

Theology on the Web.org.uk

Making Biblical Scholarship Accessible

This document was supplied for free educational purposes. Unless it is in the public domain, it may not be sold for profit or hosted on a webserver without the permission of the copyright holder.

If you find it of help to you and would like to support the ministry of Theology on the Web, please consider using the links below:



Buy me a coffee

<https://www.buymeacoffee.com/theology>



PATREON

<https://patreon.com/theologyontheweb>

[PayPal](#)

<https://paypal.me/robbradshaw>

A table of contents for *The Churchman* can be found here:

https://biblicalstudies.org.uk/articles_churchman_os.php

Changes in the Emphases of Evangelical Belief

1970-1980 : evidence from new hymnody

BILL HOPKINSON

Robin Sheldon has written in introduction to Scripture Union's new hymn book, *Songs of Worship*,

It is a welcome feature of church life today that hymns and songs are being written as prolifically as madrigals were in Elizabethan times. Whereas compilers of hymn books in the early and middle sixties were often only able to include a handful of hymns by living authors, now the whole situation has changed as we have experienced the liberating activity of the Holy Spirit. It is a period of rethinking and experimentation.¹

It is a sentiment echoed in many parts of the church, most particularly—though by no means exclusively—in the charismatic-renewal movement.² Even the second supplement to *Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised* finds that 'Since 1969 there has been an unexpected, fresh and exciting output of English Hymns.'³ It is not just that the Spirit has brought about an era of creativity, with more hymns along old lines, but that a new atmosphere—a 'period of rethinking'—has been created which has led both to the production of original hymns, and also to the new acceptance of some older material which predates the present activity.

This article examines the theological emphases implicit in this new atmosphere and finds that, in comparison with evangelical hymn and song books prior to 1970, significant changes of theological emphasis occur in the new hymn and song books currently in use by many evangelicals. These changes are as pronounced in publications such as Church Society's 1978 supplement to the *Anglican Hymn Book (AHB)*,⁴ as they are in the song books of charismatic renewal such as *Sound of Living Waters*,⁵ although the changes are not entirely the same. This is not necessarily to infer that we are in an era of doctrinal philandering. Individuals, groups and movements within evangelicalism have always emphasized some elements of doctrine more than others, and this paper seeks to note and analyse changes.

The theological importance of hymnody

Shifting emphases in the hymnody of any particular group of Christians are of more than passing historical interest. R. W. Dale once said, 'Let me write the hymns of a Church, and I care not who writes the theology.'⁶ This is too optimistic a view, but it cannot be denied that hymns have had a powerful influence in shaping theological awareness from earliest times. Hymns are, with liturgy, a main source of religious ideas for ordinary Christians. It is difficult to perceive the effectiveness of hymns in these days when they are so constant a companion to Christian life, but picture for instance the congregation of Isaac Watts at a time when they used only paraphrased psalms. The psalms, despite their own value, are not able to speak of Jesus, the Holy Spirit, the cross, the resurrection, and so on. The gospel is essentially missing. When Isaac Watts began introducing his hymns, it was a great step forward in the popular appreciation of the gospel to have etched on the minds of his congregation verses such as:⁷

Not all the blood of beasts,
On Jewish altars slain,
Could give the guilty conscience peace,
Or wash away its stain.

But Christ, the heavenly Lamb,
Takes all our sins away;
A sacrifice of nobler name,
And richer blood than they.

My faith would lay her hand
On that dear head of Thine,
While like a penitent I stand,
And there confess my sin.

My soul looks back to see
The burden Thou didst bear,
When hanging on the accursed tree,
And knows its guilt was there.

Believing, we rejoice
To see the curse remove;
We bless the Lamb with cheerful voice,
And sing his wondrous love.

Moreover, if hymns are educational, they are also re-educational. They have been used in this way frequently in the history of the church. They can be a vehicle for new theological emphases, allowing these to be absorbed by people wherever the hymns are sung. In this way John Hus's hymns were broadcast through the streets of Bohemia. Luther himself set to work to write original hymns 'to keep the word of God alive in the people.' Calvin's theological emphasis, distrusting human composition, found a necessary vehicle in the metrical psalm. The Wesleys' hymns were above all a vehicle of new understanding. Indeed, it has been said that they were the most important propaganda device of John Wesley's new theology.⁸ He himself fully recognized this, and wrote in the preface to one collection of hymns which he edited, 'This book is in effect, a little body of experimental and practical divinity.'⁹ In a lesser way, evangelists such as Moody or Graham have benefited from having their own collections of song material which best suits the idiosyncracies of their individual emphasis.

When a flourish of hymnody appears on the Christian scene, therefore, it seems appropriate to ask what it is about; that is, what new emphases it is carrying. It is on these lines that this article looks at recently published songs and hymns likely to be used by evangelicals, in order to see the direction of theological influence. Contemporary hymns are in fact a valuable means of obtaining an indicator of popular theological trends. It is normally very difficult to define what the rank and file Christian believes—or is influenced to believe—except in impressionistic or anecdotal terms, as there are few obvious ways of making a quantifiable approach to the question. Hymnody, however, has a pervasive influence and yet is compact enough to be subjected to statistical analysis. Such an analysis yields reasonably firm data for comparative study, which in turn can suggest not only the existence but also the extent of any changes in emphasis.

We should consider whose theological emphases hymnody reveals. It represents the theology of individual authors who have felt themselves constrained to write in particular terms. Without people fired by ideas (through the Spirit), the new hymns would not exist, although not all the current flurry of hymnody is new. Perhaps a more telling consideration is that of editorial policy. Look, for instance, at a prolific religious song writer such as Sydney Carter, who does not find his way into evangelical song books because editors do not care for his emphasis. In the end the editor decides what goes in, and the composition is a comment both on what is acceptable to the sponsoring body, and on what is supposed to be desirable for, and acceptable to, the particular Christian constituency. Finally, sales and use of a certain book reveal that its theological slant is acceptable to those who buy it. Any theological emphasis revealed by analysis is

not in the least invalidated by the observation that many writers, choosers of hymn books, and even editors, are unaware of any special emphasis.

Revealing the theological emphasis in a collection of hymns

There are a number of ways in which a collection of songs and hymns can be examined for their theological emphases. If we want to see the ideas of a particular author, then it is appropriate to select a few representative hymns for detailed study. If we want to know what is most striking about a collection, then an impressionistic review can be helpful. However, we want to be able to pick out the combined emphasis of many different authors over as wide a field of theological topics as possible. Ideally we should ask questions of each hymn, topic by topic. This article uses a simple method of noting whether or not there occurs in each hymn a particular religious word or synonym which captures a single element of religious belief, and reporting the percentage of hymns in a collection which contain that element of belief.

The method proceeds from the assumption that an author chooses to write about, and an editor include, what is most important to them. The more central it is to a way of thinking, the more often it will occur. On the other hand, if they have the choice, people will choose not to sing about religious ideas that are irrelevant to them. 'Grace' was a very important element of religious belief for John Wesley, and so it is no surprise to discover that when he edited *A Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People Called Methodists*, the word 'grace' appeared in 82 per cent of the hymns.

Seventy-two words or groups of words expressing an element of religious belief have been chosen for this analysis, so as to provide a reasonably comprehensive 'fingerprint' of the relative emphases in each collection of songs or hymns. The method is able to paint a picture of theological emphases by using broad strokes, and to do it in a reasonably impartial way. Each hymn in each collection is treated equally, and, apart from the initial selection of the words for study, any personal predilection is eliminated until interpretation.

There are limitations in interpreting the results, and these should be recognized:

- 1) There is a statistical difficulty in reporting the analysis of small collections of hymns, such as the AHB supplement which contains only twenty-nine. There is no significance in a difference of 5 to 10 per cent in such a case.
- 2) Not all items in a collection are used equally. Some are always avoided, others are selected frequently. For example, although the Holy Spirit is a rare subject in *CSSM Choruses*, 'Spirit of the Living God, fall afresh on me'¹⁰ is one of the more popular choruses. This is

an example of how difference between editor and user can be accommodated. However, there is a limit to selection. Although the evangelical may be able to make a suitable selection from, say, *The English Hymnal*, which reckons itself non-party, the end result is liable to be influenced in a non-evangelical direction. When selection happens for musical or lyrical reasons, we can assume the effect will cancel itself out.

3) The method records the percentage of hymns in which a motif occurs. This means the longer a hymn, the more likely a motif is to appear. For this reason, collections of choruses cannot be compared with collections of hymns, although they are still of significance because of the balance of emphasis.

4) It can be argued that the emphases of hymn books vary with the intended sphere of use, and that comparison of a book for public worship with a book for youth meetings is not on equal terms. It is true, for instance, that children's song books show a very different emphasis from adult books, and for that reason are not included in this survey. However, the evidence from comparison of the pre-1970 song and hymn book with different spheres of use, is that there is a marked degree of agreement.

The song and hymn books

From the wide range of song and hymn books available at present, nine have been chosen because of their range of influence, or because they are representative. They include the *Sound of Living Waters* series as books used by evangelicals, since these are a prime choice by many evangelicals for fellowship meetings and national gatherings. Two books which are not regarded as being used by evangelicals to any great extent, *With One Voice*, and *More Hymns for Today*, are included to put evangelical theological trends into the context of ecumenical and general Church of England emphases.

1) *Sound of Living Waters* (1974), 2) *Fresh Sounds* (1976),¹¹ and 3) *Cry Hosanna* (1980), an essential choice because of their popularity, are probably the most used by evangelicals of all the new books examined. They are an obvious example of a vehicle for a new emphasis, that of charismatic renewal.

4) *Songs of Fellowship* (1979)¹³ is included as an alternative example of renewal emphasis, although its popularity is only modest.

5) *Sing Good News 1* (1980)¹⁴ is of interest because of the diversity of contributors rather than popularity. It comprises the best entries to a Bible Society competition aimed at setting the Good News Bible to music.

6) The *Anglican Hymn Book* supplement (1978) is not a hymn book in its own right, but these few extra hymns are of considerable interest, not only because the *Anglican Hymn Book*¹⁵ is the standard

book for public worship amongst Anglican evangelicals these days, but also because the comparison between 1965 and 1978 shows neatly and directly any changes and corrections in emphases.

7) *Songs of Worship* (1980), the new hymn book from Scripture Union, is likely to be popular amongst evangelicals. It has a special importance as a book to which the publishers had looked forward since the sixties. In the foreword to *Hymns of Faith*, Scripture Union's 1964 hymn book set to run thirty years, is this tail-piece: 'The current shortage of acceptable hymns is one expression of the spiritual dearth of our day. Before this new hymn book has run its course we trust the tide will have turned and the Holy Spirit moved revivingly through the Church.'¹⁶ Scripture Union obviously believes that this has now happened.

8) *With One Voice* (1979)¹⁷ is an Australian ecumenical hymn book which Collins have promoted heavily in Britain. Some evangelicals may be using it, but it is included in order to compare contemporary evangelical and ecumenical emphases.

9) *More Hymns for Today* (1980), second sequel to the popular favourite of the Church of England, *Hymns Ancient and Modern Revised*, is included so that the previous books can be set in the context of more general trends in the church.

Seven hymn and song books published over a period before 1970 are set alongside the new books for comparison. They are selected to give a variety of types, interests and periods, and inevitably some favourites are not included.

10) *Sankey's Sacred Songs and Solos* (1920 edition),¹⁸ for sheer volume of sales (possibly 100 million), has to be included in any comparison of evangelical song books this century.

11) *The Keswick Hymn Book* (1938)¹⁹ reflects an important and continuing strand of evangelicalism, and is of interest in the context of comparison with books of the charismatic renewal, because it has often been suggested that the Keswick influence prepared for and nurtured the charismatic renewal of the sixties.

12) *Christian Praise* (1957) has sometimes been used by college Christian Unions, and may reflect an emphasis of the Universities and Colleges Christian Fellowship.

13) *The Anglican Hymn Book* (1965).

14) *The London Crusade Song Book* (1966)²¹ is included because the influence of Billy Graham has been substantial over three decades, and is sometimes presumed to be a little different from indigenous theological emphases.

15) *Youth Praise 1* (1966)²² and 16) *Youth Praise 2* (1969)²³ have an essential place, as they can fairly claim to be the most popular song books used by evangelicals—and not just the young—during the past ten years.

Theological emphases reported

Complete tables for the results of this analysis are set out as an appendix at the end of the article. They are reported in full so as to be available for further or more complete interpretation than the summary which follows.

General comments

The tables indicate a certain level of consistency between books of a similar type. *Sound of Living Waters*, *Fresh Sounds* and *Cry Hosanna* tend to have levels of occurrence of themes within the same general bracket, while *Youth Praise 1 and 2* agree within a different bracket for words such as 'Bible', 'cross', or 'fellowship'. Some differences are to be expected, particularly with the words which occur less frequently, but the level of consistency lends weight to the significance of the levels of occurrence, and to the fact that particular emphases do produce hymn books in which they are consistently stressed. This justifies the attempt to look for underlying emphases.

Furthermore, there is in general a degree of consistency between the seven books published prior to 1970, whereas there are marked divergencies after that date. To be more precise, there is a marked degree of consistency between four dissimilar books: the *Keswick Hymn Book*, *Christian Praise*, the *Anglican Hymn Book*, and the *London Crusade Song Book*. In most instances *Sankey* is also very similar, and, apart from some notable exceptions, so are *Youth Praise 1 and 2*. The significance of this is to suggest that over a prolonged period evangelicalism has not seen any substantial shifts in theological emphases, but that shifts are now taking place. This then is statistical evidence for the view that the present is a time of rethinking, or of special work of the Spirit. It is not just that new hymns are available, for the common hymns in the pre-1970 collections are fewer than one would suppose. These observations also provide more evidence to explain why the present should be felt to be a period of 'evangelical identity crisis'.

There are a number of theological topics which deserve special notice: 'salvation' and 'sin', 'love and praise', 'Holy Spirit', 'fellowship' and 'love for fellow-men', and words used for 'God'.

Salvation

Salvation is less heavily emphasized in many modern books, including *Sing Good News 1*, *More Hymns for Today*, and books of the charismatic renewal. However, this is not true of two recent evangelical books. Compared with those published prior to 1970, the *AHB* supplement and *Songs of Worship* have an equally heavy emphasis on salvation, although it is expressed differently.

There are a number of words for salvation, such as 'save', 'redeem', 'forgive', 'cleanse', 'carry away'. If we add together the figures for

their occurrence so as to even out any preference for, say, speaking of cleansing rather than forgiveness, the sum will give us a comparison of the emphasis on salvation. The higher the number, the greater the emphasis; the lower, the less the emphasis.²⁴ At the same time we can look at the opposite side of the coin—'sin'—for that should tell the same story, since it is the problem to which salvation is the remedy.²⁵

Taking first the charismatic-renewal books, 'salvation' and 'sin' occur only about half as much as in the older evangelical books, the emphasis being as strong as in the non-evangelical *More Hymns for Today*. This should not be construed as meaning that the renewal emphasis waters down or denies the truths of salvation, any more than *Youth Praise 1* should be construed as being non-trinitarian because the Trinity does not explicitly occur in any song. It merely means that emphasis is being placed on what is considered to be a more vital area. We can be more precise, however, about what is being de-emphasized in salvation. There are some themes which in a broader sense can be included under the work of salvation, such as 'healing', 'life' and 'peace'. These are not de-emphasized at all. They are more tangible and immediate expressions of salvation, corresponding to evils other than personal sin: sickness, deadness, and chaos. This suggests that, compared to the older evangelical books, the charismatic-renewal books are really less interested in personal sin as a problem of mankind. The reduced interest in salvation follows as a result. Again it should be stressed that it cannot be suggested that the theology implicit in charismatic renewal devalues the gravity of personal sin, except in so far as it finds other more relevant and pressing topics to emphasize.

Sing Good News 1 deserves special comment. It consists purely of passages from the Good News Bible, with more from the psalms than from any other book. If we were to treat the psalms as 150 hymns in a book, the figures for 'salvation' and 'sin' as above would be 60 and 37 respectively. It is therefore surprising to find 'salvation' and 'sin' as low as 37 and 8 in *Sing Good News 1*. It means that the contributors on the whole disfavoured sin and salvation in selecting passages for composition. This is an indication that Christians at large do not find sin and salvation relevant theological topics at the present time.

These comments do not apply however to the *AHB* supplement or *Songs of Worship*. 'Salvation' is not de-emphasized, and 'sin' is only marginally less than in the older books. Nevertheless, there is a marked shift in the imagery that is used in describing the operation of salvation, away from 'blood' (as an effective element) towards 'cross'. The shift begins before 1970. The blood of Jesus is a significant theme in *Sankey*, the *Keswick Hymn Book*, *Christian Praise*, the *Anglican Hymn Book*, and the *London Crusade Song Book*. It is about half as significant in *Youth Praise 1 and 2*, the *AHB* supplement, and

Songs of Worship. On the other hand, the cross of Jesus has almost 50 per cent greater weight in the latter set.²⁶

The charismatic-renewal books do not specially emphasize either, but the balance of emphasis, such as it is, in the non-evangelical books (*With One Voice* and *More Hymns for Today*) is the same as in the recent evangelical books. In fact, the trend towards seeing the action of salvation less in terms of 'blood' and more in terms of 'cross' is not a recent innovation. In John Wesley's *A Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People Called Methodist*, 'blood' occurs in 32 per cent of hymns, and 'cross' in 13 per cent. Since that time there has been a tendency towards favouring 'cross', although most strongly in the more recently composed material such as in *Youth Praise*.

Although the emphasis on the cross in the newer evangelical books is part of a continuing trend, there is another trend which appears to have a more recent beginning. There is a new stress on the word 'resurrection'. 'Cross' and 'resurrection' are often set in juxtaposition as a way of expressing the work of Jesus Christ—the effect of cross and tomb being resurrection life in the believer. This new emphasis is clear in the *AHB* supplement and in *Songs of Worship*, and possibly significant in *Youth Praise 2*. The word 'life' reflects this emphasis to a degree,²⁷ and shows a strong and distinct new emphasis amongst evangelicals, albeit shared to some extent with the wider church, as seen in *More Hymns for Today*. Instead of being a necessary afterthought to the finished work of the cross, resurrection is assuming the proportions of a major emphasis.

Love and praise

A characteristic commonly attributed to the outpouring of modern hymnody is its emphasis on praise and love for God, particularly as it is used in 'festivals of praise' or times of praise and prayer. On the face of it, this is not entirely justified. The new books, charismatic-renewal included, have no greater emphasis on love and praise than a conventional hymn book for public worship.

Care is needed in interpreting the occurrence of words with this subject. The actual words may not capture the attitude of praise in a song, nor can words alone indicate the value of a song as a medium of praise. Some music will allow words to express love and praise far more powerfully than other music, and it happens that a good proportion of the music and idiom of the *Sound of Living Waters* series is of this kind. Having said that, however, it still remains that there is nothing to indicate a greater emphasis than exists potentially in, say, the *Anglican Hymn Book*. Nor is it the case that the series takes love for God in a sentimental or over-emotional way. These books actually refer to the emotions less than others do.²⁸ That is not to say they are not emotive. Given the right context, singing 'Father we adore you' is

rather more emotional than singing 'I am H-A-P-P-Y'. I venture to suggest that this has to do with a feeling of relevance and corporateness rather than emotionalism.

Table 2 shows that the new song books have recovered an emphasis on love and praise which has not always been strong in evangelical hymnody, although it has been present, as in *Sankey* and the *Anglican Hymn Book*. It also appears that among the new books those of charismatic-renewal are not outstanding in their emphasis on love and praise, for it is shared by *Songs of Worship* and the *AHB* supplement, by the ecumenical *With One Voice*, by the variety of authors in *Sing Good News 1* (for which allowance should be made for shortness of items), and by *More Hymns for Today*. Love and praise are a common characteristic of all the new hymn and song books in this survey. However, if there is a feeling of contemporary change towards a greater emphasis on love and praise, then an important piece of the picture must be the observation that the song books which dominated the singing of young people in the period immediately before the present were the weakest of all on love and praise. Of all the books examined, it is *Youth Praise 1 and 2* which appear most out of line. Perhaps their lower emphasis is more significant than the higher emphasis of, say, *Sound of Living Waters*.

Holy Spirit

In the light of the preceding comments, it is interesting to notice that a similar situation exists with a theme which, on the face of it, appears to be a hall-mark of the charismatic-renewal movement, the 'Holy Spirit'. The charismatic-renewal books do not emphasize the Holy Spirit significantly more than previous evangelical hymn books such as the *Anglican Hymn Book*. Indeed, they mention the Holy Spirit less than some other new books such as *More Hymns for Today*. Two books noticeably out of line in this respect are *Youth Praise 1 and 2*, where the Holy Spirit is mentioned less frequently.²⁹

This again suggests that, in a supposed key area of greater emphasis in this period of renewal, the charismatic-renewal books are not in the forefront (25 per cent is only as high as in Wesley's *A Collection of Hymns . . .*), though the previous period shows more evidence of a lower emphasis than the norm for evangelical hymnody.

Fellowship and love for fellow-men

There is clearer evidence that the new hymn books have a greater emphasis on the corporateness of the Christian life, and a new interest in love for fellow-men.³⁰

On the theme of fellowship, a familiar pattern emerges of a lower than usual emphasis in *Youth Praise*; but, making allowances for *Sing Good News 1* with its shorter items, each one of the new books—whatever label we may attach—has a greater emphasis on fellowship and corporateness with the exception of *Sound of Living Waters*.

There may be some historical significance in the fact that mention of fellowship increased by 50 per cent between 1974 and 1976 in that series. In the new books, the increased emphasis on love for others is rather more marked but equally pervasive, and, if the distinction is significant, it appears a little earlier than that on fellowship. The higher emphasis is in *Sound of Living Waters* but is first seen in *Youth Praise 2* (1969), which includes a section on social concern.

This then is evidence of a general trend towards greater social concern and away from individualistic religion, and it is a trend of which evangelical and charismatic-renewal books are equally a part.

The Godhead

Recent hymn books, other than those of charismatic renewal, reveal some noticeable changes in the way in which the Godhead is spoken of. There is a little difficulty in dealing with distinctions, because of the way in which titles are carelessly interchangeable and sometimes meaningless. 'Christ', for instance, does not always have messianic significance. Allowing for this, there is a possible trend towards conceiving of God as more remote than previously, more powerful, and yet more involved with the present world or order of things.³¹ From Table 1 it can be seen that the word 'God', whether used in an indeterminate way or intending the Father, occurs more frequently in the *AHB* supplement, *Songs of Worship, With One Voice and More Hymns for Today* than elsewhere. This does not have to be at the expense of an interest in the Son (although it is in the non-evangelical books) but it does indicate a greater stressing of the characteristics of the more remote Father or indivisible God. Creation is the prime characteristic which is emphasized, although the power and might of God are also more heavily stressed in the evangelical books. This brings at once to mind the distant creative work of God, whilst at the same time it recalls that the creative power of God is vitally present and active in the world. It remembers a God who is interested in his world. The occurrence of creation is often in fact allied to new creation, 'new' being a word which occurs more frequently in recent hymn books, and which underlines the activity of God in the present—able to make people and things 'new'. This emphasis on world involvement goes alongside the social concern already noticed.

The more frequent use of the word 'Christ' partly tells the same story. The use of the more formal title 'Christ' indicates a somewhat more distanced attitude to Jesus, and focuses on the mission of the Christ as opposed to the personality of Jesus. That is to say, the use of 'Christ' has more active connotations to do with something that is to happen in the world than the use of 'Jesus'.

So we may sum up by saying that the recent evangelical books share the general trend (which the charismatic-renewal books do not) towards speaking of God in a slightly more distanced way, and under-

lining, more than the older evangelical books, his creative activity in the world.

Some conclusions

The tables for occurrence of religious words show a reasonable degree of consistency between books of a similar type. This lends weight to the theological significance of the occurrence values.

They reveal that after a long period of relatively stable theological emphases, evangelicals are being subjected to a period of rethinking and new emphases. The new era is not confined to evangelicals, and does not just stem from charismatic evangelicals. It is part of the new thinking within the wider church, some of which is shared by evangelicals and charismatics.

An evangelical portrait

The evangelical books reveal a new theological framework in which salvation has the central place it has always possessed in evangelicalism but is somewhat reinterpreted. It is less a blood-bought gift, and more a life possessed by the individual through the death and resurrection of Jesus the Christ. The life is a communal one in solidarity with other Christians and embodies, among other characteristics, the compassion of Jesus which reaches out in love to men. It is a life founded by, and shaped by, God's creative activity in his world according to the messianic plan.

A charismatic-renewal portrait

It is not easy to assemble an 'Identikit' portrait of the charismatic-renewal emphases because, relatively speaking, it is featureless. Surprisingly, the books are not overpronounced in the novelty of their emphases. There are many respects in which the charismatic books are in line with the old familiar evangelical books, including some emphases regarded as characteristic of renewal—fellowship, praise, Holy Spirit—which are hardly significantly greater than in the old books. Even in the couple of instances where the charismatic books excel the old, they are themselves excelled by other recent books. In other respects they do differ in having a reduced emphasis, particularly on themes regarded as hallmarks of evangelicalism—such as sin, the Bible, heaven, grace, and salvation.

If the charismatic books are received as fresh and new, then part of the answer may be that the books they often replace, *Youth Praise*, are low on the themes associated with the renewal movement. Another part of the answer may be that the associated music and folk idiom allow the material to be used more widely or more effectively.

The charismatic-renewal portrait is the old evangelical portrait with some muted features, with only 'love for fellow-men' enhanced.

The general picture

In 1938, the contents of American Methodist hymnals over the previous century were quantitatively analysed.³² The decline of interest in the doctrines of salvation and sin, of death and judgement, and the increase of interest in social concern, were documented. Much recent hymnody appears to fall into this general pattern of reductionism and humanitarianism, for the same features apply—apart from death and judgement—to non-evangelical, ecumenical and charismatic books, and to *Sing Good News 1*. In the matter of social concern, they also apply to evangelical hymnbooks. However, something apart from reductionism appears to be emerging in the most recent evangelical books. There are strong new emphases suggesting a fresh expression of God's saving activity.

Perhaps this article can aid evangelicals in testing how far the Holy Spirit is, or is not, at work today.

THE REV. BILL HOPKINSON is assistant curate of Sawley Parish Church, Derbyshire, and is researching at Nottingham University.

NOTES

- 1 *Songs of Worship*, edited by Robin Sheldon, (Scripture Union, London 1980), editor's introduction.
- 2 There is difficulty in the use of the terms 'charismatic', 'renewal' and 'evangelical' because what is termed 'charismatic renewal' may also be evangelical, and what is described as 'evangelical' may be part of charismatic renewal. The terms are used in a popular way and should not be regarded as mutually exclusive.
- 3 *More Hymns for Today*, ed. John Dykes Bower and others, (William Clowes, London 1980), editors' introduction.
- 4 *Anglican Hymn Book: Additional Hymns* (Vine Books, London 1978).
- 5 *Sound of Living Waters: Songs of Renewal*, ed. Betty Pulkingham and Jeanne Harper (Hodder and Stoughton, London 1974).
- 6 L. E. Elliott-Binns, *Religion in the Victorian Era* 2nd edn. (Lutterworth, London 1946) p.374 who cites Silvester Horne, *Free Church History*, p.250.
- 7 *Golden Bells* 1st edn. (CSSM, London 1890) no. 122 and many other books.
- 8 Louis F. Benson, *The English Hymn, Its Development and Use in Worship* (Presbyterian Board of Publication, Philadelphia 1915) p.244.
- 9 *A Collection of Hymns for the Use of the People Called Methodist*, ed. John Wesley, (London 1779) p.3.
- 10 *Children's Special Service Mission Choruses Book 2* (CSSM, London 1938) no. 418.
- 11 *Fresh Sounds*, ed. Betty Pulkingham and Jeanne Harper (Hodder and Stoughton, London 1976).
- 12 *Cry Hosanna*, ed. Betty Pulkingham and Mimi Farra (Hodder and Stoughton, London 1980).
- 13 *Songs of Fellowship: For Praise and Worship* (Kingsway, and Crusade for World Revival, London 1979).
- 14 *Sing Good News Song Book 1*, ed. David Reynolds (Bible Society, London 1980).
- 15 *Anglican Hymn Book* (Church Book Room Press, London 1965).
- 16 *Hymns of Faith* (Scripture Union, London 1964) p.iv.
- 17 *With One Voice* (Collins, London 1979). Formerly *The Australian Hymn Book* (1977).
- 18 *Sacred Songs and Solos: Revised and Enlarged, with Standard Hymns*, ed. Ira D. Sankey (Marshall Morgan and Scott, London 1920).
- 19 *Keswick Hymn Book* (Marshall Morgan and Scott, London 1938).

CHURCHMAN

- 20 *Christian Praise* (Tyndale, London 1957).
- 21 *Billy Graham London Crusade Song Book 1966*, ed. Cliff Barrows (The Billy Graham Evangelistic Association, London 1966).
- 22 *Youth Praise*, ed. Michael A. Baughen (Falcon Books, London 1966).
- 23 *Youth Praise 2*, ed. Michael A. Baughen and others (Falcon Books, London 1969).
- 24 cf. table 2.
- 25 cf. table 1, 'Salvation' and 'Sin'.
- 26 cf. table 1, 'Blood' and 'Cross'.
- 27 cf. table 1, 'Resurrection' and 'Life'.
- 28 cf. table 2.
- 29 cf. table 1, 'Holy Spirit'.
- 30 cf. table 1, 'Fellowship' and 'Love for Others'.
- 31 cf. table 1, 'God', 'Power', 'Create', 'Christ' and 'Jesus'.
- 32 Benjamin F. Crawford, *Religious Trends in a Century of Hymns* (Carnegie Pa., 1938). Quoted by Susan S. Tamke, *Make a Joyful Noise Unto the Lord* (Ohio UP, Athens Ohio 1978) p.11.

TABLE 1
Occurrence of
themes in
hymn books
 (in percentages)

	Sankey S.S.S	Keswick Hymn Book	Christian Praise	Anglican Hymn Book	London Crusade S.B	Youth Praise 1	Youth Praise 2	Sound of Living Waters	Fresh Sounds	Cry Hosanna	Songs of Fellowship	Sing Good News 1	A.H.B supplement	Songs of Worship	With One Voice	More Hymns for Today
Bible	13	11	4	11	7	12	13	3	3	4	0	1	21	18	6	16
Blood	13	25	16	14	22	7	5	8	7	8	0	0	11	5	9	4
Carry away, bear	5	10	4	5	4	10	7	2	3	1	0	3	7	4	2	1
Celebrate, feast	7	2	1	5	3	1	2	5	7	6	8	4	0	6	5	10
Christ, Messiah	23	22	25	28	21	28	23	20	19	18	6	12	54	47	31	48
Cleanse, purge	8	14	5	7	13	7	6	6	1	4	4	1	7	8	5	0
Create	4	2	9	11	7	4	7	9	9	9	0	8	18	16	17	24
Cross, Calvary	18	18	14	18	18	27	26	8	8	10	2	1	39	24	17	17
Death	32	24	26	29	36	26	33	23	19	23	4	11	50	37	31	26
Depression, dismay	17	13	11	17	23	9	11	4	7	9	4	7	11	9	9	10
Endeavour, work, watch	18	16	13	17	10	8	7	7	5	6	6	2	18	15	12	16
Enemy, Satan	6	11	13	13	11	2	11	5	12	6	2	8	11	7	10	1
Faith, trust, believe	37	24	16	26	26	20	24	20	17	11	9	16	21	26	21	26
Fellowship, unity	18	19	21	24	12	8	11	21	31	27	36	22	43	30	31	35
Fight	8	8	10	11	7	3	6	2	6	4	0	1	4	8	8	4
Forever	39	28	36	37	29	21	15	18	18	23	15	21	50	29	34	27
Forgive	8	13	14	11	17	9	13	5	5	9	11	6	11	17	8	12

Changes in Emphases of Evangelical Belief 1970-1980

TABLE 1
Occurrence of
themes in
hymn books
 (in percentages)

	Sankey S S	Keswick Hymn Book	Christian Praise	Anglican Hymn Book	London Crusade S.B.	Youth Praise 1	Youth Praise 2	Sound of Living Waters	Fresh Sounds	Cry Hosanna	Songs of Fellowship	Sing Good News 1	A H.B. supplement	Songs of Worship	With One Voice	More Hymns for Today
Freedom	14	16	15	14	17	15	17	17	16	13	13	5	18	17	13	13
Friend of God	5	8	6	6	8	9	7	3	1	1	0	1	4	5	7	13
Glory	29	36	30	41	37	17	20	18	25	20	15	24	50	27	38	32
God, Father, indefinite	44	39	48	51	42	35	49	44	59	50	42	59	64	58	60	64
Grace, mercy	42	38	44	45	44	24	18	20	17	17	19	4	46	32	41	39
Guide, lead	21	14	14	19	21	15	19	14	19	13	6	7	21	27	20	18
Happiness, pleasure	28	19	10	19	24	13	10	12	10	11	11	12	11	10	17	17
Heal, balm	8	9	9	9	9	4	3	11	5	13	4	2	4	14	9	7
Heart	40	40	35	43	37	29	22	25	17	27	32	14	43	32	40	33
Heaven	48	38	36	41	40	22	24	11	22	17	6	13	21	25	41	23
Holy, pure, perfect	28	32	31	37	25	11	12	19	19	19	32	18	25	24	30	21
Holy Spirit	13	15	16	17	13	7	9	17	15	21	13	11	25	24	15	26
Humility	16	25	28	21	30	13	19	9	19	16	9	21	32	17	27	22
Inner experience	10	10	14	18	9	15	12	5	5	6	9	1	7	16	10	10
Jesus, the Son	49	42	38	41	67	55	51	49	49	46	43	13	43	67	37	32
Joy, rejoice	40	29	30	34	31	18	19	29	15	30	23	22	36	27	33	41
Kept, guarded, security	23	27	24	23	23	15	14	7	8	13	15	16	38	12	18	9
King, reign, throne	28	29	31	35	28	19	19	20	19	23	21	11	54	30	34	29
Law, judgement	11	12	12	14	11	4	11	4	4	3	4	9	4	17	11	8
Life	32	24	23	23	19	23	26	26	20	25	23	19	43	42	26	26
Light	18	18	22	23	9	5	11	12	10	9	4	5	32	19	26	17
Lord	40	50	52	62	38	51	53	50	44	63	57	63	64	73	62	54
Love by God	48	49	50	55	57	31	34	26	34	38	43	20	50	53	49	44
Love for God	18	14	10	14	14	9	7	12	18	9	23	3	11	14	19	22
Love for others	8	2	1	3	2	3	7	13	12	13	23	6	11	21	10	25
Might, power	28	30	30	33	28	19	17	18	22	20	9	29	50	43	31	23
Name, banner	19	19	20	22	22	11	9	16	20	22	26	12	36	24	19	16
Nearness of God	38	25	31	35	30	19	24	19	21	28	23	22	25	23	28	22
Newness, remade	15	11	15	13	14	13	12	11	16	18	9	12	21	19	13	21
Obey, command	10	7	10	9	6	5	6	6	6	6	6	6	11	13	8	13
Peace	28	18	15	19	18	9	17	14	15	17	11	13	11	17	16	23
Plan, wisdom of God	8	9	7	13	9	11	15	8	6	6	6	4	21	19	16	18
Possessed by God, fill	21	30	30	28	28	21	17	14	12	20	19	18	29	22	15	16
Praise, worship, thanks	36	30	40	47	31	20	18	46	46	53	32	36	61	45	45	47
Prayer, cry to God	13	18	15	21	16	14	19	11	9	9	6	14	18	19	21	15
Promises of God	16	13	13	12	14	5	8	5	4	6	6	8	14	12	9	7
Redeem, buy back, pay	26	17	16	17	21	11	11	14	6	11	8	3	21	13	17	3
Resurrection	8	5	8	9	6	9	12	11	4	11	4	2	18	30	10	15
Return of Jesus	14	11	5	7	11	5	9	4	1	7	4	6	14	6	5	2
Revelation, vision	8	3	4	14	8	9	5	7	10	7	5	12	11	14	9	21
Sacrifice, Lamb	10	1	14	14	12	8	9	8	13	10	4	3	21	14	10	6
Save, rescue, deliver	55	39	40	39	54	47	44	19	19	20	6	13	54	33	34	24
Self-sacrifice, yield	13	17	15	16	15	15	11	9	8	8	8	5	21	10	12	17
Service, calling	18	16	12	14	13	10	9	8	12	11	6	9	36	27	19	21
Sin, evil	38	42	38	39	43	41	36	14	16	19	8	10	32	31	27	18
Sing, dance, instruments	35	22	21	28	28	19	16	26	29	33	23	25	36	32	30	28
Soul	36	40	28	30	26	13	9	22	16	18	8	4	21	15	23	9
Sorrow, passion, pain	39	23	25	25	23	17	25	11	12	15	2	7	21	25	25	19
Teach	5	4	4	10	4	8	5	6	2	7	4	6	21	2	8	12
This world	20	19	6	15	17	15	18	13	20	13	9	12	18	20	16	27
Trial, tempt, difficulty	22	20	12	15	23	10	13	5	6	6	2	5	18	5	14	11
Trinity	3	4	6	11	1	0	1	5	6	4	0	1	4	6	14	9
Truth	6	7	9	12	8	6	9	5	3	7	6	10	25	22	12	18
Victory	14	16	20	23	16	11	17	13	10	8	4	5	43	25	18	9
Way	30	17	17	21	20	23	22	13	17	10	9	8	18	17	15	13

TABLE 2
Sum of percentage occurrences for groups of themes

	Total of words		
	for Salvation	for Love and Praise	for Emotions
<i>Sankey S S S</i>	101	96	124
<i>Keswick Hymn Book</i>	93	68	87
<i>Christian Praise</i>	79	72	76
<i>Anglican Hymn Book</i>	79	94	95
<i>London Crusade S B</i>	105	76	101
<i>Youth Praise 1</i>	84	49	57
<i>Youth Praise 2</i>	81	43	65
<i>Sound of Living Waters</i>	46	89	56
<i>Fresh Sounds</i>	34	100	44
<i>Cry Hosanna</i>	45	101	65
<i>Songs of Fellowship</i>	42	86	39
<i>Sing Good News 1</i>	26	68	48
<i>A H B supplement</i>	100	108	79
<i>Songs of Worship</i>	75	97	73
<i>With One Voice</i>	66	99	84
<i>More Hymns for Today</i>	40	107	87

The figures are sums of percentage occurrences for intercomparison, and are not themselves percentage occurrences. Thus:
 Salvation, sum of: 'Save', 'Forgive', 'Cleanse', 'Redeem', and 'Carry away'.
 Love and Praise, sum of: 'Love for God', 'Praise', 'Sing', and 'Celebrate'.
 Emotions, sum of: 'Depression', 'Happiness', 'Joy', and 'Sorrow'.