursue their enthusiasms in their own way, while retaining an interest in their studies. AGM recorded his debt to

17. *The Presbyterian Messenger* February 1954, 12; *Minutes of the General Assembly of The Presbyterian Church of England* (1954), 320; T.F. Kinloch, *Pioneers of Religious Education* (1939); *The Life and Works of Joseph Hall 1574-1656* (1951). In addition Dr. Williams's Library, London, contains a number of books by Kinloch in its Norman H. Baynes bequest of 1961.

Powicke for "both encouragement and advice" throughout the research and preparation for *Calamy Revised*.¹⁸ Sir Maurice (he was knighted in 1946) was a distinguished medievalist and AGM quoted his comments on the *Cambridge Medieval History* and especially B.L. Manning's contribution to it ("competent ease") in the tribute to Manning after his death.¹⁹ In 1948 a collection of essays was published as a tribute to Powicke, recording that he had "kept us to the study of men as they are beneath the destructiveness which scars the course of history, responding however faint-heartedly to the calls of friendship, practical idealism, and the love of God. We have learnt the value of quiet things." Among the subscribers listed at the back of the book are N.H. Baynes, Lord Lindsay of Birker (as A.D. Lindsay had become in 1945) and A.G. Matthews.²⁰ In 1954 AGM dedicated the collection of essays, *Mr. Pepys and Nonconformity*, to Maurice and Susan Powicke "in gratitude for fifty years of friendship" (extending back to Oxford days).²¹

Bernard Lord Manning also was an historian of medieval England and as tutor and fellow of Jesus College, Cambridge, was considered by many "the most distinguished Congregational layman".²² Carter confessed to a friendship with Manning of almost thirty years in his tribute to "the man" while AGM showed an uncharacteristic admiration for Manning's "verve", "combativeness", "lively sallies" and "very good fun". Manning's history could never have been "dull", AGM informed his readers, but was "brilliant" with a "flashing surface" and depths of devotion to an "evangelical" faith.²³ Manning and AGM were contrasting characters, therefore, but such contrasts prevented neither admiration nor beneficial influence.

AGM's friendships resulted in some very varied writing. He and Carter combined to commemorate Manning's death. Earlier Carter had prevailed upon AGM to contribute to the commemorative volume for Emmanuel Congregational Church, Cambridge. Also in 1937 AGM's friendship with Carter produced an edited version of the diary of Emmanuel's minister, Joseph Hussey, from 1691 to 1719 (AGM providing a brief introductory essay). Parry persuaded him to help with *Congregational Praise* and its companion volume. Earlier his friendship with his old college principal, W.B. Selbie, resulted in his essay in the volume *Christian Worship*. Both Parry and AGM also had scholarly interests in the first half of the eighteenth century - Parry as a hymnologist with Isaac Watts, and AGM with Calamy and Walker, the opposing martyrologists.

18. A.G. Matthews, *Calamy Revised* (Oxford 1934) preface.

19. A.G. Matthews, "Bernard Lord Manning, The Historian" in *TCHS XIV* (1940-1944), ed. A. Peel and G.F. Nuttall, 139; *Dictionary of National Biography 1912-21* (Oxford 1927), 338-9; *DNB 1951-60* (Oxford 1971), 641-4; *DNB 1961-70* (Oxford 1981), 856-8.

20. *Studies in Medieval History Presented to Frederick Maurice Powicke* (Oxford 1948), ed. R.W. Hunt, W.A. Pantin, R.W. Southern, dedication, 493, 497, 498.

21. A.G. Matthews, *Mr. Pepys and Nonconformity* (1954).

22. H.C. Carter, "Bernard Lord Manning, The Man" in *TCHS XIV* (1940-44), 135; *DNB 1941-50* (Oxford 1959), 570-1.

23. *Ibid.*, 133; A.G. Matthews "Bernard Lord Manning", *op.cit.* 140.

These interests surfaced in two complementary studies of dissent in the eighteenth century.²⁴

AGM's successor at Oxted, Geoffrey Edmonds, had come straight from college, and with their common interest in hymns of quality the two became firm friends. This friendship, like AGM's others, grew over the years and resulted in the two men going off together for an annual week's holiday in Paris, to the affectionate amusement of some of the Oxted church members. Edmonds was minister at Oxted from 1927 to 1950 when he left to serve the church at Gerrard's Cross. AGM took part in the introduction service there. Edmonds was succeeded by Daniel Jenkins who as a theologian rather than an historian was not an ideal pastor for AGM but nevertheless remembers the older man as very friendly and always hospitable, with cultivated Oxford tastes. AGM was to press Jenkins, then his "former pastor", to write "an additional notice" on the theology of the 1658 Savoy Declaration for inclusion in his edition of that document in 1958 (just as he himself had been pressed by friends for written contributions to various works). The inclusion of this notice is further evidence of AGM's modesty and loyalty. Erik Routley described AGM's introduction to the Savoy declaration as "excellent" and predicted it would "long remain the last word on the history and provenance of the declaration".²⁵

In 1934/5 the Congregational church at Oxted, founded in 1902, moved from old Oxted to a new site and the church was renamed The Church of the Peace of God - usually shortened to The Peace. The name clearly reflects the strength of Christian pacifism in the years between the two wars.

AGM's long reliance on carefully nurtured friendships is therefore a constant theme throughout his life. Again in his edition of the Savoy declaration AGM expressed his gratitude for the help of another younger scholar, Geoffrey Nuttall, attributing to him the book's claim to originality and praising highly the latter's "opportunistically published" *Visible Saints* (1957) which he described as an "invaluable volume". Nuttall was to write a tribute to AGM after his death for the Congregational Historical Society.²⁶

His pastorate in Staffordshire resulted in AGM's researches on the history of the Congregational churches of that country. He addressed the autumnal

24. *Congregationalism Through the Centuries* (Cambridge 1937), 36-57; *Christian Worship* (Oxford 1936), ed. N. Micklem; *Diary of a Cambridge Minister* (Cambridge 1937), ed. A.G. Matthews; A.G. Matthews "Church and Dissent in the Reign of Queen Anne" in *TCHS* (1951), XVI 164; K.L. Parry "Isaac Watts and Eighteenth-Century Dissent", *ibid.*, 6.
25. For Geoffrey Edmonds see *United Reformed Church Year Book* (1976), 295-6; Oxted Congregational Church Deacons' Meeting Minutes; *The Savoy Declaration of Faith and Order 1658* (1959), ed. A.G. Matthews, 7, 49-50; E. Routley *The Story of Congregationalism* (1961), 38-9. Routley also said, "Nobody who takes Congregationalism seriously should be without this work", *ibid.* Edmonds himself was to write *A History of Chalfont St. Peter and Gerrards Cross* (Gerrards Cross 1964) which, he confessed, was "the work of an amateur", 5.
26. *The Savoy Declaration*, ed. AGM 7; G.F. Nuttall, *Visible Saints* (Oxford 1957), *TCHS* (1963), XIX 176-8.

meeting of the Congregational Historical Society in 1916 on Staffordshire nonconformity in the Restoration period, published his book on the county's Congregational churches in 1924 after moving to Oxted, and returned to it in 1932 after retirement when the Congregational Union held its autumnal meetings in Wolverhampton. In this latter year he displayed his characteristic dedication to thorough scholarship by producing both corrections and additions to his book "Some Notes on Staffordshire Nonconformity". The first impulse to write a history of the Congregational churches in the county came from the Executive Committee of the Staffordshire Congregational Union which asked him to undertake the project some years before 1924.²⁷

AGM's first article on Staffordshire opens with the sentence "the first outstanding event that calls for attention is the ejection of ministers at Bartholomew-tide in 1662".²⁸ This calling for attention was to remain true for AGM for many years to come, if not for the rest of his life. In his book on Staffordshire Congregationalism AGM admitted his taste for the "sweetness of correcting some of the mistakes made in previous publications" - foreshadowing his later work in correcting the exaggerated claims of Calamy and Walker. Characteristically also in that early volume AGM did not confine his researches to the Congregational churches which did not appear in the county until the eighteenth century. AGM "therefore, included some account of the Puritans, and the early Presbyterians, Baptists, and Quakers, hoping thus in some measure to fill a gap in what has hitherto been written", and displaying a sympathy broader than one limited to his own denomination (especially as his account of these kindred spirits fills almost half the book).²⁹

In the Staffordshire volume also AGM included several appendices, ranging from the ejected ministers of 1660-2, the Staffordshire conventicles of 1669, the licenses issued under the Declaration of Indulgence of 1672, the houses certified at Quarter-Sessions as places of worship under the Toleration Act, to the dissenting congregations in the county in 1773. All the appendices reveal AGM's thoroughness in points of detail yet that listing of the deprived clergy of 1660-2 clearly presages the later revision of Calamy. AGM stated "the list is substantially that given by Calamy" and then went on to show that he had checked all those ministers listed for the county and discovered some errors. He explained his omissions - some had died before 1662, some conformed, and others belong to different counties. This early list of ejected was surely the beginning of AGM's great historical detective work.³⁰ The "modest" title of the Staffordshire book was noted by a perceptive reviewer who stated that AGM had "written with judgement and much fairness from a wide knowledge, not only of special and local sources, but also of the English ecclesiastical history in

27. A.G. Matthews "Nonconformity in Staffordshire, 1660-70", *ibid.* (1917), VII; *The Congregational Churches of Staffordshire* (1924); "Some Notes on Staffordshire Nonconformity", *ibid.* (1933) XII.

28. *Ibid.*, 132.

29. A.G. Matthews, *The Congregational Churches of Staffordshire* (1924) preface.

30. *Ibid.*, 85-93, 123-130.

general".³¹ Again this book was noted as a "valuable work" and "the detailed references to sources, especially the collection in the Williams Library, are of particular value, containing as they do lists of ejected ministers, conventicles, licenses and tolerated houses, dissenting congregations...".³²

The Congregational church at Tettenhall Wood where AGM ministered had been founded with eight members "on the green edge of Wolverhampton" in 1868 and the chapel had been opened in 1873. Tettenhall Wood Congregational Church was a branch church of Queen Street, Wolverhampton from 1882 to 1949. Thus the ministers were considered assistant ministers of Queen Street. Whilst in Staffordshire AGM also took temporary charge of the nearby smaller Congregational church at Wombourne where he was described as "superintendent" in 1909.³³ The larger church at Queen Street, Wolverhampton relieved the Tettenhall Wood congregation, towards the end of the nineteenth century, of a debt of £600 and also paid for improvements to the chapel. During AGM's ministry at Tettenhall Wood the continued financial support of Queen Street, celebrating its centenary in 1911, was shown also in the building of a schoolroom (to which the receiving church contributed);³⁴ The membership figures in 1907, when AGM arrived from Oxford, totalled 71 church members with a Sunday school of 130. When he left in 1922 the church had 74 members and 120 scholars, a decrease which should be considered in the light of the losses of the First World War.³⁵

H.C. Carter was in the chair at the Tettenhall Wood stewards' meeting which issued the call to AGM in March 1907.³⁶ Whilst at Tettenhall Wood AGM was active in mission work both in his own and neighbouring villages. In June 1909 he took oversight of the church at Wombourne. In 1916 his custom of leading Sunday evening worship at the mission room at Compton and returning to Tettenhall Wood to deliver the sermon was reported. In 1917 AGM was concerned about arousing greater enthusiasm and responsibility among his church members and suggested a series of special services. He recommended Wilton Rix and the pacifist Leyton Richards as suitable preachers for such services. Rix was unable to come and T.F. Kinloch, as it turned out, substituted successfully in October and November 1917, preaching every night for a week.

31. *English Historical Review* (1926), XLI 642.

32. *The Times Literary Supplement*, 8th January 1925, 26.

33. H.A. May, *Queen Street Congregational Church, Wolverhampton: The Story of a Hundred Years 1809-1909* (1909), 103, 109; *Victoria County History of Staffordshire* (1984), XX, ed. M.W. Greenslade 44.

34. A.G. Matthews, *The Congregational Churches of Staffordshire* (1924), 228, 231, 242, 246.

35. *The Congregational Year Book* (1907), 292, *ibid.*, (1922), 226.

36. The "deacons" at Tettenhall Wood were called stewards, perhaps because of the Wesleyan origins of the fellowship. The building was bought by Queen Street Congregational Church, Wolverhampton, from the Wesleyans. The information in the following paragraph is derived from the Stewards' Meeting Minutes and Church Meeting Minutes of Tettenhall Wood Congregational Church.

In January 1911 new Sunday school rooms were opened at Tettenhall Wood and H.C. Carter, now of Cambridge, returned to preach at the opening service. AGM announced that this was a proud day for all; his church members had left Egypt and entered the "land of promise". Whilst at Tettenhall Wood AGM presided over repairs to the church floor and to the organ, and the purchase of a piano in 1912. AGM went to Staffordshire originally for a two-year term of office and in 1909 appreciative remarks were made of his work "in church and village" and the stewards unanimously asked for a further two-year engagement. In 1911 the contract was renewed and, as well as respectful comments about AGM, Mrs. Matthews's "kindness and good service" were noted. In 1913 the contract was extended to a five-year term. Expressions of appreciation of AGM's ministry in December 1913 went beyond the conventional. The minister "not only endeared himself as Pastor but those who knew him intimately were prepared to say their lives were rather richer for their association with him as a man. As a pastor he looked after the defaulters and the sick and as to services as Minister, reference had only to be made to his sermon on Sunday evening last...". The speaker stated he "would place Mr. Matthews second to no parson or minister in Wolverhampton". At the same meeting the opinion was expressed that "Mr. Matthews had served the church wonderfully and was a very fine man indeed. His preaching was of a very high order".

Also at that meeting the stewards proposed to increase AGM's stipend from £120 per annum (as it had been for the six years since he arrived) to £130, if Queen Street were willing to raise an extra five pounds and Tettenhall Wood matched it. The Queen Street deacons replied by stating that they preferred to raise the stipend to £150 per year - so they would provide an additional £15 if Tettenhall Wood would do the same. The stewards took up the challenge. One year later in December 1913 AGM was presented with a pair of "gold sleeve links" engraved with his initials as a token of the church's affection for their pastor. Again in July 1918 Queen Street gave AGM an additional £25 without any stipulation that Tettenhall Wood should make any such matching contribution. Later that year the stewards resolved to advise Queen Street that, with their approval, they had decided to alter the agreement with AGM that he should remain with them "for an indefinite period, termination to be by three months notice". Clearly AGM was well loved and respected in and around Wolverhampton.

In 1913 he was appointed one of two joint-secretaries of the Staffordshire Congregational Union. During the First World War AGM felt called to work with the YMCA in France. He spent six months thus in 1916 while A.J. Sadd assumed the role of temporary pastor at Tettenhall Wood and was away again in France for four months in 1918 when F.J. Powicke of Stockport (father of F.M. Powicke) looked after the church.³⁷ Dr. Powicke remained a firm friend of the church, returning in 1919 to preach at the church anniversary, and in 1921 at the

37. A.J. Sadd was "sometime assistant" to Dr. J.D. Jones of Bournemouth: *The Congregational Year Book* (1961), 449-50.

Harvest Festival, and looking after the church on a temporary basis after AGM's departure to Oxted in August 1922 until April 1923 when the new minister, John Morris, arrived. AGM himself returned to preach at Tettenhall Wood in July 1923 at the church anniversary services. In April 1919 AGM's interest in music and the interests of the church combined in the suggestion of a new organ to be installed in due course as a peace memorial. After years of fund raising the new organ was dedicated in November 1930 by AGM, specially invited for the ceremony. A contemporary account recorded that, "the organ is a beautiful piece of work, set in oak, and is stated to be the only one of its kind in the Midlands and is of special interest to all organists",³⁸

During AGM's pastorate at Tettenhall Wood he lived in the manse with his mother and brother. Oswald had not been well for some time. On the 12th July 1920 he attacked and killed the cook, practically severing her head from her shoulders. He had developed violent, irrational impulses towards her and even after her death believed that he was subject to influences and hypnotism which emanated from the dead woman. At the time of the crime AGM was not in the house; it was their mother who met Oswald, who had been away from home for a few days, outside in the garden. Oswald appeared to be "strange in his manner". He went indoors with his mother - and then attacked the cook in the kitchen. Mrs. Matthews at the inquest described Oswald as a kind-hearted man who "would not kill an insect"; other witnesses testified to his "disordered condition". Oswald was found insane and committed to Broadmoor Hospital. There his condition deteriorated and in July 1959, on the basis of his age and the reduced likelihood of further violence, he was transferred to Netherne Hospital, Coulsdon, where he died the following year.³⁹

This shocking affair caused a sensation in Wolverhampton, though "every sympathy was felt" for Mrs. Matthews and AGM. His close friends knew of the incident. T.F. Kinloch lived in Wolverhampton and H.C. Carter had many contacts there. Local residents also recall that AGM was engaged to be married while there and that, after the murder, his fiancée broke off the engagement under pressure from her family who feared that Oswald's disorder was congenital. AGM's friends may have wanted to remove him and his mother from the painful atmosphere of Wolverhampton. Certainly the move to Oxted was to safer, known territory. In May 1922 the stewards at Tettenhall Wood asked "if there was any reason" for the resignation "which we could alter". At the church meeting AGM was reported as saying,

He would be sorry to leave this church - indeed, previous suggestions of a similar nature he had discouraged - but now, from many points of view, he considered that it was time that he made a

38. F.H. Lamb, *Notes on the History of Tettenhall Wood Congregational Church, Wolverhampton*, (no date).

39. *The Midland Counties Express*, 17th July 1920; *The Wolverhampton Chronicle*, 24th November 1920.

change. Continuing, Mr. Matthews thought that he had done as much for this church as he could; he thought for a Minister to remain too long in a church tended possibly for both Minister and people to get into ruts and he mentioned that he had practically completed 15 years' ministry.

Needless to say the church members understood AGM's position. They still wanted him to stay.

AGM visited Oswald regularly at Broadmoor and kept in close touch with his brother's doctors there. Less frequently his mother visited her older son until she died in 1943. Oswald's confinement at Broadmoor in 1920 and AGM's move to Oxted two years later may be related. Oxted is nearer to Broadmoor than is Wolverhampton. AGM was definitely affected by this brother's illness and the crime served to reinforce his closeness to his mother, his retirement from wider, public office and his commitment to historical research. Such research offered a refuge and demanded total involvement, providing some compensation and solace. Later in life AGM confided that he had a strong aversion to the letters MA DD after his or any name. Oswald's illness haunted AGM throughout his life and must have been a source of deep sadness and may account for his own reported "strangeness" whilst at Oxted. At Tettenhall Wood he had been happy and much admired. The change in his personality, from a successful, active, outgoing minister, to a withdrawn scholar may be explained by the murder in 1920. His ministry at Oxted was not long-lasting, nor did it meet with the success he had enjoyed at Tettenhall Wood, and perhaps it is not too much to suggest that his early retirement in 1927 and his immersion in history were the results of Oswald's crime.

Near to AGM's church was Tettenhall College, a free church school founded in 1863 by leading members of Queen Street Congregational Church. Among the more active directors of the school in the years before the First World War was T.F. Kinloch, who played a vital role then during one of its occasional crises and remained a director for many years. Later in 1930 the board of directors sought a new chairman from outside its ranks. The board sought a well-known scholar and its choice fell upon Professor Powicke who remained in the post until 1945.⁴⁰

When the Staffordshire volume was published AGM had already moved to Oxted. On his arrival there in 1922 its Congregational Church had sixty members with 73 scholars in the Sunday school. When he left the pastorate in 1927 there were seventy-one members and 81 scholars. The publication of *Calamy Revised*, a bare seven years later, was a major achievement and showed how industriously and single-mindedly he had used his time. This revision of

40. G.V. Hancock, *History of Tettenhall College* (Wolverhampton 1963), 84, 97, 145, 173, 184.

Calamy was a huge undertaking, requiring “enormously laborious work”, and again in it and *Walker Revised* AGM revealed his innate modesty.⁴¹

In the preface to *Calamy Revised* AGM stated that his book was only a “supplement to the original rather than a substitute for it”. Yet even a brief comparison of the original Calamy and *Calamy Revised* shows how little of the earlier work has been copied and how much corrected. Again AGM gave credit to the piecemeal contributions made by local historians, Nonconformist scholars, parish histories, antiquarian studies and the like in the whole process of correction yet even he felt able to admit that “how far printed authorities are from covering all the ground will be apparent from an examination of the references I have made to sources of information yet unpublished”.⁴²

AGM’s desire to achieve the utmost historical accuracy is revealed in the preface too. He felt certain “there must be particulars of interest which I have inadvertently over-looked, and there must also be errors in my version of the particulars which I have given”. As with his Staffordshire researches, he intended “at some later date,... to find an opportunity of publishing something in the nature of a supplement” and expressed his hope that readers “will send me note of such sins of omission and commission as they observe”. Subsequently in July 1936 AGM had printed, and circulated at his own expense, an appendix III to *Calamy Revised* consisting of some seven pages of *addenda et corrigenda*, now happily included in the 1988 reprint of *Calamy Revised*.⁴³

In *Calamy Revised* AGM identified 1909 Nonconformist ministers ejected from their livings either in parishes, universities or schools and then provided biographies in miniature for each of them, complete with references and sources for each man. The work is over six hundred pages long and contains a learned and detailed introduction, describing the ecclesiastical settlement of 1660-2, the fate of the ejected, the background to Calamy’s work and Calamy’s several editions and alterations to his figures. AGM was later to describe Edmund Calamy, the Nonconformist controversialist, and “chronicler of the Bartholomean sufferers”, as deserving “the respect and gratitude of successive generations of readers”. The same applies to AGM.⁴⁴

Walker Revised (1948) reveals AGM’s breadth of outlook in his honest treatment of the suffering of the Anglican clergy during the Civil War and Commonwealth period. He conceded a grudging admiration for John Walker, the Exeter cleric and compiler of the *Sufferings of the Clergy*. “Even if we think him misguided in his endeavour to stiffen the backs of his fellow-churchmen against others of their fellow-Christians we cannot say it was done for filthy lucre or for vainglory. John Walker was an honest man in his loves and in his

41. *Congregational Year Book* (1922), 232, *ibid.* (1927), 282; G.F. Nuttall, “A.G. Matthews” in *TCHS* (1963), XIX 176.

42. A.G. Matthews, *Calamy Revised* (Oxford 1934) preface.

43. *Ibid.*, [568a]-[568h].

44. A.G. Matthews identified 1760 ejected from the counties plus 149 ejected from universities and schools: *ibid.* xiii, xiv; A.G. Matthews “Church and Dissent in the Reign of Queen Anne” in *TCHS* (1951), XVI 170.

still more portentous hatreds".⁴⁵ AGM intended *Walker Revised* to be a companion volume to *Calamy Revised* and in this he added "some 1,100 names" to those Walker originally included. Again modestly AGM attributed this improvement to "the complete transformation since" the eighteenth century "in the possibilities of historical research" - thus entirely discounting his own scholarship.⁴⁶

Together *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* were described by the historian of English Congregationalism as monuments of "patient industry, scholarly accuracy and fair-mindedness", "indispensable handbook for all students of seventeenth-century history" and "a rich quarry of source material for a fuller appreciation of the nature and complexity of Puritanism".⁴⁷ As Dr. Nuttall pointed out the titles of both *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* are misnomers for the new material provided by AGM, from manuscripts and printed sources, far outweighs that copied or corrected from Calamy and Walker. "Only a fundamentally modest man would have devoted himself to work of this kind in the first place, content to provide bricks for others to build with rather than to construct an interpretation of his own".⁴⁸

AGM first revealed his intention to examine Calamy's list of ejected ministers in March 1928 in an exchange of letters with the Clarendon Press. At this stage he submitted a case for a new edition of Calamy's *Account* and *Continuation* supporting his proposal by pointing out that only 300 of the 2500 ministers in Calamy have articles in the *Dictionary of National Biography*. In addition he argued that the *Account* was now scarce and quoted the Unitarian authority, Alexander Gordon, who had asserted that Palmer's *Nonconformist Memorial* contains "some blunder or other in nearly every life". AGM also referred to Sir Charles Firth, the accepted authority on seventeenth-century English history, who had suggested the need for a revised edition of Calamy. Finally AGM stated that he had already begun this ambitious project by collecting material from all available printed sources as well as unprinted. At this early date he had collected abstracts of 680 wills of ejected clerics and expected to obtain at least another 100. He was also "getting all the help which the generosity of local antiquaries will give, e.g. at present Mr. Ernest Axon is revising all my notes on Cheshire and Lancashire ministries".⁴⁹

Although the Press received a letter from Professor H.W.C. Davis (unacquainted with AGM) broadly supporting AGM's project and referring to the favourable critical reception afforded the Staffordshire volume, over three and a half years

45. *Ibid.* 172; J. Walker *Sufferings of the Clergy* (1714).

46. A.G. Matthews, *Calamy Revised* (Oxford 1934) xxxvii; *Walker Revised* (Oxford 1948) preface.

47. *The Congregational Year Book* (1963-4) 437; R.T. Jones, *Congregationalism in England 1662-1962* (1962), 457.

48. G.F. Nuttall, "A.G. Matthews" in *TCHS* (1963), XIX 176.

49. Unpublished correspondence in records of Oxford University Press in file marked "Calamy Revised", A.G. Matthews, *Calamy Revised* preface; E. Calamy *Account of the Ministers... Ejected after the Restoration* (1713); *Continuation of the Account* (1727).

later the Press had still not committed itself to the project. In October 1931 AGM's old friend, F.M. Powicke, of Oriel College, and by then Regius Professor of Modern History in the university, wrote warmly commending AGM's efforts. "He is a real scholar - methodical, accurate and enlightened." Powicke went on, "My one regret is that a concisely written work of this kind gives him so little opportunity of showing how well he can write, and how firm a grasp he has of the history of the time". However AGM preferred annotation and providing documentation for others to writing the history of these times he understood so well, even though he did not lack that sense of judgement which any historian must have. Powicke also intimated that AGM was prepared to make "a substantial contribution towards the cost of publication". Estimates suggested that the finished work would consist of 1000 pages and that this would cost almost £1000. The Delegates of the Press insisted on AGM providing £600 (three fifths) of such a sum in November 1931. To their surprise AGM agreed and by December 1932 he was again writing to the Press, correcting and improving the preliminary proofs. In a Clarendon Press memorandum at this time AGM was described as "minutely careful" and "an expert author" characteristically giving "detailed instructions with his copy".⁵⁰

By May 1934 the possibility of AGM revising Walker had been mooted with no definite commitment on the part of the Press. However, AGM had not merely confined himself to Calamy and Walker during this period. As well as his 1932 additional notes to Staffordshire Nonconformity he produced painstakingly as usual a bibliography of the works of Richard Baxter, one of the most famous of the ejected clerics of 1662. This bibliography was published in separate sections in the volumes of the *Transactions of the Congregational Historical Society*. He noted that Grosart in 1868 had published a list of Baxter's writings but this list "contains a number of errors and does not give the passages, chiefly from the *Reliquae* in which Baxter describes his works". AGM also declared his intention to publish Baxter's bibliography separately. In May 1934 in the course of his correspondence with the Clarendon Press, AGM complained that he had "some copies of this Baxter bibliography that I want to get out of this house" and asked if they could be sent out by the Press with copies of *Calamy Revised*. Consequently the Bodleian Library accepted twenty-one copies of Baxter and several were given away to bibliographers and other interested scholars.⁵¹

In July 1934 AGM was amused by a letter he received from a diplomatist in the British Consulate at Alexandria who had sent some additions to *Calamy Revised* ("the volume appears to be penetrating into some unlikely parts of our

50. *Ibid.* The figures representing the contributions towards the cost of publishing *Calamy Revised* were revised downwards as the book was far less than a thousand pages. The Press paid £300, the Hibbert Trust £100 and AGM raised £300. The Press held the copyright. See "Walker Revised" file at Oxford University Press. For H.W.C. Davis (1874-1928) see *DNB 1922-1930*, 248-250.

51. *Ibid.*: A.G. Matthews, "Some Notes on Staffordshire Nonconformity" in *TCHS* (1933), XII.

Empire"). A year later he was gratified to receive the praise of "so eminent an authority" as Sir Charles Firth.⁵² In 1938 AGM expressed his intention to leave the copyright of *Calamy Revised* to the Clarendon Press (an intention reiterated in 1949).

AGM's method of writing *Calamy Revised* was remarkable. He took copies of Edmund Calamy's *Abridgement of Mr. Baxter's History of his Life and Times with an Account of Many Others of Those Worthy Ministers who were Ejected after the Restoration* (1691), his *Account of the Ministers, Lecturers, Masters and Fellows of Colleges and Schoolmasters who were ejected or silenced after the Restoration in 1660* (1713) and his *Continuation of the Account* (1727) and simply cut them up and rearranged the lives in alphabetical order in a large scrapbook. Then AGM checked all Calamy's assertions about the ejected from the original sources as much as possible and from published secondary material where relevant.

In June 1938 AGM appealed to the Delegates of the Clarendon Press for a firm proposition for his revision of Walker. He wanted to know how many words he could have and offered to scale his work accordingly. He did not feel he would receive financial help towards the cost of publication from outside sources. As earlier with Calamy, this letter was accompanied by a supporting letter from F.M. Powicke who again praised his friend's "learning and thoroughness". Powicke repeated his regret about AGM's work in *Calamy Revised* - "it did not give him an opportunity to reveal his fine gifts as a historical thinker and a writer of English prose". He knew well his friend's retiring nature and observed, "He has deliberately chosen a task which keeps him in the background while he provides material for others. He must have spent a small fortune on Calamy and he cannot now afford to do more than bear the expense of preparing his second book - in itself a heavy expense." He wanted the Press not only to publish AGM's Walker but to encourage AGM "to write something... on the basis of his two past works of scholarship, I think that we should have a very lively and significant contribution to the history of England in the seventeenth century."⁵³

The Delegates of the Clarendon Press were prepared to publish AGM's revision of Walker when complete but set him a limit of some 500 pages (100 less than the published *Calamy Revised*). They agreed with AGM also that he should concentrate on the parish clergy who were deprived rather than the ejected university and cathedral clergy (eventually afforded a "somewhat meagre treatment" in AGM's words).⁵⁴ AGM worked within these constraints, producing a book of 460 pages which, like *Calamy Revised*, did not consider the ejections in the four Welsh dioceses but restricted himself further by confining the biographical details in *Walker Revised* to "the years of suffering, 1642/1660". The introduction to *Walker Revised* ends in a curious way, as if halfway through a sentence which has been summarily cut in two. Thus the publishers' restrictions

52. *Ibid.*

53. "Walker Revised" file at Oxford University Press.

54. *Ibid.*; A.G. Matthews, *Walker Revised* (Oxford 1948) preface.

reduced the book's immediate usefulness. With unfailing courtesy AGM expressed a debt of gratitude in 1947 to the Delegates of the Clarendon Press for "honouring the undertaking which they gave me in more propitious days than these". Again AGM felt obliged to apologise for any inexactitudes in his work and, quoting the psalmist, he exclaimed of himself, "Who can understand his errors?"⁵⁵

For *Walker Revised* the Delegates of the Clarendon Press shouldered the whole cost of publication, anticipating a loss of about £400 and retaining the copyright of the work for themselves. The conditions of publication of *Walker Revised* did not include a provision for royalty, and no royalty was ever paid to AGM for this work.⁵⁶

From 1917, when he contributed his first article on Restoration Nonconformity in Staffordshire, onwards AGM published several papers in the *Transactions of the Congregational Historical Society* and in 1933 he returned to Staffordshire history with further notes and corrections. In 1926 the *T.C.H.S.* included his "A Censored Letter" in which AGM considered a letter from William Hooke, formerly Puritan Master of the Savoy Hospital, London, to John Davenport, from 1637 resident in New England, and for many years pastor of the Congregational church in New Haven, Massachusetts, which Hooke had served as teacher in the 1640s and 1650s. The letter was written in June 1663 and was considered "pernicious" and confiscated by the sensitive government officials of Charles II. In addition AGM also published in the *Transactions* his bibliography of Baxter's writings in four instalments in 1930, 1931 and 1932 and this has properly received wider recognition. In 1927 he published a brief note entitled "Robert Browne's Will", dealing with a legal dispute after Browne's death in 1633 between his son and his errant second wife who was found to have produced a false will in her favour. Then in 1942 came AGM's tribute to B.L. Manning as historian and in May 1951 his address as President of the Congregational Historical Society, "Church and Dissent in the Reign of Queen Anne". He remained in that office until 1957 and this address was to be his last contribution for the journal.⁵⁷

In lighter mood AGM wrote on the Psalms, ignoring his own "scanty and quite casually collected marginalia" - texts for famous sermons for Bossuet, Burnet, Newman, Laud and Jowett, anthems for composers like Purcell, references in Shakespeare, Boswell's *Johnson*, Thackeray and Hardy - printed in *The Congregational Quarterly* in 1952. In the following year AGM wrote on a subject increasingly dear to him, "Homer and the Iliad". The *Iliad* is our earliest

55. *Ibid.*

56. *Ibid.* A.G. Matthews left on his death a revised, annotated copy of *Walker Revised* to the Bodleian Library, Oxford.

57. A.G. Matthews, "Robert Browne's Will" in *TCHS* (1927) X; "The Bibliography of Richard Baxter" *TCHS* (1930) XI, 102; (1931) 125, 189; (1932) 228; G.F. Nuttall, "A.G. Matthews" in *TCHS* (1963) XIX, 178.

European poem so "in the beginning was the best... As if at that date in the world's history God said, Let there be poetry: and Homer was".⁵⁸

The breadth of AGM's sympathy was displayed in a rare book review when in 1951 he appraised Ronald Knox's *Enthusiasm* (Oxford 1950) with a little, gentle chiding. "More general criticism is apt to be partisan. It comes readily to Protestant readers to retort on Catholic criticisms with an *et tu quoque*. Little enlightenment results from that argument. Inevitably Mgr. Knox is on the side of the majority. What his enthusiast minorities reacted against - the worldliness, the inertia, the superstition - it is not his book to emphasize." AGM was generous to Knox's "fresh mind and penetrative imagination" although characteristically he also noted "there are a few misprints".⁵⁹

In the 1950s AGM busied himself with various literary projects. At the opening of the decade *Congregational Praise* was published and AGM contributed a masterly summary to its companion volume. In 1954 a collection of shorter historical writings was published, named after the first two essays *Mr. Pepsys and Nonconformity*. It also contains work on Dorothy Osborne, the Whartons, and Puritan worship and in it the author allowed himself "to wander leisurely around his chosen topics" in his pleasing style - but the absence of all references and an index, although in accord with "the general tone of easy informality", is a disadvantage.⁶⁰ In 1959 AGM published his annotated edition of *The Savoy Declaration of Faith and Order, 1658*. It was noted that AGM in his introductory essay was able to give some new facts about the assembly from sources previously overlooked.⁶¹

The critical reception afforded *Calamy Revised* on publication was encouraging but guarded. AGM was described as "an ideal editor" producing an "admirable piece of work" yet it was noted that it would be well if "he could widen his borders, and work out the story both of the Anglican ejected and of the Anglicans who accepted benefices under the Commonwealth dispensation". Even *The Congregational Quarterly* only included *Calamy Revised* among its shorter notices although the editor extended hearty congratulations to AGM and stated "the denomination to which he belongs may rightly be proud".⁶² *Calamy Revised* was noticed in the *Times Literary Supplement* with grudging praise.

The general reader in quest of the facts will not complain because the occasional touches of humour in the entries tempt him to read further than he had at first intended, and if the evidence falls at

58. A.G. Matthews, "From the Margins of a Psalter" *The Congregational Quarterly* (1952) XXX 113-117; "Homer and the Iliad" *The Congregational Quarterly* (1953) XXXI, 352-361.

59. *Journal of Ecclesiastical History* (1951) II, 244-5.

60. *Companion to Congregational Praise* (1953), ed. K.L. Parry; *The Times Literary Supplement* (4th February 1955), 78.

61. *Ibid.*, (1st May 1959), 263.

62. *History* (1934-5) XIX 165-6; *English Historical Review* (1936) LI 340-2; *The Congregational Quarterly* (1934) XII 253-4.

times rather short of legal proof allowance must be made for the great difficulty of the task that has been attempted and so far as may be judged from verification of some scores of the entries, carried through with a large measure of success.⁶³

When *Walker Revised* appeared the notices were more enthusiastic although the *Times Literary Supplement* gave it only a brief mention. B.H.G. Wormald described it as an "impressive work" and remarked that "the author has combed the principal manuscript collections of the country, in addition to county records and used an astonishing variety of printed sources, which are only partially indicated in the bibliography". Godfrey Davies was unrestrained in his praise of AGM's achievements. "A student of English religious history in the mid-seventeenth century will not find it easy to avoid the language of hyperbole in speaking of the contributions made by A.G. Matthews". The two books, he judged to be "indispensable and invaluable" and he noted "a few errors as well as omissions"... "but they merely show that the compiler is human, he is far above the average in accuracy and coverage, and in enthusiasm and industry at the very top."⁶⁴ Geoffrey Nuttall too felt pride at AGM's Congregationalism when reviewing *Walker Revised* yet he noted some disappointments in comparing the two revisions. *Walker Revised* was arranged not by persons alphabetically like *Calamy Revised*, but by counties and within each county by persons, thus rendering cross-reference impossible without use of the index. Again unlike *Calamy Revised* no index locorum was provided for *Walker Revised* so that the only way to learn if a particular living was sequestered is to check all the pages referring to the county in question. The other contrast is in the amount of information given under each entry. Unlike *Calamy Revised* "there is here nothing about the clergy's parentage".

In 1971 a bibliography of English history 1660-89 included some of the lesser known works of AGM. Not only *Calamy Revised* but also the annotated list of Baxter's works and *Mr. Pepys and Nonconformity* (1954) are recommended. Two studies by Claire Cross on the seventeenth-century church acknowledge the scholar's debt to AGM. "All who work on church history between 1642 and 1662 are indebted to A.G. Matthews for his biographical reference books on the clergy of both sides who were ejected from their livings." The most recent

63. *The Times Literary Supplement* (29th March 1934) 229.

64. *History* (1950) XXXV 128-9; *English Historical Review* (1949) LXIV 375-7; *The Times Literary Supplement* (27th March 1948) 183.

65. G.F. Nuttall's review of *Walker Revised* in *The Congregational Quarterly* (1948) XXVI 273-3.

historian of Nonconformity describes *Calamy Revised* as "splendid" and "indispensable" but also quotes from AGM's essays in *Christian Worship*.⁶⁶ J.S. Morrill recommends both *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* and also states that with reference "to the problem of the sequestered clergy... the essential work is *Walker Revised*... Matthews expanded Walker's account from all the sources available to modern historians, and produced a *Who's Who* of the sufferers, arranged county by county".⁶⁷

The major part of AGM's published work has therefore been greeted by scholars of successive generations as a valuable contribution to historical knowledge. Even those works which, alongside *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised*, appear lightweight have gained academic respectability. The pressure which resulted in the recent reprinting of *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* witnesses to the persistent need for these works and their continuing importance.

The Congregational church at Oxted met in Station Road from 1900 onwards but within four years plans were being made to erect a new building in Blue House Lane. This new church, however, was only built in the 1930s so AGM ministered from the old site to a congregation of villagers and commuters which earlier included Sir George Paish, the Liberal economist and publisher, and later the Benns (including at times the young Wedgwood). The church became something of a Mansfield College, Oxford living and developed a rarefied, cloistered air. Yet Oxted managed "to convey in its halfway house between stockbrokerdom and 'our village' more than a hint of the puritan alternative". The small church was marked by a lively concern for wider issues (the local Liberal Party Women's branch met in its premises, as did later the Labour women, and the Co-operative Women's Guild) and so were its ministers. Clyde Binfield saw AGM, after retirement, as "a reincarnation of an ejected divine".⁶⁸ By the 1930s the old church building in Station Road would no longer do as the increased road and rail traffic which passed so close to it had become very noisy indeed.⁶⁹

66. C.L. Grose, *A Select Bibliography of British History 1660-1760* (Chicago 1939) 142, 144, 286; G. Davies, *The Early Stuarts 1603-1660* (Oxford 1959) 425; G. Clark, *The Later Stuarts 1660-1714* (Oxford 1956) 440; *Bibliography of British History: Stuart Period 1603-1714* (Oxford 1970) ed. G. Davies, 1st edition, M.F. Keeler, 2nd edition, 185, 188, 189, 195; W. L. Sachse, *Restoration England 1660-1689* (Cambridge 1971) 3, 76, 79; C. Cross, "The Church in England 1646-1660" in G.E. Aylmer ed. *The Interregnum: The Quest for Settlement 1646-1660* (1972) 210; C. Cross, *Church and People 1450-1660: The Triumph of the Laity in the English Church* (1976) 261; M. Watts, *The Dissenters* (Oxford 1978) 313, 513.

67. G.E. Aylmer and J.S. Morrill, *The Civil War and Interregnum: Sources for Local Historians* (1979) 32; J.S. Morrill ed. *Reactions to the English Civil War 1642-1649* (1982) 214. Unaccountably Morrill does not include either *Calamy Revised* or *Walker Revised* in his bibliography, *Seventeenth-Century Britain 1603-1714* (Folkestone 1980).

68. J.C.G. Binfield, "Art and Spirituality in Chapel Architecture: F.W. Lawrence (1882-1948) and his Churches" in D. Loades ed. *The End of Strife: Death, Reconciliation and Expressions of Christian Spirituality* (Edinburgh 1984) 204-9.

69. *Westerham Herald*, 21st September 1935.

In 1923 at Oxted AGM introduced a monthly preaching service to be held midweek in the evening and among his preachers in the winter 1923-24 were familiar names like H.C. Carter, K. Parry, Principal Selbie, and Sidney Berry who had been ordained at Oxted in 1906. On resigning in September 1927 he stated his desire to "devote all his time to the completion of a piece of literary work".

After Geoffrey Edmonds's appointment as minister the church followed his pacifist lead, passing a resolution in 1928 which expressed its detestation of war and support for the League of Nations (a resolution forwarded to the Congregational Union of England and Wales). In June 1933 Harry Stewart resigned as secretary as he was leaving the district and AGM was appointed deacon and church secretary after being approached by the minister. At this time AGM must have practically finished work on *Calamy Revised*; its preface was written in September 1933. In February 1934 Wilton Rix, minister of Ealing Congregational Church, wrote promising £200 from his church to the new building project at Oxted. Old friends remained loyal and in October 1934 K.L. Parry preached and in September and October 1935 Parry and Rix were there preaching again. The name of the new church building, the Church of the Peace of God, from a suggestion by AGM, was chosen in July 1935 (the other proposals, Christ Church and the Church of the Pilgrim Way, being rejected). The new name was an act of faith in the cause of international peace; the church had been a corporate member of the League of Nations Union from the beginning and after 1945 it enjoyed a similar relationship with the United Nations Association.⁷⁰

Oxted Congregational church decided in May 1930 to appoint a committee to advise the church members on the desirability of a new church building (possible site, architect, designs) and although AGM was not originally chosen to serve on the committee he was added to it at its first meeting in June. AGM attended the meetings regularly, helping to prepare an appeal for the new building to be circulated and enquiring about the cost of oak pews (donating £100 towards their cost, and a lesser sum for the communion table).⁷¹

The opening service of the Church of the Peace of God on September 18th 1935 involved contributions not only from Geoffrey Edmonds and AGM but also from two former Oxted ministers, Wilton Rix and Sidney Berry, the secretary of the Congregational Union. Attention was drawn at this service to the church's title and its denominational allegiance which appeared in smaller type on the service paper. "This does not mean the abandonment of anything in our belief or policy, but the subordination of it to the larger ideal of a Universal Church", announced the chairman of the building committee.⁷² In the following two months Nathaniel Micklem, Principal of Mansfield College, K.L.

70. Oxted Congregational Church Deacons' Meeting Minutes 1921-1937; Church Meeting Minutes 1920-1927.

71. *Westerman Herald*, *op.cit.*

72. Oxted Congregational Church, New Church Committee Minutes.

Parry, Rix and AGM were all due to conduct worship there.

AGM also served as deacon and church secretary from 1933 to 1944 with a year's temporary retirement in 1938 when he was replaced by his friend Harry Stewart. During this period the new church building was opened in Blue House Lane and the Station Road site sold to Surrey County Council. The deacons took seriously the church's new title when the possibility of the council letting their former premises to the Territorial Army was raised. The church's solicitors were instructed to insert a clause in the sale agreement to prevent this letting. Even in February 1940 the Peace Pledge Union was allowed to use the church hall at a reduced charge although later that year Canadian troops were using the church for their parade services and continued to do so throughout the war. In February 1943 the church passed a motion supporting H.M. Government "in providing for the Jews, and all others under enemy control in danger of massacre help and temporary asylum on the largest and most generous scale possible at this time of crisis". In April 1947 the deacons reported that six copies of the New Testament and Psalms had been purchased in German for the use of prisoners of war at the church services.

To add to the pressures of the church secretary in September 1942 AGM's mother, Mary Matthews, died at the age of 97 years. In her infirmity he had wheeled her around their house and brought her to The Peace. The church thanked God for "her serene and kindly Christian spirit, her constant interest and generous support". In January 1946 AGM was elected to the office of life deacon in recognition of his uniquely "devoted service". In various ways AGM continued to serve the Oxted fellowship. Geoffrey Edmonds's wife suffered from a protracted illness which in 1945 caused him to tender his resignation through strain. The church refused to accept this and suggested a leave of absence in 1946 in which, amongst other measures, AGM made himself available to conduct marriages and funerals if needed. In November 1945 a proposal in the church meeting to appoint elders to work alongside the deacons and minister met with AGM's approval. The elders were to deal with spiritual matters and the deacons with more practical ones. The debate was adjourned and never resumed.⁷³

Some of AGM's friends of longstanding surface again in the Oxted church minutes. In September 1937, at the anniversary of the opening of The Peace, John Whale was the preacher, while at the church anniversary in 1940 K.L. Parry returned to preach. In May 1941 the church sent Parry its congratulations on his election to the chair of the Congregational Union. In March 1943 Wilton Rix returned to preach at The Peace. Once Geoffrey Edmonds's desire to leave was known in November 1949 the deacons chose to consult among others

73. Deacons' Meeting Minutes; Church Meeting Minutes, 1937-1949. The proposal about elders may have been prompted by the need to help the then hard-pressed minister, Geoffrey Edmonds.

Kenneth Parry who had left Oxted's pastorate in 1913, about a successor to Edmonds.⁷⁴

The new minister, Daniel Jenkins, spent some months each year teaching at the University of Chicago. Consequently AGM was often asked to chair church meetings. In 1950 AGM proposed to the Independent Press that in recognition of his editorial services on the hymn book, *Congregational Praise*, the Press should present The Peace with a full supply of the new books. The only conditions were that the old hymn books should be sent to the Independent Press, and that the Press's action should not be made public. AGM asked that his own part in the scheme should not be disclosed and the gift be attributed not to him but to an anonymous friend. This is how it was explained to the church meeting in July 1950 when AGM also gave "masterly summary" of the contents of the book. The church's pride in AGM expressed itself in its congratulations on his election to the Presidency of the Congregational Historical Society in 1951 for the following five years. During the 1950s AGM served continuously on two committees of the church - the missionary committee, and that dealing with a smaller local chapel at Pain's Hill. In March 1951 he gave an oak lectern and in May he asked whether the church might keep a roll of honour of persons bequeathing gifts to the church. After "full discussion" the church meeting decided not to take any further action (perhaps providing AGM with a reason not to leave any money to The Peace in his will). AGM's death in December 1962 was recorded briefly in the deacons' minutes and his bequest of a leather-bound copy of *Congregational Praise*, given to AGM for his part in the book's preparation, was noted later. The funeral took place at AGM's house, Farmcote, on his instructions and included no address. It was followed by burial at Elmers End where his body lies between his parents and his brother. A memorial service occurred at The Peace at which Geoffrey Edmonds gave the address.⁷⁵

AGM was a thoughtful pastor and an attentive friend. In the 1930s when a younger colleague was unwell in London and away from home AGM visited him four times in less than two weeks. In 1938 Kenneth Parry and AGM visited Geoffrey Nuttall, then minister at Warminster Congregational Church, and in Parry's car the three drove to Longleat House. There special attention was paid to Heaven's Gate, in the grounds of Longleat, which is reputed to be the spot where Bishop Thomas Ken wrote "Awake my soul, and with the sun" and "Glory to Thee, my God, this night".⁷⁶ Such a civilised journey brought together the informed conversation of good companions, with mutual interests in history and hymnology, in a beautiful setting. AGM enjoyed walking and studying the ways of birds in the countryside around his Oxted home and would often take visiting friends on such walks.

74. The deacons also consulted Parry in 1955 when Daniel Jenkins resigned. Wilton Rix's death was noted at a Church Meeting in 1959. Church Meeting Minutes 1950-65. Deacons' Meeting Minutes 1950-63.

75. *Ibid.* For the smaller chapel at Pain's Hill see E. Cleal, *The Story of Congregationalism in Surrey* (1908) 83.

76. Both these hymns were later to be included in *Congregational Praise*.

He preached only occasionally after retirement and left an impression of deep thought and beautiful reading. He had an amusing mannerism of kicking the lectern and greatly disliked any distractions during his service. "We hardly dared to cough". There was a window at the back of the church through which late-comers peered to see where they might sit. AGM, observing this, would urge, "Let these people in!". Eventually he had the window curtained. AGM displayed to his fellow church members at Oxted a remarkable breadth of interest and outlook, a twinkling humour tending to the sardonic, uninhibited kindness and integrity of personality. He was "a character, always simply his quaint self."

He is remembered as having a "player-piano", and also for his profound regard for Mozart. To the church choir he was encouraging and appreciative, sending his especial thanks by post, usually on Monday morning when he was very pleased. He would also gently reprimand the choir master when the choir drifted into its habit of starting hymns sluggishly. One postcard records his delight in George Herbert's "King of glory, King of peace" - "most beautiful, quite worth coming to church for". Perhaps he betrayed his innate conservatism, as well as his discrimination in hymn tunes, in another card, "Thanks for sparing us 'Moscow' this morning. It is musically tiring and has undesirable political associations". He thanked the choir for its performance of the Mozart Requiem Mass, "You more than ever confirmed my devotion to Mozart. Here for any worth or interest they may be to you are a few thoughts, not about Mozart, who is beyond any words of mine. I lay my hand on my mouth and leave him soaring in his seventh heaven." The letter continues about Brother Thomas, and Swinburne the poet with quotations. Then AGM confesses, "Please forgive me thus relieving my mind upon you. You are the only person hereabouts likely to be much interested." Thus AGM betrayed his loneliness. On another occasion he asked the choir to perform the Weelkes Gloria which he may have known from his New College days - he paid for the scores for the choir.

AGM's kindness revealed itself in unusual ways. A National Children's Home for girls was very near the church and the principal was a deacon. Instead of moving on to the usual domestic service in the large houses of Oxted and Limpsfield, one promising girl was kept at school for matriculation and put through a teachers' training college. This was largely, if not wholly, at AGM's expense. His identity was later revealed by the principal and the girl in her surprise asked why he had paid for her. "He liked the way you smiled in church", she was told. She would have sat among the children in the front two rows during the services when AGM was still the minister at Oxted. He was fond of children - a fondness perhaps heightened by his not marrying. Later, when he had left the pastorate, he conducted the wedding service for his former charge in The Peace. For the rest of his life the girl kept in touch with him. At her induction to a school headship in Eastbourne AGM and Geoffrey Edmonds were present as guests.

One elderly member of the church recalls her attendance at AGM's preparation classes for membership. He was way above their heads. When

teaching or preaching his head movements invariably directed his eyes upwards rather than towards his hearers. The impression is that although AGM tried hard, he found communication with most people not easy. His routine pastoral visits were notably difficult occasions.

Another member recalls her mother saying to her father, "No! Don't go out and talk to that man". It was Sunday in the days of horse-drawn milk floats and AGM was patrolling the quiet roads with bucket and shovel. Father did go out to AGM who may in his precise and rather high-pitched voice have excused his practice by declaring, "June roses". AGM was a careful gardener at home, and, during the Second World War, when he took over the maintenance of its garden, at church. At the annual general meeting of the church during the war the highlight was always the gardener's report. These were discourses on a variety of topics, with little or no relation to gardening, but always well worth listening to. He did all his writing in a summer-house adorned with an enormous collection of postcards, notably of French cathedrals; sometimes he had conversations with his visitors there.⁷⁷

AGM dressed well although at times his appearance bordered on the eccentric. He was spare in build and always wore a pork pie hat, never a greatcoat. His only concession to the cold was a long scarf wound around the neck with the ends loose, worn on his frequent walks. His gait, bearing and countenance seemed suffused by the singular personality. To his friends at Oxted it was all of a piece that his housekeeper should be named Mrs. Muskett and that, as she aged, it was he who increasingly looked after her.

AGM's admiration for Homer in his later years resulted in an unpublished manuscript, "An Amateur reads the Iliad", and in earlier years he delighted in translations of Latin pieces sung by the church choir. Among the books in his sitting-room were Greek, Latin and French writers (including Marcel Proust) as well as English. He also had a collection of modern paintings and when needed he could provide an introduction to a favoured artist. To his own minister at Oxted in the late 1950s he gave a large reproduction of the Van Eyck brothers' altarpiece, "The Adoration of the Lamb", although characteristically he did not include the fifth, central panel as this offended his Puritan sensibilities. In later life AGM was quite deaf and he apologised to his minister for not paying great attention to the sermons. He would read during the sermons but he always followed the New Testament lessons in the Greek. On some Sunday evenings in summer he would walk across the fields to evensong in Tandridge parish church and in his will he bequeathed £4439 to Oxted parish church, as is recorded on a plaque in the church. He left nothing to The Peace, perhaps surprisingly although suspicions remain that he gave anonymously to it throughout his life, and not least at the time of its building. His house, Farmcote, is now the Friends' Meeting House. He left £500 each to the London Missionary Society and the Congregational Union and £4439 to the National Art Collections Fund, a

77. G.F. Nuttall, "A.G. Matthews" *TCHS* (1963) XIX 176-8.

similar sum to Oxfam, and again to the Mansfield House University Settlement Incorporated of Fairbairn Hall, London for the work of its boys' clubs.⁷⁸

In 1953 an exchange of letters between AGM and Oxford University Press revealed that both *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* were still in print and even in 1962 fifty copies of *Walker Revised* were left in Oxford.⁷⁹ In 1972 permission was sought and given by the Press for single microfilm copies of *Calamy Revised* to be made on demand, as a service to scholarship and later that year a new edition of the work was planned by a smaller publishing company, by arrangement with O.U.P. However this scheme did not come to fruition and in the 1980s the demand for *Calamy Revised* had become such that one dealer in secondhand books claimed his customers were "reduced to fighting in the streets when they see a copy". He went on, "I have only found one copy in ten years" and, with regard to *Walker Revised*, "I have never found a copy". He too suggested a reprinting of both works.

In 1984 the pressure to reprint increased markedly as several notable historians added their voices to the clamour. Bernard Capp stated the university library at Warwick had not been able to locate a secondhand copy of *Calamy Revised* despite searching for many years. He and other scholars, including Keith Thomas, Gerald Aylmer and Anne Whiteman, confirmed that both volumes remain "indispensable works of reference, and are unlikely ever to be superseded." The decision to reprint was greeted as "exciting news". However the need to make corrections and to add extra information was explored. Charles Surman's supplementary index of intruders to *Walker Revised* was an obvious candidate for inclusion as was also AGM's list of corrections for *Calamy Revised*. The possibility of new prefaces, further corrections from other scholars and the inclusion of recent publications and new sources of material were also mooted. Unfortunately the Press was unable to secure the services of a suitable scholar to supervise the required alterations and additions and chose, therefore, to print the books with fewer improvements than were desirable. AGM's own corrections to both *Calamy Revised* and *Walker Revised* are housed in the Bodleian Library but have not been included in the reprinted works. The new *Walker Revised* contains C.E. Surman's index of places, arranged county by county, whereas in the Bodleian is deposited AGM's own handwritten index locorum to *Walker Revised* arranged alphabetically. The two agree in most details although there are some differences. AGM lists Saumur and Bordeaux; Surman does not. Surman includes Smyrna and Aleppo in Europe; AGM puts them in Asia. Surman's supplementary index of persons to *Walker Revised* is there too, revised in pen by AGM with some additional references. In July 1945

78. *Ibid*; *The Congregational Year Book* (1963-4) 436-7. A.G. Matthews would on occasions have meals at Mansfield House. AGM's will: probate London 7th January 1963 (Somerset House). AGM left £26,470 gross in his will: *The Times* (18th January 1963).

79. *Calamy Revised* went out of print in 1955 and *Walker Revised* in 1964. Oxford University Press file on "Calamy Revised".

AGM sent Bodley's Librarian a copy of his corrections and additions to Tatham's Calendar of the Walker manuscripts. He stated: "in the course of revising Walker's *Sufferings of the Clergy* I used the calendar of mss in Tatham's *Dr. J. Walker* and found it seriously inaccurate, especially in the earlier part. Enclosed is a list of the more serious errors and omissions."

The Bodleian Library's copy of *Walker Revised* is considerably enlarged by the inclusion of several of AGM's handwritten notes and references. He inserted an index of intruders and other clergy, not appearing in the printed index of sufferers. Again this is not an exact replica of Surman's index of names, as included in the 1988 version of *Walker Revised*, although the differences are more marked. More importantly AGM called attention to the misprints in the original *Walker Revised*, such as that on page XVIII of the introduction where 4000 and 5000 should read 400 and 500. Unfortunately these misprints are repeated in the 1988 book. On page XXI AGM corrected the list of schoolmasters from 20 to read 30 and on the page inserted opposite he named the men in question (there he lists 39) and added seventeen more who taught in schools after their sequestrations. Again opposite page XXVI AGM listed thirteen ejected clerics who converted to Roman Catholicism, and on page XXVII he doubled the number of those executed during the Civil War and Interregnum from two to four. AGM also made various additions to his biographical notes on the sufferers as printed and he did this by inserting between each printed page of text a blank page for his own extra references. In the Bodleian annotated *Walker Revised* each county has opposite its first page a list of "see also" which for instance in London consists of 31 additional groups of references, and in Bedfordshire 17.

After the publication of *Walker Revised* AGM saw fit to present the Bodleian also with an annotated copy of *Calamy Revised* which contains as he stated, "a small body of additional information" and includes references to *Walker Revised*. This is by no means as expanded as the Bodleian *Walker Revised* and the introduction is almost unchanged. A few references have been added to the indices and in the biographical entries a small number of corrections are found. However the changes are relatively minor in comparison with *Walker Revised*, suggesting that AGM was less satisfied with the published *Walker Revised* than he was with *Calamy Revised*.

AGM breathed a thin upper-class air and cultivated an educated superiority, at times verging on the contemptuous. His sermons were beyond many in his congregations. Yet he had been a successful and popular minister in Staffordshire and despite his brother's illness, the murder and AGM's consequent internal struggle, he achieved an equanimity and a useful if not unique role for himself. His withdrawal from public life was made easier by the comfort received from a number of significant friendships, many dating back to college days. Indeed AGM had something of the dispassionate undergraduate in his character, as if commitment to any ideal would be vulgar. To his great credit no trace of self-pity is evident in his life although his melancholy, sometimes severe face disclosed an element of tragedy to perceptive observers. AGM did not look like a minister and, after retirement, he did not attend county

union meetings. Thus he was largely unknown in the Congregational churches and rarely preached or spoke outside Oxted. His influence was realised through his friendships and continues through his writings.

AGM's service at Tettenhall Wood and his devotion to The Peace, where he was minister, secretary, deacon and loyal church member, testify to his "worshipping faith". His obituary sympathetically records that he "through many trials, persevered in faith and duty and the offices of love". His unusual life, with its high achievement arising from the depths of anguish and loss, reveals a tender heart, as Geoffrey Nuttall observed in his appreciation of AGM. "The main value of history is for the heart", wrote Manning, "It keeps the heart tender, as only a study of our poor humanity can". AGM approvingly included this in his "delicate assessment" of Manning and his own heart, of course, did not grow hard. In that article also AGM allowed his readers a rare glimpse of his own approach to history; "of historical study it is true, in a more complicated sense than the phrase immediately suggests, that a man gets from it largely what he brings to it. Personality will out. Those who want objective uniformity will go but little better than empty away". The offices of love and faith, a "wide culture" and a study of history soothed the pain in AGM's own tender heart.⁸⁰

In his book on Staffordshire Congregationalism AGM wrote in his concluding paragraph that "most of the story remains untold". He was sensitive enough to know

there is another side to it all, events and personages who were not reckoned important, all the underlying human interest, the tangle of motives good and bad, of faith and unbelief, of zeal and indifference, of souls saved and souls perishing, of this but the veriest fragment is to be found recorded in print: the rest is written by no human hand, in books which are to be opened when this passing show is done.⁸¹

Thus AGM provided the epitaph not only for his own writings and all history, but for all life and his own in particular.

ALAN ARGENT

80. *The Congregational Year Book op.cit.*; G.F. Nuttall, *op.cit.*; A.G. Matthews "Bernard Lord Manning The Historian" *TCHS* (1040-44) XIX 136-142.

81. A.G. Matthews, *The Congregational Churches of Staffordshire* (1924) 247.

LESLIE WEATHERHEAD - PREACHER AND PASTOR: 1893 - 1976

In the fourteen years since he died Leslie Weatherhead has become largely and most unfairly forgotten or ignored. In 1986, on the tenth anniversary of his death, the City Temple was asked if there were any plans for a service of commemoration. The reply was that there were no such plans and that the church should be looking to the future not back to the past.¹ There were, however, plans for just such a commemoration service to mark the first anniversary of the death of the Anglican, David Watson. Weatherhead is out of favour because the tide is running against his kind of reasoned liberalism in favour of the conservative evangelicalism which so disliked him and against which he so often spoke out. The books, sermons and articles of his conservative contemporary Martin Lloyd Jones are still published but it is rare to find Weatherhead on bookstalls, although Arthur James recently re-published some of his books and they sold well. Even Hodder and Stoughton, who were his main publishers for over forty years, appear to have lost interest. In their A to Z of great Christians from all periods and all traditions, from Augustine and Tertullian, past John Wesley and William Booth to Mother Teresa, you will find David Watson but not Leslie Weatherhead, who was for so long their best-selling and most popular religious author.

During virtually the whole of his ministry Leslie Weatherhead enjoyed enormous popularity and a great international reputation. During the war an American minister was reported as saying: "After the war we'll wait and see what Leslie Weatherhead has to say".² When he visited Australia in 1951 it was reported that apart from royalty and Billy Graham, no visitor from abroad attracted more attention or drew bigger crowds. And the longer he stayed the bigger the crowds grew.³ Once on BBC television Richard Dimbleby asked a young American girl on her first visit to Britain which Englishman she admired most and would most like to meet. She replied without hesitation, "Dr. Leslie Weatherhead". His reputation and influence spread far beyond his own church and denomination, and brought many young men and women not only to a christian commitment, but to offering themselves for the ministry. Charles Duthie wrote in an appreciative article: "In the thirties and again after the second world war I was often struck by the fact that Leslie Weatherhead's books figured more prominently than any other man's in the list given by young men presenting themselves as candidates for the Christian ministry. It was clear that he had helped them decisively on the way."⁴

Leslie Weatherhead possessed a rare ability to communicate equally powerfully through the written and the spoken word: for forty years he was in the religious best-seller list: his books - *Jesus and Ourselves*, *The Transforming*

-
1. Correspondence in author's possession, dated March 1985 and 14 April 1985.
 2. K. Weatherhead, *Leslie Weatherhead, A Personal Portrait*, 1975, p.170.
 3. *Ibid.*, p.177; *Kew Advertiser* (Victoria) 17 May 1951.
 4. *British Weekly*, 16 September 1965.

Friendship, The Significance of Silence, Why Do Men Suffer? - like his preaching, made the Christian faith accessible, intelligible, attractive and helpful to thousands. Horton Davies, in *Varieties of English Preaching*, published two years after Weatherhead retired, called him the "most widely known English preacher of our day".⁵ And Duthie quoted a "highly respected theologian who belonged neither to his church or mine" who said "I find myself very much out of sympathy with the theology that lies behind Weatherhead's preaching, but he gets people through to God and that is what matters supremely."⁶

Leslie Weatherhead was born on October 14th 1893 in Harlesden, London. His family came from Moffatt in the Scottish border country. His father, Andrew Weatherhead, was a Scottish Presbyterian who had moved to London where he had married a school-teacher, Elizabeth Dixon, whom he had met at Wesley's Chapel in City Road. When Leslie was two and a half the family moved to Leicester where Andrew Weatherhead was made manager of a wholesale hosiery business. According to Leslie Weatherhead's son Kingsley, "the mother, Elizabeth, was a Christian of terrible and serious aspect", strict and puritanical, and capable of dealing out harsh and savage punishment when her son did something of which she disapproved.⁷

In Leicester he attended the Alderman Newton Secondary School where he was not particularly happy, but he was awarded the popularity prize on a vote of the other students during his last year.

On January 3rd 1903, when he was nine, he recorded in his diary his determination to serve Christ for the rest of his life, and ten years later, after two terms at Cliff College, he entered Richmond College to train for the Methodist Ministry. He had wanted to become a medical missionary in India, but his father had said that he could not afford to pay for a medical as well as a theological training. His ministerial training was interrupted by the outbreak of the First World War, and in 1915 he was sent to Farnham in Surrey, having been rejected for military service on medical grounds. In 1916 he was appointed to Madras in India, and in 1917 he again applied for military service and was accepted. He was commissioned in the Indian Army Reserve, much against the wishes of the Methodist Missionary Service which threatened to dismiss him from the ministry for disobedience. He served as a political liaison officer with the Arabs in Mesopotamia before finally being allowed to achieve his ambition to become an army chaplain, when he served in the Devonshire Regiment. In 1919 he was released from the army and returned to Madras where he continued his ministry until for health reasons he had to return to England in 1922. In Madras he had met Evelyn Triggs, the daughter of a Methodist minister, and they were married there in 1920.

Weatherhead was appointed to a church in the university district of Manchester. It was a large Victorian building with seating for a thousand and a regular congregation of thirty. With some university students he visited over

5. H. Davies, *Varieties of English Preaching 1900-1960*, 1963, p.30.

6. *British Weekly*, 16 September 1965.

7. Weatherhead, *op.cit.* p.17.

3,000 homes in Manchester, and set up discussion groups and established a social hour after the service. It was not long before the congregation grew and the church became full for Sunday services. In Manchester he developed his interest in psychology which had begun in the desert where he had met a doctor who was practising psychotherapy with remarkable results. The doctor made a connection between the treatment of psychosomatic problems and the healing miracles of Jesus which made a profound impression on Weatherhead. When this doctor was later killed in an accident Weatherhead felt called to carry on his work and develop his ideas.

In Manchester he produced his first book, *After Death* which was the outcome of his experiences during the war and was aimed at helping people who had lost loved ones. The book was liberal, especially in its treatment of hell, and stirred up a considerable controversy. He was accused of heresy and made to appear before the discipline committee of the Methodist Conference. He was exonerated, but the publicity turned the book into a best seller. His own reaction to the argument was to take a Manchester University degree and produce a thesis on the ideas about life after death in the Victorian poets. This was published as *The Afterworld of the Poets*. It gained him his M.A.

In 1925 he followed A.E. Whitham at Brunswick in Leeds, and it was during his eleven years there that he firmly established his national and international reputation. In Leeds he began to practice as a psychotherapist, and in 1929 published his book *Psychology in Service of the Soul*. This book was reprinted eight times in less than three years. He followed it in 1934 with *Psychology and Life* which established him as Britain's leading authority in this field. His pioneering work in bringing together the skills and insights of psychology and medicine in the work of the ministry aroused considerable controversy and hostility, but also produced many imitators. The greatest fuss of all was caused by his book *The Mastery of Sex Through Psychology and Religion* published in 1931. This book shocked a great many people who were horrified that a Christian minister should write so plainly and explicitly on the subject. His concern was to help young people by removing the unhealthy ignorance and fear of sex. The book was still selling well in 1968, far into the decade of the permissive society. (Though I remember being handed it in the 'fifties at the City Temple from under the counter wrapped in a brown paper cover). At the same time he produced one of his most popular books, *The Transforming Friendship* which was the result of sermons he had begun to preach in India and Manchester. This sold over 100,000 copies and was translated into ten languages.

In 1936 he was invited to become the minister of the City Temple. There he established his psychological clinic which brought together ministers, doctors and psychiatrists working together as part of the ministry of the church. As a trained psychologist himself he gave hours of his time to counselling individuals and he used the insights gained into people and their lives and problems to help countless others in his sermons and books. Such was his reputation as preacher and pastor that in 1937 he was receiving over a hundred letters every day. He was not only preaching and counselling, but was regularly

writing articles for the national press on all manner of topics, which widened his audience and increased his reputation for presenting religious ideas in a lucidly clear and often highly controversial way. In 1938, not surprisingly, he suffered a breakdown of his health due to overwork and the strain of bearing the burdens of so many people's problems.

Like many other ministers he had joined Dick Sheppard's Peace Pledge and spoke out strongly against this nation entering another war, but as war grew closer his views changed. He was disgusted by Chamberlain's deal with Hitler. Whilst most of the country was rejoicing at the promise of "peace in our time", Weatherhead said from his pulpit in the City Temple: "for myself I feel like a man who has shaken hands with a burglar and made friends with him on condition that he does not invade my house, knowing all the time that he had plundered the houses of my friends, and only waits for an excuse to plunder mine".⁸ During 1939 he sent teams of young people from the City Temple to Germany to maintain contact with German Christians as long as possible, until war was declared.

He ministered to his city centre church throughout the blitz, and in spite of the dangers of bombing crowds continued to flock to hear him bring the gospel to bear on the fears and anxieties of those critical times. In *Thinking Aloud in Wartime* he dealt with the difficult questions posed to faith by total war with honesty and courage.

When the City Temple was destroyed in 1941, he held the church together, meeting in various places, but particularly at St. Sepulchre's on Holborn Viaduct, until the war ended, and then for eleven years in Marylebone Presbyterian Church. In 1958 after seventeen years without a home the church returned to a new building on its old site. The enormous amount of money needed for the re-building was raised mostly by Weatherhead himself on a remarkable and strenuous tour of America in 1954. Much of the money was given by Mr. and Mrs. J.D. Rockefeller, who greatly admired Weatherhead's preaching and ministry. The new City Temple was opened and re-dedicated in the presence of the Queen Mother on October 30th 1958, and in 1959 Weatherhead was awarded the C.B.E.

In 1950 he had gained his doctorate from London University for a thesis later published as *Psychology, Religion and Healing* which remains a major work in the study of all non-physical methods of healing. This book greatly added to his standing and reputation as an expert in this field, which was further confirmed by his being made President of the recently formed Institute of Religion and Medicine in 1966.

In 1955 he was elected President of the Methodist Conference, which was responsible for opening conversations with the Church of England on church unity, a cause in which he strongly believed.

When he retired from the City Temple in 1960, the *Guardian* described him as "a pastor without equal".⁹ He still had over thirty titles in print and crowds were

8. *Ibid.*, p.115.

9. *Guardian*, October 1960.

still queueing to hear him every Sunday. In 1965, when his last substantial book, *A Christian Agnostic*, was published to coincide with the fiftieth anniversary of his ordination, over a thousand people crowded into the City Temple for a lunch-time teach-in on the book. Once again a book of his roused considerable controversy and there were many hostile reviews. Erik Routley, who did not like the book, nevertheless wrote in *The British Weekly*: "there must be few Christians among those who can read English, who do not owe Dr. Weatherhead a debt of some kind; many owe him an immeasurable debt".¹⁰

Weatherhead's critics could be fierce and vocal, as well as uncharitable. For many conservative christians he was regarded as an arch-heretic although when he went to Sweden to address a conference, Bishop Arvidson, who acted as his translator said to him: "We are very conservative here in Sweden. I have read many of your books, and I find that you are quite heretical at the beginning, but you always end by being orthodox. Would you please begin near the end when you address our people?"¹¹

He was accused of being a popular preacher, as if that were something to be deplored. He was attacked for over-simplifying the gospel, to which he protested:

If I quoted Thomas Aquinas, and Bergson and Otto and Dibelius, someone is sure to think it is a clever sermon, and intellectual preaching - If, having paid studious regard to all I can learn from such masters - I take pains to write simply and illustrate in a homely way and clear away doubts and beat out a track so that a boy of fifteen or a charwoman or a miner or a university professor can equally easily find their way to God, then my effort is damned by some highbrow - by the label 'popular'.¹²

He did in fact do his homework and took great pains to translate abstract and difficult theology into language that ordinary people could understand. Horton Davies refers disparagingly to Weatherhead's use of personal and intimate stories to illustrate his sermons as "Weatherhead's eavesdroppings" a term which Weatherhead found particularly objectionable.¹³ Horton Davies also remarks with surprise that Weatherhead preached so few topical sermons, but as Weatherhead himself pointed out in the preface to *That Immortal Sea*: "I have not included any topical sermons, for the events for which they were prepared are so removed into past history that they are of no interest. But this does not mean that I do not approve of topical sermons. Too great a number of them might lead a preacher to become superficial, but surely the preacher who can say 'Thus saith the Lord' about some situation which is in everybody's mind, should do so".¹⁴ He did in fact frequently comment on current affairs, and often in a courageous and controversial way. During the war especially what was

10. *British Weekly*, 16 September 1965.

11. Weatherhead, *op.cit.* p.165.

12. *Ibid.*, p.141.

13. Davies, *op.cit.* p.219 n.

14. L. Weatherhead, *That Immortal Sea*, 1953 p.7.

happening in the world could not be ignored. In his book *This is the Victory* (1940) he looks ahead to the end of the war and sets out a programme of reforms which not only anticipate the welfare state but also such things as the nationalisation of state services and even the abolition of national sovereignty, and the establishment of a Federal Government in Europe.¹⁵ He spoke out against the Hydrogen bomb, and he spoke up for John Profumo when he was being vilified in the press. He was not, however, directly political, or very interested in politics as such. Unlike Donald Soper, he did not think it helpful for a minister to be identified with a particular party or line; he felt this would alienate those members of his congregation who took a different view and make it more difficult for him to minister to them.

Leslie Weatherhead possessed quite exceptional gifts and skills as a communicator with a rare power to hold an audience. Such was his power that it was even suggested that since he used hypnotism sometimes in his treatment of patients he must also be practising mass hypnotism on his congregations. He was not an orator in the classic sense. On first hearing his voice seemed surprisingly soft and liquid. His style was intimate and conversational. He liked to look at his audience and to carry it along with him, to persuade rather than to dominate or command. One of his most attractive qualities was the way he encouraged you to think for yourself and gave you time to think along with him. He did not bombard you with his rhetorical power or impress you with the weight of his scholarship. His gestures were never wild or extravagant; they were illustrative rather than emphatic. He used humour to relax his audience and to re-capture their attention, and his wit was quick and sharp. He was accused of sentimentality, and he could be very emotional. Sometimes his voice would break and he would find it a struggle to proceed. I asked him about this once (before I had done much preaching and knew the experience myself). He said, how could you talk about the agony of Gethsemane, or the awefulness of the cross without emotion or feeling? He did not depise feeling in religion, and believed that it was very important - but it should be kept always under the constraint of reason.

He was labelled a psychological preacher, but he did not merely preach psychology. He was too much aware of the dark side of things to go in for the kind of "positive thinking" approach of Norman Vincent Peale or Robert Schuller. He used the considerable insights which his psychological training and experience had given him always in the service of the gospel, to help people see into the truth about themselves and their own lives and to bring new light to bear on the stories of Jesus and his dealings with people. One of his favourite sayings was that of Samuel Rutherford - that religion was meant to be the kind of burden that sails are to a ship and wings to a bird. His knowledge of the Middle East and his powers of imaginative description enabled him to bring Bible passages vividly to life. He frequently explained Eastern customs and referred to the original Greek to give new meaning to difficult and obscure passages. Because the person of Jesus was central to his faith and preaching he used the

15. L. Weatherhead, *This is the Victory*, 1940 pp.301 *et seq.*

New Testament stories more than the Old, as a comparison of the blank and full pages in his interleaved pulpit Bible shows.

He tackled the difficult subjects, deeply aware of people's doubts and questions; the problems of suffering and death, evil and guilt. He stressed the importance of a reasoned and rational christian faith. He believed that all truth was of God, wherever it came from, and that truth was paramount and sacred. It should not, and could not, be imposed on anyone at second-hand by dogmatic assertions of authority, but had to be received and felt (as he put it) "in your ductless glands". He was keen to explore new ideas especially on the frontiers of knowledge. He was a member of the Council for Psychological Research because he believed in the existence of a non-material reality, but this was an extension of his christian faith, not a departure from it. He preached frequently on the harsh sayings of Jesus, convinced that they had to be taken very seriously. He believed utterly in the invincible love, goodness and forgiveness of God. He was a convinced universalist, believing that God's love must win over even the most resistant soul since God's purpose, which included every human life, could not finally be defeated, and that purpose was wholly loving and wholly good.

He possessed a sensitivity to nature which gave his sermons a particularly mystical quality and dimension. The beauty he saw in nature he felt pointed to the beauty of God Himself, and he equated the beauty of God with the goodness of God. He was a great believer in the "beauty of holiness" and this influenced his approach to worship as a whole. Preaching to him was not only a means of instruction and inspiration, it was a means to worship. He wanted every part of a service to lift people into the presence of God. It was not only his sermons but his prayers also that touched people's hearts and spoke deeply to their needs. He introduced the practice of praying for individuals by name during public worship, a custom which is now common in many churches but which he pioneered. Sometimes these intercessions produced remarkable healing results, and this practice always deepened the atmosphere of worship and the involvement of the congregation in worship. His preaching was at heart deeply devotional; he believed that every sermon should leave each person in the congregation waiting to worship and praise God, and when he stopped speaking there was a deep and profound silence; a hush which no-one wanted to break.

He preached for a commitment. He believed that the heart of Christianity was living in relationship with God as he made Himself known in the person and presence of Jesus, and he wanted everyone to share in this transforming friendship. When he began his ministry it was the custom in Methodism to ask those who had been converted during the service to stand up. Weatherhead did this regularly in his early days, and carefully recorded in his diary the numbers of those who did so. Later he frequently challenged his hearers to make a decision for Christ, but he would tell them to go home and think about it first: he was opposed to important decisions being made under emotional pressure, because they might be regretted and retracted later.

Although crowds queued to hear him preach, under his ministry the City Temple was not just a preaching centre. He saw the church as a loving,

welcoming and accepting community and he put great emphasis on Christian fellowship. Patients in the Psychology Clinic were encouraged to attend worship and to join the Friday Fellowship, where they would find friendship and support.

Leslie Weatherhead's reputation as a pastor and counsellor was as widely renowned as his fame as a preacher, and the two went together. A major part of this appeal as a preacher was in the way his hearers felt that he was talking to them personally and dealing with their own problems. Weatherhead's "eavesdroppings" were accounts of a particular individual's troubles (carefully disguised so as not to betray confidences) which, because they were not unique, helped others in his congregation to gain insight into themselves and so enabled far more people to benefit from his psychological skills and rare counselling gifts than could possibly have been seen by him individually. This applies also to his books which, published world-wide, brought him letters of gratitude and appreciation from all over the world, but at the same time greatly added to the numbers of people pouring out their troubles and laying the burden of them upon him. His pastoral concern for those who consulted him was remarkable. To give one example: in 1940 (the time of the blitz with all its tremendous and distressing pastoral demands) a young girl of nineteen wrote to him after reading *The Mastery of Sex*.¹⁶ He replied, as he always did, dealing fully with all her questions. Then, over twenty years later, he took the trouble to write to her again to ask how things had worked out for her. Although by that time she had moved, his letter eventually reached her and she wrote to thank him and tell him she was happily married with a family. This giving of himself was costly. He was a highly sensitive and vulnerable man and sleep, health and peace of mind were the price he paid for his caring. Yet he believed, as he said in one of his last sermons, that caring mattered most.

Denis Duncan has referred to him as "a wounded healer".¹⁷ His own dark experiences not only gave him insight into other people's pain, but enabled him to relate to them in such a way that they responded to him and trusted him, because they felt he really understood. When his book *Prescription for Anxiety* was published in 1956 it sold 30,000 copies in the first three weeks. In this book particularly his openness and honesty about his own bleak periods of anxiety and depression encouraged readers to believe that he knew himself what they were going through. Bill Kyle passed on to him a letter from a doctor friend which said "Lately I have returned to Leslie Weatherhead's *Prescription for Anxiety*. I always seem to read this in times of stress and strain - I don't think I could have got through these past few years without that book and my own copy is just about falling to pieces and dog-eared".¹⁸ An elderly lady wrote to him "Recently a friend of mine gave me a copy of your book *Prescription for Anxiety* and I write to express my gratitude for all the help you have given me". She continued "on a longish bus ride the other week I kept thinking of your *House of*

16. Private correspondence in author's possession.

17. *British Weekly*, 24 January 1986; address at Westminster Central Hall Commemoration, 12 January 1986.

18. Private Correspondence.

Prayer and recalling the names of the different rooms - I had a wonderful day out with all my friends and all went well".¹⁹ Such letters are typical of ones he was receiving all the time from all over the world.

There was a well-known saying about the three great Methodist preachers who were together in London during the war years - that Weatherhead loved people, Soper loved an argument and Sangster loved Jesus. But Weatherhead not only loved people: he clearly loved an argument and was always ready to enter or initiate a debate and was often highly provocative and controversial; and, above anything else, he loved Jesus. When he was in America in 1954 he was asked to give a series of lectures which were later published in a book called *Over His Own Signature*. They are studies of the "I am" sayings of Jesus. Explaining his choice of theme he said: "it seemed to me that nothing is more important than what I call 'looking at Jesus' ".²⁰ This more than anything else was the dominant theme of his ministry. At the end of his first book, *After Death*, he wrote: "Through every activity of life the only thing that matters is that we should allow the life of the ages [by which he meant the quality and power of the life of Jesus] to express itself, and that we should infect with it the lives which from day to day we touch".²¹

This he succeeded in doing. It is to be hoped that those who make lists of outstanding christians in future will find a place, and an honoured place, for this man who preached powerfully, courageously, lovingly and warmly, the transforming friendship of Jesus Christ, and through whom that friendship became a real and living experience for so many.

JOHN TRAVELL

REVIEWS

You Are My Witnesses. The Waldensians Across 800 Years. By Giorgio Tourn and associates. Pp. 334. Claudiana, Turin, 1989. \$19.95

The English Dissenters were not alone in commemorating 1689. For the Waldensians that year marked the tercentenary of the "Return" of the exiles from Germany and Switzerland to their Valleys. This book is one of a number published to coincide with that anniversary.

The Waldensian story, spiced as it has sometimes been by myth, is the stuff of which "gripping yarns" are made. Even griping historians are moved by it. It has fired the imagination of many - not least within the United Reformed Church. Shorn of legend and subjected to modern historical scrutiny, it remains a fascinating narrative of Christian witness across the centuries, often in face of considerable odds; and this despite the all-too-human failings of the saints.

The present volume is a revision of Giorgio Tourn's much-translated work of 1977, appropriately supplemented by welcome new sections on the Italian

19. Private Correspondence.

20. L. Weatherhead, *Over His Own Signature*, 1955, p.11.

21. L. Weatherhead, *After Death*, 1923, p.143.

Methodists, now federated with the Waldensians (Giorgio Spini); the Latin American branch of the church from 1857 onwards (Roger Geymonat); and the witness of the Waldensians from 1945 to the present (Giorgio Bouchard). Enhanced by texts, prints, maps, 146 excellently-reproduced photographs, a bibliography, tables and quotations from some "Voices in the 1980s", this is the most comprehensive single-volume work on the Waldensians from their origins in the twelfth century to the present.

The American Waldensian Society is to be congratulated on its initiative in undertaking this project in co-operation with the Waldensian boards in Italy and Argentina-Uruguay, whose Moderators contribute "A Word". The Foreword by Frank G. Gibson, Executive Director of the AWS admirably sets the scene and pulls no punches. The Waldensians, we learn, "are far too contentious among themselves, are possessed of elitist streaks, do not easily accept loving criticism from sister churches." It would seem that beneath their heroism the Waldensians resemble ourselves.

We need more books of this kind from other parts of the Reformed family to increase our sense of global fellowship, and to offset that tunnel vision which can all too easily afflict denominational history.

ALAN P.F. SELL

Patterns of Reform. Continuity and Change in the Reformation Kirk. By James Kirk. Pp. xxii, 516. T&T Clark Ltd., Edinburgh, 1990. £24.95

Thirty years ago the four-hundredth anniversary of the Scottish Reformation was marked by the publication of Gordon Donaldson's *The Scottish Reformation*. This appeared to demonstrate how protestantism was predominantly influenced by Lutheranism mediated through the anglican experience, and how the reformed kirk was from the start episcopalian in intent. Neither argument was novel, but the Scottish episcopate had never been so effectively championed. At the same time a number of catholic historians set out to show a pre-reformed church which was full of vitality and which retained the affection of many of the Scottish people. The long established orthodoxy of a popular Calvinist reformation overthrowing a decayed, moribund church was cast aside. A succession of apologists for the catholic and episcopalian point of view have since built up the picture of a protestant coup in 1560 by a small band of zealots exploiting anti-French feeling, followed some fifteen years later by a further hijacking of the church by presbyterian extremists (= calvinists) under the leadership of Andrew Melville.

For some time Dr. Kirk has been the most persistent critic of this interpretation. In *Patterns of reform* he has brought together nine previously published articles, some of which have been extensively rewritten, as well as three completely new essays. If Kirk's counter-revision has suffered in the past from being spread out over a number of years in a variety of publications, the cumulative effect of this collection is to leave one wondering how we ever strayed so far from the truth. Here protestantism appears as an energetic, popular and radical religious movement which made a decisive breach with the past in the years between 1557 and 1573. There was a degree of continuity in personnel, financial organisation and the lack of persecution, but it is the

change which impresses. Protestantism was not merely the faith of a few itinerant preachers, but initially was sustained in the remarkable privy kirks by a wide range of lay people. It is Calvinism, the most uncompromising form of protestantism, which provided the doctrinal and political drive to this astonishing revolution. A trained, protestant clergy with a firm commitment to a preaching ministry was established throughout most of lowland Scotland, and was already making substantial inroads into the highlands within fifteen years of the reformation parliament. There is in fact a good deal about the highlands, and Kirk convincingly demolishes the pessimistic view of a region deprived of its priests and left in a pagan limbo. In the highlands the ministers of the reformed kirk set about their work of teaching, educating and civilising with all the vigour of evangelists imbued with a sense of mission. Even a relatively cautious convert to the new order like John Carswell, superintendent of Argyll, was inspired sufficiently to translate the Book of Common Order into Gaelic. Nor was this reflection only the work of the clergy. Over and over again one is faced with the importance of lay support and patronage in first protecting the underground church of the 1550s, and then of promoting the work of the kirk after 1560. These range from a lawyer like Clement Little who anticipated the need for a college in Edinburgh to train future ministers, to the great magnates and the lairds whose partnership provided enormous political and social leverage, but who often exacted a price of their own in church lands and ecclesiastical patronage.

The biggest casualties of Kirk's sustained attack are the bishops. It was the unwanted survival of the bishops which burdened the church with so many anomalies, creating the need to devise temporary methods of regional supervision - the superintendents - and a succession of financial compromises designed to gain access to the fruits of the old benefice system. That bishops survived at all was due to the determination of James VI and I to rule the church through career opportunists like John Spottiswoode who embraced the King's erastian views in return for personal advancement. It was King James, not Andrew Melville, who hijacked the Scottish Reformation, plunging the church into a bitter controversy which was to rumble on throughout the seventeenth century.

This is a very important book by a scholar known for his meticulous attention to detail and with an unrivalled knowledge of his sources. Unfortunately, in his enthusiasm to bury the opposition Dr. Kirk is inclined relentlessly to pile on the detail to the point where the reader is exhausted. Consequently, neither the reader nor the student will find this an easily accessible volume. However, for those prepared to persevere *Patterns of reform* provides a wealth of information, and as near to a cast iron case for the popular, Calvinist and presbyterian reformation as one is ever likely to encounter.

KEITH M. BROWN

The Dissolution of Dissent, 1850-1918. By Mark D. Johnson. Pp. xxiii, 345. Garland Publishing, New York and London, 1987. \$55

Deservedly published in the Garland Series of Outstanding Dissertations, Dr. Johnson's important study concerns the theological changes that affected

Old Dissent in the period between the Great Exhibition and the end of the First World War. More particularly it is concerned with Congregationalism and with its theological education moving through the thought of R.W. Dale to the founding and development of Mansfield College, Oxford. But this is not theology apart from the world, as treasured in the study, but theology in context for it is argued that Oxford-accepted Congregationalism is very different from the nonconformity of social protest of the earlier part of the century.

The first chapter, sub-titled "The Theological Education of R.W. Dale", focuses on the Old Evangelicalism and the New, and starts with Dale's perhaps too-influential evaluation of the impact of the Evangelical Revival within the history of English Dissent, namely that it was responsible for the loss of an inherited Puritan churchmanship, high in its respect for the corporate identity of the church. That cannot be denied but it needs to be set both within the context of the missionary failures of eighteenth-century dissent and the new urgency of mission recaptured from the last decades of the eighteenth century onwards. That is to say, not all was loss. Johnson characterises Dale's "New Evangelicalism" as, eschewing the otherworldliness of the older evangelicalism, championing a theology of participation, requiring nonconformists to be full participants in the mainstream of national life. In securing this change, the influence of F.D. Maurice becomes abundantly clear. And so, argues Johnson, by assimilating nonconformity to the mainstream of national life, Dale and his well-intentioned colleagues actually contributed to "the erosion of a separate Nonconformist culture".

The second chapter, by analyzing the persons involved and the forces at work in the Leicester Conference of 1877, witnesses stage two of this process of dissolution which Johnson sees as a highly significant indicator of the development of Congregational theological angst. Whilst no church left the Congregational Union as a result of the action, the Leicester men still occupied their pulpits and the resolutions of the Union in no way hindered the continued drift of Congregational theology in an ever more liberal direction. By contrast the Baptist Union did lose churches over the Downgrade and the controversy did have a sobering impact on theological developments amongst the Baptists.

And so to the story of the colleges: first, the crisis of the 1870s, that is their failure to produce the cultivated ministers that upwardly mobile congregations were anxious to secure. The trouble was those who were cultivated seemed all too easily to abandon the orthodoxy of historic congregationalism. Thus plans were laid for the storming of the Oxford citadel and the opening of Mansfield, and the bringing of the training of Congregational ministers within the Oxford School of Theology. The fascinating story of Mansfield's early years is of interest not only for its own sake but also for what it indicates of the position of dissenters in the university generally, and the leakage not only to nonconformity, but to the Christian faith of those who had taken advantage of the opening of the university to dissenters. At Mansfield, Fairbairn promoted the New Puritanism, as a kind of refinement of Dale's New Evangelicalism, defined as an attempt to realize New Testament ideals under the conditions of modern life and "to apply them to the spirit and needs and aspirations of the whole man and every man, as

well as to society and the State”.

But, argues Johnson “the New Puritanism failed to provide Nonconformity with a strong enough rationale for survival” and so “at Mansfield the New Puritanism became a plea for ecumenism”. That is to say that as Congregationalists lost confidence in the particularities of their own position - theologically, ecclesiologically, and politically - so the catholicity of ecumenism became the more attractive, especially in a context of more general secularization. More particularly Johnson refers to conversations about possible reunion with the Anglican Church. “Ecumenism”, claims Johnson, “was the final phase in the dissolution of Dissent”.

Johnson tells a good story and for that we should be grateful, for the analysis is shrewd and the research thoroughly carried out. But can the text of that last sentence be allowed to stand as an epitaph to Nonconformity? There are at least three reasons why I think that cannot be so. In the first place, Johnson gives insufficient weight to the achievements of nonconformist theologians both in the nineteenth and in the twentieth century.

Secondly, there is the question of representation. Whilst not wishing to challenge the judgement that in many respects Congregationalism was the brand leader of English nonconformity and thus very influential within the whole body, the question must be asked as to how far Mansfield can be allowed to stand for the whole of Congregationalism, and how far scholarly Congregationalism can stand for the whole of Nonconformity: were others, however benightedly, more faithful to their dissenting, puritan, evangelical heritage?

And thirdly issue must be taken with the concept that ecumenism necessarily involves the dissolution of dissent. Is ecumenism in fact such an unprincipled creature? Moreover there was a practical evangelical ecumenism in the nineteenth century long before Mansfield students began to study Ritschl. Nor did the Anglican Church stand where it had stood at the beginning of the nineteenth century, but, *pace* Neibuhr, had increasingly accommodated itself as a denomination alongside the major Free Churches to becoming a part of what has been called a pluralistic establishment. Nor can the impetus to ecumenical action ever be isolated in purely insular terms, but must always be considered within the context of the pressures bearing upon Christian witness across the world. By contrast, to say that “Ecumenism was largely a response to the acute awareness that Christianity, itself, [as manifested in the larger denominations in England and North America], was losing ground to the complexities of modern industrial society”, seems peculiarly partial in its judgement. Is ecumenism itself to be as closely tied to the outlook of the SCM and the Mansfield tutors that threw their weight behind the movement as is here suggested?

It is Johnson’s meagre judgement of the ecumenical movement which is in the end the most serious part of his analysis for it is the part that, if justified [and certainly this reviewer questions whether in fact the case has been substantiated], speaks most urgently to current strategies. Whilst the case may not have been made historically, this important book may still stand as a cautionary warning to dissenters involved in the ecumenical movement to pursue the principles of puritanism, dissent and evangelicalism within that broader catholic context.

J.H.Y. BRIGGS

Young Vincent. The Story of Van Gogh's Years in England. By Martin Bailey. Pp. 167. W.H. Allen, London, 1900. £14.95

Beautifully written and illustrated, with eight prints in colour, this book will give pleasure to all with an interest in art and biography. Dr. Bailey is a journalist with several books to his credit who is hoping to arrange an exhibition about Van Gogh's stay in England. The subject is of interest to our Society because of the artist's brief yet significant attempt at pastoral work at Turnham Green Congregational Church under the benevolent eye of Thomas Slade-Jones, its founder and minister. Had Van Gogh had a better command of the English tongue and a more tractable spirit, he might well have become a Congregational minister or a missionary serving with the London Missionary Society, and the world would have lost one of its great imaginative painters.

Vincent's life was a series of grim failures. He was that kind of aloof, shy, unsociable person, who soon puts others off. Hence he suffered rejection in love and work. There can be no doubt about his zeal for the gospel in the period of which we are speaking, but no one could imagine him leading a congregation. Save, perhaps, Slade-Jones, who employed him as a teacher at his school in Isleworth at £15 *per annum* plus keep, and encouraged him to test his vocation by Sunday School teaching and visiting the children's homes at Turnham Green. Even when he failed to return to school after the Christmas vacation in 1876, Slade-Jones kept faithfully in touch with him and a little later on accompanied him and his father, also a pastor, to an interview at a Bible school at Laeken, Brussels. Unhappily, Van Gogh did not survive his probation there but was turned out for rebelliousness and bad dress and manners. Looking back in 1881 Van Gogh began to see where he had gone wrong. He had wanted to give, not to receive. "Foolish, wrong, exaggerated, proud, rash - for in love one must not only give but also take".

As far as we can tell, Van Gogh never painted in England. However, he was developing a powerful sense of observation - his descriptive writing is sharper than a novelist's. And he never stopped drawing. Unhappily his one drawing of Turnham Green church is totally unremarkable, being not much larger than a postage-stamp in the margin of a letter. It is unmistakably a tin tabernacle.

The last chapters of the book describe Van Gogh's debt to the artists who supplied the *Illustrated London News* and the *Graphic* with drawings. He collected 500 of them. Of particular interest are the origins of some of the artist's most famous paintings in George Eliot and Charles Dickens.

The author has gathered together the researches of several people, amateur investigators, as well as his own discovery of rich deposits of family correspondence, hitherto unpublished, in the vaults of the Van Gogh Museum in Amsterdam, and produced an account of the artist in his early twenties, and incidentally, of life in London and the Home Counties in mid-Victorian times, which deserves our praise and gratitude.

JOHN H. TAYLOR

Gathered Together: A History of Harpenden United Reformed Church. By Mary Skinner. Pp. 55. Harpenden, 1990. £3.50 from the author, 5 Carisbrooke Road, Harpenden, Herts.

Harpenden is a pleasant place, where one would like to live if one had to work in Luton. It has a deliciously churchy Methodist Church, architecturally ruined by prosperity. Its United Reformed Church (formerly Congregational) has its late Victorian moments. Frank Salisbury, the fashionable artist who was both a Methodist and a Congregationalist, and whose work is due for revival, was reared in Harpenden. Henry Gilbert, the agricultural scientist who pioneered at Rothamsted, was a Congregational minister's son. Halley Stewart, the politician, industrialist and philanthropist who had started as a Congregational minister, retired to Harpenden. And Harpenden's Congregational church benefited from them all. Henry Salisbury built its Sunday School; Ann Gilbert provided its British School with hymn books; Halley Stewart sat in the front pew, below the pulpit. In its early days the church benefited from the ministry of men who ran Harpenden's "Dissenting Grammar School for Boys", set up by Maurice Phillips who had been headmaster of Mill Hill, and for a while rivalling Mill Hill. In sum Harpenden's Congregational church was more prosperous than most causes in such places. Mary Skinner's judicious history demonstrates the fragility of such prosperity, the brevity of too many ministries, the clashes of personalities and the failures of strategy as well as the fidelity of many families and that devotion of the awkward which at times transcends all awkwardness.

J.C.G.

A History of King Street Mission, Eccles and The Closing Years of Cavendish Street Congregational Church, Manchester. By Ian H. Wallace, 1990.

Ian Wallace, a retired minister in Greater Manchester, continues the somewhat masochistic task of providing histories of churches which are now closed. In *A History of King Street Mission, Eccles* he tells the story of a mission church which had a relatively brief history from about 1875 to its closure in 1965. Much of what he writes concerns the routine life of a working-class cause - sales of work, social events, comings and goings of ministers and members, recalling an age which seems more remote than the calendar declares.

The Closing Years of Cavendish Street Congregational Church, Manchester, is sadder, relating the last days of a once-famous church with notable ministers in its record. With the social changes in its surroundings, it sank into a low condition: saddest perhaps is the record of its difficulty in finding any minister to take on its care. There was a final flourish when Alex. Holmes introduced a healing ministry and the church was crowded again; but he soon departed across the Atlantic. The church closed and the premises were sold in 1969.

Each of these two small books is obtainable from the author at 5 Priory Court, Abbey Grove, Eccles, Manchester M30 9QN, at a price of £1 plus 50p postage.

STEPHEN MAYOR