

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

REVIEWS OF BOOKS.

DR. BRILIOTH ON THE HOLY COMMUNION.

EUCCHARISTIC FAITH AND PRACTICE, EVANGELICAL AND CATHOLIC.
By Yngve Brilioth. *S.P.C.K.* 12s. 6d.

Dr. Brilioth needs no introduction to English readers, for his book on *The Anglican Revival* is widely acknowledged to be one of the most discriminating studies, by a foreigner, on the Tractarian and Anglo-Catholic movement. In the present work, written after he had published his book on the present state of our Church, he strives to trace the history of Eucharistic Faith and Practice throughout the ages, and if we find ourselves at times unable to accept conclusions drawn by him, we give him full credit for competent knowledge and honesty of purpose. Where we are most in disagreement with his views, is in the sections dealing with English matters, and we are not surprised when we gather that as far as our Church is concerned he learned most from one who was closely associated with Pusey House. It is almost impossible for a foreigner, no matter how keen he is in his search for facts, to arrive at them in perspective, and this is seen in his comments on the teaching of the Congregationalists, in which he attributes apparent importance to the "Free Catholic movement," which in spite of its many publications represents only a minute fragment of Free Churchmen without any influence whatever among the great body. And at times some of his references to isolated passages from Anglican writers mislead the reader. Even English authors are not free from the fallacy of "single instances," and a brilliant foreigner is specially liable to fall into the snare.

His book is timely when our relation to the Orthodox Church is under discussion. He tells us plainly that it is impossible to make the rite instituted at the Last Supper into a sacrifice (in the ordinary sense), except by rendering "Do this" as "Offer this"; an interpretation which is quite needless, even though there is no doubt that the word *poiein* sometimes bears this meaning. He brushes aside the popular interpretations in Anglo-Catholic circles of passages in the Epistle to the Hebrews with the remark that no theory of the Eucharistic sacrifice held any place in the writer's thought, and the history of the growth of the idea of Eucharistic sacrifice as expiatory or propitiatory is faithfully presented. And when he comes to the doctrine of the Greek Church on the character of the change in the Elements following consecration he states what we believe to be strictly in accordance with the facts: "The Greek view of the sacred elements as possessing a substantial holiness of their own passed over to the West, and became a decisive factor in the subsequent development, side by side with the Western idea of the sacrifice. Later on, it was the turn of the East to receive the idea of the Real Presence back from the West in the materialized

form of transubstantiation (*metousiosis*), and this doctrine in large measure took the place of the less definite conversion doctrine (*metapoiesis*) of John of Damascene, which would otherwise be the final point in the development of the early church in the East." In all discussions of Eucharistic teaching it is essential to bear in mind the two aspects of Sacrifice and Elements, for the characters of both are so interconnected that it is impossible to separate them. The effort to keep them apart and explain their innocence—so to speak—when sundered, must be resisted as giving an entirely wrong idea as to what the word Mass, which combines both, connotes.

In his description of Eucharistic teaching in our Church it is clear that his sympathies are Anglo-Catholic, although as a Lutheran he is disturbed by the practice of Reservation, which involves the risk of a "paganizing" of Christian worship. He is most enthusiastic on the Canon found in the Deposited Book, on which he writes: "In spite of the criticisms of the Canon of the New Prayer Book, which have been made by some of the most eminent English liturgical scholars, the foreign observer may be allowed to express the opinion that if it should come into general and authorized use, the Church of England will possess one of the noblest of all evangelical Eucharistic liturgies." All we have to say on this is, that whatever may be the merits of the Canon in the eyes of Dr. Brilioth the remarkable fact remains that no feature of the Deposited Book has been less welcomed by its supporters, for Diocesans have announced that they have received very few applications for permission to use it at the services of the Church.

When we pass from the Church of England to the Swedish Church we find our author most informing, and are interested to note that the word Mass has quite a different meaning in Sweden to what it has with us. It is used for a service generally in conformity with our Morning Prayer without any Eucharistic addition. We well remember how during the Copec meetings many English observers were amazed to find High Mass as part of the official services of the Congress—an illusion due to their ignorance of Swedish usage. Here, on the contrary, the introduction of the word Mass has a definite significance concerning the Eucharistic Presence in the Elements and the Sacrifice of the Host. In all these matters—even in reading this most attractive volume—we have to avoid the danger of giving the same word always the same meaning.

THE HISTORIC JESUS.

THE HISTORIC JESUS. By James Mackinnon. *Longmans*. 16s.

We approached the study of this book with feelings of gratitude to its writer for his great work on Luther, and we have to confess to a feeling of profound disappointment with the conclusions Dr. Mackinnon reaches concerning the Person and miracles of our Lord. As was to be expected, Dr. Mackinnon illustrates the teaching and life of our Lord with a wealth of historical knowledge and the fruit of a well-trained mind. The description of the time in which our

Lord lived, the sketches of the environment and the study of the chronology of His ministry—latent though it frequently is—are most helpful to the Bible Student. The same may be said of the reverent spirit that breathes through his pages. He concludes concerning our Lord's Person: "No abstraction He, as the orthodox theologians have too often made of Him. But whilst His human existence is that of ourselves, it touches the sublime and leaves us by contrast on the lower level of aspiration, of discipleship, of adoration of the divine in Him, in Whom the Father-God has manifested Himself and come nigh unto us and imparted the power to rise above and overcome the sin and the sorrow, the darkness and the dread of this life in the flesh." Yes: our Lord is all this, and we too have at times revolted against the abstractions of some writers, who, however, in their emphasis on the Deity of our Lord, were much nearer the right conception of His Person than, we believe, Dr. Mackinnon is. The human mind is strange, and we have more than once in reading this book felt that at heart Dr. Mackinnon rises above the feeling he gives of holding, as central, the thought of an "all too human Christ."

We have read carefully what Dr. Mackinnon says on the three crucial incidents—the Virgin Birth, the raising of Lazarus and the physical Resurrection of our Lord. On all three he adopts an attitude of the rejection of their historicity. He traces the first to the growth of a legend: "True, the belief in the natural generation of the Divine Saviour might well consort with a very elevated conception of him in the thought of Paul and even the fourth Gospel. To the more naïve type of mind, reflected in the nativity stories, this generation was evidently incompatible with the person and function of the Messiah." And the naïve type has triumphed to the detriment of historical fact. Again, in writing of the raising of Lazarus he says "the story, though wonderfully dramatic, cannot be regarded, in some respects, true to life." It manifestly reflects the hand of the writer who, skilful as he undoubtedly is, never quite succeeds in obliterating himself, and therefore begets the suspicion that as an historian he does not know the difference between history and allegory, though the allegory may have some basis in the traditions relating to Jesus' psychic power over disease. And the miracle is not historical.

On the Resurrection he comes to the same conclusion: "Had Joseph, after the conclusion of the Sabbath on the previous evening, removed the body, which had been hastily buried in his own tomb, to another, and did Mary, after all, ground her belief in the resurrection, not on the empty tomb, but on the appearance of Jesus, which the writer regards as a bodily one? The inference of the extraction of the body is not necessarily a modern assumption. It has at least the impression of the first visitant to the tomb to support it." He offers as an alternative theory the growth of a visionary experience of overstrained women. We can only regard such efforts of explaining away as desperate attempts to retain the Easter Faith by rejecting the Easter Message, in spite of the fact that the whole

teaching of the early Church was based on the Message. If the Message be untrue, then we are of all men most miserable, for we have founded our faith on historical untruth and have been the deluded victims of a mirage.

CHRISTIAN ETHICS.

THE PROBLEM OF RIGHT CONDUCT. A Text-book of Christian Ethics. By Canon Peter Green. 6s.

We have read a great number of books on Christian Ethics, We have studied the history of Ethics from the academic standpoint and like most students have found ourselves at times bewildered by the effort to confuse what, to our untutored mind, seemed to be self-evident, and at times we have felt that the effort to frame Ethics into a living whole as distinct from the consciousness of right-doing which comes from the study of the Gospels and communion with God through Christ, is an impossibility. We have inherited a Christian tradition of conduct which has been the basis of our modern life, and until half a century ago it was the custom of rationalists to praise as highly the Christian Ethic as they condemned often ferociously the absurdity of the Christian Faith. To-day on all sides we see not only the authority but the utilitarian expediency of the Christian Ethic challenged, and the need for sound, healthy guidance has become a necessity. Few men are able to write a book that will be satisfactory to the professional student and the Christian worker. Canon Green boldly essayed the task, and having read his book from cover to cover we unhesitatingly recommend it to all who wish to know why they act Christianly and to learn the consequences of violating the morality of the New Testament.

Ethics have a definite basis in human nature, in society and in man's relation to God. We can never neglect any one of these three factors, and Christianity emphasizes the dependence of right conduct on right ideals. The revelation of God in Christ gives us an example of what our ideal ought to be, and Canon Green is never blind to this fact. He knows the stock and even the exceptional apologies given for moral aberrations, and he has a healthy regard for the part reason has to play in meeting plausible objections. He knows that mathematical proof cannot be given of the right solution to many hard questions, but he can point to the right approach and the means of securing that practical certitude which we must have when we start on a definite course of right action. There is hardly a leading problem of conduct that has to be faced by the average man or woman that does not come under discussion, and if it does not, Canon Green gives us the principles that ought to guide us. He is not blind to the difficulties good men have, not in choosing between what they know to be right and wrong, but in determining what good they should follow when competing goodnesses have to be faced and one or other rejected. He truly tells us that the Christian way is the right way. "You cannot, so to speak, add a top varnish of Christianity to a non-Christian philo-

sophy. Especially the doctrine of sacrifice exemplified in the Cross (and, incidentally, also in all saints, heroes, mothers and other saviours of men) must go to the very roots of human conduct. This, the way of sacrifice, must be *the* way. This, of course, is what St. Paul meant when he said, 'God forbid that I should glory, save in the cross of our Lord Jesus Christ'; God forbid, that is to say, that I should have confidence in any course of conduct other than that which is exemplified in the Cross of Christ. This principle of the power of Sacrifice, this truth that mankind can have anything for which someone is prepared to pay the price, is the greatest practical importance in Ethics." Here we close with the remark that valuing the book most highly, we by no means agree with some of the Canon's conclusions. But then, if we did agree, there would never be any conflict between the "goods" and life would not be enriched by the different choices of equally honest men.

ENGLISH PURITANISM.

STUDIES IN ENGLISH PURITANISM FROM THE RESTORATION TO THE REVOLUTION, 1660-1688. By C. E. Whiting, D.D., B.C.L. S.P.C.K. 21s.

A few years ago the Bishop of Truro declared that the "Church of England took an enormous risk" when at the Reformation "it put the Bible in the hands of the public." Certainly this "risk" was greatly increased when at the same time it allowed the individual Christian to exercise the right of private judgment in matters of Faith. When the Homily on "The Knowledge of Holy Scripture" counselled the "humble man" "to search any truth boldly in the Scriptures," and if ignorant, to search the more "to bring him out of ignorance," it opened wide the door to liberty of thought and interpretation which had been so rigidly closed for several centuries previously. Undoubtedly it was a courageous policy involving "risks," but as the result proved, these "risks" were small compared with the alternative of the intellectual stagnation which so largely prevailed when liberty of thought was so carefully confined, hampered and restricted within the bounds of medieval orthodoxy. With the Bible practically a "new book," in the mother-tongue, and eagerly read by all classes, it was only natural that the succeeding century would witness to very diverse results from this new liberty of private interpretation of the Scriptures. The general disorganization and the increased license of the times of the Civil War and the Commonwealth only intensified and accelerated this tendency, and consequently in this respect there is a fruitful field to be examined during the Restoration period. Sufficient time had, however, now elapsed to furnish the best opportunity of estimating the "ravages" which this exercise of an unlimited right of private judgment had produced.

Dr. Whiting examines this changeful and fascinating period of history with a fullness of knowledge and detail which at once excites the admiration, if not the despair, of most students. In his ex-

haustive study of the subject scarcely a phase of English Puritanism is neglected, and as a result he gives us a most comprehensive survey of the history of the whole movement and of the fortunes of the various sects which flourished at the time, coupled with an amazing amount of reliable information concerning the treatment of the ejected Nonconformists, and especially of the fortunes and fates of their leading ministers. It was a generation of remarkable contrasts, of darkness and light. There was the shameless worldliness and licentiousness of the Court party, the sober and solid learning and devotion of many of the clergy, and the pronounced piety and religious, even if at times fanatical, fervour of the "sectaries," as evidenced in their transparently holy and self-denying lives.

From the original documents, which he cites freely, we are able to form a correct estimate of the extent of the persecution and of the sufferings which these Dissenters "for conscience' sake" endured, and also to compare them with the privations inflicted on Churchmen during the Commonwealth régime. It is an unprofitable task which only makes us thankful that we live in a more tolerant age when the "odium theologicum" does not produce such distressing and direful results. There is little doubt that under both régimes the unfortunate Quakers, who were hated by all parties, fared far worse than the more organized regular Dissenting bodies, like the Presbyterians, Independents and Baptists. Undoubtedly numbers of Quakers died from the effects of the severe persecution, while over 12,000 suffered imprisonments, fines and prosecutions between 1660 and 1680. In fact, the account of the shameful brutalities and inhumanities used towards these largely inoffensive and harmless sufferers is revolting and scarcely credible. It is a striking testimony to their faith and zeal that even during this most troubled period they were conspicuous in their apostolic missionary labours.

In an instructive chapter on "The Minor Sects," the author gives us much curious and even startling information concerning the wild and often loose and immoral views and teaching of the many insignificant sects, the very names of which few people to-day have even heard of. The total numbers of these dangerously fanatical people were very small and almost negligible compared to the main body of the orthodox Dissenters, and they furnish evidence that the "risks" of unrestricted liberty of thought had not led to any very disastrous consequences. Dr. Whiting gives us a most informative account of "Dissenting Life and Institutions," in which we learn much about the numerous Dissenting Academies which existed in different parts of the country where famous Ministers and even often future Church dignitaries received a really good and liberal education. There is a most interesting chapter on "The Foreign Protestants in England," especially in connection with the refugees from the persecution in France owing to the "Revocation of the Edict of Nantes." Even before this time there is evidence that the French congregations in England used the French translations of the English Liturgy, and refugees on reaching England

immediately conformed to the usages of our Church, and these French and foreign churches accepted the episcopal control of the Bishop of London. In this way we get abundant illustration of the real fellowship and intercourse which existed between Churchmen and the French Protestants at this time, and it is valuable evidence of the continuance of that close relationship which was maintained between Anglican Churchmen and their Reformed brethren on the Continent from the reign of Edward VI. It is a little difficult, therefore, to justify Dr. Whiting's statement that after 1662 the "Anglican Church had nothing to do with the Protestant Churches of the Continent," especially when we recall the close intercourse which Bishop Cosin had with the French Huguenots, and the cordial spirit displayed towards the Foreign Reformed Churches later on by Archbishops Sharp and Wake.

The facts which Dr. Whiting has so laboriously collected are often most illuminating and instructive, but his comments on them occasionally betray, and are coloured by, his own special ecclesiastical outlook and prejudices, and he would find it very difficult to substantiate the accuracy of some of his *obiter dicta*. He does not, for instance, cite the rubric which could establish his assertion that "the Prayer Book orders Holy Communion on all Sundays and Holy Days"? It is also surely a misuse and confusion of historical terminology to call *at this time* the Churchmen "Catholics" and the Nonconformists "Puritan and Protestant." Since the anti-thesis was then drawn between "Puritan" and "Protestant," and at least up to 1662 all churchmen were ranged in the latter class, and the clear-cut divisions were those of "Papist," "Protestant," and "Puritan." He himself quotes an Anglican writer in 1674 who identifies the "Protestant Religion and the Church of England" (p. 409), while the Bishops declared in the House of Lords in 1673 that the "Protestant Religion" is "comprehended in the Thirty-Nine Articles" and the other Formularies of the Church of England. Neither is it accurate to declare that the Puritans who remained in the Church after 1662 became "the Low Church party," since this designation was more properly applied to the Latitudinarian, who, as Dr. Sacheverell declared in his *Low Churchman's Creed*, "believed in little or no Revelation, and had rather lay his faith upon the substantial evidence of his own reason than the precarious authority of Divine Testimony"—a Creed which was certainly not that of the Puritan!

Again our author contradicts himself when in one place he declares that the Dissenters had no quarrel with Church *doctrine* (p. 45), and yet in another he asserts that they objected "to the Anglican system in its *doctrine*" (p. 490). Certainly the latter statement is incorrect as regards the main body of the Nonconformists, since they willingly subscribed to all the *doctrinal* Articles as required by the terms of the Toleration Act of 1689, while Baxter expressly declared that they had no quarrel "with the *doctrines* of the Prayer Book." In view of the definite contemporary evidence, it would be interesting to see how Dr. Whiting would substantiate

his categorical assertion that "the Anglican Church refused to recognize Presbyterian ordination" (p. 491). He himself gives several quotations from the writings of prominent Churchmen testifying that the "Church of England did not unchurch the foreign Protestants" (p. 517), while the actual proposal of the Bishops at the "Jerusalem Chamber Conference," 1689, was to allow foreign divines to minister in England *without further ordination* (Cardwell, *History of Conferences*, 412). Numerous Caroline bishops, including Bramhall, Cosin, Sharp, Hall, Ferne and Wake, definitely repudiated this intolerant position. Dean Sherlock expressly declared "the Church of England does not deny but that in case of necessity the ordination of presbyters may be valid." But the fact that the revived Scotch Episcopal Church in 1662 permitted all the existing Presbyterian ministers, willing to do so, to retain their cures *without re-ordination* is a sufficient practical refutation of this unfounded assertion of the Anglican denial of Presbyterian Orders.

In spite of the mass of detail and the numerous quotations which are necessarily contained in these 580 closely printed pages, Dr. Whiting's story is well related and makes, not dull, but most interesting reading. He has certainly given us the fruits of a most laborious and valuable research work, which obviously must have taken several years of close and patient study to compile. It constitutes a veritable storehouse of facts and varied information for the historical student of this period.

C. S. C.

THE ICONOCLASTIC CONTROVERSY.

A HISTORY OF THE ICONOCLASTIC CONTROVERSY. By E. J. Martin, D.D. S.P.C.K. 16s.

This book is ably written, well printed and well bound. It forms not only a remarkable volume in the publications of the new Church Historical Society, but a notable contribution to our knowledge of Byzantine history. The work of Bury has not been in vain. Yet the price is far too high for a book which has been published by a powerful and well-supported Christian agency. If the S.P.C.K. is really to help the spread of knowledge and to encourage reading, it must reduce the price of future works in the Church Historical Society series. The book has a poor index.

Dr. Martin pays a tribute to Neander, whose work on this period is still valuable. Iconoclasm sprang from the conviction of the Isaurian Emperors and was sustained by the policy of their successors, the Armenians. It was inspired by the breath of nearer Oriental hostility towards idolatry. From the same source came the teaching of Muhammed, a fact which Dr. Martin merely notices in passing. He might have stressed the point that Muhammed would never have been necessary as a scourge of the Church, if Eastern Christianity had remained free from image-worship. In the first Christian centuries art was merely symbolic, but with the

appearance of pictorial art came the development of superstition in worship. The most extraordinary powers were attributed to the images. A deliverer arose in the person of Leo the Isaurian, who flung back the Saracens from the walls of Constantinople in 718—a victory comparable in effect with that of Charles Martel at Poitiers (732). The high-water mark of the movement was reached in the time of Constantine V (Copronymous), who assembled the Council of 753. The controversy played a larger part in the East than in the West because it was interwoven with the Christological dispute. It was argued that the worship of images either mingled the Godhead with the manhood, and so ended in a Monophysite view of the Person of Christ, or divided Christ into two Persons, and so became the heresy called Nestorianism. Dr. Martin thinks that this criticism was unsound. The Council of Constantinople (753) condemned the worship of images, but not the invocation of saints, although this was prohibited later.

Between the two phases of Iconoclasm came a reaction inspired by the Empress Irene, and the Council of Constantinople of 786 reversed the decisions of the Council of 753. The greatest of the later Greek theologians, John of Damascus, co-ordinated the orthodox defence, and his influence was mainly responsible for the failure of the second attempt of the Iconoclasts to rescue the work of their predecessors.

Policy rather than conviction inspired the revived Iconoclasm of Leo V, the Armenian. Image-worship was not allowed, but pictures might be placed high up on the walls of the churches, provided that lights and incense were not burned before them. The Council of 815 did no more than confirm the canons of 753. We may note in passing that the murder of Leo V by Michael the Stammerer was an act of self-defence, and so explains the friendly attitude of Pope Pascal I. However, the Seventh General Council of 786 and not those of 753 and 815 fixed the doctrine of the Eastern Church, and left it in the stereotyped form which John of Damascus had outlined. Yet the Iconoclastic movement was not without result. The image was displaced by the icon in Eastern Christianity, bas-relief took the place of statues, and there was a renaissance of art which returned to primitive models.

Iconoclasm in the West followed a different course. Here it was much more closely interlocked with papal and imperial politics. The Papacy opposed the movement in the course of its quarrel with the Eastern Emperors. Charles the Great espoused it in the course of his opposition to Irene, who failed to respond to his political flirtation. Yet Dr. Martin hardly emphasizes sufficiently the natural antipathy of the Frankish rulers, allied with the common sense of Carolingian learning, towards the excesses of image-worship, and it is doubtful whether he allows enough weight to the writings of Claudius of Turin, Jonas of Orleans, Walafrid Strabo, or even Hincmar as true expressions of the best minds of the West. Possibly this bias, which appears from time to time, in favour of image-worship, although in contradiction with some of his most

telling paragraphs, prevents him from allowing, with Bastgen, that Alcuin, not Charles the Great, wrote the so-called *Caroline Books*. Certainly, if this had been allowed, he must have placed greater stress on the work of the other Carolingian writers. But he truly observes that the Papacy was compelled to tolerate in Charles what it opposed in the Isaurian and Armenian Emperors, and we are heartily in accord with his observation that pictures and images increased in the West when the learning of the Carolingians faded, "Medieval heresy" (and Iconoclasm was regarded as a heresy) "is usually an effort towards intellectual liberty . . . all the sporadic outbursts from Iconoclasm to Wyclif are related to each other"; and he admits that Claudius of Turin had "curious affinities with the sixteenth-century reformers," yet without allowing that there is any fundamental resemblance between Iconoclasm and the Reformation. Again, we may agree with him that Iconoclasm hastened the loss of Oriental imperial dominion in North Italy, and quickened the rise of the temporal power of the Papacy, but it is too much to argue that it was the main cause of the separation between the Eastern and Western Churches. The *Cambridge Medieval History* (Vol. IV) has shown that the causes of fissure were mainly political and geographical. But this is a book for which Evangelicals may be grateful to its lucid and learned writer.

SCIENTIFIC DOGMATISM.

THE FLIGHT FROM REASON. By Arnold Lunn. *Eyre and Spottiswoode*. 7s. 6d.

Mr. Arnold Lunn has done something which required at once courage and a sound judgment as well as wide reading. We have so long been under the domination of catchwords that are supposed to represent the last words of scientific thought that we have been unconsciously accepting materialistic views. These opinions have come to be looked upon as final and authoritative, whereas in fact they are simply the heritage of those who came into the legacy of a type of nineteenth-century thought that has ceased to hold its own where men think and reason.

We have here set forth certain conceptions of Evolution, certain presuppositions of materialism and certain widely held fallacies associated with the pugnacious and proud "science" that dethroned God, abolished mind and left no room for purpose in nature. With rare skill Mr. Lunn selects typical statements and shows how irrational they really are and how wrong they are seen to be in the light of fuller knowledge. He notes that the writers whom he assails close their eyes to inconvenient facts and assume what they believe will fit in with their conclusions. Occasionally he drifts into the extreme of thinking, that because he has exposed a certain type of scientific thought, he must be considered to have killed all cognate ideas. For example, the abandonment of Darwinism does not imply, in the minds of those who have abandoned it, the rejection of the whole idea of Evolution. And again he is much more sym-

pathetic than we believe he is bound to be with spiritualism and its beliefs. Certainly we cannot account for all the phenomena that he describes, but then we have long since passed the post which declares we must know the causes of what we know. Taken as a whole, *The Flight from Reason* should be read by those who wish to see in right perspective the real position of much that passes for scientific and to understand why many believe that there are at least as many unfounded dogmas in the creed of the Victorian Scientist—and most men in the street who talk of science do so in Victorian terms—as there are unprovable dogmas in the Christian Creed which they so glibly attack.

THE HOLY SPIRIT.

THE HOLY SPIRIT. By Raymond Calkins. *Student Christian Movement Press, 1931. 5s.*

The American edition of this book appeared in 1930. But it does not maintain the high standard of the Student Christian Movement publications. The author rightly draws attention, on two occasions, to the neglect of the doctrine of the Holy Spirit by the Church, yet the reader will learn little about that doctrine here. Indeed, the title of the book might well be exchanged for something more general such as "Modern Christianity" or "The Lack of Spiritual Enthusiasm in the Church." Such a title would at least indicate more accurately the contents of the book. The author concentrates attention in these addresses on many obvious defects of modern Christian life and organization, without offering, in his constructive passages, more than vague appeals for a revival of spiritual religion. No attempt is made to grapple with the doctrine of the Spirit, to relate it to the doctrine of the Father and the Son, and then to distinguish the special function of the Spirit in the soul and in the Church and the world.

But he has written with undoubted zeal and has produced some interesting passages. He draws attention to the actual phraseology of some of the New Testament references to the Spirit. The Holy Spirit descended on Jesus at His Baptism "like a dove." At Pentecost a sound was heard "as of a rushing mighty wind," and He appeared in the form of tongues "like as of fire." So, also, the derivation of the word Comforter from "confortare," "to strengthen," is a useful piece of exegesis. Words of wisdom are written when we are warned that the disciples were Christians before they were baptized by the Spirit, and that a *vivid* personal experience of the Spirit's descent upon the individual is not an essential experience. In some cases the Spirit comes quietly and imperceptibly. But there must be fire in personal Christian life. The result will be an effective witness for Christ, and he quotes some striking lines from the *Panama Canal Digger's* song:

"Got any rivers that are uncrossable?
Got any mountains you can't tunnel through?
We specialize in the wholly impossible,
Doing the thing that no man can do."

THE CHALLENGE TO THE CHURCH. By Bernard Herklots, M.A.,
Vicar of St. John's, Wimborne. London: Skeffington & Son,
Ltd., Paternoster House, St. Paul's, E.C.4. 4s. 6d. net.

This vigorous treatise is described as "a dispassionate investigation of the Church's position and prospects," and the author's endeavour has been to find points of contact between different schools of thought, and to suggest that the Challenge which comes to the Anglican Church from many sources and in many ways should prove a factor for unity, as well as a stimulus to leave controversy behind, and bend its united energies to a great constructive task. The Challenge is dealt with in seventeen chapters—consequently a great deal of ground is covered. Seeing that no religious questions divide Christendom like those connected with the Holy Eucharist, we turn with special interest to the chapter headed "The Challenge of the Holy Sacrament." In it we find Anglo-Catholic and Evangelical invited to lay on one side, not as something discredited but as something for the moment superfluous, the whole doctrinal armoury and library and paraphernalia of controversy over Eucharist and Mass and the like, and celebrate the Lord's Supper in such fashion as each feels will give fullest expression to a single and overpowering sense of the inexplicable wonder of the Divine Presence. Mr. Herklots would like to see collected in one spot in one immense colossal pile every book that was ever written about the Holy Communion, and he would have the Archbishops and the Pope, Free Church divines and the heads of all the Churches of the world, set fire to the great pile! Other aspects of the Challenge—in connection with Science, the Bible, Reunion Proposals, etc., etc.—bring us into the arena where we can discuss the subject seriously and calmly. It would be idle to pretend that all the members of any "party" within the English Church will find his fellows in complete agreement with the author, but it is probable that we may grow more tolerant of each other as the answer to the clear and insistent "World call" is heard more plainly. We commend Mr. Herklots' forceful message to the members of the Anglican Communion.

S. R. C.

A HISTORY OF VICARAGES IN THE MIDDLE AGES. By R. A. R.
Hartridge. Cambridge University Press. 15s.

In this work Dr. Hartridge's main, though not exclusive, concern is with our own country. The happy result of this treatment is that he has not dissipated his energies over too vast a field, and is able to support what he says by a thorough and exhaustive examination of examples and statistics.

The book is mainly concerned with the appropriation of tithes by authority, long before A.D. 1000, and papal and episcopal afterwards; also with the adequacy or inadequacy (mainly, it appears, the latter) with which the substituted "vicarages" were endowed and carried on.

The author traces the growth and power of the legal mind in the Church, paramount in the thirteenth century, but spoilt even

then, and in an increasing degree later, by the fact that though the laws of the Church were good, the administrators of them marred their effectiveness by their fickle inconsistency. Nevertheless, he would have the reader remember that "Innocent III's influence was the power that ensured a reasonable service of the parish churches of medieval England" (p. 35).

In the fourteenth century, mainly because of its many calamities, there first came into prominence an abuse which was destined to grow until the Reformation. The monasteries, pleading distress, began to appropriate churches on a large scale. The habit was bound to grow with snowball rapidity, as the tithes were never restored to their previous owners, and, with inevitable expansion, more would constantly be required. The reader is not, therefore, surprised to find, a few pages later (p. 122), that "the whole period 1300-1400 is one of unceasing appropriations and rapid encroachment on the part of the monasteries on the parishes."

The fifteenth century, nevertheless, contained possibilities, and opened with a reasonable hope that all might yet be well, "for not until the Conciliar Movement failed was hope abandoned and the Reformation made inevitable" (p. 127).

In this later period Dr. Hartridge admits the very great evils which followed upon the Dissolution, but maintains that the Monasteries, though they "gave great alms," undoubtedly "took much greater." It was not until the later years of Queen Elizabeth that the law began seriously to take cognisance of the new difficulties.

This is but to touch upon the fringes of a work replete with valuable and well-documented matter. It may be especially recommended to students of that vexed problem, the Dissolution of the Monasteries.

THE CHURCH AND THE CHURCHMAN IN ENGLISH DRAMATIC LITERATURE BEFORE 1642. By Dr. C. Van der Spek. *H. J. Paris, Amsterdam.* 6s.

In his Introduction to this book, Dr. C. Van der Spek clearly states that, within this period, his objects are to determine how far contemporary dramatic literature reflects the social and political position of the English clergy; to analyse the attitude taken up by dramatists toward the Clergy and Church; and to consider the religious influence of the stage.

Until the Reformation, dramatic criticism is directed, with increasing freedom, against obvious abuses. The author is, however, careful to emphasize in his concluding chapter, that it is the priests and clergy who are attacked, while "the Church as such is unimpeachable, no attack on her intrinsic being is tolerated" (p. 173).

Immediately after the Reformation it might well be expected that the attacks would be yet more virulent and unconcealed; and, indeed, they apparently became recognized weapons of controversy. The anti-papal feeling was, of course, strengthened by the national menace from Spain. It is, therefore, all the more

refreshing to find in the writings of Shakespeare a broader and more tolerant view. That the bias was merely quiescent is, however, proved by the fresh outburst of feeling aroused by the Spanish Marriage Project.

Nevertheless, this did not mean that the new Anglican clergy were to be exempt from criticism. At first they appear to have retained all the pre-Reformation abuses under the new forms of religion. The dramatists were quick to hold them up to scorn, but at the same time showed a prudent, though hardly creditable, tendency to confine their attacks to the lower ranks of the clergy. Exceptions to this line of procedure, such as are found in Chaucer's saintly priest, were apparently rare, and the reader is left to take comfort from Professor Trevelyan's spirited defence, quoted by the author, of the "poor parish priests" of the two centuries preceding the Reformation.

Dr. Van der Spek's businesslike treatment of the subject does not call for complexity or waste of words, and his concise style is enlivened here and there by touches of dry humour. His use of the curious word "impopular" is inclined to catch the eye.

The book is attractively "got up," with a stiff paper back, wide margins, and delightfully large print. Messrs. Blackwell, Ltd., Broad Street, Oxford, are the English agents for the publication.

THE REIGN OF GOD. A Drama. By Sir Francis Younghusband.
London: John Murray. 5s. net.

The author of this drama has been described in *The Times* as possessing a singularly receptive and thoughtful mind, and of this there is certainly further evidence in this attempt to portray the life of Christ through a drama in which the main emphasis has been laid upon the vision of the Kingdom of God, because it was that vision which actuated our Lord throughout. In the preface he tells us that as a young man the life of Jesus made no appeal to him, but that through the last forty years its significance has been growing upon him. This is largely due to the influence of Seeley's *Ecce Homo*, though he feels, as others have done, that Seeley had not caught "the full significance of Jesus' life." In an introduction we have a further unfolding of the purpose of this drama. We cannot pretend to agree with Sir Francis on all points. We wonder, for instance, what justification he has for saying that the New Testament is not a precisely accurate record of the utterances and doings of Jesus. He is on safer ground when he says that Jesus was able to produce such an impression on His disciples that "because of it, they have influenced the whole course of human history." Elsewhere we read, "Jesus was not God Himself. He never claimed to be," and again, "Jesus may justly be regarded not as God Himself, but as the supreme representative of God—as the supreme embodiment of the Creative Spirit of the universe." Has he forgotten that Jesus said, "He that hath seen Me hath seen the Father"?

"Emphasis has been put on the Baptism of Jesus by the Holy Ghost, rather than on the Crucifixion because . . . it was in that solemn moment by the Jordan that He touched absolute perfection." But was there ever a moment in which He did not touch absolute perfection and when He was not "most intimately in touch with the Holy Spirit which animates the world"?

However, the drama may be either staged or read, and will in either case present a telling picture of Jesus as He was in the days of His flesh.

S. R. C.

WHERE GO THE DEAD? By Rev. C. W. Hale-Amos, M.A., D.D.
London: Thynne & Co., Ltd. 3s. 6d. net.

There can be no doubt that the war created a demand for books on the after-life, that that demand still exists and is being met by the frequent appearance of treatises on immortality and kindred subjects. Having read a good many of them we can confidently say that they belong to the three classes—good, bad and indifferent! Last year Dr. Hale-Amos's *Flashlights and Certainties* met with even more than a favourable reception, and we give a cordial welcome to the second and enlarged edition which lies before us. A glance at the index shows how many-sided is this subject. Here will be found Christadelphianism, Christian Science, Russellism, Spiritualism, Conditional Immortality, Universalism, etc.—these and other topics are treated in these pages. Well bound and printed, it will be welcomed by the general reader and the Bible Student. There should be a copy on the Book Table in every Church. And, by the way, there should be such a table in every Church.

S. R. C.

PASSION PERSONALITIES. By the Rev. Alfred Thomas, M.A., F.R.S.L. *London: Skeffington & Son, Ltd., Paternoster House, E.C.4. 3s. 6d. net.*

Bishop Welldon, the Dean of Durham, contributes a Foreword to this suggestive volume of addresses on the personalities connected with the Passion, and the author has drawn out their characters in such a way as to invest the drama of our Lord's trial and death with a fresh reality—the result is a thrilling story and, as Dr. Welldon says, Mr. Thomas has carried out a happily conceived idea with true sympathy and reverence. Preachers in search of material for Holy Week addresses will welcome this latest attempt to analyse the characters and conduct of the Actors in our Lord's Passion.

THE SERMON ON THE MOUNT. By the Rev. Clovis G. Chappell, D.D.
London: Williams & Norgate, Ltd. 5s. net.

A delightful collection of vigorous and vivid addresses, and we have no hesitation in saying that since Bishop Gore published his work on the Sermon on the Mount there has been nothing so arresting as this. It undoubtedly takes its place in the forefront among the really masterful expositions that deal with the pressing problems of

present-day Christianity in the light of New Testament teaching. They are all alive with humour and pathos, vivacity and profound scholarship. Every preacher should possess himself of this book, with its wealth of suggestion and its plentiful store of apt illustrative matter. He will find it difficult to find a more profitable investment.

S. R. C.

SIMON THE ZEALOT. By Rev. John S. Hoyland, M.A., F.R.Hist.S.
London: Williams & Norgate, Ltd. 7s. 6d. net.

Here is a delightful volume quite out of the ordinary. Its purpose, in the first place, is to show how the Ministry of Christ must have looked to the Jewish Nationalists of His day, but especially to the man in the inner circle of His disciples, whom we know from his name—Simon the Zealot—to have been a strong nationalist. In the second place, the purpose of the book is to show the practical implications of Christ's ideal of Reconciliation for the concrete problems of His own day, which in many ways are strikingly similar to the concrete problems of the modern world. By the Jews as a whole and by the Nationalists in particular, the advent of Christ was mainly regarded from the political standpoint. To them the Messiah meant emancipation from the hated Roman yoke. As they gradually discovered that He had no message save one of peace, no Kingdom but that of His Father in heaven, their hopes were dashed to the ground and they crucified Him. The book consists, in the main, of brief lectures or talks given day by day to Hindu students, many of whom—the author tells us—were clad in the white homespun of the out-and-out Indian nationalist. The first section is entitled "Beginnings." In the second and larger section the Zealot tells his story, or rather his stories—of parables, miracles, interviews, instructions and happenings in the life of the Redeemer. The short chapters will be found full of helpful suggestion, free from fanciful extravagances and based on the Gospel narratives. Some of the familiar stories Mr. Hoyland has revived, and he can hardly fail to set his readers thinking.

S. R. C.

"THE CHURCH" AND "THE KINGDOM" SCRIPTURALLY CONSIDERED.
By the Rev. William C. Procter, B.D. *London: Thynne and Jarvis, Ltd. 1s. 6d. net.*

Mr. Procter, with his usual careful analytical method, has set out the various passages which deal with the Church and the Kingdom. He seems to assume the two are always distinct—a view that creates more difficulties than it solves. One of his propositions is that the Church was not founded until after the Lord's death, Resurrection and Ascension. During the Great Forty Days (Acts i. 3) "to the apostles whom He had chosen" the Lord was "speaking of the things pertaining to the Kingdom of God." Was *that* the Church which Mr. Procter says was not yet founded? And if the "Kingdom" was not "the Church," then what was it? And what

was the nature of the commandments He had previously given to the apostles? Does Mr. Procter think they had nothing to do with the life of the Church. Then presumably it was not the Church—for it was not yet founded—to which our Lord gave the Sacrament of our Redemption. No: we wonder has Mr. Procter ever read the late Canon Hammond's *What does the Bible say about the Church?*

FANNY JANE BUTLER, PIONEER MEDICAL MISSIONARY. By E. M. Tonge. *Church of England Zenana Missionary Society.* 1s.

Many a noble, unselfish life has been lived "unhonoured and unsung" in the Mission Field. We are glad to have this brief record of one of the Pioneers of Medical Mission work in India. With no exceptional opportunities for self-development or education, but with a deep love for the Master, Fanny Jane Butler patiently and perseveringly worked for the realization of the life-work to which she had dedicated herself, and her efforts resulted in splendid achievement. It is just the book to place in the hands of young girls.

TWENTY DIALOGUES ON UNIVERSAL RELIGION BETWEEN SEEKER AND FINDER. By Walter Walsh, D.D. *London: Williams and Norgate, Ltd.* 2s.

Christian people will do well to leave this little book severely alone. It emanates from a strange community known as the Free Religious Movement, of which Dr. Walsh is described as the Leader. Many forms of religious faith and practice are treated of in its pages. If they are all equally true, it follows (as a great thinker is credited with having said) that they must be all equally false. However, this Free Religious Leader tells us that no kind of religion is entirely false and none entirely true. We are told that the life of our Lord has behind it a mass "of marvels and miracles, myths and legends," and that "the time has come to set aside" the distinctive doctrines of the Gospel and the Sacraments—"two symbolic or magical rites." These have indeed been already abandoned by this precious "Movement." Our Religion is said to have been inherited from various older sources, and Bible infallibility is a "monstrous notion . . . the greatest obstacle to religious and social progress." Our Lord is spoken of as "the vanished Jesus." What will happen to this "Movement"? In a few years it will be forgotten—it will vanish—but Jesus will still be the Leader and Guide.

S. R. C.

AT THE WELL OF BETHLEHEM. By Mona Swann. *London: Leopold B. Hill, 101, Gt. Russell Street, W.C.* 2s. net.

A narrative Drama in three parts—Ruth the Gleaner, David the Shepherd, Mary the Mother—arranged from the Authorized Version of the Bible with a Foreword giving full directions for production.